The Clement S. Stacy Undergraduate Research Conference, sponsored by the School of Liberal Arts and Social Sciences at Purdue University Calumet, was convened for the 21st consecutive year on April 13, 2013. Once again submissions were reviewed by a faculty panel, and 60 presentations were selected for the conference. Students from 14 institutions presented their research on a wide range of topics in literature, history, political science, gender studies, film, religion, psychology, philosophy, and health.

Research is an essential part of the mission of higher education, and Purdue Calumet places great emphasis on affording undergraduate students the opportunity to engage in research and disseminate their findings. At the conference in April, the students were presenters; they had to hone their skills in public speaking, PowerPoint presentation, and responding to vigorous questioning from session attendees. In the proceedings, the students become authors, polishing research writing skills such as analysis, synthesis, and proper citation of evidence. I am extremely pleased that the work of these students is published in these electronic proceedings, and I hope you will enjoy reviewing the outstanding papers contained herein.

To the faculty mentors, friends and family of the students, I send my sincere thanks for your support of the students and their important work. I would also like to publically acknowledge Purdue Calumet’s Ruby d’Azevedo, who again this year was the principal conference organizer and sole editor of these proceedings. Her efforts were absolutely crucial to the success of this year’s event and this subsequent publication. Valuable assistance was also provided by our faculty review panel, by Dr. Rebecca Stankowski, Executive Director of Multidisciplinary Studies and Assessment, and by Ms. Kathryn Hejmej, Administrative Assistant to the Dean.

Again, congratulations to the authors of these papers. I very much hope to see you continue your excellent work in the liberal arts and social sciences.

Sincerely yours,

Ron Corthell

Ronald Corthell, Dean
School of Liberal Arts and Social Sciences
Purdue University Calumet
Volume I – Table of Contents

A - K

Megan Abbate .................................................................................................................. 1
University of Dayton

LaJenne Alcantar ............................................................................................................. 10
Purdue University Calumet

Rolo Baez ......................................................................................................................... 28
Southern Illinois University Edwardsville

Anthony Bara .................................................................................................................... 35
Saint Xavier University

Victoria Boswell, Mindy Eastling, and Sara Mendez ....................................................... 55
Purdue University Calumet

Erin E. Brown and Emilee L. VanderSluis ........................................................................ 62
Purdue University Calumet

Deanna M. Curletti .......................................................................................................... 82
Purdue University Calumet

Candalynne Datz .............................................................................................................. 108
Georgian Court University

Tiffany Deaton .................................................................................................................. 119
Purdue University Calumet

S. C. Doran ....................................................................................................................... 131
University of Toledo

Jim Elliott .......................................................................................................................... 143
Purdue University

Jeff Emond ......................................................................................................................... 156
Purdue University Calumet

Marisa Enos ..................................................................................................................... 165
Central Michigan University

Jacqueline N. Fillmore ..................................................................................................... 180
Central Michigan University

Erin Foreman .................................................................................................................... 190
Wilmington College
Angelina Gomez ................................................................. 197
Purdue University Calumet

Kayla Greenwell .................................................................. 202
Purdue University Calumet

Evan Hixon ........................................................................ 209
Purdue University Calumet

Emily Hunter ........................................................................ 217
Wheaton College

Gowoon Hwang .................................................................. 224
Taylor University

Cassandra John ................................................................... 230
Purdue University Calumet

Nicole C. Kiszka and Elizabeth M. Rawski .................................. 237
Purdue University Calumet

Abigail Knapp ...................................................................... 256
Wilmington College

Jana Knezovic ...................................................................... 264
Saint Xavier University

Grace Kruse .......................................................................... 284
Purdue University Calumet
Developing Social Consciousness through Multicultural Young Adult Literature

Young adult literature is often overlooked and undervalued in relation to literature written for adults. In schools, teachers tend to emphasize the literary canon of traditional literature over young adult texts. There are many reasons for this: young adult literature sometimes includes controversial themes; it can be seen as having less literary merit than the classics; there are few associations or organizations in place to identify and evaluate good young adult literature; and there is little guidance available to teachers as far as how to teach this literature in comparison to the literature available on curriculum involving the classics.

However, more and more scholars and educators are beginning to recognize that young adult literature has immense value. Adolescents make connections with these texts more easily than they often can with works in more traditional curricula. In the middle and high school classroom, selecting texts which maintain teens’ interest, many of which are within the young adult genre, will help teachers convince students to keep reading in the classroom at a time in their lives when many students stop completing assigned readings, thereby stagnating their literacy development (Harmon 90). Unfortunately, canonical literature fails to engage students, instead deterring them from reading and depriving them of the benefits of proficient literacy skills. A 2010 article in Education by Jan Wilson and John Rhodes reports that 84% of students find homework boring. David Gallo’s 2001 article “How Classics Create an Alliterate Society” found that only 20% of students “usually or always liked the assigned books” in high school classes. In a 2012 issue of English Leadership Quarterly, students cited “reading selections” and “teacher’s close-mindedness toward topics of reading” as negative experiences in their Language Arts courses. The survey concluded that the best way to improve student performance in schools is to engage them to actively take interest in their own learning (Yu). An environment conducive to learning should be enjoyable for students and teachers, should target students’ individual needs, and should challenge students to be critical thinkers motivated to succeed. Adolescents cannot be convinced to read simply because they should. Literature must have personal significance. One primary way to create this is to use young adult literature to help students develop their identities. Extensive research argues that literature can be one of the most effective ways to recognize the complexity of individuals and break down

[1]
stereotypes in the process, also calling for self-reflection (Glasgow 54). Identity development is often a primary theme in young adult literature, since its audience is in the midst of identity formation (Bean). Readers can explore characters’ journeys, think about their own identity development through the lens of these varying perspectives, build their own unique identities based on this influence, and better understand the identities of others in the process.

Once teachers do identify the value that young adult literature can add to their classrooms, they often find themselves limited in their selection of acceptable young adult literature due to the non-standard English diction, lack of credibility and respectability in comparison with those novels designated as classics, or controversial themes rampant in such texts (Harmon 92, 98). Such topics commonly include suicide, depression, bullying, violence, gangs, prejudice, racism, sexuality, alcohol, drugs, theft, and morally questionable behavior. Whether acting as parents, teachers, or community members, adults often have strong opinions regarding which literature is appropriate for youth, concerned that such topics may negatively affect adolescents at an impressionable time in their identity formation. Specifically in young adult literature, books that are considered controversial are often banned publicly by schools or other community organizations (“Banned & challenged books”). The American Library Association, among other organizations, tracks the most commonly banned books of all time as well as for each year. Within these records, common reasons for the bans are listed. Some of the most common reasons cited in recent years include “offensive language,” “religious viewpoint,” “sexually explicit,” “racism,” and the relatively generic label, “unsuited to age group” (American Library Association). Interestingly enough, however, many of the most commonly banned books often also frequent bestseller lists, suggesting that these topics appeal to young adults.

Young adults participate in two types of reading: leisure reading and school-assigned reading (Glenn). Leisure reading often presents students with material far different from that examined in the classroom. Furthermore, adults have less control over literature adolescents choose to read in their free time. With an absence of guidance, students have freedom over the meanings they choose to take from literature, and these meanings may not always build positive identities. Alice Trupe argues that young adult literature is often skipped over in the classroom completely, and when adolescents select their own young adult reading material, they may not find examples of multiculturalism or any other ideas which can help them develop their social consciousness (Trupe). Wendy Glenn provides insights into some contemporary fiction which she herself finds lacking in positive prototypes for young
adults, but acknowledges that these novels remain popular with students. Instead of dismissing these novels as being wholly without value, Glenn demonstrates how students can construct positive meanings even from novels which may reinforce negative values. She presents the potential to use books like these to foster critical literary skills in students through self-inquiry and societal-inquiry. Glenn’s research considers, unlike some other scholarship which ignores, the significance of the books students select as leisure reading outside of school, and shows how such books can be brought into the classroom in a positive manner. When analyzed and discussed, addressing controversial topics within the classroom can enhance identity development, strengthen morality and formulate assertive, discerning adolescents. Young adults can establish a strong sense of self through topics and characters with which they can relate, such as those found throughout young adult literature. Controversial topics in young adult literature can be used not only to pique young adults’ interest in reading but to increase awareness of the larger world and to actively establish a unique identity within this world.

Many scholars of young adult literature, due to backgrounds in the field of education, emphasize the necessity of maintaining open-ended presentations of literature so that students can develop their own interpretations; therefore, they do not focus on attempting to draw any specific interpretive meaning from the texts they studied. While their teaching strategies may be sound, they either lack the skill set or disregard the close reading skills that literary scholars hone (Wolk). The practice of “close reading” involves analysis of an author’s particular word choice, construction, use of literary devices, and other factors involved in the composition of a work. By exploring denotation, connotation, and implication of the author’s choices, literary scholars can draw conclusions regarding various meanings to take from a piece of literature. As a literary scholar, it is imperative to argue for a particular way of interpreting a text to draw a larger meaning and significance from the work or works one is studying.

Students will benefit from practicing critical literacy in the classroom. This method of interpreting literature by analyzing the author’s perspective and intentions independently of a student’s own interpretation teaches students to construct their own meaning which may even resist the author’s intention (Bean). A critical literacy approach will teach students to analyze, critique, and question the story, the characters, the values, and the culture present in the novel. These analysis techniques can transfer easily into skills to be used within the world at large. Students can benefit from this type of thinking in every aspect of their life, becoming critical and autonomous thinkers. Young
adults who have an understanding of critical literacy can examine ways in which the world constructs and manipulates them and how this compares or contrasts with their own personal attempts to establish identity. This will help students to discern for themselves their values and, in doing so, to create a definitive identity on their own, limiting the importance of outside influences. Furthermore, adolescents can use this critical stance to examine their own process of identity formation.

Further marginalized is the sub-genre of multicultural young adult literature. These texts are often reserved for reluctant readers, a dangerously racist conflation of struggling readers and minority students (e.g., Early, “Mexican White Boy”). Minority students grow in number each year but face a curriculum which excludes, marginalizes, or stereotypes them. In this increasingly globalized world, all students will benefit from greater multicultural understanding (Alsup 31). Educator Joy Dangora advocates for African-American literature in Language Arts curriculum. She cites the racial achievement gap and particularly the lapse of African-American males behind other groups in academic performance, identifying “self-concept” and “identity issues” as two contributors to this problem. Relevant and applicable literature can help correct this problem by better engaging such students (Alsup 26). As a history teacher, she argues that incorporating African-American young adult literature can help all students, not just African-American students, to develop a greater awareness of the many dimensions of the history of America; furthermore, she argues that the addition of this literature to the curriculum will enhance the ability of students, African-American males in particular, to develop definitive positive perceptions of their own identities due to themes of racial pride and self-worth (Alsup 27). Many scholars note the challenges of finding effective multicultural literature. Kuo notes that it is important to consider authenticity via the author’s background, the complexity of the plot and characters, sufficient detail and complexity within the social issues explored, and finally accurate depiction of cultural features (Alsup 33-36).

Students can critique young novels with themes of multiculturalism to gain a better understanding of their own process of identity formation, and the societal limitations imposed upon this process. One great example of this comes in Matt de la Pena’s novels. His book *Mexican WhiteBoy* features a protagonist, Danny, who identifies as half Mexican and half white. The boy grows up in an affluent neighborhood, attending a primarily white school, and struggles to assimilate while at the same time striving to preserve his Mexican heritage. Danny’s self-reflections
throughout the book evidence this conflict. Matt de la Pena uses Danny’s journey towards empowerment to demonstrate the limitations created by narrowly-defined ethnic stereotypes. These stereotypes create a binary between universalism and particularism, pitting them in conflict against one another. During the process of identity formation, Danny is able to transcend this binary paradox and defy restrictive stereotyping.

At the beginning of the book, de la Pena pits Danny’s dual identities as mutually exclusive. Danny struggles with feelings of dislocation between his two homes: Leucadia, where he resides with his mother, and National City, where he visits his extended family on his father’s side: “And Danny’s brown. Half-Mexican brown. A shade darker than all the white kids at his private school, Leucadia Prep. Up there, Mexican people do under-the-table yard work and hide out in the hills because they’re in San Diego illegally. Only other people on Leucadia’s campus who share his shade are the lunch-line ladies, the gardeners, the custodians. But whenever Danny comes down here, to National City – where his dad grew up, where all his aunts and uncles and cousins still live – he feels pale. A full shade lighter. Albino almost” (de la Pena 2). Danny identifies himself and those around him in terms of “shades.” A “shade” is a slight, almost imperceptible difference, yet the modifier “full” suggests a drastic difference. The pairing of “full” and “shade” demonstrates that, for Danny, that minor difference has major implications. When describing his mother’s home in Leucadia, Danny notes the negative stereotypes present for Mexicans: “under-the-table yard work,” “hide out in the hills,” “illegally,” “the lunch-line ladies, the gardeners, the custodians.” These associations have given him a negative concept of his Mexican heritage. Later, the characterization “albino” implies abnormality due to whiteness. Thus, Danny demonstrates that he feels equally alienated by his white identity. At this point in the novel, Danny cannot find positive associations with either portion of his dual identity.

Regarding Danny’s negative perceptions of Mexicans as lower class workers in his upper level neighborhood, Kuo argues for the importance of understanding where such stereotypes come from, how they may be ungrounded, and how they may be over generalized (Alsup 36-39). Kuo also discusses the value of presenting characters who deal with prejudice, as they can provide a model for young adults to cope with prejudice they experience within their own lives (Alsup 44). Furthermore, Kuo suggests that the struggle faced by Danny in Matt de la Pena’s novel as one prevalent in many multicultural novels. She presents this process as first viewing the two
identities as mutually exclusive and trying to identify with one or the other, then as a transformation in which one discovers the ability to blend aspects of both identities (Alsup 40-41).

For Danny in *Mexican WhiteBoy*, his sense of displacement haunts him throughout the novel, while he spends the summer visiting his father’s family in National City. He reflects on his predicament: “No matter how many words he defines or love letters he composes or pieces of junk mail he reads aloud to his grandma while she waters spider plants potted in old Folgers coffee cans, he’ll still be a hundred miles away from who he’s supposed to be. He’s Mexican, because his family’s Mexican, but he’s not really Mexican. His skin is dark like his grandma’s sweet coffee, but his insides are as pale as the cream she mixes in. Danny holds the pencil above the paper, thinking: I’m a white boy among Mexicans, and a Mexican among white boys” (de la Pena 90). Danny’s ability to verbalize his predicament suggests that he has become acutely aware of exactly why he feels so out-of-place. The use of the expression “a hundred miles away” hearkens to the location of his ancestors, Mexico, which Danny is metaphorically and physical unable to reach because he is in America, and because he has grown up in a predominantly affluent white neighborhood. Danny has decided who he is “supposed to be,” suggesting a destined path which one must follow, but the path he imagines is unobtainable for him. Danny’s skin color has become a roadblock, preventing him from completing his journey from adolescence into adulthood. The juxtaposition of “coffee” and cream,” however, foreshadows the potential to mix two identities just as the two liquids can be mixed together.

Scholars of post-modernism argue that this movement has complicated notions of identity. The historically unchanging community and family have been replaced by contemporary dislocation and rootlessness. Many adolescents find themselves feeling displaced and disconnected as a result. The transient nature of society has led identity formulation to be created based on actions and experiences rather than located in unchanging traditions and backgrounds (Bean). Globalism has further complicated identities in the increasing number of cross-cultural identities that exist. As more and more cultures become interconnected, many adolescents must establish ways to merge identities with aspects of multiple cultures (Bean). Fostering a more global understanding among adolescents generally will help to establish that diverse cultural identities are combinable rather than mutually exclusive. Greater acceptance of these new hybrid identities will prevent detachment, isolation, and conflict often experienced by adolescents who struggle to merge distinct identities.
By the end of the novel, Danny has transformed into a confident individual who feels accepted both at school and around his Mexican family members. He has learned to navigate the shared space between his white identity and his Mexican identity. In Danny’s case, it is not universalism which prevails, but becoming closer to his Mexican roots. He rejects some of the stereotypes of both identities: for example, the notion that a Mexican cannot wear preppy clothes, or that he cannot be a Mexican if he doesn’t speak Spanish. He must gain the self-confidence to accept that he does not conform to the traditional definitions of either identity, but must learn to self-define his identity. Rather than seeking the approval of others to validate identity, identity must be self-established. Since adolescents are in the midst of their own identity development process, reading a book with a similar journey can help them discover their own agency and empowerment.

Danny’s journey in *Mexican WhiteBoy* aligns well with arguments made by scholar Melissa Hasbrook. She criticizes John Dewey’s for nationalistic approach to education, asserting that Dewey wanted people to find commonalities, and that in doing so he wanted them to ignore differences because he perceived these differences as dangerous to the stability of democracy. She discusses the negative impact this attitude, in the ways that it promotes conformity and treats non-assimilating minorities as a threat. Furthermore, Hasbrook discusses “multiculturalism” as it is presented in schools today. She argues that the contemporary version merely tokenizes and makes use of international stereotypes to teach children about that which is “other.” Since nationalities are not homogenous, this outlook becomes problematic for anyone whose identity does not fit the stereotypical category that people expect it to. Instead, teachers must learn to promote the collective identity, a concept which accepts the complexity of varied experiences (Harmon 75). While this article focuses on teaching and barely covers young adult literature, these ideas are very significant to inquiry about globalism and individualism. When exploring young adult literature, it is important to carefully construct an interpretation which can build open-mindedness about identities and differences rather than creating narrow, categorical identity definitions like some which have already been developed.

Young adult literature has been marginalized or devalued in the past. As these works continue to gain recognition and notoriety, it is evident that young adults can benefit greatly from interpretation and analysis of young adult literature. Many of the questions raised by young adult novels such as those by Matt de la Pena are complex and multi-layered. These novels can spark discussion which will encourage students to think critically about their own
identities and their own perspectives on the world. Because high school students are in the midst of their identity development, the characters they read about will influence their sense of self, ability to fit in, and social understanding of their world’s composition. While controversial topics prevalent in young adult literature have often been ignored, texts with such topics can appeal to young adults’ interests and also work to further their process of identity development. These topics can build open-mindedness as well as definitive opinions on values, morality, and identity. Multicultural young adult literature with controversial themes can foster social consciousness in order to allow young adults to recognize commonalities, overlook differences, and promote tolerance, creating an awareness of the global world and establishing an identity within that larger context.

References


“We Are the Girls Who Don’t Take No Stuff”: Women’s Influence in the Black Panther Party

The 1960’s were a decade filled with political strife. This decade gave way to two civil rights leaders. The first was Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. Some might say, he was the leader that many believed would bring about the necessary change. He was intent on gaining freedom and equality for African-Americans and people of color. King’s method was a non-violent one, which promised that they would “be free one day” (“I Have a Dream”). The other side of this spectrum was Malcolm X. Malcolm X’s message was one of a different kind. He did not advocate a non-violent approach to black struggle. He disagreed with the message of, “turning the other cheek,” that King championed. He upheld that the oppressed should defend themselves, if necessary. Not only did his message differ from King’s, so did the method of its arrival. He wasn’t a pastor or even a college graduate. Part of his life was spent incarcerated, like so many oppressed peoples in America. His entire image was one that appealed to the young generation of the nation because he was once one of those confused, misguided youths.

According to Hayes and Kiene, it became apparent that there was a segment of the youth that was growing fatigued and jaded with King’s message and with many of the non-violent organizations (159). They grew up viewing their parent’s struggles and hardships and became impatient. This promise of freedom and “the promise land” hadn’t yet come to fruition in their parent’s prime. They didn’t want to “be free one day,” they wanted their rights and equality now. They were disenchanted with the struggle for civil rights and became entranced by the chant and ideology of “Black Power.” They were only a faction of the population that felt this way. People’s frustrations with racism, war, lack of decent housing and education, employment, food and health care, high incarceration rates, police brutality etc. finally began to manifest itself physically and violently. This period birthed many race riots from Detroit, to Chicago, to Newark (The Kerner Report 37-42). This was the socio-cultural scene that lent itself to the creation of the Black Panther Party for Self-Defense (Hayes 159).

The Black Panther Party for Self-Defense was created in October 1966. It was the realization of Huey P. Newton and Bobby Seale. It took form in Oakland, California. This organization’s main focus was to reach out to
those black males that found themselves being oppressed and targeted by the police and, systemically speaking, by society (Matthews 278). Their plan of attack was to address police brutality by knowing their laws and rights, as well as carrying guns for armed self-defense under the law, which later led to the passing of the Mulford Bill in 1967 (Revolutionary Suicide 154). In order to give their party structure and focus, Newton and Seale created a manifesto of sorts called The Ten-Point Platform and Program. This platform laid out the changes that the party sought for oppressed peoples and people of color. The Black Panther Party demanded, on behalf of the people, decent housing, control of their communities, employment, an honest education, an end to racist capitalist control, and an end to the draft etc. (122). All of these demands directly affected the daily well being of oppressed people throughout the country. While the Black Panther Party was a radical, grassroot, and quite evolved organization they, often, forgot to take into consideration, the women.

Historical analysis usually serves the men of the party: Huey P. Newton, Bobby Seale, Eldridge Cleaver, David Hilliard etc. These are the names that ring out when the Black Panther Party comes to mind. They have had their stories, trials, and accomplishments documented many times over. However, women were there. They were on the front lines, in the offices, selling The Black Panther on the corners, as well as in the leadership. Women played an integral role within the Black Panther Party. They were involved in every facet of the organization. While they have not received the same recognition as the men, even forty-five years later, they were paramount to the maturation of the Black Panther Party.

During the Black Panther Party’s developing years, from 1966 to 1967, the focus on paramilitary tactics, the male youth, and general acceptance of societal gender roles led the party to be an inevitable machismo, masculine force. Their call out was to those men stuck on the corners, ex-convicts, and men who were suffering at the hands of this imperialist, white supremacist, patriarchal culture. Newton was proud of the fact that his Panthers were “proud black men, armed with guns and a knowledge of the law . . . [who] provided a needed example of strength and dignity by showing people how to defend themselves” (128, 135). They were often seen as the best the black communities had to offer. With that said, Seale documented in his memoir, A Lonely Rage, that there was a woman present at a meeting in February 1967 (203). The woman’s identity was not known but she did spark a conversation amongst the Panthers. What was a woman’s role in this organization? Was she to be included in this revolutionary struggle?
The first documented woman to join the BPP was Tarika Lewis. As a sixteen-year-old teen in Oakland, Lewis began to foster her inner revolutionary. She co-founded Oakland Tech High School’s Black Student Union with friends, Larry Thomas and Rolanne Harrison, and was active in setting up groups and activities for African-American students, as there were none (Lewis). As a part of the “Voices of Panther Women” panel, held by University of California Berkley, Lewis goes on to describe, “...twenty-four years ago, I literally put down my violin and picked up a gun. Chairman Bobby reminded me that I was the first sister to join the Party. I reflected on that, being a sister, but to me, at that time, I was a revolutionary first and a sister second” (Lewis). This was the first of many female narratives. She dropped out of school and left behind her violin to dedicate her life to the people, the struggle.

Lewis was no different from any man in the Party. Every rule that a man had to follow, she too had to follow. Lewis regularly attended and later on led many of the political education classes required of the BPP members. She learned how to dissemble, clean, and reassemble guns, so well that she soon taught the drill classes. Further ascending through the ranks, she later became the assistant to Emory Douglass, The Minister of Culture, as a Visionary Illustrative for The Black Panther newspaper. Within that position Tarika Lewis describes her task as the following, “my duty was to open the eyes of the people, to give them hope, courage, understanding; to teach, guide, and pull the cover off what was going on and what should be done about it” (Lewis). Even with these accomplishments, Lewis still found herself dealing with the disrespectful, chauvinistic overtones, which came with the party never truly having dealt with its chauvinistic, patriarchal gender roles.

Lewis was soon promoted to section leader, then lieutenant and since the Party was still dominated by its majority male presence, she often had trouble with her comrades. She recalled, “When the guys came up to me and said ‘I ain’t gonna do what you tell me to do ‘cause you a sister’ I invited ‘em to come on out to the weapons range and I could outshoot ‘em” (Lewis). This was the approach that many women took to settle these episodes of blatant sexism. Many women felt that the only way to beat them was to play by their rules. Assata Shakur recalls, “ [A] lot of us [women] adopted that kind of macho type style in order to survive in the Black Panther Party . . . You had to develop this whole arrogant . . . style in order to be heard” (Matthews 290). In a sense, many women adopted the
loud, traditionally male demeanor, which ultimately perpetuated that machismo, to receive respect, much like Lewis and Shakur described.

What Lewis did was important. As the first woman to join the Party she challenged everything the BPP knew prior to her arrival. While it is important to appreciate Lewis’ accomplishments, it is of equal importance to realize that her enrollment did not automatically change the attitudes surrounding women, their gender, and their position within the revolution. The chauvinism and traditional patriarchal gender roles continued to plague the Black Panther Party until its dissolution in 1982, with the closing of the last Panther Liberation School (LeBlanc-Ernest 306). For the Party to move beyond its sexist, chauvinistic infrastructure its leaders would have to do the same.

Another early recruit that enrolled in the Black Panther Party was Kathleen Cleaver. She joined the Party in November 1967, after relocating to California to live with her, fiancé, Minister of Information, Eldridge Cleaver. Kathleen Cleaver served as assistant editor to The Black Panther. She was also the first woman to be placed on the organization’s Central Committee, which was, essentially, a governing head, with many of the national leaders being incarcerated. By 1967, Cleaver was the first woman to hold a national leadership position as Communications Secretary (Hine 136). Cleaver’s role was critical within the organization. In an interview with Angela D. LeBlanc-Ernest, Cleaver remembered, “I went there [Oakland] in the midst of a total crisis. They didn’t really have any organization to speak of at that time” (308). She came into the BPP and started campaigns surrounding their incarcerated leaders, calling for their liberation. She organized one of the largest rallies within BPP history, the “Free Huey” birthday rally of 1968 (Brown 127).

Cleaver’s position within leadership was not a common occurrence. She admitted to LeBlanc-Ernest that “she was not a victim of overt gender discrimination . . . she attributed this to her unique status in the organization.” (308). As aforementioned, Cleaver entered the Party with her husband, whom was the Party’s Minister of Information. Cleaver stated that, “she came in working with the leaders of the Party so there was no way . . . to be treated differently” (127). While she understood her rare position, she was not oblivious to the treatment of other women. While in the organization she repeatedly viewed chauvinism, sexism, and misogyny first-hand. Cleaver recalls:
If a woman would express an idea, because that idea is coming from a source that they’re not looking for an idea from, it [would be] discounted . . . They looked to women to help them, to take care of them, to be their mothers, to be their lovers. But they did not look to women for their ideas (309).

On the opposite side of the spectrum, there were numerous women that experienced what Cleaver described. Often, women found very soon after joining the BPP that the Party was not as progressive when it came to addressing the liberation of black women, which led to their departure (323). They were not able to see that woman’s liberation is directly related to the liberation of people of color. To deny the woman her freedom, in turn, further perpetuates the dominant, oppressive, patriarchal culture, which also oppressed the black male. However, for a long time the rhetoric of the Party would not only actively deny the black woman her liberation, it would ultimately, blame her for the black male’s oppression.

In March of 1965, *The Negro Family: A Case for National Action* written by Daniel Patrick Moynihan was released by the U.S. Department of Labor. Some might say this report was crucial in shaping the ideological perspective of the 60’s. It caused a great deal of controversy due to its argument. According to Tracey Matthews:

> Moynihan’s report used sociological, historical, anecdotal, and statistical information regarding the status of Black families to draw the conclusions that Black families were matriarchal, that Black men were unable to fulfill the roles required of men in a patriarchal society, and that the resulting pattern of female-headed households was largely responsible for the ‘tangle of pathology’ in which black people found themselves (275).

His premise was that over time the black household shifted from a traditional patriarchal household to a matriarchal one. Furthermore, he suggested that this very shift was a fundamental contribution to the detrimental state of the black family in America. Moynihan explains his position as follows; “the Negro community has been forced into a matriarchal structure which, because it is so out of line with the rest of the American society, seriously retards the progress of the group as a whole . . .” (Moynihan). The matriarch has allowed the family to fall out of line with the rest of America. She has, essentially, bastardized the black family and allowed it to slip into a state of destitution. According to Moynihan and the then traditional notion of family structure, men are supposed to be the head of the
household. They are the breadwinners, and the woman keeps the home. To cut a man off from making a living is to castrate him and deny him his position as leader. He was made to feel less than a man.

While there does not seem to be any direct reference to Moynihan in any BPP newspapers or essays published by the leadership, one can see that he may have influenced a few ideas. In Huey Newton’s 1967 essay, “Black America: Fear and Doubt,” the position of the black American male is described as a tragically bleak one. According to Newton:

> . . . a man is valued according to his profession . . . Often his wife (who is able to secure a job as a maid, cleaning for white people) is the breadwinner. He is, therefore, viewed as quite worthless by his wife and children. He is ineffectual both in and out of the home. He cannot provide for, or protect his family. He is invisible, a nonentity. Society will not acknowledge him as a man. (79).

This essay seems to fall in line with Moynihan’s argument. Whether Newton meant to or not is irrelevant. Newton, along with the likes of Eldridge Cleaver, Bobby Seale, and many men in the ranks believed this to be fact. Men and women within leadership and rank-and-file were so enthralled by these men, they idolized them. They regarded them and their words as an absolute truth that they, often, dare not question. Assata recalled, “. . . instead of criticizing what was happening, most of the Party members defended it . . . That was one of the big problems in the Party. Criticism and self-criticism were not encouraged, and the little that was given was not taken seriously” (Shakur 226). As a result the discussion around this female/male pedagogy would not evolve for some time.

Newton’s essay provides an insight into the Party’s early understanding of where a woman falls in relation to a man. Much like Moynihan, Newton suggests that the black man’s productivity and value is directly related to the submission of the woman. Although it is not blatantly stated, it is, unmistakably, implied. They both measured the black man’s masculinity and worth as a productive being against the woman’s ability to submit herself to a patriarchal household, furthermore to a patriarchal society. The irony of it all is that this very notion is, undoubtedly, a bourgeois one. It would later prove that it was, quite, counter-revolutionary, for one to measure his or her worth against the very society that enforces their oppression. Even though the BPP was an organization that was quite radical for its time, it was still cloaked with traditional patriarchal gender roles.
This is the environment that Regina Jennings entered the summer of 1968. She arrived in Oakland after leaving her native Philadelphia to become a Black Panther. When she came to the Oakland office she was addicted to narcotics. Like many oppressed people, Jennings used drugs to numb herself to her conditions. She attributes her recovery to the BPP. She recalls, “The Panthers, like many people in the Black community, understood my dependency on drugs; and under the leadership of the captain, they helped me gradually abandon the addiction” (Jennings 148). While the Party was not progressive on the woman’s issue, it was very understanding and knowledgeable around the crippling effects of racism and capitalism. She credits the Party with opening herself up to her history. She explained, “our teachers taught us so vigorously about our importance to our community that I started to care about learning and understanding our situation with an undrugged mind” (148). Jennings threw herself into party duties.

As a rank-and-file member her responsibilities consisted of selling *The Black Panther*, serving breakfast to children before school, as part of the survival program. She was involved in setting up dances for the community youth and, of course, was required to attend all political and drill classes. She felt an extreme love for her people, which is why it pained her that her that she could just not solely exist for the people. Her captain wanted her submission. Jennings recalls, “All I wanted was to be a soldier. I did not wish to be romantically linked to any of my comrades, and even though I gave my entire life to the Party—my time, my energy, my will, my clothes, my money, and my skills; my captain wanted more” (150).

Jennings rejected his advances and was scolded for it. He made her existence a miserable one. He gave her outrageous duties. It should be noted that in the early stages of the Party there was no way to democratically challenge or air a grievance with a comrade or leadership. The only method was to offer your problem to the Central Committee, which was, at this time, entirely male. The Central Committee agreed with Jennings' captain. The entire panel agreed that, “[she] should not behave as a bourgeois woman and bring such values to the Party. They believed that [her] attitude of sexual abstinence was both foolish and counter-revolutionary” (151). Jennings couldn’t deal with the outright sexism of the Party any longer. She tried to make it work at the National Headquarters, but encountered the same sexism and misogyny. It, ultimately, caused her to leave the Party for good.
Jennings story is not a singular one. Many women dealt with this sexism and left before truly becoming involved in the organization. This narrative was all too common. Often, men felt that it was the duty of their female comrades to service them. Once again, there were ideologies by men in leadership that reinforced this notion, that the female body should be used to benefit the revolution. In Elaine Brown’s, *A Taste of Power: A Black Woman’s Story*, she describes Seale’s “pussy power” ideology. He asks a young woman, named Marsha, on the security squad what a Panther has to do in order to have sex with her. She responds:

“. . . a Brother’s got to be righteous. He’s got to be a Panther. He’s got to be able to recite the ten-point platform and program and be ready to off the pig and die for the People . . . a sister has to learn to shoot as well as to cook, and be ready to back up the Brothers . . . a sister has to give up the pussy when the Brother is on his job and hold it back when he’s not. ‘Cause Sisters got pussy power” (189).

This was an ideology that many took seriously, both men and women. In the minds of many it was a woman’s duty to use her entire body to service the revolution, even her sex. A woman’s sex was to be treated as a commodity to further the goals of the Party. This could not be more counterintuitive. Another national leader, Eldridge Cleaver, had even regarded the act of raping a woman an insurrectionary act (Soul on Ice 33). This role was not liberating. It was another form of oppression. Once again, the women were forced into a role, which was created through the male need to feed their machismo. Many women, like Jennings, rejected this position, refusing to submit to the desires of their comrades. The year 1969 brought about a shift in Party thought and a new, fresh perspective and discussion regarding the woman of the vanguard.

This new conversation was centered on Ericka Huggins. Huggins was a member of the west coast chapter in L.A. and was married to the Deputy Minister of Information in L.A., John Huggins. She started off as a rank-and-file member and became captain of the new female recruits. As captain she led political education classes. She was newly a mother when men from Ron “Maulana” Karenga’s US Organization shot down her husband, John, along with Alprentice “Bunchy” Carter. She was taken to jail, with her newborn, and booked. Yet still, with all of this going on she remained strong and continued the fight. Angela Davis recalls Ericka’s response as she walked out of the prison, “What’s wrong with you all? We can’t stop now. We’ve got to keep on struggling” (Davis 195). She went off
to New Haven, Connecticut to bury her husband and find a safe space for her daughter Mai. It was here that she started a new chapter of the Black Panther Party becoming the first woman to develop her own chapter, as well as serve it as the Deputy Chairman. She established a free breakfast program and established a BPP Liberation School for the youth.

In 1969, Ericka Huggins and thirteen other New Haven Panthers were arrested and charged by the FBI. The charges were murder, kidnapping, and conspiracy. In a brilliant chapter entitled “Cointelpro,” from his book, We Want Freedom: A Life in the Black Panther Party, Mumia Abu-Jamal describes the crimes “supposedly” committed by the New Haven Panthers. “George Sams, claiming to represent the Central Committee . . . appeared in New Haven and accused a new Panther, Alex Rackley, of being an informant. Sams killed Rackley, beating, burning, scalding, and eventually shooting . . . In fact, it was Sams who was an informant” (140). Not only was the informant the one who committed this heinous act, he then got on the witness stand and blamed Bobby Seale and Ericka Huggins. Huggins was incarcerated from 1969 to 1971. This was the first nationwide case regarding a female Panther to get notoriety. Prior to this case, women were active in the ranks and throughout leadership, but this trial showed women in a different light. They were strong. They too were held to state repression. They were no different than their male comrades and they were finally on their way to seeing it.

In 1969, Eldridge Cleaver released his message to Ericka Huggins and the rest of the Party from exile. He explained the need for women’s liberation to be included in the struggle for freedom:

I know Erica [sic], and I know that she’s a very strong sister but I know that she is now being subjected to a form of torture that is horrible . . . Let it be a lesson and an example to all of the sisters, particularly to all of the brothers, that we must understand that our women are suffering strongly and enthusiastically as we are participating in the struggle. The incarceration and the suffering of Sister Erica [sic] should be a stinging rebuke to all manifestations of male chauvinism within our ranks . . . That we must too recognize that a woman can be just as revolutionary as a man and that she has an equal stature . . . That we have to recognize . . . revolutionary standards of principles demand that we go to great lengths to see to it that disciplinary action is taken on all levels against those who manifest chauvinist behavior (98).
This marked a significant shift in Party rhetoric. This was the first time that a man within national leadership publically challenged male chauvinism. It was a milestone. It would be followed, in 1970, by Huey Newton's essay, "The Women’s Liberation and Gay Liberation Movements." Once again, opinions did not change overnight. However, there was now new dialogue, one that benefitted the position of the woman in the Party. She was not merely there to play backup to her male comrades; she was woman all her own. She was a force to be reckoned with. Many men did not have an experience as traumatizing as this. Huggins’ revolutionary acts paved the way for many women. The Party was, finally, actively, publishing essays and developing a rhetoric that saw women on the same footing as her revolutionary male comrades. In 1971, the charges against Huggins and Seale were dropped. She returned to Oakland where she taught at an Intercommunal Youth Institute, as well as an Oakland chapter of the Panther Liberation School (Hine 223). She became a champion for education reform.

This shift in rhetoric induced many interviews involving female Panthers on their opinions regarding women’s liberation and how it relates to the Panther struggle (Matthews 283). One interview, which was originally published in *The Black Panther*, was particularly thought provoking. The interview, “Black Panther Sisters talk about Women’s Liberation” offered superb insight into the developing psyche of the BPP. Unfortunately, the women are anonymous so they are simply referred to as “Panther Sister.” The interviewer asked the women what they felt the role of the black woman was. The answers vary, but two answers stood out. The first Panther woman states that, “to say we want full share . . . is kind of difficult . . . Our men have been sort of castrated . . . some brothers still have this fear of women dominating the whole political scene . . . We’re going to have to be sensitive enough to say that we’re going to take more of a share of the political arena, but, at the same time, we’re going to have to keep these things in mind.” (“Black Panther Sisters talk”). This quote is intriguing because it displays the mindset of some female Panthers. It is true, that not all felt the same way as this woman. However, one should observe that many women themselves adopted these patriarchal gender roles, in spite of the revolution around them.

Much like the aforementioned Marsha, women perpetuated these ideas with the notion that they were, indeed, revolutionary. They were jaded by the previous rhetoric. Most importantly, it shows that it was a gradual process. Another woman responded to that same question with a completely different response:
It’s important that within the context of that struggle that black men understand that their manhood is not dependent on keeping their black women subordinate to them . . . Black women as generally a part of the poor people of the U. S., the working class, are more oppressed, as being black, they’re super-oppressed, and as being women they are sexually oppressed by men in general and by black men also (“Black Panther Sisters Talk”).

This woman confronted the question with an evolved perspective. She understood that a man should not judge his manhood by the oppression of the black woman. She understood that a woman and a man could be revolutionary completely separate from each other, as well as together. It is a concept that took a while to reach it’s way through the ranks. Having said that, these interviews, along with the incessant revolutionary acts of women continuously worked to alter the Party thought.

Another woman that contributed to this alteration was Angela Davis. Davis was distinct in that she was the first woman to have a prosecution gain worldwide notoriety. Davis joined the Black Panther Party in July of 1968, after leaving the Southern Non-Violent Coordinating Committing. She came to the Party in an effort to leave the misogyny and the persecution she received by identifying as a communist with the SNCC. Davis soon led the political education classes. She was instrumental in organizing the community around slain youth. Davis recalls, “[there were] marches through the street of the surrounding neighborhoods, door-to-door leafleting, street rallies, [withdrawing] patronage . . .” (Davis 193). She, along with her comrades, assumed responsibility for making their community aware of these murders on more than just a level of loss. They helped their community understand the political undertones of these slayings. Furthermore, she was a significant figure in the committee that served to create Lumumba-Zapata College. It was a college that focused on the need of oppressed persons of color, as well as the oppressed working class. Davis was also a member of an organization that demanded the acquittal and the release of the Soledad Brothers. It was the beginning of what would, ultimately, become her calling.

In 1970, Davis was implicated in the August 7th, prison break attempt orchestrated by George Jackson’s younger brother, Jonathan Jackson at Marin County Hall of Justice. He tried to free inmates by arming them with guns and by taking the judge hostage as leverage. All except one of the inmates died. One of the guns Jonathan used came back as being registered to Davis (“Back to Africa” 235). Davis became a revolutionary sensation.
overnight. President Nixon called for her arrest. August 18, 1970, Angela Davis became the third woman to be placed on the F.B.I.’s Most Wanted list (Aptheker 120). October 19, 1970, she was caught in New York City and taken to face her charges (121). Davis recalls walking into the courthouse, “[I] was accused of murder and kidnapping . . . [I] strode into a Marin County courtroom, [and] raised a clenched fist.” (Davis 292). There were soon rallies in countries all over the world demanding her freedom.

Davis spent most of her adult life trying to help her people. She dedicated herself to the revolution. She was just as committed as any of her male comrades. Throughout this entire ordeal Davis remained dedicated to the struggle. Even while imprisoned she produced outstanding essays and books on topics which she would soon champion. Three of her most critically acclaimed compositions were produced while incarcerated: Are Prisons Obsolete?, If They Come in the Morning: Voices of Resistance, and “Reflection on the Black Woman’s Role in the Community of Slaves.” Davis administered interviews, when allowed, while imprisoned that enlightened the entire world to the revolutionary struggle taking place in the United States, if they weren’t already aware. She was acquitted of all charges in 1972. The only men who gained this sort of critical acclaim and mass organization were those men in National Leadership. These cases usually swarmed Newton, Seale, Cleaver, Hilliard etc. Davis was the first woman to experience imprisonment at this level. Both women and men looked up to Davis.

On April 2nd, 1969, twenty-one New York Panthers, donned “The New York 21,” were arrested on a weapons, an attempted bombing, as well as conspiracy and other related charges (Abu-Jamal 164). Prior to these charges, Joan Bird, of the New York chapter, found herself abducted by the New York Police Department on “...conspiracy to commit attempted murder against [NYPD officers] and to inflict heavy blows upon them” (Balagoon 305). She remembered, “I was found in the car by the pigs and they dragged me out and began to beat and stomp on me and use heavy blackjacks and beat and kicked me in the stomach, lungs, back, and handcuffed me . . .telling me that I had better tell them the truth or that they were going to kill me” (305-306). It was thoroughly believed that these indictments were concocted, as Shakur noticed a massive spike in arrests, office raids, and seizures in the months preceding these allegations (294).

Of these twenty-one Panthers charged, two were women: Afeni Shakur, Section Leader of the New York Harlem chapter, and Joan Bird. They were radical women in every sense of the word. They were indicted on the
same charges as the men. Their gender did not provoke the state to lessen its repression in any way. In fact, they were brutally beaten both during the course of their arrest and while imprisoned (355). The treatment of Joan Bird is described, “[she] was kidnapped, beaten and tortured . . . punched . . . given the ‘Thumb Torture,’ hung upside down by the ankle out of a third story ‘police precinct’ (355). All members of the New York 21 were abused and assaulted. However, this was the first time that it happened to women in the public eye. Major publications like Newsweek noticed that “ . . . the handling of the suspects between their arrest and their trial was something less than a model of American criminal justice . . . none of it was very becoming to the state” (355). Both Ericka Huggins and Angela Davis were incarcerated but their experiences were not those of Shakur and Bird. They were, of course, imprisoned in appalling conditions and denied basic human rights. This is not said in an effort to downplay their revolutionary struggles. It is noted, merely, to show the degrees of separation between these arrests. Bird and Shakur were two women that embraced the duties of a revolutionary, wholeheartedly.

Much like Joan and Afeni, Assata too came out of the New York chapter. She joined in 1969 while attending City College of New York. Like most Panthers she was assigned the task of cooking and administering food for the Breakfast program. She was also in charge Defense Committee work with her fellow Panther, Zayd Shakur. The committee worked aggressively to raise bail and legal support for the New York 21. She was also essential to the Harlem chapter’s Saturday Liberation School for kids. With the incarceration and the trial of the New York 21 the entire chapter found themselves constantly persecuted and raided by the NYPD. Soon after Shakur recalled constantly being trailed.

It wasn’t long after that Shakur was officially on the radar of the NYPD. April 5th, 1971, she was wanted for questioning regarding her “alleged” involvement in the robbery of a Hilton Hotel. Her face was plastered across magazines and newspapers. She even said that there were wanted posters of her everywhere and that police officers had a picture of her in their squad cars (238). Assata Shakur evaded arrest by going underground and joining the Black Liberation Army. She went on trial on eight separate occasions between April 1971 and March 1977. One of these trials was for the killing a police officer. It was dismissed due to the lack of evidence. It was May 2nd, 1973, which provided the police and FBI with the ammunition they needed to hold Shakur. She was driving on a
New Jersey turnpike when she and two Panthers, Zayd Shakur and Sundiata Acoli, were pulled over by state trooper, James Harper, for a damaged tail-light. The situation soon turned hostile.

It was, essentially, a shoot out. Zayd was shot dead. Sudiata escaped, only to be captured later. Shakur was shot with her hands up. She almost lost her arm due the nerve damage. Assata remembers the scene, "I felt myself being dragged across the pavement. My chest was on fire. My blouse was purple with blood. I was convinced that my arm had been shot off and was hanging inside my shirt by a few strips of flesh. I could not feel it" (Shakur 3). The entire journey to the hospital she was beat on by the state troopers. Once she reached the hospital they stayed in her room, chaining her to the bed. She was denied legal council, or contact with anyone, for that matter. The police constantly threatened her. After she was charged, she was sent to the first of many prisons.

Though incarcerated, her conditions remained abysmal. Attorney Lenox Hinds stated that Assata Shakur understated, "the awfulness of the condition in which she was incarcerated" (xv). She was not allowed any sort of stimulation, whether it was books or exercise, even human contact. While she healed her arm and carried a child to term, the police did everything within their power to withhold any medical services from her. She was often denied contact with humans. She once spent four months in solitary confinement under twenty-four-hour surveillance (Grady-Willis 379).

It became so bad that when she finally encountered a social environment again she couldn’t speak. She remembers, "I just sat there staring at them. I know I must have looked crazy . . .I was overwhelmed. I could hardly talk. When someone asked my name I stammered and stuttered . . .that was one of the things that always happened to me after long periods of solitary confinement: I would forget how to talk" (Shakur 89). Shakur spent a great deal of time in solitary confinement. This would be her condition for seven years. In 1979, Assata’s fellow comrades of the Black Liberation Army would aid in her escape from prison. The government sent out a national search to try and find her. She fled to Cuba, where she was granted political asylum (266). She fell in love with the socialist government. She felt truly loved and at one with the country. A feeling she had never felt in her native country.

Over the course of Assata Shakur’s struggle she became a symbol of resistance, rebellion, and revolution. She was the definition of what a revolutionary should be. She, arguably, underwent the most grueling state repression, ever seen by a man or woman within the Party. The national leadership underwent a fair amount of
incarceration and witnessed atrocities in their own right, but Assata was a woman that endured over seven years of intense state repression. There was no way anyone could deny a woman's revolutionary potential after Shakur’s experiences. The time of reckoning had finally arrived. Lewis, Jennings, Huggins, Davis, Afeni, Joan, and Assata all lent themselves to the struggle, their entire being. They all paved the way for the first woman to ever become Chairwoman of the Black Panther Party.

Elaine Brown joined the Black Panther Party in April of 1968. She was a rank-and-file member of the southern California chapter. She found herself ascending through the ranks following the UCLA shootout. The death of John Huggins and Alprentice “Butchy” Carter left holes in the leadership. David Hilliard assigned Brown to the position of Deputy Minister of Information. She later ran for the City Council of Oakland and, simultaneously, managed Bobby Seal’s campaign for mayor. Their platform consisted of interests and policies that were relevant to the oppressed community of Oakland (Brown 314). She was also among the early women to have a place on the Central Committee. Furthermore, Huey Newton made her the editor of The Black Panther. Brown was critical to the shift of the party.

In 1971, Newton redirected the Party’s focus to their survival programs. LeBlanc-Ernest explains, “...between 1971 and 1974, the Party expanded the scope of its community projects...Several additional survival programs were established, including a free ambulance service, free plumbing and maintenance, free pest control, and free food give-aways. The party also created a sickle cell anemia research foundation to test for the disease” (LeBlanc-Ernest 316). These survival programs endeared the Party in the heart of Oakland’s citizens. When a parent couldn’t afford to put groceries in the house they could call the BPP. If a family could not see an incarcerated family member for lack of transportation, the BPP would provide it.

It wasn’t long before Newton found himself, once again, facing incarceration. In 1974, he flew to Cuba to escape being incarcerated again. A few days after his departure Newton placed a call to Brown and asked her to assume the position of Chairwoman. She was titularly only second to Newton, the Minister of Defense. During Brown’s tenure the leadership swarmed with women. She appointed women to as many positions as possible. Most notably, she appointed Ericka Huggins, Joan Kelley, Norma Armour, and Phyllis Jackson to the, still male dominated, Central Committee. She geared the Party towards local politics. She ran on her own ticket in the 1974 Oakland
elections. Brown placed Huggins as administrator of the Panther Liberation School and its coordinating programs and projects (Brown 362). She positioned Phyllis Jackson as the coordinator of all Party campaign work (362). Joan Kelley was appointed Minister of the “Nonmilitary Apparatus,” meaning that she was in charge of legal matters and the survival programs (362). Norma Armour was made the Minister of Finance (362). Brown set out to make a female presence known in the Party and she accomplished it, much to the dismay of male Panthers. For the three years that she was Chairman of the Party she effectively, positively impacted the Party.

Huey Newton returned to the United States and the Party on July 3, 1979. He said that he would not remove Brown’s new appointments. However, while he said that he wouldn’t remove the women, he did not make any attempts to stop acts of chauvinism against them, or any women, for that matter. Newton came back from Cuba a different man. The final act that forced Brown’s resignation was a senseless beating. Regina Davis was another woman appointed during Brown’s tenure. She managed the teachers and other personnel at the Panther Liberation School. She also designed the children’s healthcare, field trips, daily activities etc. (444). Which is why Brown couldn’t understand why Huey could have anyone beat her. Regina Davis made the mistake of telling a male Panther, under her in rank, to carry out a task. This male Panther refused and when Davis reprimanded him, he beat her. Davis was hospitalized with a broken jaw. Brown resigned towards the end of 1977. Armour, Jackson, Kelley all soon followed her. Brown’s incumbency saw to increased female involvement and an increased, beneficial involvement in the political spectrum. Quite honestly, the Party disintegrated after her departure.

The Black Panther Party remained for another five years. The only prominent woman to remain after Brown’s departure was Ericka Huggins. Huggins functioned as the Oakland Community School director until 1981. She resigned once she discovered Huey was embezzling. She recalled the only reason she stayed for as long as she did was her commitment to the children. These are only a few of the countless women that were involved in this organization. To name them all and their contributions would take an extensive operation. The truth is women were essential to this movement. They were the backbone of this organization. From rank-and-file members like Joan Bird, Regina Jennings, and Assata Shakur to women of national rank like Kathleen Cleaver, Afeni Shakur, Ericka Huggins and Elaine Brown, they all had an active role in the development of this Party. Whether it was the Black Panther Party’s free breakfast programs, Panther Liberation School, or one of their many survival programs, women
were there and they were imperative to its functioning. African-American women challenged these machismo, chauvinistic, patriarchal beliefs everyday and rose in spite of it.

Works Cited


Lewis, Tarika. “Voices of Panther Women.” Video of conference proceedings at the University of California at Berkeley. 26 October 1990.


The SNCC Position Paper and the Rise of Black Feminism

During the 1960’s, America bore witness to the rise of various protest movements demanding changes to American society, culture, and law. Two of the most prominent of these were the modern black freedom movement and second wave feminism. The former strove for racial equality while the latter fought for equality of the sexes. Although focusing on different aspects of American society, both the modern black freedom movement and second wave feminism, struggled vigorously to challenge the oppressive social, cultural, and legal norms which historically left them as second class citizens of American society. With this in mind, it would seem obvious to some that the black freedom movement and second wave feminism should have been strongly allied with each other since both were fighting against the inequalities of their time. Unfortunately, this was not the case. In fact, when historians examine the 1960’s they find that a complicated and tense relationship existed between the two movements.

Explaining the difficult relationship between these two movements has occupied the work of historians both after and even during this turbulent period in American history. This essay will attempt to expand upon this already vast body of literature by first briefly examining why such a troubled relationship existed between the modern black freedom movement and second wave feminism. The essay will then proceed to analyze a document written in 1964 called the “SNCC Position Paper on Women in the Movement” in order to assess the nature of sexism within one of the most prominent organizations within the black freedom movement; the Student Non-Violent Coordinating Committee or SNCC for short. Ultimately, this essay will argue that the “SNCC Position Paper on Women in the Movement” reveals how sexism within SNCC affected the work of women involved with SNCC, the ideas undergirding the prevalent sexism within SNCC, and finally why the Black Freedom movement served as a catalyst for feminism.

In order to understand why the modern black freedom movement and second wave feminism had such a difficult relationship, two things need to be kept in mind; the first of which is that within the black freedom movement feminism was generally not looked upon kindly. Wini Breines writes in her essay “What’s Love Got to Do with It? White Women, Black Women, and Feminism in the Movement Years” that, “Radical black heterosexual feminists risked the disdain of men and the black community, ” and that (pg.20) “It was risky to be a feminist in the Black
Furthermore Charles Payne notes that the two most famous leaders of the Black Freedom movement, Malcolm X and Martin Luther King Jr., both held what Payne describes as, "rigid, traditional views," when it came to gender roles. Altogether most historians agree that anti-feminist attitudes were highly prevalent within the black community during the 1960's. Within the black community it was not viewed as acceptable to hold feminist views or be a part of the feminist movement. As a whole, black people simply did not view the feminist movement in a positive light. The modern black freedom movement may have challenged prevailing attitudes about race, but it oftentimes left contemporary attitudes about gender untouched.

Second, although subject to extensive sexism within the movement Black women nonetheless had a very hard time identifying with mainstream feminism. Unlike white women, black women had a double burden of both race and sexual oppression to deal with. Black women were not just oppressed on the grounds of their race, but on the grounds of their sex. Sexism was common and deeply embedded within the black community. “Black men, at least the ones I knew, seemed totally confounded when it came to treating Black women like people,” writes Michael Wallace in an autobiographical essay describing her journey to becoming a black feminist. As a result of this double burden, it was much harder for black women to be a feminist than it was for white women. On top of this, it certainly did not help that many of the early and most prominent feminist organizations were predominately started and ran by middle class white women. Although black women were involved with these early feminist organizations ultimately a deep divide existed between white and black feminism. The needs and aspirations of black women were much different from the needs and aspirations of many white feminists. This of course affected the degree to which feminism was supported by black women; even those fighting for racial equality.

As a result of these two factors, the black freedom movement and feminism had a very troubled relationship throughout the 1960’s, and even beyond. These difficulties made it hard for the two movements to join forces against the oppressive social forces and institutions of their day. Although some today may see it as obvious that two movements fighting for equality should be united in their efforts, this notion was certainly not obvious to most people black or white of the 1960’s.

Despite these difficulties the relationship between the black freedom movement and feminism was not entirely one of enmity, and in fact the black freedom movement in many ways served as a catalyst for second wave feminism.
feminism especially among black women. On top of this many black women played an active and important role in the Black Freedom movement. Examples of such black women include Ella Baker, Rosa Parks, and Fannie Lou Hamer. As famous as these three women are, their activities and contributions to the black freedom movement represent only the tip of the iceberg when it comes to appreciating the crucial role women played in the movement. Whether black men approved of it or not, the black freedom movement provided women with plenty of opportunities to rise above their traditional status in society. Furthermore, by the end of the 1960’s and into the early 1970’s black feminists groups had begun to develop. These black feminist groups include the Third Women’s Alliance formed in 1968 and the National Black Feminist Organization formed in 1973(Thompson, 339;340). Groups such as these undoubtedly helped to bridge the divide separating black women from feminism. What all this shows is that while the relationship between the black freedom movement and second wave feminism was not always a positive one, it was not totally a negative one either.

In an essay entitled “Black Power Catalyst for Feminism” Sara Evans charts how sexism within the Student Non-Violent Coordinating Committee or SNCC, one of the organizations most active in the struggle for racial equality during this period, contributed to the rise of feminism among those involved in the black freedom movement. According to Evans, “Black Women struck the first blow for female equality in SNCC,” (83). Over the course of the essay, Evans charts how both black and white women as active yet often times frustrated figures of the black freedom movement, eventually rebelled against the sexism prevalent in organizations like SNCC thus contributing to the rise of black feminism.

Her analysis of how black feminism arose out of the discontent of women within SNCC is fascinating, but leaves many unanswered questions. In particular it raises the critical question, “Why did the frustrations and protests of black women at SNCC ultimately catch on leading to the rise of a new feminist consciousness within many of the woman who worked with SNCC.” Evans describes the events leading up to the development of black feminism from SNCC and other aspects of the black freedom movement, but she does not identify the precise reasons why events unfolded as they did. In other words, her analysis leaves open the issue of why at this particular point in history did the dissatisfaction of many women within SNCC ultimately contribute to the development of a burgeoning feminist movement.

[30]
Written in 1964 during the heyday of the black freedom struggle, the “SNCC Position Paper on Women in the Movement”, is a critical document to examine in order to understand how the discontent of black women within SNCC eventually played a role in the rise of black feminism. This is because the work was specifically written to document and address issues of sexism at SNCC. The work is divided into two parts with the first half actually providing a list of examples of sex-based discrimination at SNCC and the other half being a plea against such discrimination within SNCC. By providing historians with a list of specific examples of sexism at SNCC, the first part provides historians with an invaluable glimpse into the nature of sexism at SNCC. The second half of the Position Paper is important in that it provides historians with critical hints as to why feminist sentiment eventually arose within SNCC by showing how at least some members of SNCC critiqued the gender inequality prevalent at SNCC. As a result, despite being actually written by two white women, Mary King and Casey Hayden, the work is still invaluable when it comes to understanding both the nature of sexism at SNCC and why women both white and black began to resist such gender inequality (Harris).

The first part consists of a listing of eleven examples of sex discrimination at SNCC. Although it is not feasible to examine every single one of the eleven examples in depth, three can be offered up as representative of how conditions were at SNCC. In one example, the authors cite a 1964 report which instead of including women among the list of personnel involved with a project instead sets them aside and labels them as “girls” and not persons (King, and Hayden). Another example the author provides involves, “A veteran of two years’ work for SNCC in two states spends her day typing and doing clerical work for other people in her project, (King, and Hayden).” Finally, yet another specific example of sexist behavior at SNCC that the authors of the Position Paper point to is that when two organizers one male and one female were working together on a project, the female worker was automatically assigned to do clerical work even though she had as much work experience as the male organizer (King, and Hayden). These three examples, as well as the list as a whole, certainly do not provide historians with an exhaustive listing of sexist activity at SNCC. Nonetheless, they do give historians a more concrete picture of conditions within SNCC.

The first portion makes it clear that sexism within the movement affected women’s labor or work within the organization on several levels. First, it affected the work opportunities women had within SNCC. This can be seen
both within the three examples cited in this essay and within the longer listing as a whole. A woman could be a
veteran of the movement and have the same amount of experience and talent as a man yet still find herself stuck
doing clerical work leaving her skills and abilities completely ignored. In other words, the work of a woman did not
open up the same opportunities it did for a man. A hard working man at SNCC could probably expect to have some
sort of leadership position within the organization whereas an equally hard working woman did not. Altogether what
the first portion of the Position Paper reveals is the degree to which sexism at SNCC was an issue of labor.

More importantly, however, it reveals that undergirding sexism within SNCC was the idea that women were
inherently unfit to do virtually anything beyond clerical work. What is evident throughout all eleven examples is the
implicit idea that women were intrinsically less capable than men especially when it came to anything beyond
ordinary secretarial work. This is made clear in the fact that the Position Paper contains many examples of perfectly
qualified women being denied important positions within SNCC simply because they were women or “girls”. One
could easily describe this clearly deeply embedded notion within the minds of people at SNCC as a sort of false
essentialism. Essentialist in that they clearly believed that women were simply inherently destined to play a lesser
role than men within society, and false in that this idea was clearly wrong. Many men and possibly even women at
SNCC may have genuinely believed that women naturally did not belong in leadership positions, but the many
effective female leaders within SNCC and the wider Black Freedom movement of course disproves such a notion. All
of this is crucial for understanding how the black freedom movement was able to act as a catalyst for the feminist
movement.

If the first half of the Position Paper showed the authors marshaling their evidence, then the second half is
their plea to end gender discrimination within SNCC. “Assumptions of male superiority are as widespread and deep
rooted and every much as crippling to the woman as the assumptions of white supremacy are to the Negro,” declare
the authors at the beginning of this second part (King, and Hayden). This declaration basically summarizes the main
point the authors of the Position Paper wish to make. Their central argument against gender discrimination
throughout this second half of the paper is based on the idea that racism and sexism are simply the same form of
oppression and discrimination applied to different parts of society. Although the authors of the Position Paper are
very much aware that their sentiments conflict with the majority consensus at SNCC, they still firmly believe that
sexism within SNCC is wrong in the same way racism within the wider society is wrong. In other words, for the authors of the Position Paper both sexism and racism are based on some form of false essentialism which mistakenly believes that blacks and women are inherently inferior when they are not.

The fact that the authors of the Position Paper build their case against sexist practices at SNCC by drawing a clear comparison between racism and sexism sheds compelling light on exactly how the experiences of women at SNCC were able to act as a catalyst for feminism; especially black feminism. If the arguments of the Position Paper’s authors are any indication, SNCC and probably the wider Black Freedom Movement aided in the rise of feminism by showing that the way in which society orders itself does not necessarily reflect reality. For example, society may say that black people are inferior to white people, but just because society says this to be the case does not mean that it is actually the case. With this in mind, it is easy to see how one could take this same logic and apply it to issues of gender equality. The majority of people at SNCC may have genuinely believed that women were less capable than men, but just because the majority of them believed it did not make it true. If Sara Evans argument that the experiences of women at SNCC contributed to the development of black feminism is true, then one of the reasons why this occurred is because the Black Freedom movement allowed people especially women to question traditional societal norms. In other words, it allowed them to be aware of the false concepts and ideas which ordered race relations, and subsequently gender relations.

It is very likely that most men who fought against racial injustice in the 1960’s probably did not consider that by fighting against racial inequality they were also laying the groundwork for a surge in feminist sentiment. Nonetheless, the “SNCC Position Paper on Women in the Movement” seems to suggest just that. The more people began questioning the oppressed status of blacks in society the more they also questioned the oppressed status of women. With that in mind, it is probably no coincidence that the 1960’s bore witness to the Black Freedom movement, Second wave feminism, and a host of other social movements. Once people began to challenge one aspect of society it was only a matter of time before they challenged other aspects of society. The relationship between the Black Freedom Movement and Second Wave Feminism is an extremely difficult one to comprehend, but if historians are to understand the 1960’s it is imperative that they learn bit by bit how that relationship played out.
Work Cited


Harris, Jessica. Personal Correspondence. 9 Jan 2013.

Hull, Glorie. All Women are White, All Men are Black, but Some of Us are Brave. New York: The Feminist Press at the University of New York, 1993. Print.


A wooden cross, typically a unifier of Christians across the globe, became a great divider in Poland in August, 2010. The cross had been placed outside of the presidential palace in Warsaw by supporters of President Lech Kaczynski, who had perished, along with ninety four others, after his presidential plane crashed in Smolensk, Russia earlier that year. The unity spurred by national mourning soon gave way to protests over the appropriateness of the cross’s location.

The supporters of the late president, who had been known for his strong Roman Catholic values, called themselves “Defenders of the Cross” and physically prevented government and church authorities from removing the cross after President-elect Bronisław Komorowski stated that “the cross in front of the presidential palace is a religious symbol, and hence, with the cooperation of church authorities, will be moved to a different, more appropriate location.” These actions drew the ire of Polish secularists, who were disgusted that a religious symbol had been placed in a public space. For them, the church should have had nothing to do with the state.

The major Polish political parties dove quickly into this national debate over the role of religion in public life. The pro-cross group contained many members of the Law and Justice Party, a major conservative party in Poland stressing strong Catholic values as a necessity for the nation. Jarosław Kaczyński, the late president’s twin brother and head of the Law and Justice Party, quickly criticized President-elect Komorowski, the head of the more secular Civic Platform Party, stating, “If President Komorowski removes the cross…it will be very clear who he is and on which side he falls on disputes regarding Polish history and ties.” Kaczyński’s statement is a reminder that the debate over a religious or secular national identity has attempted to define what it means to be Polish for well over a century. Indeed, it has been at the heart of Polish nationalism wherever Poles happened to be. The passionate responses the cross elicited were not simply due to a contemporary scuffle between conservatives and liberals. Rather, the foundational cause was a reawakening of the debate over the key components of Polish identity and nation.

Perhaps the historical force most difficult to define has been nationalism, and attempts to define it have produced no shortage of arguments. Most agree, however, that it represents a concept not grounded in tangible
reality. Rather, it is a human construct. The historian Benedict Anderson describes nationalism as the formation of “imagined communities” which are “limited” in their boundaries and “sovereign” in the political sense. Ernest Gellner describes nationalism as a principle subconsciously invented to meet industrialization’s demand for standardization effectively. Human construct or not, the nineteenth and twentieth centuries witnessed nationalism significantly begin to affect how individuals viewed themselves and the rest of the world. While earlier in history, individuals had drawn identity from their immediate localities, the age of nationalism ushered in the belief in a much broader identity.

Poland was no exception. The problem for this central European country was, however, that from 1795 to 1918 it was partitioned between Austria, Russia and Prussia. Repression perpetrated by these imperial powers created considerable impediments to forming a nation. Prussia and Russia, for example, consciously sought to Germanize and Russify their Polish lands respectively. A segment of the Polish population existed outside the choking grip of autocracy, however. It existed far away in the United States and would come to play a large role in developing and sustaining Polish nationalism. Poles began immigrating en masse to the U.S. beginning in the 1870s and, Chicago especially, gained a large Polish population.

Poles who immigrated to the U.S. debated how Polish identity was to be constructed and what role Polonia, or the ethnic Polish community outside Poland, should play in constructing this identity. Two opposite ideas of what it meant to be Polish clashed, sometimes violently, on the streets of the Windy City. One was the belief that a Pole was first a Catholic and then a patriot. Only through God’s grace would Poland ever regain independence, and for this to occur Poles in America needed piously to put religion front and center, constructing parish communities and local ethnic communities from the grassroots. This idea was embodied by the Polish Roman Catholic Union of America (PRCUA). For this group, only Roman Catholics could be Poles. The opposite belief held that a politically sovereign Poland must come before everything else. Adherents believed that the Poles in America and Chicago must channel all of their efforts to the immediate and uncompromising reinstitution of an independent Poland. Religion was still important, but it should be reserved for the private sphere. The public sphere was to be politically nationalist in nature. This belief was embodied by the Polish National Alliance (PNA). Not just Catholics, but all people from the old Polish lands, including Protestants, Jews, and nonbelievers, were considered Poles and welcomed into the PNA.
These contrasting views of Polish identity in Chicago make any conclusion about one, single Polish nationalist movement impossible. Indeed, they challenge nationalists’ own beliefs that nationalism is some innate truth. If that was the case, such diametrically opposed views on Polish identity could not develop. Rather than uniting under one concept of the nation, Chicago’s Polonia developed two different ones. The PNA’s and PRCUA’s conceptions of the nation were supported by politics and faith respectively and evolved from each group’s particular historical experience.

Historical Background

Polish immigration to the United States in the nineteenth century consisted of two phases, roughly corresponding with the two concepts of nationalism which would later develop. The first, beginning as early as 1830, consisted mostly of political exiles who sought to continue to fight for Polish independence from abroad. Poland had not been a sovereign state since 1795 when the old Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth, plagued by internal weakness and corruption, was ripped asunder by the Austrian, Russian, and Prussian empires, ending seven hundred years of Polish monarchical and noble rule. Norman Davies argues that these partitions are what lit the fuse for modern Polish nationalism. Indeed, the nineteenth century witnessed numerous Polish insurrections, none of which succeeded. The November Uprising of 1831, a small uprising in 1848, the January Uprising in 1863, and one in 1905 all failed fairly quickly, and each was followed by increasingly repressive measures by the partitioning powers to deter future conflicts. Such a seemingly hopeless situation in the Ojczyzna (fatherland) forced Polish activists and revolutionaries into exile all over the globe, including the U.S. These were mostly ex-noblemen and other elites who had lost their privileged political status in Poland and were influenced largely by the romantic traditions developed by notable Polish authors like Adam Mickiewicz and Henryk Sienkiewicz, who espoused in their literature a glorious Polish past, which would soon be reborn. It was this romantic tradition which would heavily influence state-seeking nationalist organizations like the PNA.

The second, and latter, phase of Polish immigration began in the 1870s and continued into the early twentieth century. Unlike the first immigration of select political exiles, this was a mass immigration. Between 1850 and 1914 an estimated 2.5 million Poles arrived in the U.S. Political motives hardly concerned these immigrants; instead, this immigration consisted mostly of peasants fleeing from cultural repression, economic depression, and
overpopulation in Poland. They came to the U.S. *za chlebem* (after bread). These peasants had little concept of Poland as a political state because they had not enjoyed citizenship historically. Rather, they derived their identities from local or regional communities centered on the parish and the Roman Catholic Faith.

Poland’s Catholic heritage had been present throughout its history. It began in 966 A.D. when Mieszko I converted to the faith, establishing what is now Poland as a recognized kingdom. Over time, several customs and cultural events became intricately tied to the Church and the faith. A plethora of Saint’s days and other holy days evolved through the centuries. Poland’s overall Catholic identity was only somewhat interrupted in the seventeenth century when it became fashionable for the nobility to convert to Calvinism. After the partitions, Catholicism became a unifying force partly because Russia and Prussia, the two most repressive partitioners, were Orthodox and Protestant respectively. Those living in the Polish lands could thus distinguish themselves from their overlords through the faith, and the parish took on a fundamental role in the creation of a common identity in Poland. This shared unity immigrated to the U.S. James Pula writes, “The parish was indeed the core of the Polish community in the U.S., as it had been in Poland. It provided not only religious benefits but served as a focus for social activity, promoted Polish nationalism, and acted as an intermediary with the unfamiliar ways of American society.” For most Polish immigrants then, different local and regional identities were united only by the common faith which, for them, represented Polishness. From this ideology sprang the PRCUA’s roots.

Upon arrival in the U.S., the social differences between the two immigration waves eventually dissipated as Polish neighborhoods formed, literally bringing the two groups next to each other. However, the different identities that each group held remained a source of contention. This was especially true in Chicago. In 1864, Peter Kiolbassa, a Polish immigrant who had lived for some time in the United States’ first permanent Polish community in Panna Marya, Texas, arrived in Chicago and founded the Saint Stanislaus Kostka Society, which aimed to establish the first Polish Church in Chicago. Kiolbassa espoused the more localized, parish-based view of Polish identity. At the same time, Władysław Dyniewicz, also a Polish immigrant, founded the *Gmina Polska* (Polish Community) in Chicago, which would become a subset of the wider nationalist movement dedicated to fighting for Polish independence from abroad. Furthermore, Joseph Parot writes, “the *Gmina* was probably a hastily conceived attempt by Dyniewicz and a
small group of ardent laypeople to counter the potential strength of the more religiously oriented St. Stanislaus Kostka Society.”

Both groups were diametrically opposed to each other, to the point that two different Polish churches arose on Chicago’s north side. The Saint Stanislaus Kostka Society founded a church of the same name in 1871. Taking advantage of that church’s overpopulation, the political nationalist camp constructed its own church—Holy Trinity Church—two years later, although it still fell under the administration of the former. A conflict raged between these two churches for roughly twenty years as Holy Trinity fought to gain independence from Saint Stanislaus Kostka, which was run by the Resurrectionist Fathers, a clerical group whom the political nationalists despised. Rallies and riots, sometimes violent, resulted from this conflict until a Papal representative granted Holy Trinity autonomy in 1893. Nevertheless, the seeds of discord had been sown. The Gmina Polska and the Saint Stanislaus Kostka Society had forged a bitter rivalry within the Polish American community in Chicago and the United States, a rivalry that would be continued by the PNA and PRCUA. Two different concepts of nationalism would compete simultaneously.

Historiography

Few historians have examined how the rivalry between the two major Polish nationalist ideologies was carried out in rhetoric and action in Chicago. Still, historians have clearly recognized this rivalry from the time it was active. Stanisław Osada and Karol Wachtl, writing at the turn of the twentieth century, both offer early histories of the PNA and PRCUA respectively. Their biased narratives provide first hand accounts of the divisions that existed. Indeed, Stanislaus Blejwas’s biography of Osada is clearly sympathetic to the political nationalists and the fight for Polish sovereignty. William Thomas and Florian Znaniecki mention the rivalry when discussing Polish-American organizations in their 1920 sociological study, The Polish Peasant in Europe and America. All three works are more valuable for the primary documents they include within them than their historical analysis.

More recent sources examine the rivalry’s basis in religion, ethnicity, and even class. A detailed discussion regarding the rivalry is offered by Joseph Parot in his 1981 study of Polish Catholics in Chicago. He places the roots of the rivalry in Poland and explores the formation of both the PRCUA and the PNA. Parot distinguishes between a “Polish Catholic,” who put the Polish nation first and a “Catholic Pole,” who put the Catholic faith first. Victor Greene
analyzes the growth of national consciousness among immigrant Poles and Lithuanians in the U.S. He traces the Polish nationalist feud in the U.S. to the problem arising over parish ownership, especially to the conflict between Saint Stanislaus Kostka and Holy Trinity. The religious nationalists were willing to submit to a pastor of a different ethnicity because for them, the faith was most important. Political nationalists found this unacceptable. They demanded Polish control of their parishes. Donald Pienko’s history of the PNA also explores the rivalry. In order to examine the PNA’s rise, it necessarily examines its chief rival, the PRCUA, and the struggles between the two groups. At the same time, however, Pienkos downplays the rivalry’s ferocity. Although the rivalry may not always have been as dramatic as contemporary sources indicate, as will be demonstrated, each side held a fundamentally different theory of nationalism. Of all the relevant sources, John Radziłowski’s history of the PRCUA offers the clearest and most defined differences between the two competing ideologies. He argues that class differences in PNA and PRCUA membership played a large role in shaping the two groups’ philosophies, reflected in the peasants’ more localized view and the gentry’s more national view of Poland.

The existing sources explore the rivalry to different extents, yet none attempt to place it within a broader framework of the construction of a national identity. Developing a nationalistic theory needs to play a pivotal role in examining the division’s underlying cause because ultimately both groups sought membership in some type of an imagined community.

Much has been written about Polish nationalism in Europe, especially when it comes to literature and language’s influence. A.P. Coleman, who traces the role of the Polish language in national identity construction, discusses the significant role that romantic literature played in fostering a national consciousness in Poland. He highlights the Polish poet Adam Mickiewicz as someone “who, above all others, employed the Polish language consciously and purposefully as an instrument for creating a national consciousness.” Similarly, Stanislaw Eile, in his work on Polish literature’s impact on nationalism, focuses on Mickiewicz’s comparison of Poland’s partitions to Christ’s crucifixion and “prophesies” that one day “the Nation will rise from the dead.” This identification of Poland with Christ helped inspire nationalists to conspire and sometimes lead fruitless insurrections against numerically superior forces. Matthew Frye Jacobson argues that native Polish nationalism, in the form of literature, had an impact on the Polish community in America in three distinct ways. First, it “blurred the boundaries between emigrant Poles
and those they had left behind,” by helping the emigrant connect with his fellow Pole overseas by reading about the Polish experience. Second, it raised national “resurrection” to an almost sacrosanct level, inspiring the emigrants to support their homeland’s freedom movement. Third, it espoused the virtues of “political self-sacrifice and martial endeavor” as heroic virtues to be displayed in this freedom movement. Thus, the Atlantic Ocean did not hinder dialogue about the Polish nation.

Many scholars have sought to understand the powerful force of nationalism in the twentieth century. Benedict Anderson assigns nationalism’s rise to print capitalism. In essence, he argues that with the printing press’s dawn, capitalists found it profitable to print in vernacular languages to attract more readers. This vernacular printing gave scores of individual languages legitimacy, challenging the dominance of “sacred languages” such as Latin. Anderson maintains that this print capitalism sparked the development of a national consciousness across entire ethnic groups, creating “horizontal comradeship.” The invisible concept of nationalism could unite people who would otherwise not have known each other.

Ernest Gellner arrives at a different nationalist theory. He argues that industrialization demands standardization in the workforce and the ability for society’s members to be easily interchangeable and able to communicate. Such standardization requires an education system which creates a common high culture. Nationalism becomes the struggle to achieve this common high culture through the acquisition of the only force capable of maintaining it—the state. Indeed, both Anderson’s and Gellner’s theories imply that a nation can only be supported or structured by a political state. Neither considers the possibility that alternate capsules for nationalism can exist.

This paper will argue that, in fact, more than one capsule capable of sustaining nationalism exists by examining the rivalry between the PNA and the PRCUA. Polish American newspapers, published by the Polish American community, reveal these organizations’ divisions especially well. Indeed, these newspaper’s nationalistic leanings are an example of Anderson’s print capitalism theory put into practice. It is important to understand that these newspapers often sided with one camp or another. Two newspapers, Zgoda (Harmony) and Naród Polski (The Polish Nation), were the official organs of the PNA and PRCUA respectively. Other newspapers, like the Dziennik Związkowy (United Daily) and Dziennik Chicagoski (Chicago Daily), although not official organs, fell in line with the PNA and PRCUA respectively.
Both the PNA and PRCUA were nationalistic, but in a different sense. The PNA’s priority of attaining Polish independence and statehood fell more in line with Gellner’s and Anderson’s argument that a nation ultimately requires a limited state to survive. On the other hand, the PRCUA’s theory blending Polish identity with Catholicism did not necessarily require a state. Substituted for the state, in this case, was the Roman Catholic faith, which constituted a powerful enough force to keep Polish nationalism alive. Hence, two very different nationalisms resting on different foundations can exist for one group of people, at one point in time.

The PNA and Political Nationalism

The early PNA’s nationalist beliefs resembled Gellner’s and Anderson’s political concept of a nation. Its founders visualized the Polish nation as both limited and sovereign because an independent Polish state was their ultimate goal. They sought to instill what Anderson would call horizontal comradeship among Poles, meaning a common national consciousness extending “horizontally,” indifferent to class or faith, across the entire ethnic group. To accomplish this, they believed in attaining a modern liberal Polish state with an emphasis on democracy, national education, and citizenship.

An international desire to unite Poles across the U.S. to work toward a politically independent Polish nation spurred the PNA’s formation. As mentioned previously, after the failed revolts in Poland, exiles, mostly from the upper classes, sought refuge across the globe in order further to plan Poland’s independence. A central hub for these exiles was Switzerland. The exiles in the U.S. looked to Switzerland for guidance on how to carry on the fight, believing that their local parish-based Polish communities were not the answer to recovering the Polish nation. These Polish-American exiles petitioned Agaton Giller, a leading Polish-Swiss exile, to write a letter promoting the idea of a national Polish organization in the U.S. In his letter, Giller cited the U.S.’s large Polish population in arguing that “it should be the opinion of a well-understood patriotism to steer [this Polish strength] in such a way as to ensure that the fatherland’s cause can benefit as much as possible.” He stressed that organization is the key to this goal, and that an all-encompassing Polish organization in the U.S. would benefit Poland in several key ways, one of which would be to bring Americans’ attention to the partitioned country, giving it greater legitimacy. Stanislaw Osada wrote a footnote emphasizing Giller’s opposition to the “Kraków School,” a thought system emerging after Poland’s last failed insurrection in 1863 which held that Poland was incapable of wresting political independence from the
partitioners. Instead, the Polish nation should be kept alive through the Polish faith and language. For Giller and the political nationalists, however, attaining a modern liberal Polish state was not only possible, but necessary.

The PNA’s inclination toward liberal ideals is evident in its early organizational structure. Spurred by Giller’s letter, the PNA was founded in 1880 as a fraternal insurance society and eventually based its national headquarters in Chicago. It was a successor to Dyniewicz’s *Gmina Polska*, which had already represented an extension of Poland’s international independence movement. Each year the PNA held a *Sejm*, or diet, to draft constitutions and amendments. This *Sejm* was the PNA’s supreme legislative body which summoned democratically elected representatives from local “lodges” across the country. These representatives elected the executive officers and voted on amendments. Additionally, the organization contained an executive branch called the “central administration,” which consisted of the president, vice president, treasurer, and secretary. These executives ran the organization in between legislative sessions. Finally, a judicial branch was formed which consisted of a “censor” who served as a check on the executive and legislative branches. Thus, the PNA espoused liberal democratic principles through its organization and structure, even granting women full membership in 1900. As far as the PNA was concerned, its governmental system could someday be transferred to an independent Polish state.

That the PNA had as its mission the attainment of an independent Polish state is evident in its constitutions and early correspondences. Article II, Section V of the 1904 constitution calls for “maintaining and developing, through all honorable methods, the national spirit of the Polish people.” The 1906 constitution adds, “the alliance leaders will legally act for the attainment of independence for the Polish lands in Europe.” The PNA’s political nationalist aims are thus made clear in its written principles. To further promote the PNA and justify its principles, its first president, Juliusz Andrzejkowicz, wrote a circular in February 1880 commending the Poles in the United States for having already created a degree of “unified strength” embodied in the various Polish “communities, parishes, and societies.” However, he questioned the effectiveness of what he called the “piecemeal unifications” of Poles into various different organizations and communities, instead proposing to “unify all of these societies into one large Polish National Alliance, one powerful organism…beating with one heart for [the] Motherland and ready to work for her usefully and successfully.” This circular clearly promoted stepping outside those small parish communities and uniting purely for Poland, a type of horizontal comradeship which would be fostered through nationalization.
The PNA’s goals rested on nationalizing the average Polish immigrant, who was from the peasant class and whose local orientation had hitherto prevented him from developing a broader national political consciousness. To the modern researcher, such goals followed Anderson’s theory of horizontal comradeship lockstep because they involved incorporating people from all walks of life into the nation. Traditionally in Poland, only the szlachta, or nobility, had held political identity. After the partitions, this Polish political heritage was passed down to the intelligentsia and other elites, who were behind the PNA’s founding principles. Most peasants were grounded locally, united by parish and village ties, however. The PRCUA attempted to use this unified, but localized base to represent its own type of nationalism. Contrariwise, the PNA challenged the PRCUA by attempting to make these religious and local ties secondary to the broader objective of achieving a politically sovereign Poland. In his letter, Giller outlined how to accomplish this: “There is, therefore, no doubt, that through the creation of an intellectual class in America, the masses…will transform into a group of people actively useful for the cause of the fatherland.” The goal was clear: open the peasants’ minds to the cause of Polish independence, and make them active members of this Polish nation. In essence, liberalize them.

For the political nationalists, quality education was crucial to this goal. Giller had promoted the idea of Polish immigrants moving up in American society, not to become Americanized, but rather to one day employ their knowledge and status to help liberate Poland. They viewed the United States as sort of a breeding ground for future Polish citizens. Zgoda regularly printed articles highlighting certain Polish Americans’ intellectual feats as inspirational examples. One article congratulated a Pole who had just become a lawyer, another reported that one Frances Ekowski had become a dentist; still many others highlighted the few Poles involved in Chicago politics. Such exemplary individuals would ideally employ their knowledge and skills to aid the fatherland in any way possible, one being the propagation of Polish national consciousness.

PNA-affiliated newspapers in Chicago wrote incessantly on topics highlighting the necessity to educate Polish-Americans on their duty to the fatherland. These newspapers stressed pulling the average immigrant out of a narrow line of thinking and into a broader national consciousness. Again, the goal was to extract immigrants from their localized, parish-revolving worldview. One notable article in the Dziennik Związkowy, addressed its readers as “you all who have achieved knowledge,” and called on them to “go among the masses” to “teach them how to join
you in working for the good of the fatherland." It treated the readers as men and women who had already broadened their minds through education and were ready to enlighten the rest. The article addressed them further proclaiming, "We must go among our Polish people to lift up their spirits and teach them who they are and where they should be headed." Where they should have been headed, besides the Dziennik Związkowy news racks, was toward a national awakening that would prepare them to one day sustain a politically sovereign Poland.

Indeed, the PNA claimed that only those educated and nationalized Poles could effectively help bring about political sovereignty. On the fiftieth anniversary of Poland’s 1863 insurrection, the Dziennik Związkowy wrote,

It is appropriate to draw lessons for the future from the past. Thus we must bring the masses of our people to national realization, awaken their spirits, and broaden their education and faith in their own strength, and, most of all, affirm the entire nation in the conviction that we must achieve political independence sooner or later.

Here the idea of “horizontal comradeship” is evident, in which all the people of the Polish nation can and ought to share the same Polish identity, the same nationality. The Polish masses in America needed a national awakening in order fully to devote their energies to Polish independence. They needed to realize that they possessed the inner strength and free thought to bring this about. Upon doing so they would essentially become Polish citizens. In fact, Giller idealistically writes that eventually, when the Poles in America are sufficiently educated and nationalized, they should return as useful citizens to Poland. Regarding new PNA members, the Dziennik Związkowy wrote, "Newly gained members are already new Polish soldiers, pulled under the national standard." The use of the term “soldiers” implies that these members are under the Polish state’s command. It also implies fighting, again revealing the PNA’s immediate demand for independence. Waiting it out, or worse, settling for a different concept of the Polish nation, was unacceptable.

For the PNA, then, time was of the essence as it saw itself as a liberalizing force that would rid the Polish nation of what it deemed reactionary or backwards and instill progressive thinking. Norman Davies writes of nineteenth century liberals that they “opposed the inbuilt prerogatives, wherever they survived, of Crown, Church, or aristocracy.” This is consistent with how the PNA viewed its PRCUA rivals and their affiliates. One article which
promoted the PNA’s nationalizing policies implicitly referred to its clerical opponents and their newspaper organs as “organs of ignorance, which cannot handle the light.” Another article attacked the clergy for opposing a secular Polish school because “it does not fall under the influence of those [the clerics] who feel they have a monopoly on education.” The political nationalists held a fundamental mistrust of the entire clergy, whom they feared would only hurl Poland centuries behind. Instead, they believed they were progressive in their efforts to educate Poles to become future citizens of an independent Polish state. Primary loyalties needed to be shifted from the local parish to that state. Religion was fine, but it needed to remain in the private sphere, while politics and liberal principles defined the public sphere.

Thus, the early PNA falls very much in line with Gellner’s and Anderson’s concept of a nation. Clearly, the Polish nation is imagined as a politically sovereign state for the PNA. Indeed, Poland would be limited to its place in Europe where it would gain its deserved political sovereignty. Gellner is even more explicit than Anderson when it comes to defining a nation. To maintain Gellner’s nation, a “political infrastructure” is absolutely required in order to give it the necessary legitimacy and protection. The PNA nationalists fit right into this category. For them, a nation could only be sustained through the state. A number of explanations can be sought for why they thought of a nation in this way. One key factor may lie in the PNA’s own heritage of originally being embraced by the elites and intelligentsia. These individuals, in turn, descended from the Polish nobles who had traditionally enjoyed political power in the old kingdom but had lost it during the partitions. Hence, the political nationalists inherently thought more in political terms and dubbed any Pole not placing primary emphasis on Poland’s independence a national traitor. They did not consider, and arguably did not have the frame of reference to consider, that a nation could be sustained through some other means, like religion.

The PRCUA and Religious Nationalism

In his 1913 history of the PRCUA, Karol Wachtl writes, “the ideas of nation and religion unite inseparably in our [Polish] nation…they complement each other, fortify each other, and join together.” Indeed, for the Polish religious nationalists, the Polish nation was synonymous with the Roman Catholic faith. The PRCUA embodied this belief from its founding in 1873. Like the later PNA, the PRCUA was a fraternal insurance society. Unlike the political exiles who had founded the PNA in an effort to continue Poland’s independence fight from abroad, however, the
PRCUA was founded by priests and maintained a very local, parish-oriented view of Polish nationalism. This view was more in line with the peasants’ worldview in the old country as opposed to that of the elites’, who possessed a broader political understanding. It was exactly such a view that, as discussed, the PNA activists sought to replace with their political nationalism. For the PRCUA camp, however, nationalism did not require political scaffolding, challenging Gellner’s and Anderson’s contention that a state infrastructure is a prerequisite for a nation. The introduction to the PRCUA’s first constitution lists a major goal as being “able to serve God and Country with a pure Catholic heart, and with the customary integrity of our Polish ancestry, independently of those wicked men who seek exclusive possession of our souls and bodies.” “Those wicked men” refers not to the PNA, which had yet to be founded, but rather to the already existing politically nationalist philosophy of placing an independent Poland ahead of Catholicism. The Roman Catholic faith was the primary glue holding the Polish nation together, not a political state.

Indeed, PRCUA activists believed that religion was the only remaining force capable of keeping the Polish nation alive. They viewed Poland’s armed insurrections as noble but fruitless. Essentially, Poland had failed so many times in achieving a sovereign state, that these nationalists felt a different concept of nation was necessary. Modestus Maryanski expressed this view during his speech at the sixty fifth anniversary of Poland’s 1830 uprising. Nothing is known about him, but he was important enough to have his entire speech printed by the Dziennik Chicagoski, an unofficial organ of the PRCUA. He stated, “Under the pressure and oppression of its enemies, all opportunities save one, all chances and strongholds, and all vigilance with which [Poland] fortified its self during the past century of horror are lost, and now nothing remains but the ramparts of national faith.” In essence, he rejected the political nationalists’ more romantic view that a politically sovereign Poland could be achieved. He viewed Poland’s enemies as too powerful to subdue by the sword. Instead he emphasized that “Religion was and is [Poland’s] greatest unconquerable fortification. God is its hope and strength. God will also be its salvation and bring it victory.” Political strength was not necessary for Maryanski because God’s strength will sustain Poland.

The Reverend F. Szukalski, then pastor of a Polish Church in Beaver Dam, Wisconsin, even more forcefully stressed the religious nationalist argument in a Chicago speech. He implied that religious nationalism was a prerequisite for political nationalism stating, “The downfall of our fatherland was caused primarily by the apathy towards the Holy Catholic Faith and disregard of its teachings.” He cited historical examples in which he claimed that
Christ helped deliver Poland from its enemies before beginning a tirade against Poles, mostly in the nobility, who began converting to Protestantism in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. He implied a direct connection between the Protestant converts and the mostly Protestant partitioners. Szukalski concluded by stating, “The Catholic faith is so woven into the Polish nation that whoever attempts to separate nationality from faith will distort his ideas of [gap], and lose his faith.” Hence, his thesis is essentially that religion is so important to the life of the Polish nation that a politically sovereign Polish state cannot exist without it. For Szukalski, the only reason Poland ever enjoyed political independence was because it was intertwined with the Roman Catholic faith. Politics was secondary.

No single individual espoused the religious nationalist view more strongly than the Reverend Wincenty Barzyński. Becoming pastor of St. Stanislaus Kostka Parish in 1874, Barzyński was described as “solid as a rock regarding religious matters,” and his motto was “Bóg i Ojczyzna” (God and Country). Not only was he virulently against the political nationalists privately, he was their most vocal opponent publicly. He referred to them as “professional pseudo-patriots” who spread a “disease of falsehood” by placing the Roman Catholic faith on a secondary tier. Indeed, he considered them traitors, stating “The Czar, along with Bismarck’s henchman can be found among your own Polish brothers, who under the flag of freedom and patriotism, are tearing apart your most important national treasures: faith and virtue.” It is in that statement that the root cause of the PRCUA’s fear and repugnance toward the PNA and political nationalists comes through. By comparing them to Bismarck especially, he was associating them with the infamous Kulturkampf in Germany in the 1870s. Michael Gross defines the Kulturkampf as “a campaign sponsored by liberals and prosecuted by the state intended to break the influence of the Roman Catholic Church and the religious, social, and political power of Catholicism.” Catholics were completely ostracized from public life. Reverend Barzynski and the religious nationalists thus feared that the Polish political nationalists too would happily expel the Church from such areas as education and politics. The Reverend especially resented the PNA’s acceptance of other faiths into the Polish nation, at times even going on anti-Semitic rants. One could not be Polish without being Catholic, and the elimination of the Church’s place of privilege and prestige would kill the Polish nation. Barzyński and the PRCUA’s religious nationalists did have one commonality with the PNA’s political nationalists, however—they too sought to spread their version of national consciousness to the Polish-American masses.
The religious nationalists aimed at resurrecting traditional values and Catholicism in every Pole. One article in *Naród Polski* attacked the editors of rival newspapers for creating strife among the Poles in America. It espoused a return to the traditional past and idolized past Poles who “never knew that the cross, emblem of Christianity should be pushed aside…that they should substitute the eagle or red flag for it. They did know that their forefathers and kings alike bowed before God, built churches, and respected their clergy.” Essentially, the PRCUA advocated the peasant past, built on community, church, and family. The lack of an independent Poland was simply not an obstacle for the religious nationalists. They were perfectly happy fostering Polish nationalism in Chicago, the U.S., or anywhere else in the world “with calm, quiet work, spread[ing] morality, education, [and] inspiring love of country.” Radziłowski calls this building of a Polish nationality from the grassroots on foreign soil “organic work.” As with the PNA, education would play a central role in this work.

Education was the primary method by which the religious nationalists sought to instill a traditional Catholic identity in Poles. To some extent, the PNA and PRCUA had similar educational goals. For example, like the political nationalists, the religious nationalists aimed at raising the average Polish American’s status in society in the belief that he or she would be better equipped to serve the Polish nation. Once again, the idea of the nation forged the distinction between the two groups. For the PRCUA, education began at home where it was “the sacred duty of all mothers to teach their children from childhood the benefits of believing in the Catholic religion.” It then continued in the parish parochial schools. The Polish parochial schools in the U.S. began in the late nineteenth century, often in the basements of churches. Their primary purpose was to instill the ideas of faith and fatherland in children. The political nationalists attacked this focus on religion arguing that Roman Catholicism was not in danger; rather, the Polish national spirit was. They despised the clerics who ran the parochial schools, accusing them of selfishly seeking to monopolize education. Essentially, they resented that the parochial schools “care[d] more about religion than Polishness.” For the religious nationalists, however, religion was “Polishness” and vice versa. They believed that through the parochial schools, they were protecting children from “denationalization and religious-less-ness.” One group’s treachery was another group’s nationalism.

The PRCUA’s model of nationalism thus challenges Anderson’s and Gellner’s theories. For one, it does not require a sovereign state to sustain it. Rather, it feeds on the Roman Catholic faith, an invisible yet binding force. It is
invisible because it cannot be pinpointed to any one object or location, and it is binding because it creates a commonality among people. To this end, at least, it does fit Anderson’s definition of an imagined community. It is not what Anderson would call universal Christendom, however, because it is not universal. Unlike Anderson’s contention that Christianity once served as a unifying force for people across the globe, the religious nationalists truly customized the faith to go hand in glove with Poland. Other ethnicities did not concern them. Only Catholics from the Polish lands were considered Polish. Secondly, the religious nationalists’ concept of Polish nationalism was not limited. Essentially, an independent Poland was not important to them because they did not require it to realize their idea of nationalism. This is most likely due to their origins in the peasant and church communities, which did not take part in politics during the old kingdom of Poland, but rather focused on local affairs. Indeed, Poland could exist wherever Catholics from the Polish lands existed because they did not draw their nation from a tangible object, but rather from an intangible force.

A Superficial Resolution

These two nationalisms might have continued to compete had World War I not trivialized them. With Europe in flames, Poland saw its greatest opportunity to rise from the ruins of the old regimes. No Pole in America could deny this truth. Instead, Polish-Americans saw the need to unite in defense of their homeland’s independence. The result of this was the founding of the Polish National Defense Committee (KON) which united most Polish organizations, even the PNA and PRCUA, into one organization aimed at aiding Poland. Thus rallied, American Polonia raised money and soldiers to help their brothers in Poland. Poles paid not only in cash but in blood. The Polish Falcons organization, which had been providing quasi-military training since the 1880s, produced 7,000 soldiers who volunteered to fight for the U.S. and 5,000 soldiers who shipped overseas to fight in a Polish Army.

With the war’s end came the collapse of the Russian, Austro-Hungarian, and German Empires. From their ruins sprang a politically sovereign Poland in 1918. Clearly, the political nationalists had achieved their goal. Poland gained a liberal democracy with universal suffrage and an emphasis on social welfare. In this Second Polish Republic, “The Catholic Church was pushed on to the fringes of political life,” writes Davies. Afterwards, Polish nationalism in the U.S. began to wane on the whole. Plenkos writes, “World War I’s close was accompanied by a dramatic diminution in Polonia interest in the affairs of the new state.” Instead, greater Americanization in the
succeeding decades altered Polonians’ national identities. Poland’s survival was no longer at stake. The Polish nation would henceforth be sustained through a political territory. Although it may be true, in this case, that the political nationalists ultimately emerged victorious on the surface, the association of “Polish” with “Catholic” never fully diminished.

Conclusion

Thus, two nationalisms can clearly coexist within one ethnic group. In the case above, one definition depended on a political state for survival, while the other depended on the Roman Catholic faith. Why each group developed the definition that it did was likely based on its historical experience in Poland, with the PNA descending from a political tradition and the PRCUA descending from the parish. Both groups saw the struggle against the other as a struggle for the life of Poland itself. The PNA could not endure the thought of religious intrusion in the Polish nation, while the PRCUA was terrified that increasing liberalism would be the death knell of Roman Catholic tradition. The example of the conflict between nationalists in early Chicago and American Polonia presents further evidence of nationalism’s amorphous nature. For one group it can mean one thing, for another something else. Thus, although Anderson may not be correct that nations are always “limited” and “sovereign,” they are definitely imagined.

It is therefore evident why the conflict over the cross in Warsaw drew such zeal from the parties involved. Each side subconsciously feared that their conception of the Polish nation was under attack by the other. For the “Defenders of the Cross,” the cross’s removal would mean the removal of the Polish nation’s Catholic backbone. For the secular counter-protesters, the cross’s continued presence would mean the continued presence of a backward and intolerant institution in national public life. Ultimately, the cross was moved to a church, and the secularists seemingly won. Yet if the rivalry’s historical pattern continues, this victory shall be short lived.
Primary Sources

Archives
The Polish Museum of America

Media
Polska Agencja Prasowa
The Associated Press

Newspapers
Dziennik Chicagoski
Dziennik Związkowy
Naród Polski
Rzeczpospolita
The Independent
The New York Times

Bibliography


Examine the Effects of Mortality Salience and Political Orientation on Attitudes toward Civil Liberties

Abstract

American attitudes toward civil liberties seem to be influenced by past and present public policies. Researching this topic can help to predict outcomes of political elections and policy decisions. Little research has examined this link, and none through the lens of mortality salience. Continuing previous research done by Dr. David P. Nalbone (IRB protocol #603003578, approved through 11-28-2013), student researchers Victoria Boswell, Mindy Eastling, and Sara Mendez use the condition of mortality salience (MS; awareness of one’s mortality) to manipulate participant’s responses, predicted to be consistent with self-identified political orientation (SIPO). This study will help researchers understand if MS manipulation and SIPO act as significant predictors of attitudes toward civil liberties. We hypothesize that Republicans/conservatives would be more likely to favor restrictions on civil liberties (including the use of torture in interrogations of suspected terrorists) than Democrats/liberals, especially if they are in the MS condition. A mortality salience and civil liberties questionnaire will be used for this study. The measurement scales include a mortality salience manipulation, the Right Wing Authoritarianism Scale, the Social Dominance Orientation Scale, measures of support for civil liberties and governmental actions, and demographics. The questionnaire will be programmed and housed on the VOXCO software and will then be linked to the MTurk website, in order to secure a fairly representative sample. After the questionnaire is uploaded onto MTurk, participants will be recruited to respond to the online link. Participants will be compensated $.75 for completing the questionnaire. Once all questionnaires are collected, the data will be analyzed in SPSS.

The use of interrogation by U.S. military forces was heavily debated shortly after the U.S. invaded Iraq in 2003, and especially after the Abu Ghraib scandal, in which U.S. soldiers were depicted as humiliating prisoners in the now-infamous photographs (DeAngelis, 2009). Forceful arguments were presented on both sides, with civil libertarians arguing that torture and other high-stress interrogation techniques are counter-productive (e.g., Feinstein & Levin, 2012; Sontag, 2004), and pro-interrogation proponents arguing that such techniques are both effective and morally justified (e.g., Sontag, 2004). Public opinion on the use of torture was similarly mixed, with a majority of respondents opposing torture, although a false consensus effect may have been in play, such that more people thought it was supported by their fellow citizens than was actually the case (Gronke et al., 2010).

Terror Management Theory

Terror Management Theory (TMT; Pyszczynski, Solomon, & Greenberg, 2002) pertains to how an individual deals with the perception of his or her own death. As humans, people have an instinct for self-preservation. The thought of one’s own death works against this instinct. Being made aware of one’s mortality—whether consciously or not—produces anxiety, as it serves a reminder of our limited existence. Mortality salience tends to produce two
general types of reactions: (1) efforts to boost one’s self-esteem (e.g., by derogating out-group members) and (2) efforts to defend one’s worldview (e.g., via belief in an afterlife), which often serve to mitigate anxiety about death. In short, defensiveness is used to mitigate the terror inspired by thoughts of one’s ultimate mortality. How this perception of death affects attitudes and reactions is the basis of TMT.

Generally defined as the awareness of one’s own death (Pyszczynski et al., 2002), mortality salience is at the forefront of TMT. How do people act when the thought of the inevitable comes to mind? Some are very realistic and are not bothered by the thought of impending doom. Others, however, do not like to think of their own death and deal with it by forming some sort of illusion or defense mechanism. Such defensiveness has been found across a wide range of ages, ethnicities, cultures, and other background characteristics (Pyszczynski et al., 2002). For example, exposure to subliminal words associated with death led to large changes in presidential preference before the 2004 U.S. presidential election (Solomon & Florette, 2011), and these changes appear to have wide applicability (e.g., Ma-Kellams & Blascovich, 2011). Early TMT work (e.g., Greenberg, Simon, Solomon, Pyzzczynski, & Chatel, 1992; Greenberg et al., 1990) demonstrated that mortality salience tends to produce a need to ward off thoughts of mortality, and one way to do so is to adhere more stringently to one’s culturally-supported worldviews.

**Political Orientation**

One of the primary means whereby voters are classified is with political party affiliation (e.g., Democratic or Republican). Another means of such classification is via political orientation, generally measured as a unipolar measure ranging from very liberal to very conservative. In the U.S., there is considerable overlap among these two classification systems, as being Democrat is associated with being more liberal, and being Republican is associated with being more conservative. However, the relationship between the two variables is far from perfect, as Americans are more likely to self-report being conservative than liberal (Gallup, 2009), and nearly half of all Americans view the Democratic party as being “too liberal” (Gallup, 2010), yet political party identification is nearly even between Democrats and Republicans, with independents leading both by a slight margin (Gallup, 2011).

Morris, Carranza, and Fox (2008) reported that when political party affiliation (Republican or Democratic) was made salient (by having respondents report it), people were more likely to make financial investments, in which their investment preferences mirror the language associated with their reported political party. Specifically,
Republicans tended to choose investments labeled “conservative,” and Democrats tended to choose the opposite; however, the pattern was not present when political party was not made salient. We thus chose to manipulate political party salient to see if mortality salience would magnify its tendency to produce party-consistent attitudes, beliefs, and behaviors.

**Torture and Civil Liberties**

Security and liberty have been often seen as trade-offs, with increases in one coming at the expense of the other. Cohrs, Kielmann, Maes, and Moschner (2005) examined the correlation between right-wing authoritarianism (RWA) and the support for public policy restrictions on civil liberties, showed that RWA was associated with a greater agreement toward placing restrictions on civil liberties and allowing for an increased surveillance for protection (Cohrs et al., 2005). Crandall and colleagues (Crandall, Eidelman, Skitka, & Morgan, 2008) found that, after the exposure to a mortality salience manipulation, the use of torture in questioning detainees was supported and seen as more effective and justifiable when it was described as a long-standing practice, but less so when described as a new practice. Markel and Vieux (2008) reported that men were more supportive than women of the use of torture on interrogation suspects.

In line with these results, our first hypothesis is that people who are Democratic or liberal (as opposed to those who are Republican or conservative) will be more opposed to the use of torture and other civil liberties restrictions. Our second hypothesis is, after making mortality salient, as opposed to thinking about regular, non-mortality salient circumstances, this pattern will be more pronounced. Thus, we predict an interaction between political orientation and mortality salience, such that the latter magnifies the (presumed) tendencies of the former.

**Method**

**Participants and Procedure**

Participants were recruited from the online website MTurk, an Amazon.com-based website designed to match up requesters (e.g., researchers) with workers (e.g., participants). Participants were asked to participate in a survey titled “Views on Social Issues.” Participants were informed their participation was completely voluntary and they would receive compensation of $.75 for completion. Participants were also informed they must be 18 to 64 years of age and a U.S. citizen, and clicked to indicate their informed consent.
Materials

The survey incorporated measures including the Social Dominance Orientation (SDO) Scale, the Right Wing Authoritarianism (RWA) Scale, questions on support for torture and civil liberties more generally, and demographics, including political party affiliation and political orientation. Specific sections of the questionnaire are detailed below.

**Mortality salience manipulation.** Participants were randomly assigned to either the control or the TMT condition. Participants in both groups were first asked a filler question (“Please describe the last time you went to the grocery store.”) Participants in the control group were asked to briefly write about their feelings of anxiety about going to the dentist (“Please describe briefly the emotions that the thought of going to the dentist arouses in you. Jot down, as specifically as you can, what you think will happen to you as you go to the dentist.”). Those in the TMT group were asked to briefly write about their feelings on their own death (“Please describe briefly the emotions that the thought of your own death arouses in you. Jot down, as specifically as you can, what you think will happen to you as you physically die and once you are physically dead.”). Immediately after the manipulation, a filler task, consisting of seven simple mathematical questions (e.g., 2+7 = ___) were presented.

**Political affiliation and orientation.** In order to make political affiliation salient, we next measured political affiliation, with two questions: (1) With which political party are you affiliated? (Answer choices: Democratic party, Republican party, Other [third] party, I am not affiliated with any political party); (2) How would you describe your political orientation? (Answer choices: Very liberal, Liberal, Moderate, Conservative, Very Conservative).

**Right-wing authoritarianism.** A 15-item right-wing authoritarianism scale (including items such as “It is better to accept bad literature than to censor it”) was used (Altemeyer, 1981). Participants responded to items using a 7-point Likert scale ranging from -3 (Strongly Disagree) to +3 (Strongly Agree).

**Social dominance orientation.** A 16-item social dominance orientation scale (including items such as “Some groups of people are simply inferior to other groups”) was used (Pratto, Sidanius, Stallworth & Malle, 1994). Participants responded to items using a 7-point Likert scale ranging from -3 (Strongly Disagree) to +3 (Strongly Agree).

**Attitudes toward social policies.** Eight items were used to examine attitudes toward civil liberties (including items such as “In a time of crisis or war, the media should NOT cover ant-war protests”). Eleven items
were used to examine attitudes toward terrorism (including items such as “Terrorists must be considered the enemy of civilized society, regardless of their motives”). Six items were used to measure dogmatism (including items such as “There are two kinds of people in this world: those who are for the truth and those who are against it”). Five items were used to measure trust in authorities (including items such as “I think you can trust the government in Washington to do what is right”). Thirty-two items were used to measure militarism and sociopolitical values (including items such as “It is better to fight terrorists on foreign soil than on our own soil”). Participants responded to these items using a 7-point Likert scale ranging from -3 (Strongly Disagree) to +3 (Strongly Agree).

**Support for government actions and policies.** Eighteen items were used to measure support for government actions and policies, after reading the question stem “In the following statements, please indicate whether you favor, oppose, or neither favor nor oppose each action by circling your reactions to each of the statements below” (including items such as “Government reading without a warrant of any e-mails sent between people outside the United States”). Participants responded to these items using a 7-point Likert scale ranging from Strongly Oppose to Strongly Favor.

**Demographics.** Finally, participants answered eight demographic questions designed to measure their age, gender, race, relationship status, religious affiliation, television viewing habits, union membership, and 2012 presidential election vote.

**Results and Discussion**

At present, we do not have enough data to perform analyses, so participant recruitment is continuing. We will test our hypotheses by conducting a series of multivariate ANCOVAs, using mortality salience condition (TMT vs. control) and political orientation (ranging from very liberal to very conservative) as independent variables, and our measures attitudes toward social policies and support for government actions and policies as our dependent variables, and several control variables (SDO, RWA, gender, race [White vs. non-White]). Our first hypothesis was the leftist (as opposed to rightist) political orientation (i.e., being Democratic or liberal) would lead to reduced support for torture and other civil liberties restrictions. Our second hypothesis predicted a Mortality Salience x Political Ideology interaction, reflecting a magnification of the MS effect for political partisans. We will also examine the covariates RWA, SDO, race, and gender to examine their effects on the dependent measures.
Limitations

As with all research, this study had several limitations. First, our sample comes from an online population, and is thus likely to be skewed to being more educated than the general population. Second, our sample of dependent measures may not adequately capture the domain of possible items that might reflect the concepts of attitudes toward torture or civil liberties in general.

Conclusion

Knowing how people self-identify in terms of being more leftist or rightist on the political spectrum, in addition to other measures that we included (such as political orientation and gender), helps to clarify how one views the issue of whether or not the U.S. engaged in torture as an interrogation tactic. Given the combative nature of recent political rhetoric (including recent elections), knowing how the public views the issue of torture and civil liberties restrictions may help researchers better understand what types of arguments will be persuasive to the voting public.

References


http://www.feinstein.senate.gov/public/index.cfm/files/serve?File_id=026a329b-d4c0-4ab3-9f7e-fad5671917cc


Erin E. Brown and Emilee L. VanderSluis  
Purdue University Calumet

The Effects of Personal Support and Gender on PTSD

Abstract

Many returning combat veterans are diagnosed with Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD) and/or other types of mental disorders. The purpose of this study is to identify the effect of four support systems on PTSD using 124 combat-veterans with the diagnosis as participants. The four systems are; familial, spousal, veteran-peer, and civilian support. Participants will complete a set of surveys that include; four copies of the Medical Outcomes Survey (Social Support Survey) and the Post Traumatic Stress Disorder Checklist (Military Version), as well as undergo demographic screening, and a physical health exam. The veterans will then participate in a three-month treatment program using one of the four support systems. Following the completion of the program, participants will again complete the PTSD Checklist (Military Version). To determine the influence of social support on PTSD a 5X2X4 factorial design was used. Four copies of the MOS (Social Support Survey) and one PTSD Checklist (military version), two genders (male and female) and four types of social support were used. It is expected that there will be a main effect for type of support with peer support being most effective, and an interaction between sex of participant and support system, with males expected to benefit more than females from peer support. The importance of this study is to understand what type of support is most beneficial to male and female veterans returning from wars so that scarce therapeutic resources can be applied in the most beneficial way possible.

This proposal examines the different effects of gender and different types of personal support that factor into the duration and severity of having posttraumatic stress disorder. More specifically, how do these variables affect our combat veterans who have been previously diagnosed? This hypothetical research on PTSD will examine how and if social support and gender have an effect on a returning soldier’s mental health. Social support can come from various groups of people in the returning soldier’s life whether it be friends, fellow soldiers, relatives, significant others, or people in the surrounding community. According to David D. Luxton, PhD (2010, p. 1027) the gender of the returning soldier also plays a role in the extent of symptoms.

The number of cases of PTSD has jumped in the past ten years due to the Operation Iraqi Freedom and Operation Enduring Freedom Wars in Iraq and Afghanistan. Not only have reported cases of PTSD increased but the suicide rate among returning soldier has also increased. The dramatic increase of both reported cases of PTSD and suicides make this hypothetical research important. Returning soldiers, physicians, families, and society need to know what type of support will help a soldier with PTSD the most. PTSD can be characterized by a group of symptoms involving but not limited to the re-occurrence of trauma, avoidance of anything that would remind them of the traumatic events, the absence of emotion, and hyper emotional arousal. (American Psychiatric Association,
In both, the general population and among Veterans, PTSD is associated with marital problems and familial instability. Mechanisms such as coping skills and personal resources can impact controlling PTSD and help the outcome of reducing PTSD on social functioning. Whether it is family, civilian friends, veteran friends, or others in the community; we are trying to find out which is the most helpful to the healing process of this disorder? Also, it is important to know whom PTSD affects more; a male or female? If there is a difference then that should be addressed during treatment as well. With knowing this information, future cases of soldiers can be helped more effectively. With less cases of PTSD there will also be a decrease in the suicide rate. There have been many studies conducted on the differences among gender and support to the returning combat veteran. Some of which show significant differences among the variables we chose to include in this research study. Through reviewing research articles, it is clear to see a trending pattern among various types of support assessable to the returning soldier and how gender as a variable affects the disorder.

Cavella, Drescher, Laffaye, and Rosen (2008) examined the different types of social support to whom a soldier found the most understanding while dealing with PTSD. They believed that "lack of social support is a post trauma risk factor for the development of PTSD" (p. 395). To find out which type of support a soldier found most comforting, they took a sample of one hundred and twenty-eight male veterans and had two surveys conducted over a six-month period of time. Each completed a PTSD residential treatment program within six months to two years before the study; the average age was fifty-seven, with an average of 13.8 years of education and ethnicities varied from Caucasians, African Americans, mixed races, and even other. For the relationship status, nearly half were married, thirty-nine percent were divorced, five percent were widowed, and two percent had never been married (Cavella et al., 2008, p. 395-396).

In order to measure the severity of the PTSD, the researchers used the PTSD Checklist Military version (PCL-M; Weathers & Ford, 1996), which consists of 17 self-report items that correspond with PTSD symptoms listed in the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (DSM-IV; American Psychiatric Association[APA], 1994). Using a 5-point scale, 1(not at all) to 5(extremely). Participants rate themselves on how each symptom has affected them over the past months. They then used the Life Stressors and Social Resources Inventory (LISRES; Moos, Fenn & Billings, 1998) that provided six aspects about relationships. The participants filled out one
for each category used; spouses, family, non-veteran friends, and veteran peers (Cavella et al., 2008, p. 396). The results showed a mean score of 61.4 for the PTSD Checklist-Military (Weathers & Ford, 1996). For terms of resource, veteran peers and spouses were perceived more resourceful than non-veteran friends and relatives. When it came to interpersonal stressors, it was shown that veteran peers caused the least stress; followed by non-veteran friends, relatives, and then spouses. This data showed that veterans see veteran peers as the most understanding of what living with PTSD is like. They used veteran peers as the biggest support source and found it mostly stress-free, (Cavella et al., 2008, p. 399).

Wilcox (2010) explored social relationships in recent soldiers with CE (combat exposure), and then preliminarily investigated the correlation of a specific social support on posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD). Social support can be support from family, friends (fellow soldiers or civilian), spouses, children, and even the community itself. Social support can also be categorized into ways the soldier is supported; communication between persons close to the soldier to understand what he or she is feeling that day, it can be a financial support from family or friends, or even help getting to doctor's appointments or help finding things to do in the community that will help the soldier not feel so alienated from society. Social support is said to have an effect on the severity of PTSD symptoms, greater levels of social support predicted lower PTSD symptoms in combat veterans (p. 175).

In this study there were 83 married male Army combat veterans stationed at mid-Atlantic military bases close to where the research was originally taken. There were no females in this study, it's not that they were excluded from the research, women just failed to participate. Of the sample, about 85% were white, about 10% were Black and a little more than 2% were other; the subjects ages ranged from 19-38 with a mean of 24.69. They collected the data between October 2007 and June 2008 and there was three criteria for the study; First, combat veterans who have served in a war for the United States in the past 7 years or currently in a combat zone, Second, married during time of participation, and Third, over the age of 18 years. Materials used for the study included, the MSPSS (Multidimensional Scale of Perceived Social Support) (Zimet et al., 1988). The MSPSS is a 12-item self-report measure that inquires about three dimensions of social relationships (family, friends, and a significant other) on a 7-point Likert-type scale. The PTSD checklist, Military Version was also used to gauge the returning soldier's symptomatology upon returning from deployment. The soldiers are given the PCL-M when they came back from
deployment and they were to answer the 17 questions by self-evaluating and numerically rating the severity of each question from not and all, to severe. In the end, all the numbers are added up and scores that totaled above 50 points were consistent with having high level of PTSD and scores that totaled below 50 points were consistent with having low levels of PTSD (Wilcox, 2010, p. 177). The results showed that 35 of the soldiers had scores above 50 putting them in the “higher” PTSD category and 48 soldiers scored below the 50 points putting them in the “lower” PTSD category. There was no score lower than 17, indicating all participants in this study had some degree of PTSD. This study showed that social support from friends is a good buffering for returning soldiers with PTSD but having social support from a significant other show more of an impact on the returning soldier’s quality of life.

Monson and his colleagues (2009) explored the issues that arise when returning soldiers with PTSD try to go back to home life. They also synthesize research on prior eras of veterans and their intimate relationships and briefly review intervention efforts that have involved veterans’ intimate partners. Monson and his colleagues (2009) explained that veterans diagnosed with chronic PTSD, compared with those exposed to military-related trauma but not diagnosed with the disorder, and their romantic partners report more numerous and severe relationship problems and generally poorer family adjustment. Veterans with PTSD also divorce at higher rates than do their trauma-exposed counterparts without PTSD. PTSD is explained in this article as one of the leading factors in failed marriages and suicides in soldiers. Much research has been done to show the instability of female and male soldiers upon their return from active duty. Several studies of combat veterans with chronic PTSD have found that, of the PTSD symptom clusters, avoidance/numbing symptoms are relatively more strongly associated with intimate relationship dissatisfaction and impaired intimacy. Male returning soldiers diagnosed with PTSD are more likely to be responsible for psychological and physical violent behavior against their significant others and children than are soldiers without PTSD (p. 708). There have been three uncontrolled trials of Cognitive-Behavioral Conjoint Therapy for Posttraumatic Stress Disorder (CBCT for PTSD) is a time-limited, evidence-based intervention consisting of 15 treatment sessions scheduled for 75 minutes each. This manualized therapy is problem-focused and has the simultaneous goals of improving individual PTSD and enhancing intimate relationship functioning. With the CBCT females report less intimacy problems and more problem solving communication in relationships. Findings from six veteran couples who completed the intervention indicate significant improvements in these symptoms according to
patient, partner, and clinician ratings. There were also significant improvements in the veterans’ self-reported total PTSD symptoms but not re-experiencing or hyperarousal symptoms (Monson, et al., 2009, p. 709).

Luxton, Skopp, & Maguen (2010) examined gender differences, gender in conjunction with combat exposure and PTSD with in soldiers after deployment. The purpose of this study was to examine post deployment depression and PTSD symptoms among men and women who were deployed in support of OEF/OIF. Luxton and his colleagues (2010) analyzed data from a large sample of post-deployed OEF/OIF Soldiers in order to test whether gender would moderate the association between CE and depression when controlling for PTSD symptoms (p. 1028).

The methods showed data were analyzed from a pre deployment and post-deployment screening database at a large Army installation. The screening included a global pre- and post-deployment health assessment, including mental health screening, for all active component soldiers. The pre-deployment assessment was conducted between 45 and 120 days before deployment and all soldiers are mandated to complete the post-deployment screening 90–180 days after returning from an operational deployment. Cases included 6,943 (516 were women and 6,427 were men) active duty Soldiers that completed the post-deployment screening process between March 2006 and July 2009. Ages ranged from 18 to 54 years. There were three measures looked at in this research combat exposure (CE), Depression, and PTSD. For combat exposure, screening items included four Yes/No questions about combat experienced during the most recent deployment. For depression screening they used the Patient Health Questionnaire (PHQ) an assessment tool that can be self-administered by patients to screen for threshold disorders that correspond to specific Diagnostic and Statistical Manual Fourth Edition (DSM-IV) criteria such as depression and its severity. For the screening of PTSD, the Primary Care PTSD Screen (PC-PTSD) use a 4-item (Yes/No) self-report screening instrument for PTSD that is a standard part of the DOD’s post-deployment screening. The screen asks about the presence of symptoms and does not include a list of potentially traumatic events (Luxton et al., 2010, p. 1029). The results indicated that higher levels of CE predicted higher levels of post-deployment depression and the Gender CE interaction predicted post-deployment depression scores. Greater number of previous deployments was associated with lower post-deployment depression scores. PTSD scores were also associated with depression scores, and accounted for most of the variance in post-deployment depressive symptomatology. Taken together, these results suggest that women who experience combat might be at higher risk for depression following
deployment compared to men, even when pre-deployment depression and post deployment PTSD levels are held constant (Luxton et al., 2010, p. 1028-1030).

Our objective through this hypothetical research was to find if there are any differences in the severity of PTSD between male and female veterans (IV#1) that have served in the military. Also among the genders, what type of support (IV#2) proves to be most beneficial to the progression and duration (DV) of PTSD in the returning soldier? We believe that through our hypothetical research, we will have found that as far as gender goes women who have PTSD will have the symptoms of PTSD longer than their male counterparts who also have PTSD; whereas for males with PTSD, we believe they will suffer from PTSD more in severity but not in duration. In terms of social support we believe we will find that it has a positive effect in the severity and longevity of returning soldier’s symptoms of PTSD and their quality of life. Specifically we feel the type of support that will be most beneficial to a returning soldier is the companionship of a fellow soldier; having a common ground and familiar stories to share, helps the soldier not feel alienated, and without having to go into great detail or lengthy explanations the soldier will be more willing to talk more frequently. With the amount of newly reported cases, managing PTSD and treatment of the disorder needs to be bumped to the forefront of the world’s military mental health objectives and not swept under the rug. This is why new research is imperative to our combat veterans. With the lack of reporting of symptoms of PTSD, most soldiers may be unaware of the fact that they may need help. Also, this research is needed to provide a more in depth view on what a soldier’s life is like upon returning from combat and into civilian life, and what resources inside and outside of their family/ community they find useful and can also be a resource for future soldiers to reference.

Method

Participants

In a hypothetical study, two hundred and six participants (N=206) were randomly selected within a group that had been previously diagnosed with PTSD. Within this group, all participants were combat veterans that had deployed within the past ten years in the Operation Iraqi Freedom and Operation Enduring Freedom wars in Iraq and Afghanistan. Prior to this hypothetical study, the veterans were diagnosed and receiving treatment at two Veteran Affairs locations, one in Chicago, IL, and the other in Crown Point, IN. None of the eligible participants were receiving any other treatment outside of the VA. With the 206 eligible veterans that were chosen to participate only 60%
Of the 124, there were seventy-five males and forty-nine females. The ethnic distribution of this sample was as follows: 58% Caucasian, 38% African American, 7% Latin American, and 3% Asian American. Marital status among the sample were that 58% of them were currently married during the study, 17% divorced/ separated, 3% widowed, and 22% were never married. The ages among the groups varied and put into categories of 18-24, 25-30, 31-36, 37-42, and 43 and older. 23% of the sample was 18-24 years old, 17% of the samples were 25-30 years old, 26% of the sample was 31-36 years old, 19% of the sample was 37-42 years old and the remaining 15% were 43 and older.

The veterans were not screened for which branch of the armed forces each participant belonged to. If participants were screened for what branch they served in then the study would be biased. Simply because regardless of what caused the PTSD (in this case combat exposure), this study was to find the relationship between gender and social support and their impact on PTSD.

Original participants were required to complete a mandatory, post-deployment three month treatment program with the Adam Benjamin Jr. VA Medical Center, in Crown Point, IN or The Jesse Brown VA Medical Center in Chicago, IL. All participants agreed to not receive any other treatment outside the VA during this three month period which controlled for all participants to not be receiving different, multiple treatments. Within the procedures subsection of this method, the selection process and procedures used to prevent errors in external and internal validity.

Material and Apparatus

A mechanical .2 pencil and a manila packet that contained eight questionnaires were provided to each participant during the first test. The questionnaires included: A demographic screening, physical health exam, the PTSD Checklist Military Version, and four copies of the MOS Social Support Survey (Shelbourne & Stewart, 1991), and a written consent form. During the second test, only the PTSD Checklist Military and a debriefing form were administered. The written consent form was a single sheet of paper that informed the participants of the importance of the surveys. They were told that the surveys were being used to check for well-being after being diagnosed for PTSD. They were not informed that the actual study was being conducted for the progression and severity of PTSD. They were informed that the information was anonymous and confidential. Only a number represented their identity.
The written consent form also stated that they did not have to complete the tests if they did not wish to. There was a one hundred dollar cash incentive if they were to finish the study but they did not have to feel inclined to if uncomfortable with the material. Also stated in the consent form was that the participants were to not receive any treatment outside of the VA. They were not to partake in any drug activity nor be prescribed any type of drugs. They were informed that the treatment was to be strictly verbal and if the clinician felt that they needed to be on medication they would no longer partake in the study. They were also informed that there were six mandatory bi-weekly individual sessions and three group sessions. If they did not attend them, they would be disqualified from the study. They were asked to sign and date the form before filling out any of the other surveys. The demographic portion of the packet included six multiple choice questions concerning ethnicity, gender, age, and marital status.

The physical health history inventory was to screen for any previous combat-related injuries. The first question was if they had experienced physical trauma of any kind caused by being placed into combat environment. Examples of which are head trauma, loss of limb, small arms wounds (bullet wounds), puncture/fracture/burns, exposure to shrapnel, hand-to-hand combat, and rape. The PTSD Checklist Military version was provided to determine whether or not they had PTSD and the severity of the PTSD.

The final part of the packet was the four copies of the MOS Social Support Survey (see Appendix B for survey and scoring information). The reason for distributing four copies is so that each level of the independent variable could be accounted for. Those levels include: spousal support (if applicable), relative support, veteran support, and civilian friends/community support. The MOS Social Support Survey’s subscales were tangible support, affectionate, positive social interaction, and emotional or informational support. The survey consists of twenty five-point answer scales ranging from none of the time (1) to all of the time (5). During the second half of the test, along with the PTSD checklist, a debriefing form was administered. It stated the true purpose of the study was to find relations between personal support and gender towards the progression of PTSD. It also informed them that all information was still confidential and remained anonymous. It explained why research of this topic was imperative to future studies and the information they gave was crucial to future treatment and studies involving other veterans.

There were five clinical psychiatrists on staff at the Adam Benjamin Jr. VA clinic who had previously agreed to run the same program in the same amount of time between their patients and the nine clinical psychiatrists on staff
at the Jesse Brown VA Medical center agreed to do the same. Each psychiatrist provided the packet, pencil and room for the study. The treatment that was received by all participants was similar by all factors. Each participant agreed to attend bi-weekly session with their assigned VA clinician as well as attending a group therapy treatment once a month. In total, each participant received six individual treatments and three group therapy sessions. During the individual treatments all clinicians followed an identical treatment plan that lasted forty-five minutes per session. Participants were required to keep a personal journal to discuss at their personal appointments. No prescriptions were administered to the participants during the three month session. The clinicians used strictly verbal treatment. Previously mentioned in the consent form the participants were informed that if they needed to be prescribed medication for depression due to the severity of symptoms they were to no longer take part in the study. If the clinician felt that the patient needed to be put on medication then they immediately informed the researchers post-appointment and no longer followed the treatment plan.

Procedure

The first scheduled appointments were in August of 2011, and the second round were in December, before beginning, participants were asked to read and sign the consent form. After all instructions were given, the clinical staff member relocated the individual to a separate room nearby so the participants could have a quiet and private atmosphere. Participants were given sixty minutes by the staff member to complete the packet. Once all the items were completed, participants were instructed to hand over all materials to their designated staff member and were required to schedule another appointment to complete the second half of testing.

After every participant completed all items in the second time point, all packets were collected and dropped into a file box for the research team to view. The research team then proceeded to view and separate all packets based on gender. One hundred and twenty four participants completed all items in the packets, consisting of seventy-five males and forty-nine females. The sample sizes of common support systems used by female and male post deployed veterans are shown in the table below.

Table 1

Sample sizes of common support systems to post deployed veterans; male or female.
Results from veterans MOS Social Support Survey were scored. The highest number among the four issued support surveys were accounted as most desired and influential support source. Then after determining which source was most influential, the participants were categorized into their preference of four different groups (numbers in table 1). These are the number of males and females that have chosen what support source they found most helpful. These were scored from the MOS Social Support Survey.

Research Design

Participants showed up to the facility of their choice, either Jesse Brown VA Medical Center or Adam Benjamin Jr. VA Clinic, as either male or female for their intended appointment therefore, a random assignment was not possible. A two group pretest-posttest quasi-experimental mixed design was used; selection bias could not be controlled.

Results

Data analysis of the 2x5x4 factorial design was conducted for descriptive and inferential statistics with the use of the SPSS software. PTSD score frequencies were analyzed within each independent variable sample group as well as within themselves as an entire sample (N=124). Overall, the posttest showed that the symptoms of PTSD within males had regressed within the three month period more than it had for the female group. There are significant differences among the males who preferred veteran support during the pretest and posttest with a beginning mean of 57.07 score on the PCL-M, then dropping to an average of 46.37 on the posttest. Among the females, there was also a drop in the mean from the PCL-M in the pre and posttest, starting with 60.00 to 55.45. The second form of support that showed a greater difference among the means in the pre and posttest is spousal. In the males pretest, the mean from the PCL-M was 57.15, and dropped to 53.05 three months later. For the females, the mean in the pre-test was 54.08 and dropped to 53.00 in the posttest. For the support source of family (relatives) the mean score for males dropped from M=59.80 in the pre-test to 50.27 in the posttest. For females there was only a .62 differences in the means; pre-test M=61.50, and posttest score of M=60.88. The last form of support that was preferred by the sample
was civilian support for males $M=52.10$ for the pretest and $M=50.20$ in the second test. The females had an average mean score of $61.22$ in the pretest, and $M=60.78$ on the posttest. Both males and females showed the least progression when this was the form of support they chose.

The null hypothesis for the first independent variable is determining the differences such that $H_0$: Males $\geq$ Females. This hypothesis states that over time, males will either have the same or larger scores on the Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Checklist Military Version (PCL-M). The alternative hypothesis is that females will have higher scores during the pre and posttest such that $H_1$: Males $<$ Females. For the interaction between the independent variables our null hypothesis is that both males and females regardless of support will not have differences in their PTSD scores, such that $H_0$: Males $=$ Females. The alternative hypothesis to this is that males and females scored will differentiate regardless of support source they had chosen, being that $H_1$: Males $\neq$ Females. Table 3 shows the differences among the means of both males and females during the pre and posttest. As for the second independent variable, which is personal support the null hypotheses is that $H_0$: Spousal $=$ Relative $=$ Civilian $=$ Veteran in terms of personal support. The alternative hypothesis is that the four levels of support will differentiate from each other, such that $H_1$: Spousal $\neq$ Relative $\neq$ Civilian $\neq$ Veteran. As for the interaction between this independent variable, we believe that veteran support will have the largest differences in scores, being so our null hypothesis will be $H_0$: Veteran $\geq$ Civilian, Relative, Spousal. The alternative hypothesis is that $H_1$: Veteran $<$ Civilian, Relative, Spousal. The alternative hypothesis is stating that participants who chose veteran support with have scored less than others who chose from the other different support sources.

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Male Vs. Female</th>
<th>Spousal Family Civilian Vs. Veteran</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Test One</td>
<td>Spousal</td>
<td>57.15</td>
<td>5.518</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Family</td>
<td>59.80</td>
<td>6.847</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Civilian</td>
<td>52.10</td>
<td>1.912</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Veteran</td>
<td>57.07</td>
<td>4.660</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>56.97</td>
<td>5.521</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[72]
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Spousal</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>54.08</td>
<td>3.679</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>61.50</td>
<td>6.024</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civilian</td>
<td>61.22</td>
<td>7.446</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veteran</td>
<td>60.00</td>
<td>5.703</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59.02</td>
<td>6.240</td>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>56.00</td>
<td>5.074</td>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>60.39</td>
<td>6.486</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civilian</td>
<td>56.42</td>
<td>6.955</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veteran</td>
<td>58.24</td>
<td>5.251</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>57.78</td>
<td>5.878</td>
<td>124</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Test Two**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Spousal</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>53.05</td>
<td>5.520</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>50.27</td>
<td>9.145</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civilian</td>
<td>50.20</td>
<td>2.150</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veteran</td>
<td>46.37</td>
<td>5.623</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>49.44</td>
<td>6.646</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>53.00</td>
<td>4.824</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>60.88</td>
<td>6.151</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civilian</td>
<td>60.78</td>
<td>7.172</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veteran</td>
<td>55.45</td>
<td>7.626</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>56.71</td>
<td>7.249</td>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>53.03</td>
<td>5.190</td>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Spousal</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>53.96</td>
<td>9.589</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civilian</td>
<td>55.21</td>
<td>7.391</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veteran</td>
<td>50.00</td>
<td>7.840</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>52.31</td>
<td>7.735</td>
<td>124</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
To determine whether or not to reject the null hypothesis and retain the alternative hypothesis, an ANOVA analysis was conducted. Table 4 indicates that the time, time vs. gender, time vs. support, and times vs. gender and support all have significant effect sizes. All except time vs. support and gender have a significance of .0, with that being .46, still $p < .05$.

Figure 1: Averages among gender at two testing periods

In figure one above shows the average scores from the PTSD checklist in males and females during time one and time two. Females had higher averages in both testing periods than the males.

In figure two below, the difference of preferred support sources between genders are presented. Males showed lower scores from the PTSD checklist in all areas except for ones who preferred spousal support. This indicates that the males compared with females that preferred spousal support had higher scores on the PTSD checklist. This proves that even though it is preferred, spouses have more effect on females than they do males.
Figure 2: Differences among males and females in preferred support during time one

Figure 3: Differences among males and females in preferred support at time two

Figure three also shows the differences among both gender and their preferred source of support for the posttest. In figure three, the graph shows that veteran support, over time, had lowered the PTSD scores the most for both male and females. The participants that preferred civilian support did not affect the scores as much as the other
sources did. For spousal support, it lowered the female’s scores much more than the males, so that in time two, the two group’s scores were very close in average. Also, the scores for males and females in time two regarding civilian and family support showed such close scores for each gender that it is hard to distinguish the lines.

Table three below presents the ANOVA results for our between-group variable, gender. Support itself does not provide a significant effect size (.64>.05), but does when compared with support. A significant effect size of .002 shows that the different types of support do affect males and females.

Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Type III Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Partial Eta Squared</th>
<th>Noncent. Parameter</th>
<th>Observed Powera</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>643548.666</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>643548.66</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10956.15</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.990</td>
<td>10956.157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>1350.801</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1350.801</td>
<td>22.997</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.165</td>
<td>22.997</td>
<td>.997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>support</td>
<td>437.728</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>145.909</td>
<td>2.484</td>
<td>.064</td>
<td>.060</td>
<td>7.452</td>
<td>.603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender * support</td>
<td>901.876</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>300.625</td>
<td>5.118</td>
<td>.002</td>
<td>.117</td>
<td>15.354</td>
<td>.914</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Error</td>
<td>6813.671</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>58.739</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In conclusion of looking at these data results it is clear that we can reject all of the null hypotheses. In rejecting the null hypotheses, we then accept the alternatives which state that males and females do differentiate in scores (Males≠Females), males do have lower scores over time than females (Males<Females). For support we accept the alternative hypothesis stating that there is a difference in preferred support source among participants (Veteran≠Civilian≠Relative≠Spousal) and also that participants who preferred veteran support had a lower score in both genders over time (Veteran<Civilian, Relative, Spousal).

Discussion

Our main objective for this research was to find if there were any differences in the severity of PTSD among male and female veterans that served in the military and if so, what type of social support proved to be the most beneficial to the progression and duration of PTSD in returning soldiers; female and male. This research examined
four different types of social support (family, spousal, veteran, and civilian) accessible to most veterans upon returning to civilian life. Our findings indicated that both male and female veterans preferred veteran support over the other social support outlets. Among those who chose veteran support as their primary support; their PCL-M post test scores that were administered at the end of the three month study were significantly lower than their pretest scores. With the distribution of the MOS Social Support surveys, we issued four to all veterans regardless of marital status. Doing so could have had an effect on the outcome of preferred spousal support. Since the participants were not all currently married, we could not accurately provide data on the reliability of support sources. Also some of the veterans may have not have had as many close friends and relatives as others. Other veterans may have or may have not had issues with their spouses or family and friends at the time, which would also influence the outcome and score received for that variable. During hypothetical measuring our participant’s PTSD, we used a controlled setting for all of the veterans by using the solitary rooms in the VA clinic they were assigned. This could have posed as a threat to internal validity because they were not in a normal, comfortable setting. Though we did attempt to make it as comfortable as possible, it still could have been seen as an alien, uncomfortable one. In future studies those extraneous variables should be taken more into account for. Throughout the study, a main focus was trying to eliminate as many potential biases and threats that could cause any error or manipulation. To participate in this study, all participants are previously diagnosed with PTSD by the veteran affairs clinic. This being the case, a preexisting case of PTSD, caused the selection to not be randomized which, in turn, caused a selection bias that could not be controlled. Also, having two different locations to conduct this study may be considered a potential threat to the validity; the researchers involved in collecting data for this study, made sure that throughout this study both locations were identical in how the study was conducted throughout the duration of this process. All participants were given the same goals and therapy in their group meetings as well as in their individual meetings, and as well as the same testing evaluations.

There are limitations to this research that should be noted. As previously stated, the participants were not randomly selected therefore a difference in gender participants were significant. Due to the fewer female participants, the results were less significant than the results for males. In future studies, a more evenly distributed group of individuals should be selected for research. Another limitation that should be noted is the instrument used to conduct
this study. Using self-report data could become a factor because it is hard to verify what is true and what’s not. At the beginning of our study, we explain to all participants that all materials are confidential and if they feel uncomfortable with the material they could discontinue with the study at any time.

The belief that social support systems have a positive effect on a returning soldier’s symptoms of PTSD and quality of life was supported by this research. If referring to the results section of this proposal, in table four, it is shown that the effect sizes are all significant. The power of time was at 1, both gender and support separately had a power of .999. When all compared together they had a power of .653. Each variable, either standing alone or compared with each other did represent a high power, and with a 95% confidence interval, it is clear that these results can be applicable to the population of veterans. In terms of defining the significance of each variable, the two most obvious were time and gender, due to its significance level of .000. Of course they have the lowest significance because neither of them are changeable. When comparing time and support, it still proved to be significant with a .000. When comparing all variables, the significance was 0.46, which is much higher than the others but lower than .05. It is clear that gender, time, and types of support are crucial to the development and progression of PTSD. It is believed that the companionship of a fellow soldier; post combat, would be more beneficial to other soldiers because their common experiences and familiar stories would help them become more open to talking and feel less alienated. The findings also indicated that a male soldier’s overall progress with PTSD was more substantial than female soldier’s progress in every way. Due to the differences of averages in time one and two between females, it showed that though their score did decrease, it was not as significant as the males. Why this could be is that males are socially inclined to handle their emotions externally and females internally. With this treatment being strictly verbal with the veteran affairs, it is possible that the females did not discuss as much as the males did during their individual and group sessions. Without them discussing their issues there is a chance that they never resolved some of their experiences with PTSD.

There are many unanswered questions about PTSD and personal relationships among veterans that the world would like to see answered in the future. Few studies show a significant amount of female participants who are returning from combat and how PTSD affects them, their family and its severity. It is very important for future research to be conducted due to the upring wars and battles that our country takes part in. The variables we tested
in this study are part of the source of PTSD severity. Future researchers need to take into account that the symptoms do affect males and females differently and that their environment around them is extremely powerful in the progression of them. In the future, it would be good for more researchers to find out why PTSD affects gender differently, and what specifically in a support source makes it better for the returning soldier. In order to take care of our country, we must learn how to take care of the one’s who defend it.

References

Appendix 1

*MOS Social Support Survey*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>None of the time</th>
<th>A little of the time</th>
<th>Some of the time</th>
<th>Most of the time</th>
<th>All of the time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotional/informational support</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Someone you can count on to listen to you when you need to talk</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Someone to give you information to help you understand a situation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Someone to give you good advice about a crisis</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The survey consists of four separate social support subscales and an overall functional social support index.

A higher score for an individual scale or for the overall support index indicates more support.

- To obtain a score for each subscale, calculate the average of the scores for each item in the subscale.
- To obtain an overall support index, calculate the average of (1) the scores for all 18 items included in the four subscales, and (2) the score for the one additional item (see last item in the survey).
To compare to published means in the article referenced below, scale scores can be transformed to a 0 - 100 scale using the following formula:

\[
100 \times \frac{(\text{observed score} - \text{minimum possible score})}{(\text{maximum possible score} - \text{minimum possible score})}
\]

Appendix 2(http://www.vvaarizona.org/documents/PTSDTool2.pdf)

PTSD CHECKLIST -- MILITARY VERSION (PCL-M) SCORING CRITERIA

--Each column has points associated with it

1 Not at all = 1
2 A little bit = 2
3 Moderately = 3
4 Quite a bit = 4
5 Extremely = 5

--Add up the total for questions 1-17. The question, “Has anyone indicated that you’ve changed since the stressful military experience?” has been added for Life Skills purposes only and was not included in the original template.

--Cutoff Score: 50
The Effects of Child Abuse and Gender on Socioeconomic Status

Abstract

This study investigated the effects of child abuse and gender on social economic status (SES). Eighty participants with diverse characteristics were randomly chosen from prequalified surveys that were distributed at three local supermarkets in Northern, IN. Participants took the CES-D (Center for Epidemiologic Studies Depression Scale) to measure the level of one’s depression and the LOT-R (Life Orientation Test-Revisit) to measure the level of one’s optimism. The CES-D and LOT-R scores were combined and averaged, resulting in a scoring system that ranked SES levels from 0 (high SES) to 30 (low SES). The effects of child abuse and gender when measured individually alter one’s SES, however, the most significant interaction was found when the effects of child abuse and females were measured together. This study shows how the quality of one’s life is altered by child abuse. Further research could study the effects of counseling for maltreated children on SES.

Keywords: child abuse, social economic status, gender, maltreated children, quality of life.

The Effects of Child Abuse and Gender on Socioeconomic Status

One’s level of socioeconomic status (SES) has been categorized by household income, educational level and occupational status. Two variables, gender and child abuse, should be examined when critiquing SES because it is plausible to consider their effects negatively influence one’s SES placement. Numerous cross-sectional studies are available on the topic of socioeconomic status, however, few have made the conclusion that one’s gender and child maltreatment specifically relate to one’s socioeconomic status (Tanaka, Jamieson, Georgiades, Duku, Boyle, & Harriet, 2011). Rather, it has been suggested the strongest relationship to socioeconomic status is one’s education level, and mental health (Tanaka et al., 2001). Current research has shown, that child abuse and low education levels are related, and it is also suggested that maltreatment negatively affects one’s future income and employment level (Tanaka, et al., 2011). Studies confirm when comparing abused children to others, abused children received lower grades (specifically in language arts, and on standardized testing), they were absent from school twice as much, and were suspended more than twice as many times (Lansford, Dodge, Pettit, Bates, Crozier, & Kaplow, 2002).

Prospective studies show there has been a direct link between the accumulation of human capital, and the poor employment outcomes. Therefore, it is extremely important that young adults be prepared for the work force. Ones education level has been shown to predict how prepared young individuals are for employment (Tanaka et al.,
Since previous studies indicate a connection to child maltreatment and education, research on child abuse, gender and socioeconomic status supports future generations. Entering adulthood brings on numerous challenges and changes for an individual. Starting a new career and family are just some of the important steps that lie ahead for the young adolescent (Tanaka et al., 2011). Further research on the effects of child abuse and specifically gender on socioeconomic status will help to ensure that more appropriate and valid interventions are offered to previously maltreated individuals, allowing one to achieve a higher SES level within the community.

Tanaka, Jamieson, Georgiades, Duku, Boyle, and MacMillan, (2011) found that little research was done on child maltreatment and its effects on employment. The few studies conducted showed little external validity, and the results were concluded as bias. Although numerous factors showed a link between child maltreatment and occupational development, generalization was lacking due to the fact these studies focused mainly on women and lesbians. Samples for these studies were limited to welfare agencies which increased the potential for bias. Previous research has concluded that the maltreated child showed lower social and mental competence. It has been found that higher levels of self worth, positive relations with peers, and a high level of education were positively related to better employment opportunities. Furthermore, the process the child goes through upon entering young adulthood played significant roles in future occupational adventures. Failure to succeed in the work force as a young adult strongly suggested a lower SES level as an adult. Since a substantial level of education, self worth, and social competence were needed to excel professionally, and maltreated children typically came from a home environment with a low level of SES, a relationship between the two has been shown.

For participants, Tanaka el at. (2011) used data from a longitudinal study from the Ontario Child Health Study (OCHS). Initially, the data sampling unit was taken from the 1981 Canada Census. The compilation of data was done through stratified, cluster, and random sampling. In 1983, the baseline data was composed from 3,294 children using an age range of 4 to 16 years. A second and third compilation of data took place in 1987, and in 2000 - 2001. In 2001, the finally amount of participants was 3,265 with an age range of 21to 35 years. The most current follow-up assessment was done in 2001, which included 2,355 participants. Participants had taken questionnaires, to decipher whether or not child maltreatment had taken place. The ending sample included both men and women; the combined sample total was 1,893 participants. To exam the income portion related to the study, a subset of
1,454 participants was used. To analyze previous childhood experiences and environment, a baseline was taken from the 1983 data. For information regarding adult outcomes, a baseline was taken from the 2001 data. Tanaka et al., (2011) examined child maltreatment with the use of the Childhood Experiences of Violence Questionnaire. The "educational attainment" was concluded by the number of years of education. The SP-36 was used to assess the participant’s current mental and physical health. To assess for employment, the Statistics Canada was used.

Tanaka et al., (2011) found that 32.5% of adults with serve child abuse had a lower annual income level, when compared to adults without serve child abuse. This finding had a positive relationship with previous research, which stated that child abuse negatively affects ones income potential. This study determined that serve maltreated males were susceptible to less employment opportunities; however a repeat study was highly advised. Limitations were included with this study, such as, the possibility that classifying maltreatment is subjective, and it has been suggested that one’s “current mood state” influenced results.(pg.826) Furthermore, more research is needed to further dissect the reasons as to why the education level for maltreated children was so low. Variables such as, the parent’s ability to pay for pre-educational services or college need to be examined further, as to this might influence a maltreated child’s educational level, more than the abuse itself. Overall, the study demonstrated that previous research was accurate in concluding that the effect of child abuse caused negative consequences on ones potential income and employment opportunity.

Lansford, Dodge, Pettit, Bates, Crozier, and Kaplow, (2002) found that child maltreatment was a nationwide problem. In 1998, approximately three million children had been referred to child protective agencies, yet, the long term consequences of child abuse remained uncertain. Lansford et al., (2002) acknowledged that many previous studies suggest that negative consequences are a predictable outcome for child abuse. However, bias for past studies was suggested because of the predisposition of the clinical samples used. Furthermore, it remains unclear as to whether or not the effects of child abuse were temporary, meaning “its effect will diminish over time”, and whether or not gender played a significant role in its lasting effects. Previous research also showed concerns as to whether or not it had been the effects of child abuse that correlated with the negative adjustment problems in adult years, or rather, the effects of confounding factors, such as low SES family level, and family anxiety.
Lansford et al., (2002) had chosen participants from “nonreferred communities” (p.825) rather than institutions that were commonly known to have dealt with child maltreatment. Samples were approached from the following states: Nashville, Knoxville, Tennessee, and Bloomington, Indiana, during kindergarten preregistration. Of the approached 75% were willing to partake in the research, this resulted in a sample of 585 children, 52% were male, and 48% were female, and groups were established for maltreated and non-maltreated children. Twelve years later when the study concluded, 77% of the maltreated and 79% of the non-maltreated participants remained, which had brought the total participants to 463.

Detailed interviews with the mothers and questionnaires completed by both the mothers and the children were used throughout this study. Interviews had to do the child’s development, methods of discipline, the health of the child, and information about whether the child had ever been abused. Official school records from 9th to 11th grade were used to assess level of education, and assess the child’s knowledge. The specific questionnaires used for this study were, 16-Item Retrospective Infant Characteristic Questionnaire, 113-Item Child Behavior Checklist, Youth Self –Report Form of the Child Behavior Checklist, Adolescent Behavior Questionnaire. At the end of this study children indicated with a scale (1-5, with 1 being the lowest) the likelihood of attending college.

Questions concerning the child’s “developmental progress, misbehavior, discipline practices, and whether or not the child has ever been physically harmed by an adult” (p.826) were asked to the child’s mothers. Another series of questions were asked solely for the intended purpose to control outside variables. An index that complied information about the parents education and occupational level was used to establish socioeconomic status. A 16-Item Retrospective Infant Characteristic Questionnaire was used to assess three parts of the child temperament: “resistance to control, unadaptability, and difficult temperament.” (p. 826). Mothers gave a report on the child health, from prenatal to early postnatal, and lastly, official school records were made available for the study. The school records were from 9th to 11th grade, and these records were used to evaluate the student’s grade point average, and standardized testing in mathematics and language arts. After the child finished 11th grade, the mothers completed the 113-Item Child Behavior Checklist, upon completion, the answers were used to create the following subscales: Aggression/Anxiety/Depression, Dissociation, Delinquent Behavior, Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder, Social Problems, Thought Problems, and Social Withdrawal. The children (once finished with 11th grade) completed the
Youth Self –Report Form of the Child Behavior Checklist, which had scales similar to the one the mothers had completed. The children then completed the Adolescent Behavior Questionnaire. This questionnaire assessed the risk behaviors of the child, as well as its frequency. Lastly, the children assessed the chances of attending college with a scale from 1-5: 1= very low, 2=low, 3=about 50-50, 4=high, 5=very high.

Lansford et al., (2002) found that maltreated children received lower grades in school, and on standardized testing than non-maltreated children. Furthermore, maltreated children had missed more school than non-maltreated children. It has been shown that maltreated children had higher levels of depression, anxiety, dissociation, social problems, and delinquent behaviors when compared to non-maltreated children, and more maltreated children than non-maltreated children stated going to college as unlikely. Based on gender, the effects of maltreatment affected girls more. One limitation to this study was that participants were not chosen with random assignment, which could not have been avoided since some of the participants needed where ones that suffered from child abuse. Therefore, certain variables such emotion abuse and neglect could not be controlled. Another limitation was the deciding factor between whether or not maltreatment actually occurred. Lansford et al., (2002) determined that the maltreated child is more likely to suffer from psychological and behavioral problems, even with controlling outside risk factors for the child and family.

Artazcoz, Benach, Borrell, and Cortes (2004) found that previous research on social class usually focused on males only. Little research has been conducted in regards to gender differences and the effects of unemployment on mental health. Previous studies suggested that poor mental health is linked with unemployment, however, the absence of social class, meaning the “nonfinancial benefits” has affected mental health as well, though not directly, but rather through self-esteem, and mental and physical activity. Furthermore, it is unknown whether the toll on mental health from unemployment is related to the family dynamics and responsibilities within the household. Previous research has been limited to studying one uniform group because most studies have used certain groups (e.g. iron workers, steel workers) known to have had a high number of samples available for study, hence, findings from these studies are not generalized and have low external validity.

The Catalonian (Spain) population was used for this research. The 1994 Catalanian Health Survey was based on 15,000 members. Samples were chosen from the 8 regions in Catalonia based on the size of the
population. A subsample was collected which included, all employed and unemployed workers with an age range from 25 to 65 years. Individuals that reported long term illnesses were removed as to avoid “reverse causation effects.” The final sample consisted of 2422 men and 1459 women, both employed, and 371 men and 267 women, both unemployed.

Artazcoz et al., (2004) used the 12-item version of the General Health Questionnaire. It has been a commonly used test for research in unemployment, because it has been able to decipher “breaks in normal functioning” and it has been shown to decipher these breaks from actual lifeline traits. A 2 point scoring system was used 0=absent and 1=present, focusing on the main areas which were: employment status, family roles, and occupational status. Lastly, the Hosmer-Lemeshow test was given to the all participants.

The main areas examined were employment status; the 4 categories evaluated where: employed, unemployed, receiving compensation, and unemployed and not receiving compensation, Family roles; the 6 categories evaluated where: single, married, or cohabitating, and separated, divorced, and widowed, and Occupational status; assigned by social class: Class I referred to managerial, senior technical workers, and freelance professional, Class II referred to workers in intermediate occupations and managers in commerce, Class III referred to skilled non-manual workers, Class IV referred to (Iva) skilled and (IVb)semiskilled workers, and Class V referred to unskilled manual workers. The first assessment began with the unemployed versus the poor mental health participants. Respondents in the unemployment category where then separated by ones receiving compensation and ones not receiving compensation. The social class was evaluated by “manual versus nonmanual,” and lastly, the family roles were assessed by “marital and parental status.” The Hosmer-Lemeshow test was used to evaluate “goodness of fit.”

Artazcoz et al., found 3 important areas of concern throughout this study. First, unemployment compensation and beneficial effects of unemployment differ greatly for gender, family role, and social class categories. Second, due to family responsibilities, such as holding the title of provider for the family, men’s health had a more profound effect when unemployed. In the manual group, the risk of poor health was increased by marriage, but for women, marriage and living with children not did increase the risk for poor health, but rather it acted as safeguard towards poor health. It has been concluded that there were differences between ones gender and family
roles when it came to social class. The only limitation found with this study was that it could not be entirely confident that poor mental health was the actual cause for unemployment, however, it is unlikely, due to the careful consideration and process that had been done when the participants were chosen for this study.

The first independent variable used in this proposal is child abuse. Its two levels examined were, the existence of child abuse, and non-existence of child abuse. It is hypothesized that child abuse has negative effects on one's socioeconomic status. Independent variable number two, is gender. Its two levels are, male and female. It is hypothesized that gender has a role in determining one's socioeconomic status. Lastly, the two variables will be examined together. It is hypothesized that child abuse and one's specific gender affect the outcome on one's socioeconomic status.

A two by two factor design will be used for this research proposal, examining both one's gender, male or female, and the existence or non-existence of maltreatment. Certain extraneous variables such as poverty, education level, mental health, and the child's characteristics (e.g., difficult temperament) will be controlled as much as possible for this research proposal. Previous studies state the importance of controlling such extraneous variables, as they are likely to be effects of maltreatment rather than effects of maltreatment on SES (Lansford et al., 2002).

Method

Participants

To recruit participants for this study, flyers were passed out to shoppers at well known grocery stores. Developers of the study chose a particular Saturday during the month of September 2012, to pass out flyers from 9am until 10pm. The following grocery stores in Merrillville, IN. were used to distribute these flyers: Jewel, Meijer, and Aldi. This study was open to all races and anyone over the age of twenty-five. The flyers stated that participants were needed for a study to test the effects of child abuse and gender on socioeconomic status. The flyers prequalified participants for this study through demographic and economic questions. An e-mail link on the flyer provided more information about the study, and those who were interested were allowed to register for the selection process. The only restrictions the study had was age. If participants were not twenty-five years of age or older their names were not submitted for the random selection process.
To make certain the study had diversity and to increase its external validity, three grocery stores were used in a highly populated and diverse area. Grocery stores in Merrillville, IN. were chosen based on their ability to serve all socioeconomic classes. The demographic areas surrounding Merrillville, IN. are Schererville, Dyer, Hammond, Gary, Valparaiso, and Munster. The use of these areas made certain that large age groups, many races, and a wide variety of income and education levels were addressed. In doing this, the ending sample generalized the larger population, which helped eliminated threats to the external validity.

Other extraneous variables were controlled for to heighten the study’s external validity. Reactivity was not a concern for this study since participants would not be observed therefore; it is highly unlikely they would purposely change their behavior while testing, and no pretest was required for this study, thus, pretest sensitization was eliminated.

From the flyers distributed, 200 people had an interest in participating. From the 200 interested participants, 40 were not considered because of the age restriction. This left a total of 160 interested participants. From this group, 80 people were randomly chosen. The ending result for participants ended with N=80, with 40 of the participants being women. Their ages ranged from 25 to 72.

**Materials and Apparatus**

The CEVQ (Childhood Evaluation of Violence Questionnaire), CES-D (Center for Epidemiologic Studies Depression Scale), and the Life Orientation Test-Revised (LOT-R) were the instruments used for testing in this study. A combined average score from the CES-D and the LOT-R were used to measure SES. Participants were also prequalified for this study; their education level and current household income were addressed.

The CEVQ was used for all participants in this study. Participants were prequalified during the recruitment process of this study, but to ensure further validity of this particular effect (child abuse), and to keep all testing measurements the same, the CEVQ was administered to all. It had an overall internal consistency rate of $\alpha = .76$ when used in previous studies (Tanaka et al. 2011) and it used a Likert-scale in its evaluation. (Appendix A)

The CES-D was used in this study to evaluate the degree of depression. The CES-D in combination with LOT-R created a profile of the mental state of the participant which was used to measure SES. This survey had 20 questions. Questions such as, “I had crying spells” or “I felt sad” or “I felt that people disliked me” were asked.
Participants used a multiple choice format to answer using the following Likert-scale: Rarely or none of the time = 1 day; Some or a little of the time = 1-2 days; Occasionally or a moderate amount of the time = 3-4 days; Most or all of the time = 5-7 days. This survey was given in paper format, it was printed on yellow paper, and participants used a black Papermate pen to answer the survey questions. See Appendix B for the CES-D survey.

The Life Orientation Test-Revised survey consisted of ten questions. The survey evaluated the level of one’s optimism. Questions pertained to one’s general outlook towards life. Questions such as, “If something can go wrong for me it will” or “I don’t get upset too easily” or “I enjoy my friends a lot” were asked to the participants. Participants answered using a Likert-scale with 0= Strongly Disagree; 1= Disagree, 2= Neutral, 3=Agree, and 4= Strongly Agree. This survey was given in paper format, it was printed on yellow paper, and participants used a black Papermate pen to answer the survey’s questions. See Appendix C for the LOT-R survey.

Testing took place at Purdue University Calumet in Hammond, IN. Four separate rooms were used in the building, in an area known as Gyte. The rooms were labeled "1", "2", "3", "4". The four rooms were used for testing the participants. Each room was 20 x 30 feet; they had the same decorations throughout; white walls, three windows, one door, and one chalkboard. A constant temperature of 75 degrees was kept in each room. Each room contained twelve sets of cool-white fluorescent bulbs. Each room had two supervisors for the study, one male and one female, these supervisors over saw the entire testing procedure.

To ensure this study’s internal validity remained intact the study took the following measures to control for extraneous variables, such as instrument change, and testing: the survey’s remained constant for all participants, all participants were prequalified, and all participants took the CEVQ, CES-D, and the LOT-R in the same order. All participants had the same amount of time to complete the survey’s, and the survey’s were evaluated the same for each participant. No pre-test or post-test was given to the participants. This study controlled for the order of testing because all participants took the CEVQ first, the CES-D second, and the LOT-R last. Participants were not familiar with the surveys used, and they did not establish practice effects because they only took the surveys once. Motivation to do well the second time was not a concern because these surveys were only taken once.

**Procedure**
Prior to conducting this study, all participants signed informed consents, and the IRA (Independent Review Board) reviewed all aspects of the study to ensure that ethical standards were in place. To control for differential attrition, the informed consents explained that the study was open to all interested participants, and that those chosen were done so by random assignment. Diffusion of treatment, and maturation were controlled for at this time. Diffusion of treatment was addressed by informing all participants about the importance of confidentiality. They were instructed not converse about the study with each other or family and friends. It was explained to them that testing would be limited to 45 minutes. Testing time was limited to ensure that participants did not experience fatigue and boredom.

Block counterbalancing was used to ensure that internal validity was intact throughout the testing process (Table 1). With the block counterbalancing it was assured that each sample group would be tested for only one day, and for only one level of the independent variable. These groups were separated during each one hour time slot. The block counterbalancing also aided in controlling for diffusion of treatment. Since the entire group of N=80 had been broken down into smaller sample groups of four participants each, discussion between the groups about the study was controlled for. To ensure privacy, participants were also unaware as to which group they were in.

These groups of four used for the block counterbalancing were chosen by random, which controlled for selection of bias. These four groups were defined by the following: females who experienced child abuse were labeled as CAF, females that did not experience child abuse were labeled as NCAF, males who experienced child abuse were labeled as CAM, and males that did not experience child abuse were labeled as NCAM. The detailed block counterbalancing schedule (Table 1) is provided below.

| Table 1 |
| Block Counterbalancing |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8am-9am</td>
<td>4 CAF</td>
<td>4 NCAF</td>
<td>4 CAM</td>
<td>4 NCAM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9am-10am</td>
<td>4 NCAM</td>
<td>4 CAF</td>
<td>4 NCAF</td>
<td>4 CAM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10am-11am</td>
<td>4 CAM</td>
<td>4 NCAM</td>
<td>4 CAF</td>
<td>4 NCAF</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Break 11am-12pm  |  BREAK  |  BREAK  |  BREAK  |  BREAK  \\
12pm-1pm       |  4 NCAF |  4 CAM  |  4 NCAM |  4 CAF  \\
1pm-2pm        |  4 CAF  |  4 NCAF |  4 CAM  |  4 NCAM |

Note: CAF stands for child abuse, female. NCAF stands for no child abuse, female. CAM stands for child abuse, male. NCAM stands for no child abuse, male.

Previously via e-mail participants were instructed to arrive at the Student Union Center of Purdue Calumet a half hour before their designated testing time, refer to Table 1 for testing times. At the Student Union Center supervisors waited, one male and one female, for all participants for that particular hours testing to arrive. Once all participants were in place, the supervisors explained that this study was open to all interested participants and a review on informed consents took place. Diffusion of treatment, and maturation were addressed and controlled for at this time. Participants were informed about the importance of confidentiality. They were instructed not converse about the study with each other or family and friends. Testing procedure was limited to 45 minutes to ensure that participants did not experience fatigue and/or boredom. Participants had no knowledge as to what group they were in.

Once testing procedures where covered and informed consents were signed participants were brought to their designated room. This procedure was done for each hours testing group. To ensure that all participants were given the same amount of time to complete the surveys, testing for each of the four groups waiting until it was exactly the time instructed beforehand to start. For example, if all participants were in their designated room, and it was 9:50 am, participants waited until exactly 10:00 am to begin. Once testing had begun, no one was allowed in the testing rooms. Participants remained in the testing room until one of the supervisors indicated that the testing for that particular hour was done. Supervisors then debriefed participants by formally thanking them for their participation, and at this time they were reminded of the informed consents that were signed, and the importance of confidentiality. Completed surveys for each of the groups were taking back to the main study’s center for evaluation.
This study was free from sampling bias as this study was open to all interested participants and the selection process for choosing the final participants was done by random assignment. This study is reliable, has internal validity, and can be easily replicated. The CES-D and the LOT-R are both well known and reliable surveys. Neither grade subjectively, rather, a Likert-scale is used to produce an evaluation of one’s mental aspect toward life. The CEVQ has an overall internal consistency rate, when used in previous studies, of $\alpha = .76$ (Tanaka et al. 2011) showing that the CEVQ is capable of measuring childhood violence. The CES-D and the LOT-R are both well known and reliable surveys, and they are not graded subjectively.

Extraneous variables such as diffusion of treatment, and testing have been addressed. This study controlled for differential attrition and maturation by keeping the testing to one day only, and the time needed for testing to under an hour. This was done to control the boredom and fatigue that participants may experience with testing, which if not controlled for, could alter the results of this study. History was controlled for, as all rooms remained free of any incidents that would affect some of the participants. All rooms had the same conditions throughout the testing procedure. Instrument change was not a concern, as the CEVQ, CES-D and the LOT-R were not graded subjectively, or by any mechanically equipment that could break down. Regression was not a problem for the study as no participants were tested twice; therefore, the scores had no mean to gravitate towards or to deviate from.

Research Design

A two by two factorial design was used for this study. Detailed information has been provided to show how the participants were randomly chosen for this study. Two levels categorize each group, with the two groups (independent variables) being child abuse and gender. The two levels (dichotomous variables) for child abuse were abused and not abused. For gender, its two levels (dichotomous variables) were male and female.

Refer to Table 2 for more detailed information regarding the two by two factorial design for this study. The independent variable, child abuse, is located at the top of the factorial design, and the other independent variable used in this study, gender, is located on the right of the design.

This proposal was a quasi-experiment which studied the effects of child abuse and gender on socioeconomic status. Operational definitions were in place for this study. The independent variable, child abuse,
was defined as the violence acts one experienced prior to the age of sixteen. To evaluate the presence of child abuse, the instrument used was the CEVQ (Childhood Experience of Violence Questionnaire). The independent variable gender was defined as male or female. The flyers used to recruit participants prequalified them for this variable. SES (socioeconomic status) was the dependent variable. For this study it was defined as ones quality of life. SES was measured by the following instruments: the CES-D (Center for Epidemiologic Studies Depression Scale) survey, and the Life Orientation Test-Revised, and ones level of education, and ones current household income, which was done through the prequalifying process. To measure SES, the average score from the CES-D and LOT-R from each participant were used. The CES-D and LOT-R were used to measure SES because of their ability to determine the mental state of an individual. The results of these two surveys combined with ones education level and income allowed the study to better measure ones quality life, thus strengthening the internal validity for this study, because this study measured what it indented too.

A between subjects design was used for this study therefore; participants were measured for only one level of the independent variable. For example, the independent variable gender has two levels: male and female. Participants in this study were than only measured for one level, either male or female.

Table 2

*Two by Two Factorial Design*

**Child Abuse**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No Child Abuse Experienced</th>
<th>Experienced Child Abuse</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20 Subjects</td>
<td>20 Subjects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 Subjects</td>
<td>20 Subjects</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Gender**
Male

Female

In this study the dependent variable is socioeconomic status, and the two independent variables were child abuse and gender. Child abuse (IV#1) was broken down into two levels its dichotomous variables were; those who experienced child abuse and those that did not. Gender (IV#2) was broken down into two levels its dichotomous variables were; male and female. The selection process of choosing participants for each level was done randomly, and an ending result of 20 participants per level was used for this study. Using block counterbalancing the 20 participants per level was broken down into smaller groups. These groups consisted of 4 participants and they were classified as follows: CAF = females that experienced child abuse, NCAF = females that did not experience child abuse. CAM = males that experienced child abuse, and NCAM = males that did not experience child abuse.

The control of extraneous variables was done throughout the study which strengthened its internal validity. The study was open to all interested participants, and the selection process was done randomly. This controlled for selection bias, and ensured the participants were diverse in areas of race, age, and economic standing. To control as much as possible for differential attrition a large group of participants was chosen, and a detailed informed consent was signed by all that participated. Through the informed consent, participants were made aware of the importance of privacy needed throughout this study. Extreme measures were taken to ensure that diffusion of treatment was controlled by utilizing the four rooms available for testing. Participants were kept separate, and supervisors remained in the rooms throughout the entire procedure. Participants were also unaware they were separated into groups.

For this study, no pre-test or post-test took place which controlled for regression toward the mean. Block counterbalancing was in place to ensure that order of testing was controlled and that participants were measured for only one level for the independent variable. Testing time was limited to 30-45 minutes to control for maturation. Participants were not expected to test for hours, as this would have brought on fatigue and boredom and affected the results of the study.
The survey CEVQ, CES-D and the LOT-R remained the same for all participants. This was done to ensure that instrument change was controlled. These surveys used a Likert-scale in determining their results, and their instructions for grading were strictly followed for this study. Extreme measures were taken to make certain all areas of the study remained constant for all participants. History was controlled for as much as possible, by keeping constant the room size, the seating arrangements, the temperature, and the lightening, and no outside occurrence affected the study. Testing time was limited to 30-45 minutes to control for maturation. Participants were not expected to test for hours, as this would have brought on fatigue and boredom and affected the results of the study. This study had no pre-test or post-test ensuring that regression toward the mean was controlled for.

Table 3 provides detailed information as to what extraneous variables were anticipated throughout this study and the procedures put in place to control them.

Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Extraneous Variable</th>
<th>Possible Issues</th>
<th>Controlled</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Selection Bias</td>
<td>Gender, income, ethnicity</td>
<td>Randomly selected, used a broad local area to choose participants for racially and economically diverse groups.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differential Attrition</td>
<td>Drop out of the study</td>
<td>Selected a large group of participants. A detailed written consent was signed by participants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diffusion of Treatment</td>
<td>Sharing of information with others</td>
<td>Ensure that participants are separate and not allowed to discuss information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Order of Testing</td>
<td>Test timing</td>
<td>Block counterbalancing was used</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instrument Change</td>
<td>Changing of instruments during experiment</td>
<td>Ensure instruments and variables are kept constant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>Differences in the conditions</td>
<td>Any unforeseen events are kept</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Maturation | Short or long-term changes in participants that affect DV | Testing time was limited to reduce short term changes in participants, such as fatigue and boredom.

Regression Towards the Mean | Low and high scores regressed towards the mean | Ensure reliable valid measures are taken. No pre-test was conducted.

Results

The mean score (mean was the average number of scores which was found by adding up the scores and finding the sum and dividing by the number of scores (see the CES-D and LOT-R for meanings of levels) on the CES-D and LOT-R was M=17.46. The mode (mode was the number that occurred the most frequent in the results) of the CES-D and LOT-R was 20. The median (median was the middle score) of the CES-D and LOT-R was 17.00. The range (the highest score minus the lowest score) of the CES-D and LOT-R was 19. The standard deviation (std) was the measure of dispersion of scores around the mean of a distribution. The standard deviation (std) of the CES-D and LOT-R was STD=4.96. This means the variability of the survey scores were widely distributed. The range was close to five times the std. which is completely normal for a large data set. The larger the std. the more spread out the scores, the smaller the std. the more the scores cluster around the mean.

The mean score for male vs. female was M=1.50. The mode of male vs. female was 1. The median of the scores was 1.50. The range of male vs. female was 1. The standard deviation (std) was STD =.503. This std. is small, which means the scores clustered around the mean.

The mean score for abused vs. non-abused was M=3.50. The mode of abused vs. non-abused 3, the median of the scores was 3.50. The range of abused vs. non-abused was 1. The standard deviation (std) for abused vs. non-abused was STD= .503. The std. is small which means the scores clustered around the mean.

Table 4

Descriptive Statistics for CES-D and LOT-R Survey

Statistics
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>male vs female</th>
<th>abused vs nonabused</th>
<th>cesd lotr aver 0-30</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>N</strong></td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Missing</strong></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mean</strong></td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>17.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Median</strong></td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>17.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mode</strong></td>
<td>1(^a)</td>
<td>3(^a)</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Std. Deviation</strong></td>
<td>.503</td>
<td>.503</td>
<td>4.968</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Variance</strong></td>
<td>.253</td>
<td>.253</td>
<td>24.682</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Range</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sum</strong></td>
<td>120</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>1397</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^a\) Multiple modes exist. The smallest value is shown.

*Figure 1. CES-D and LOT-R Survey Histogram*
The Histogram axis X evaluated the combined score of the CES-D and the LOT-R with a score of 0 being the lowest and referring to a lowest SES level, and a score of 30 being the highest and referring to the highest SES level. Axis Y on the histogram indicated the frequency of the scores. Most people in this study scored between 15 and 20, and the highest score was 30 and the score with the most frequency was 20.

This study had three different null hypotheses. The first null hypothesis was that the effects of child abuse are equal to no child abuse (H₀: Child Abuse = No Child Abuse). The alternative hypothesis was that the effects of child abuse are not equal to no child abuse (H₁: Child Abuse ≠ No Child Abuse). The second null hypothesis was the effects of gender (female) are equal to the male gender (H₀: Female = Male). The alternative hypothesis was that the effects of gender (female) are not equal to the male gender (H₁: Female ≠ Male). The third null hypothesis was that the interaction of the effects of child abuse and one’s specific gender are equal to zero (H₀: Child Abuse & Gender = 0). The alternative hypothesis is that the interaction of the effects of child abuse and one’s specific gender were not equal to zero (H₁: Child Abuse & Gender ≠ 0)

This study had three working hypotheses. The first alternative hypothesis was that the effects of gender altered the level of one’s SES. The second alternative hypothesis was that the effects of child abuse altered the level one’s SES and the third alternative hypothesis was that the effects of gender and child abuse combined significantly alter the level of one’s SES. Research supports the working hypotheses for this study.

This study used ANOVA (an analysis of variance) to measure the effects of gender on SES. ANOVA revealed the main effect of gender, $F (1,76)=47.733, p <.05, \text{Partial ETA Squared}= .386 = 1.00$ was statistically significant with a low effect size ($d=.386$). Since the power size is 1, it is highly confident that the null hypothesis should be rejected; however, the effect size was small, which indicates that the variable (gender) significantly impacted the level of SES more than the variable gender alone. Females had significantly higher CES-D and LOT-R scores (M=20.65) than males (M=16.90). Refer to Table 5 for statistical information on the effects of gender on SES.

Table 5

Male vs. Female

2. male vs. female

[99]
ANOVA revealed the main effect of child abuse, $F(1, 76) = 316.092, p < 0.5$, Partial Eta Squared $= .806$, power $= 1.00$ was statistically significant with a large effect size (d=.806). With a power size of 1, it was highly confident that the null hypothesis should be rejected. The effect size was large which indicates that the variable (child abuse) does impact the level of SES more than the variable gender alone. Child abuse had significant higher CES-D and LOT-R scores ($M = 23.60$) than non-child abuse ($M = 13.95$). Refer to Table 6 for statistical information on the effects of child abuse on SES.

**Table 6**  
Abused vs. non-abused

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent Variable: cesd lotr aver 0-30</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>abused</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>abused</td>
<td>23.60</td>
<td>.384</td>
<td>22.836 - 24.364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nonabused</td>
<td>13.95</td>
<td>.384</td>
<td>13.186 - 14.714</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**3. abused vs. non-abused**

Dependent Variable: cesd lotr aver 0-30

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>abused vs nonabused</strong></th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>abused</td>
<td>23.60</td>
<td>.384</td>
<td>22.836 - 24.364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nonabused</td>
<td>13.95</td>
<td>.384</td>
<td>13.186 - 14.714</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANOVA revealed the main effect of gender *child abuse, F (1,76)=97.155, p<.05, Partial Eta Squared=.561 = 1.00 was statistically significant with a medium effect size (d=.561). With the power size of 1, it was highly confident that the null hypothesis should be rejected. The effect size was medium which indicates that when the two variables were combined (gender & child abuse) the effects significantly impact the level of SES. Females that experienced child abuse had significantly higher CES-D and LOT-R scores (M = 28.15) than males that experienced child abuse (M= 19.05) and males that did not experience child abuse had significant higher CES-D and LOT-R scores (M = 14.75) than females that did not experience child abuse (M = 13.15). Refer to Tables 7, 8 and 9 for statistical information on the effects of gender and child abuse on SES.

Table 7
Gender (male vs. female) * Child abuse (abused vs. non-abused)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4. male vs. female * abused vs. non-abused</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lower Bound</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>male abused vs nonabused</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>male abused</td>
<td>19.050</td>
<td>.543</td>
<td>17.969</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>male nonabused</td>
<td>14.750</td>
<td>.543</td>
<td>13.669</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>female abused</td>
<td>28.150</td>
<td>.543</td>
<td>27.069</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>female nonabused</td>
<td>13.150</td>
<td>.543</td>
<td>12.069</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 8

Descriptive Statistics

Descriptive Statistics

Dependent Variable: cesd lotr aver 0-30

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>male vs female</th>
<th>abused vs nonabused</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>male</td>
<td>abused</td>
<td>19.05</td>
<td>1.849</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>nonabused</td>
<td>14.75</td>
<td>2.197</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>16.90</td>
<td>2.960</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>female</td>
<td>abused</td>
<td>28.15</td>
<td>3.543</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>nonabused</td>
<td>13.15</td>
<td>1.663</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>20.65</td>
<td>8.072</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>abused</td>
<td>23.60</td>
<td>5.387</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>18.78</td>
<td>6.329</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9

Test of Between-Subjects Effects

Tests of Between-Subjects Effects

Dependent Variable: cesd lotr aver 0-30

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Partial Eta Squared</th>
<th>Observed Powerb</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>gender</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>281.250</td>
<td>47.733</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.386</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>childabuse</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1862.450</td>
<td>316.092</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.806</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gender * childabuse</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>572.450</td>
<td>97.155</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.561</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Error</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>5.892</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>80</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corrected Total</td>
<td>79</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 2. The effect of gender and child abuse on SES Graph

The graph in Figure 1 shows detailed information for the results of the CES-D and LOT-R surveys. The higher the CES-D and LOT-R scores, the lower the SES. The main effect in this graph showed that those who experienced child abuse scored higher on the CES-D and LOTR survey than those that did not experience child abuse. The above graph also indicated that males scored higher on the CES-D and LOT-R survey than females. When gender and child abuse were combined, the females that experienced child abuse scored higher than males that experienced child abuse.
The graph in Figure 2 provides an alternate view of the detailed results from the CES-D and LOT-R surveys. This study was 95% confident that the range for gender and child abuse would be small. Males who experienced child abuse had an $M=19.05$ with a 95% confidence interval of a lower bound of 17.969 and upper bound of 20.131. Males that did not experience child abuse has an $M=14.75$ with a 95% confidence interval of a lower bound of 13.669 and an upper bound of 15.831. Females who experienced child abuse had an $M=28.150$ with a 95% confidence interval of a lower bound of 27.069 and an upper bound of 29.231. Females that did not experience child abuse had an $M=13.15$ with a 95% confidence interval of a lower bound of 12.069 and an upper bound of 14.231.

*Figure 3. Male vs. Female Graph*
Discussion

The results of this study lend support to all three alternative hypotheses. This study predicted that the interaction between gender and child abuse significantly altered the level of SES. The confidence interval for this study was set at ninety five percent which indicated that a Type 1 error could not have occurred or affected the results of this study because there was less than a five percent chance that the null hypothesis was true. A Type II error was not possible for this study because the null hypothesis was rejected.

Since the null hypothesis was rejected it was plausible to consider that a random error had taken place in this study, however, because the random error was expected, degree of freedom was used -- allowing one of the participants scores to vary, and not affect the results of this study.

Previous research supports the findings of this study. Currie and Widom (2010) suggested that the long term effects of child abuse negatively affected ones future income potential. Lansford et al., (2002) determined that the maltreated child was more likely to suffer from psychological and behavioral problems, even with controlling outside risk factors for the child and family. The CES-D and LOT-R measured the level of one’s mental outlook on life using questions to evaluate the psychological and behavioral well-being of the participants.

This study had certain bias’s that affected its external and internal validity. The surveys used for this study were not used to its full capacity. The CEVQ was used on all participants to ensure that those who claimed to have been abused were truly abused, however, this survey can also used to establish the degree of child abuse. For this study, the degree of child abuse was not used. It is plausible to consider that the degree of child abuse – meaning its severity – could affect the way in which one answers the CES-D and LOT-R surveys. For example, if participants that claimed to have experienced child maltreatment all scored with a low degree of child abuse it is a possible that their CES-D and LOT-R scores might not have been as high as they were for this study.

The CES-D and LOT-R measured the depression and optimism level of each participant. To strength the internal validity of this study, a depression survey, such as the Beck Depression Inventory Survey might have given a more balanced view on the mental state of the participants. This particular survey is quite longer than the CES-D and LOT-R, and it is possible to consider that even with combining the CES-D and LOT-R survey’s, the survey’s were too short to fully measure the life out look for the participants, and could have caused limitations for this study.
The main effect for gender and child abuse had an observed power of one which indicated that there was a significant difference in the SES when these two variables were combined. The Partial Eta Squared indicated that the effect size was medium which suggests, with a less than five percent chance error, that the effects of gender and child abuse alter SES.

This study had certain weaknesses and limitations. Participants used for this study might not have been completely honest in answering the CEVQ, CES-D and the LOT-R surveys. Participants might have been dishonest without intend, due to the stress and painful memories associated with the questioning, especially for the CEVQ survey. Other weaknesses and limitations might include that participants experienced stress from outside sources at the time the questioning took place -- stresses such as: loss of employment, or loss of a loved one. Both of which would have resulted in lower scores on the CES-D and LOT-R surveys.

The findings of this study would benefit both those abused and those not abused. For those abused, this study demonstrated the importance of intervention and therapy for the abused victims. With this in place, the likelihood of obtaining a lower SES might be avoided. This study is also beneficial for society as whole because a low SES has been linked to higher crime rates, and higher health costs for society.

This study did not measure for the severity of child abuse. Future research measuring the severity of child abuse should be done and would help to explain if this variable has a role in determining the outcome of one's SES. To expand further on SES, it would also be beneficial to determine if SES if affected by intervention methods. Future studies could research whether or not the counseled child abuse victim had a higher SES level than a non-counseled child abuse victim. Findings from these studies could be beneficial to numerous child abuse victims, not to mention society as a whole.
References


Two Compson Brothers and Four Elements of Nature

In regards to *The Sound and the Fury* by William Faulkner, the author himself declares that the three first-person narrators, the brothers in the Compson family, represent different types of morality: Jason is evil, Quentin is good, and Benjy, who has no understanding of good or evil, is neither (Bleikasten 416-17). Morality is often expressed through religious practices, and the fact that Faulkner dates each section of his four-part novel to coincide with a holy event demonstrates that he pays close attention to theology. The first chapter from Benjy’s cognitively-deficient perspective takes place on Holy Saturday before Easter in 1928, the second piece is seen from Quentin’s emotionally-shattered state on Holy Thursday of 1910, the third section from Jason’s selfishly wrathful mentality occurs on Good Friday of 1928, and the final, third-person narration happens on Easter Sunday in the year 1928 (Collins 71). In addition to these unambiguous Christian references, Faulkner also makes allusions to various faiths – including, but not limited to, Christianity – in more subtle ways. One of those methods is by correlating each of the four elements of nature to differing aspects of spirituality. Earth is a life-giving source often used in relation to Caddy, the sister of the three fraternal Compsons, fire is a force for physical and internal purification, air is a catalyst for change amongst the living, and water is a direct link between the realms of the living and the dead. These depictions of the elements show earth and fire as primarily positive, and represent air and water as neither. Because Jason is malignant, his interpretations of natural components are skewed and do not warrant examining in this context. Faulkner’s impartial and encouraging portrayals of the four elements and the spiritual connections they possess are, as a reader might expect, more apparent in observations made by the unbiased and benevolent brothers, Benjy and Quentin respectively, during their personal narrations.

Earth is fertile and therefore able to produce life, like a woman, which is where the ancient concept of Mother Earth derives. Earthly properties are often used to represent Caddy in Faulkner’s text because she is fertile - as is expressed by her being not only female, but the sole child in the Compson family to procreate - and viewed as a maternal figure, especially by Benjy. Caddy “like[s] to take care of [Benjy],” who is a permanently child-like character (Faulkner 41). The novel begins by describing flowers, trees, and soil, which are three key components of earth. The
first sentence of the extensive work refers to the gaps in the fence as “flower spaces,” a “flower tree” is mentioned twice in the first paragraph, and the image of “ground [that is] hard, churned, and knotted” is transcribed on the bottom of the first page (3). Flowers and trees are earthly symbols that are prominently featured in Benjy’s and Quentin’s narrations.

Dilsey, another surrogate mother figure for Benjy (Benjy’s biological mother scarcely ever bestows any of her offspring with attention.), always ensures that Benjy has flowers. For example, when Benjy is a child “Mother…has[s] some flowers” (6) and Dilsey counsels Mother to “[g]ive [Benjy] a flower to hold” so he will cease weeping (7). Another instance is when Luster gives Benjy a flower and then hits it out of his hand; Benjy cries as the flower blows away, but it returns when Dilsey arrives (35). Benjy’s “flowers” are compared to “his graveyard” due to their tendency to stir old memories (36). Caddy “rattling flowers” sparks a memory of “Mrs. Patterson [coming] across the garden, running” for a letter that Benjy is sent to deliver (9). Once Benjy reaches adulthood in age, though not in mental capacity, most of his recollections pertain to Caddy.

“Caddy smelled like trees” is an observation that is repeated many times throughout Benjy’s chapter (12, 27). Benjy determines that the scent is good because it is natural, thus he becomes distressed when Caddy begins to wear perfume. Respecting Benjy’s preferences, Caddy has Benjy make a gift of her perfume to Dilsey (27). Beyond merely harboring adoration for their aroma, Benjy believes trees possess great power. “The trees were buzzing” is a description made by Benjy more than once, for in his mind the silent leafy figures – not the insects residing in them – are capable of making noise (24, 48). Benjy’s opinion of trees is not entirely illogical. Trees are a significant symbol of life in copious traditions because they can live for hundreds of years. As a result, it is theologically rational that Benjy becomes concerned when he cannot sense trees clearly. In addition to the previously cited olfactory sense, Benjy develops fretfulness when the visual sensation of trees is obscured; Benjy “[begins] to cry” when “trees [are] black on the sky…[and it is] dark under the trees” (30). Grief over the loss of a tactile experience with both trees and flowers is communicated when Benjy bawls over being unable to visit his favorite pastureland, which is sold by the Compson family to pay for Quentin’s first year at Harvard (60).

Quentin typically expresses earth in greater detail than Benjy. In the case of flowers, specific names of flora are affirmed rather than simply generalizing all types of botany with colored petals as ‘flowers.’ Some notations of
certain plants are that Quentin and his siblings play under the “wisteria frame” during their childhood when Mother is well (106), and a “banked scent” causes the “marriage of roses” to be evident (49). Another, more significant, recollection that Quentin divulges is that a precise flowery fragrance fills the air the first time he discovers his sister has shared her body with a male: “[W]omen so delicate so mysterious…some man…inside of them…getting the odor of honeysuckle all mixed up” (81). Sex produces life, and honeysuckle, which requires fertile ground in order to live, happens to be present during a paramount event in Quentin’s life that involves love-making. This factor results in Quentin making correlations between “the twilight-colored smell of honeysuckle” and sexual activity (61). Quentin does not “chase after dirty little sluts” and has no obvious yearning to partake in intercourse himself, though he wishes that he could have been “unvirgin” instead of Caddy because he feels that her honor has been compromised (50). Faulkner states that The Sound and the Fury “began with the mental picture” of a girl’s “muddy drawers” ascending a tree while two brothers watched her (Godden 99-100). Faulkner’s comment not only includes the element of earth with its use of soil and tree, but also implies that one of the novel’s main purposes is to “explicate…why…a sister’s hymen matter[s]” (Godden 100). According to Quentin’s father, “men invented virginity,” thus the concept is inconsequential and cleansing imagined contamination is unnecessary (Faulkner 50). Quentin obviously disagrees, as he focuses not only upon the impurity of his sister, but also of plants when he points out that roses are “[n]ot virgins like dogwood, milkweed” (49) and it is “the smells [of] roses…that breathed o’er Eden” (52). The mentioning of Eden along with a floral symbol of corruptibility is not to be overlooked. Its significance lies within the fact that, in addition to bearing resemblance to the ancient concept of Mother Earth, Caddy also shares similarities with Eve, who is thought by Christians to be the mother of the human race from the Garden of Eden. Like Eve, Caddy is a female figure from a pleasant piece of land that lost her innocence and was consequently punished (Fletcher 142).

The famous “apple tree” of “Eden” from which Eve plucks and eats the fruit of knowledge that God has forbidden consumption of, is directly mentioned in the novel (Faulkner 67). Faulkner alluding to this well-known tree symbol is unsurprising, as it reflects the pear tree that Caddy climbs, an act that displays blatant disobedience of her father’s commands, in order to look inside the window and acquire the knowledge of what lies within (Fletcher 142). The understanding she gains is one of death, as what Caddy witnesses is her grandmother’s funeral. It is possible
that Quentin seeks to follow Caddy’s example, like Adam repeating Eve’s act, for it is noted multiple times that Caddy “[goes] on toward the trees” (97), and Quentin rejects unchaste “[r]oses [that grow] on either side of the path. [He goes]…toward the woods” (106). “The lane [that goes] along the wall…dissolving into trees” symbolizes civilization melting into something natural (77), and Quentin recognizes that even amongst urbane society, where the university he attends is located, he cannot cease focusing upon his sister’s sin. Despite the crimes Quentin perceives Caddy has committed, he still feels love and admiration for his sister’s maternal instincts, and is capable of identifying Caddy’s positive attributes within trees. One paradigm is when Quentin observes on his walk a “boy…climb[ing] into the fork of the tree and [sitting] there” whilst the boughs cradle and support him, like a mother to her child (78).

Because of this appreciation, Quentin longs to fumigate both Caddy and trees of any negative characteristics. This is proven by Quentin’s frequent notation of sunlight in relation to trees, such as “the trees where the afternoon slanted” (93), “I could see…branches…and the sun slanting through them” (102), and “flecks of sunlight brushing against my face like yellow leaves” (103). This is due to Quentin’s hope that light can restore the purity that Caddy – and the botanical representatives of her - lost by obtaining knowledge of both death and sex. When Quentin “[thinks] of home,” what is brought to his mind are notions of “mud…and roman candles” (56). The combination of elements demonstrates that Quentin defines a comfortable ‘home’ as a place that has a tainted Caddy sanitized by blazing candles.

Fire is viewed as a positive substance because it enlightens and purifies. Christian Hell is believed to be full of flames so that the sins of the unholy souls that are sent there can be purged of their wrongdoing. Benjy is aware that fire contains optimism inside of its molten core even though he is incapable of cognitively grasping the metaphysical reasons of why or how. Consequently, he harbors an intense fondness for flames. This affection is illustrated when “[Benjy begins] to cry” as soon as “the fire [goes] away” (38) and/or candles are blown out (37). He also eagerly “[goes] to the fire[s]” that are built in the hearth of the Compson library (39). The people that take responsibility for the care of Benjy’s well-being realize his love for blazes and utilize it in advantageous ways when Benjy searches for comfort. Caddy instructs Versh to “take [Benjy] to the fire” after he has waited outside in cold weather for her to return from school (5), Luster tells Benjy twice to “[l]ook at the fire” so he will desist crying (37), and Dilsey has Benjy “look at the fire” while she doctors his injured hand (38).
Fire’s ability to decontaminate is demonstrated in Benjy’s narration far beyond the commentator’s mere affinity for combustion. “There is a fire” in “Mother’s room” and it is reflected in a “mirror” (39), but the light of “[t]he fire doesn’t reach” where Mother’s “hair is on the pillow” (40), which explains her illness. Mother willfully remains far from the purifying flames to prevent her sickness from being purged; the motivation behind her deliberate decision is she prefers to continue being physically ill so she can retain an excuse to wallow in self-pity. Conversely, some women in Faulkner’s work embody the element of fire itself. “Quentin looks at the fire. The fire is in her eyes and on her mouth. Her mouth is red” (41). Miss Quentin follows her mother’s example and effectively escapes from the Compson family, and the fact that she is full of fire in the first narration of the tale foreshadows that she will cleanse herself of the supposed Compson ‘curse.’ Benjy recognizes the resemblance between the two females even if he does not comprehend that Miss Quentin is Caddy’s offspring, for after noting the connection between Miss Quentin and the fire, he recalls that Caddy’s “hair was like fire, and little points of fire were in her eyes” (46).

Quentin does not share Caddy’s fiery strength. “[T]he clean flame” is where Caddy yearns to go to purify herself succeeding her acts of promiscuity because “[w]hen [men] touched [her, she] died” inside (94). However, Caddy preserves the conviction that her soul can be healed and does not hasten her arrival to the Hell that she believes will eventually restore her. Quentin, on the other hand, plans the drastic act of suicide, and – ere acting upon the intention – he gives a cigar that he lit to a “blackbird” on a street corner so he will not be mugged (53). Sacrificing fire to a disreputable figure without a fight shows that Quentin is a tragically weak character that forsook hope of ever having his shortcomings cleansed or forgiven. This tragedy is demonstrated further when Quentin remarks, “[i]f people could only change one another forever…like a flame swirling up…then blown cleanly out…instead of…cedars…vivid dead smell of perfume” (111). The beginning of the statement shows that Quentin wishes for the positive alteration brought about by an unsoiled inferno, but he does not view it as something that is possible. He also implies that fire is fresher than the scent of trees or perfume, which reflect Caddy because trees resemble Caddy’s personal aroma and perfume is what Caddy wore when she became old enough to be conscious of her own sexuality. Air is an active element in the quotation because it is “blown.”

Air is a lively element throughout the entire literary work. Serenity is often associated with things that are passively unchanging. As Faulkner illustrates in The Sound and the Fury, air is disruptive because it is a catalyst for
action and change. Uncle Maury, whom Benjy is initially named after before his mother switches his name to the biblical Benjamin, says that Caddy has “been in school all day. She needs the fresh air” (5). This foreshadows that the child Caddy is at the time will one day alter, though it is doubtful that the narrator, Benjy, distinguishes the subtle foretelling. Benjy rarely uses the term ‘air’ or ‘wind’ directly. He describes that the flag “flapped” (3) and that there are “rustling leaves” (5), however, failure to accredit wind for the movements suggests that Benjy is under the impression that the objects are moving of their own volition. To the uneducated Benjy, air has the power of life and death, for it provides motion - and therefore supposed ‘life’ - to nonliving things. Benjy claims that he “[can] smell the clothes flapping” (9). Processing the scent of fresh linen is normal, though flapping is an action that humans see or hear rather than sniff. Benjy’s assertion implies that gestures prompted by air can be experienced through the senses in an atypical form.

The eldest Compson child also refers to air obliquely. He rides on a train “puffing with short, heavy blasts,” suggesting that the inanimate vehicle is bestowed with a semblance of life via air (56). Quentin compares Caddy to a “cloud” twice before elaborating that she possesses a “floating shadow of a veil,” hence Caddy’s wedding veil creates a shadow that, like a cloud that promises rain, indicates negative consequences to come (52). Wind moves clouds and causes veils to ‘float,’ but the element is not directly mentioned. In other passages narrated by Quentin, though, air is explicit in its representations of flow, movement, and change. Quentin puts his face “into the cold air” to gaze behind him as the train bears him away in order to regard a black man he gave money to because Quentin is traveling to a new location and realizes that he will likely never view the man again (55). “[T]he air thin and eager like this, with something in it sad and nostalgic and familiar” reminds Quentin of times and events that have passed and the fact that they will not ever be repeated (78). Despite its abilities to cause shifts in life, air is not all-powerful, as Quentin detects: “Even sound seemed to fail in this air, like the air was worn out with carrying sounds so long” (72). The words ‘so long’ can imply carrying noises that are prolonged or carrying sounds for an extended period of time. Either way, air is an exhaustible force. When Quentin “[has] to pant to get any air at all out of that thick gray honeysuckle,” it suggests that items with earthly properties are more pungent than air (95). This is especially true when earth is combined with water. Quentin asserts that he “lay there feeling the earth…listening to the water…[so he won’t] have to breathe hard and smell [the honeysuckle]” (99). Inhaling oxygen transmitting that particular scent
forces Quentin to acknowledge Caddy’s participation in sexual activities, which is the shift that brings him the most emotional discomfort. Together, earth and water sufficiently overpower air and distract him from the disturbing changes occurring around him. Ultimately, that is why Quentin selects water as his method for dying; suffocating under waves means that he need not breathe ever-moving air.

Drowning is also an appropriate method for Quentin to perish by because water is portrayed as a direct link between the living and spiritual realms in several belief systems. For examples, the River Styx is the route that souls traverse to reach the Underworld in Greek mythology, and rain floods the entire planet so that the human race can be birthed anew in the ancient Jewish and Christian legend of Noah. Any doubt that Faulkner depicts water as a connection between the spiritual and living realms in *The Sound and the Fury* can be assuaged by the fact that monotheistic and polytheistic convictions are directly mentioned in correspondence with the element: “That’s where the water would be, healing out to the sea and the peaceful grottos. Tumbling peacefully they would…when He said Rise” and “pulling upstream in the face of the gods” (71). This undeniable relationship with the divine allows water to be the most versatile element. It can change its own form to solid, liquid or gas, travel in numerous ways - such as through rainfall or flowing rivers - and be combined with other elements of nature. Water has “psychological and mythic implications as the unconscious” that can be pleasant or unpleasant (Dauner 75). Its presence can cause agreeable notions, such as “[seeing] the river” has Quentin “[thinking] how nice it [will] be for them down at New London” (Faulkner 67), or cause devastation if concentrated upon improperly. Quentin’s announcement that he “ruined [his] eyes watering the elephant’s fleas” is a metaphor (60); giving water to those that do not need or deserve it may result in damage the same way that focusing one’s unconscious on issues that are insignificant can bring about destruction. Such wreckage is shown when obsession with imagined inadequacy in protecting a sister’s virtue compels Quentin to devise his own extinction.

Benjy’s relation to water and the unconscious is apparent to those around him, though it probably is inconceivable to him. Dilsey forbids Luster from bringing Benjy to the branch because it brings recollections to the surface of Benjy’s psyche (37). “The boy [that gets] in the water” with Luster reminds Benjy of when “Caddy squatted down and got her dress wet” (11). Memories of Caddy tend to make Benjy weep because he deeply misses her. Benjy learns about the various states of water when the branch freezes during winter and Caddy “[breaks] the top of
the water and [holds] a piece against [Benjy’s] face. ‘Ice,’” she informs him (9). The form of water travel that Benjy perceives most frequently is when it pours from the sky. He remembers “Caddy [saying], I hate rain” because she resents the type of weather that keeps her caged indoors (37), and holding a live being captive can cause him or her to feel as if they are dead. “Father…smelled like rain” (41), notes Benjy, and on the next page he comments, “Quentin smelled like rain, too” (42). The significance of Caddy disliking rain when her father and brother share a characteristic with wet weather is that it indicates Quentin’s role as a male figure that would keep her confined in order to preserve her chastity, and - though Caddy’s father in particular is not overprotective - fathers are wont to embody such behavior. On a plethora of occasions, Benjy decrees that he “[can] hear the roof” (42), accrediting the roof with making its own sound rather than attributing the din to rainwater, causing water to resemble air in this instance by going unnoticed.

Quentin invariably notices water, and experiences it with many senses simultaneously, such as when he declares, “I could smell water, and in a break in the wall I saw a glint of water…water shearing in long rolling cylinders, rocking the float…with a plopping sound” (57). Quentin hears water, sees it shining and moving in distinct shapes, and smells it, as Benjy smells trees and rain. Quentin experiences it tactilely too when “[t]he water [makes his] finger smart a little” (51). Quentin’s careful scrutiny of water teaches him to recognize the bridge it creates between the realms of the living and the dead. This is further illustrated in the fact that he shares folklore, “[n]iggers say a drowned man’s shadow [watches] him in the water all the time” (57). This modern superstition held by blacks may have originated from the belief of Ancient Greece and India that avers if someone gazes upon his reflection in a pool, then “water spirits [will] drag the person’s reflection (or soul) underwater, leaving him to perish without his soul” (Peavy 439). Both creeds depict water as a force that can separate a person from the sins residing within his shadow/soiled soul, thus Quentin perceives that water has the potential to assist him in satisfying his urge to detach himself from impurity. The problem is that “the river glint[s] beyond things,” always out of Quentin’s reach, like the spiritual world itself (Faulkner 71). Quentin develops an all-consuming desire for death; ergo he obtains a subsequent fixation with water. He refers to water more often than any other element. The term “water” is used sixty-one times in the chapter recounted from his perspective (Dauner 75). Quentin eventually elects to die by water when he determines that he will never forgive himself for his failures and deduces that he is incapable of imitating water’s
malleability. Quentin chooses death over the task of reevaluating his idealistic view of the world and making alterations within himself.

Unlike Quentin, water is versatile and can blend with other elements that it encounters, which is to be expected since it successfully mingles the living and departed worlds. When partnered with earth, water is usually the more subtle feature. “[T]he water building and building up the squatting back the sloughed mud stinking surfaceward” shows that water propels earth to make it more conspicuous (87). “We [leave] the road. Among the moss little pale flowers [grow], and the sense of water mute and unseen” (86). Off of the road, or typical path, earth is more noticeable, as the water remains silent and invisible, like a spirit. Quentin has an affinity for water, however, and can detect it in spite of its subtlety. He “[begins] to feel the water before [he comes] to the bridge. The bridge [is] gray stone, lichened…where the fungus crept. Beneath it the water [is] still and clear in the shadow, whispering and clucking about the stone” (73). This incident exhibits that Quentin can feel the presence of water over a great distance as if it is a deity, which he cannot do with earthly stone. Quentin’s experience on the bridge carries the additional implication that one of water’s divine skills is being capable of maintaining a contradictory state of ‘stillness’ while producing ‘whispering and clucking’ sounds. Water mixes equally as easily with what is commonly regarded as its opposing element, fire. Benjy repeatedly reports within a span of a few pages of text that he “[can] hear the roof and the fire” in unison (44). Quentin explicates his suicide by combining water and fire to suggest that beyond the medium between life and death (water) there is a place of purification (fire) when he muses, “I could not see the bottom, but I could see a long way…If it could just be a hill beyond that: the clean flame” (74).

When water merges with air, earth is usually involved as well, as in “[i]t smelled of rain and all flower scents the damp warm air” (94). In the phrase “the air seemed to drizzle with honeysuckle” water is the action word that carries the earthly element of honeysuckle through the air (94). “[T]he water gurgling among the willows…and waves of honeysuckle coming up the air” also has water as the verb, though on this occasion it moves air through earth instead of earth through air (96). As previously noted, air is typically the active vehicle, but water’s adaptability enables it to take on the energetic role. “[G]lasses glinting beneath running leaves like little pools” has air as the verb ‘running,’ and ‘leaves’ and ‘pools’ as plural nouns for earth and water (64). This demonstrates, once again, that air is a means for action. It also presents the earth and sea as symbols that are so endless and all-encompassing that they
cannot be thought of in the individual sense. A description of fog in Benjy’s narration is the only occurrence of all four elements being utilized at once. “Smoke blowing across the branch” compares the gaseous water to fire’s ‘smoke,’ has the body of water share its name of ‘branch’ with the limb of a tree, and entails air in the action of ‘blowing’ (9).

The Sound and the Fury portrays earth as a life-giving source often used in relation to Caddy, fire as a force for physical and internal purification, air as a catalyst for change amongst the living, and water as a direct link between the realms of the living and the dead.

Incorporating the four elements of nature into the written work in these ways principally connects nature to spirituality. The purpose for this association is made clear at the conclusion of the literary work. Benjy is distressed when the carriage takes him down an unfamiliar path, but becomes “serene again” whilst clutching a “broken flower...[in his] fist” once the surroundings transform into a recognizable environment where everything is “in its ordered place” (199). Routine and order are essential for humans to feel at ease with themselves and their circumstances, however, as the novel demonstrates, life is wrought with changes that can disturb people’s inner peace. For example, Quentin seeks to re-establish order by controlling minute details, such as putting away a toothbrush (113), but these factors cannot compensate for Quentin’s inability to cope with significant shifts in his life, and he winds up eliminating his own existence. The ending of the book conveys that Dilsey is one of the only characters that are content with life despite the constant modifications it endures, and she is moved to tears by a sermon at church on Easter Sunday (185). By seeing the world through the eyes of distraught brothers who have either relinquished spiritual hope or never fully understood it and thereafter observing a content religious woman, readers of The Sound and the Fury are taught that a life without faith is one that will most likely never know happiness. The frequent implementation of natural elements throughout Faulkner’s novel, and the fact that the text commences and closes with the image of a flower, reveals that developing awareness of, and appreciation for, nature is vital in the quest for acquiring faith in one’s life.
Works Cited


Arab Spring, Why Now?

The Arab Spring has captivated the Political Science world. The new Fourth Wave of democracy is taking place presently in the Middle East as described by well-known Political Scientist Samuel Huntington. He identifies several waves of democratization; the First Wave beginning with the American Revolution in 1776 swiftly proceeded by the French Revolution. The Second Wave was a result of the victory obtained by the Allies in World War II. The Third Wave was a global process that began in 1974, with the fall of the military government in Portugal and the death of Francisco Franco in 1975. Both were quickly succeeded by successful democratic transitions. It then spread to Latin America, Asia, Central Europe and Africa. Freedom House tripled the countries it judged to be democratic from 39 in 1974 to 123 in 2005. This wave came from what Huntington called "snowballing": the accumulate buildup of economic frustration, spread of democratic values that undermined the legitimacy of the authoritarian regimes, along with shadows of earlier transitions. He also added "reverse waves" to his thesis, which are reactions against the democratic process. Huntington argues this first began with the rise of Fascism and Communism in the 1920s and 1930s, and the resurgence of Authoritarism in Latin America, Africa, and Asia in the 1960s and 1970s. The number of democracies declined to 114 in 2010. This was a result of the restriction of non-governmental organizations, independent media, and opposition political groups. Examples of such autocracies are Russia, Iran, Venezuela, and China.

Presently, the Fourth Wave is breaking out in countries that were thought to have the most resistance to democratic change. The Arab Middle East was the only major region of the world that the Third Wave by passed completely. The phrase “Arab Exceptionalism” was created to characterize the phenomenon. The Economist published an article just two weeks before the uprising in Tunisia, explaining the democratic deficit in the Arab World. A World Values Survey and other opinion polls conducted surveys over a decade before the protest, showing that a large majority of Arab persons wanted to be ruled by democratic systems. (Gershman) Similarity to the Third Wave, the pent up frustration with their economic situations, corruption of leaders, and lack of democratic choices helped bring about the Arab Spring. Adding to the mix was a large youth population that had no hope in their current situations. They took to the internet and organized quickly and bought about change on their terms. It was not that easy though, many lost their lives in the battle. But those strong people have made
history and will forever have their story told. My research aims to answer three central questions: First: Could the Arab Spring have been prevented? Second: what kind of impact did social media and youth play in the success of the revolutions? Third: how are these countries doing two years later?

**The Arab Spring Begins**

Throughout 2011, chants of democracy rang throughout the streets of the Arab world. Beginning to look like a Pan-Arab awakening. Young people in search of political freedom and economic opportunity, rose up against their sclerotic masters. Coming as a surprise to the world, after almost two generations of waves of democracy that had swept over the regions from Southern and Eastern Europe to Latin America, East Asia to Africa. But not in the Middle East. Tyrants had closed up the political world. Consent had drained out of public life; the only glue between ruler and ruled was suspicion and fear. And then the last straw broke the camel’s back.

In December 2011, a desperate Tunisian fruit vender named Mohamed Bouazizi set himself on fire to protest the injustices of the status quo. Soon millions poured into the streets taking up his message. “In too many places, in too many ways, the regions foundations are sinking in the sand.” Former U.S.Secretary of State Hilary Clinton proclaimed in Qatar in mid-January 2011. As the rebellion made its way eastward, it skipped Libya and arrived in Cairo, “the mother of the world”. Egypt was already known for its barbaric rebellions. It took eighteen extraordinary days for Egyptians to rid Mubarak of his position, joining Tunisian’s Zine el-Abidne Ben Ali, who was ousted a month earlier. From Cairo it spread like wildfire to Yemen and Bahrain. Bahrain was on a tightrope between its Sunni rulers and Shiite majority. Making it a vulnerable state. As the poorest Arab state, Yemen’s movement never really had the momentum like the others. Then the winds shifted moving the air of protest back to previously skipped Libya. Where the self-proclaimed “dean of Arab rulers”, Muammer al-Qaddafi had been ruling for four agonizing decades. In Mid-March of 2011 Syria stepped up to bat. Decade’s earlier Bashar al-Assad’s father Hafez had created a regime, with power resting in the hands of Alawite minority. Hafez created the most intimating state in the Arab east. The violence in the Syrian uprising has been most pronounced in Homs the country’s third-largest city, because of its demographics: two thirds Sunni, one quarter Alawite, and one tenth Christian. Also, has one of the highest birth rates in the regions. *Time* magazine named “The Protester” the person of the year in 2011, showcasing the important time in the Middle East and North Africa.
The Arab Spring started in Tunisia and spread across the Arab world. The Middle East and the North Africa region consist of twenty countries and territories, with a population of three hundred and ninety five million people. According to Freedom House, the region is only two percent free. By the end of 2012 Egypt, Libya, and Tunisia had moved up in status to partly free from not free the previous year. Syria is still labeled not free. (Freedom House) Tunisia settled their dust with relative ease in comparison to Egypt, and held elections. Foreign intervention aided Libyan rebels to topple the regime. Qaddafi and one of his sons was pulled out of a drainage pipe and beaten to death, showing the little remorse the citizens had for their former leader. Iran and Saudi Arabia kept the Bahrain uprising under repression. Yemen also failed to impact their political structures either. Egypt has held elections putting the Muslim Brotherhood in charge, raising some concern over the separation of state and religion. Egypt lacks the economic power to build a successful modern Islamic order, unlike other states with oil riches. They live off of tourism, the Suez Canel, infusions of foreign aid, and remittances from Egyptians Abroad. (Ajami)

First, Could the Arab Spring have been prevented? These countries knew the large youth population was going to be a problem when they were of working age. Why did the regimes ignore the issue, instead of planning for it? Marwan Bishara explains in his book, The Invisible Arab, the “youth bulge” theory. This is when population grows faster the job market, leaving a high unemployment rate among the youth. Making social unrest inevitable. (p.63) In The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order Samuel Huntington points out three significant political consequences of a youth bulge. “First, young people are the protagonist of the protest, instability, reform and revolution…These youth provide recruits for Islamist organizations and political movements…The rapid expansion of literacy in Arab societies also creates a gap between a literate younger generation and thus a ‘dissociation between knowledge and power’ likely ‘to put a strain on political systems’. (p.117-119) The rise of Nazism in Germany was credited much to the “youth bulge”. (Moller), 240-244). It is interesting how you can look at times of political unrest and see that large youth population is a large factor. The Arab Human Development Report (UNDP 2002) voices concern over the widespread economic stagnation in the Arab world, and the consequences for the large youth groups. Along with recent expansions in higher education in many Arab countries, this may provide conditions for high levels of terrorist activity. (Urdal p.624) The Arab Spring was not exactly a terrorist activity, but it did bring about a lot of violence and political unrest. Saddam Hussein while standing trail, said America may have bought me down, but your people will bring
you down. (translated) He was speaking to fellow dictatorships in the region. Since the uprising many Arabs are
reminded of what Hussein warned of. The Arab Spring was foreshadowed almost a decade before it happened.

Second, what kind of impact did social media and youth play in the success of the revolutions? Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube are all verily new to the world, but as we saw in the Middle East they are great
tools for mobilizing people. Seventy percent of Facebook users in the Arab world are between the ages of 17 and
29 (Dubai). Ninety-two percent of social media users in Egypt use it for news and information (Dubai). Egypt
attempted to end the protest by cutting off internet connections for a whole day. That only fired up the protesters
and showed the rest of the world the extreme dictators will go to, to stay in power. “We use Facebook to
schedule the protests” an Arab Spring activist from Egypt announced “and [we use] Twitter to coordinate, and
YouTube to tell the world.” (Kassim) The use of social media allowed dissents to spread the word quickly before
governments could react. Government fell like dominos since there was no controlling the wild fire of tweets.

Google executive Wael Ghonim was part of a group that helped publicize the protest in Egypt through Facebook and YouTube. The Facebook page “We are all Khalid Said”, was made to honor Khalid after he was beaten to
death by police in the street outside of an internet café. This was to let the world be more aware of the human
rights abuses taking place in Egypt. Dr. Vail Naser stated that the fruit seller setting himself on fire would have
been like a tree falling in the forest if the youth did not take notice on social media. At that time twenty percent of
youth was on Facebook in Tunisia. Lina Ben Mhenni is a Tunisian Blogger, who blogged and photographed the
uprising as it took place. Ben Mhenni, showed courage by blogging under her real name while the President Zine
El Abidine Ben Ali was still in power. She was also nominated for the Nobel Peace Prize. A new middle class has
formed with more literate, affluent and educated young people. These young people created a new political
community. Egypt also saw a new middle class being formed before the 2008 fiscal crisis. Mark Lynch bought up
in his blog how social media is now damaging the process towards democracy in the revolution countries. First,
how social media tends to exaggerate stories; he relates it to the story of the boy who cried wolf. Second, it was
useful for organizing protesters, but not for producing political parties or voters. Once the protests were over the
protesters backed off, and already organized groups took the stage. Soon protest broke out in Egypt again, due
to elections. Third, a strong case can be made that the Internet has contributed to the dangerous polarization
that now besets so much of the Arab world. (lynch) Fourth, the Arab revolutions first started as a single narrative
of popular revolt, borrowing slogans from each other, and now have broken away from that focusing on local
problems. Facebook groups tend to be more local orientated, fragmenting regional unity. Yemenis borrowed much of their slogans from Egypt after seeing their success, but then realized it did not fit their demographics. Fifth, the success of a quick revolution in Tunisia spread just as quickly as the horrors of the Syria civil war. Everyone was interested when we saw hopeful faces in the media of youth rejoicing after a regime were defeated. But, with the now bloody Syrian Civil War people are not as curious and seem to be turning a blind eye. Sixth, is the push back by governments against online uprisings. Bahrain famously had “eggs” anonymous Twitter accounts with few followers and no clear identity, which hurled abuse at anyone who dared tweet about the country.

Another reason for the Arab Spring could be global warming. This is a new idea being studied. The Center for American Progress, the Center for Climate and Security and the Stimson Center examined the role of climate change in the Middle East’s upheaval during 2010 and 2011. Global warming did not alone cause the Arab Spring, but it sure did hurry it along. The crop failures due to droughts raised food prices to out of control prices. The poor families were struggling even more. According to Michael Werz, senior fellow at the Center for American Progress and one of the authors of the report, the argument here is that there are a number of symptoms -- such as food scarcity, water rationing, crops failure, migration and rapid urbanization -- squeezing the margins of what a society can deal with before exploding. The overwhelmed societies, with weakening states were then pushed to their limits. Dr. Vail Naser did a talk at the Lee Kuan Yew School of Public Policy in 2012 and that is when I first heard of Climate Change in connection with the Arab Spring. He bought up how they wheat shortage and price spikes impacted the basic staples in the North African and Middle East regions. Bread and rice are the main stables of their diet. There is also a water shortage, due to a drought.

Third, how are these countries doing two years later? After the demands for democracy, elections were held and unrest still cries out in the streets. Elections were thought to be unfair and corrupt. These countries are finding that the road is not a yellow brick road. It’s actually quite bumpy and full of potholes. History has also told us that past authoritarian democracies suffer teething pains when it comes to repairing economies. Most of the countries that participated in the Arab Spring have held elections, the exception is Syria. Unlike the revolution of 1989, these protest had no clear leader. Due, to social media everyone took it as their job to spread the support. They had no Lech Walesa. So when leaders left everyone just looked around, like what now? They needed groups that were already organizational. The Muslim Brotherhood was the largest group to come out already
organized in Egypt. Many worried about what kind of leadership they would produce. Since these are Muslim countries would they become run by sharia law or become like Turkey? Turkey has been successful in keeping their Islamic and Democracy cultures separate. Syria has turned into a civil war; New York times estimated on January 2, 2013 that over 60,000 people have died so far. President Bashar-al-Assad is in complete denial that his people are against him. Slowly high ranking officials have been turning against him, and the international community not sure what to do. Egypt has held elections, but protesting has not stopped. An Egyptian man was just beat by police in February. Ironically the President reached a statement on Facebook: "no return to rights abuses of citizens and their freedoms...after the January 25 revolution." (Telegraph) Tunisia is the country that has made the most progress. The 217 constituent assembly created a constitution from scratch. It was going to be modeled after Sharia law, but was met with much criticism. They then decided Sharia law would be left out of the constitution. Since this is the country that set off the Arab Spring, we can only wonder if the other countries will also follow Tunisia's democratic plans. These countries have fallen deeper into recessions due to the revolutions and need to quickly boost their economies. Egypt needs to grow their economy by eleven percent. (Naser) Welcoming globalization could help them. The new governments will also have to address a growing population problem.

The Turkish model is one that is of great importance for these revolution countries. Turkey proves that there can be a modern Islamic state. A study by the University of Maryland's Shibley Telhami in 2011 found that Turkish Prime Minister Recep Tayyip Erdogan is now the most popular leader among Arabs, and the "Turkish Model" is the most desired political system. We should look at the Turkish model briefly, to better understand its context. Mustafa Kemal Ataturk, founded the modern Turkish State in the 1920s on the ruins of the collapsed Ottoman Empire. Since then Turkish politics have been dominated by the interaction between secular Islamists and secular Liberals, with the military as the guarantor of the secular nature of the state. The constitution does not allow any religious institution to supersede the government, nor does it specify Islam as an official state religion. The Justice and Development Party (AKP) in Turkey represents a form of Islamism that is compatible with democracy in a country that carried out the most radical secularization program in the Muslim World. For Arab liberals, the AKP’s moderation has offered a third way between secular authoritarian governments and radical Islamists, It presents a model under which Islamists parties, through institutional limitations, can be moderated and engaged in the democratic process. The success of Turkey’s democratic experiment and its
economic model of high productivity and export-led growth have contributed to the country’s rising image in a region where authorities’ regimes and rentier economies dominate. Over the years Turkey has made great strides in reducing abuse of police powers, ceased injustices against human rights, lifted the ban on Kurdish Language, and adopted a civil code with gender equality and freedom of association and assembly. The have also created a new foreign policy idea called “zero problems with neighbors”. It has allowed Turkey to established economic and political alliances in the Middle East. Leader of Tunisia’s Ennahda Party Rachid Ghannouchi stated this in October 2011 reflecting on the Turkish model; “Turkey is a model country for us in terms of democracy.” A study by the Brookings Institution in Washington D.C. concluded that Turkey’s Islamist Justice and Development Party (AKP) could be a democratic model for nation’s emerging from the Arab Spring uprising. Samer Shetata, assistant professor of Arab Politics at Georgetown University says the model will not necessarily work in Arab Spring Countries. Especially in Egypt, with a predominately Muslim population that sees secularism as anti-religious. Tawik Hamid, a scholar at the Potomac Institute for Policy Studies in Washington D.C. concurs with Shetata by stating; “The Muslim Brotherhood is not open to moderate its positions and shift its priorities from Islamization to economic growth….And the Constitution contains inadequate protection for women and non-Muslims, and leaves the door open for potential oversight of legislation by Islamic scholars.” On the other hand Tunisia’s constitution has no mention of the Islamic Law. (Elshinnawi) Turkish President Abdullah Gul became the first head of state to visit post-Mubarak Egypt. Turkey did not take a clear stance against Muammar el-Qaddafi, by opposing NATO involvement in Libya. After drawing much criticism they relented. They continued the strategic steps when it came to Syria. They tried to encourage President Assad to carry out reforms. After seeing failure and much international pressure, Turkey joined the anti-Assad pack in August 2011. The Syrian uprising has shaken their “zero problems with neighbors” strategy. The Syrian opposition blames Turkey for not being more forceful. According to a Turkish Economic and Social Studies Foundation survey, public opinion on the region views Turkey’s involvement in the Arab Spring as positive but ineffective. (Tol)

Syria has now become completely different from its revolutionary brothers. Its leader is not taking defeat as easily, and due to the threat of chemical warfare the outside world is wondering how to stop the bloodshed. The revolution started in March 2011, and President Assed released dozens of political prisoners and uplifted the 48-year old state of emergency. With continued protest he sends tanks to quiet anti-regime protesters, and US and EU tighten sanctions. By October the UN had a resolution only to be vetoed by Russia and China. The Arab
League suspends Syria in November, because it fails to implement the Arab Peace Plan. In February 2012 the UN says the death toll is at 7,500. China and Russia continues to veto UN resolution plans. In May several countries expelled Senior Syrian diplomats in protest to the violence that continues. In June Syrian troops shot down a Turkish plane after it strayed into its boarders, and Turkey warns of a military backlash. Free Syrian Army is gaining momentum and has blew up several security chiefs in large cities. Finally in August the UN General Assembly demand President Assad resign, and the US warns about invention if chemicals are used in warfare. December 2012 the US, Britain, France, Turkey, and Gulf states formally recognize Syria’s opposition National Coalition as “the legitimate representative” of the Syrian people. (BBC) Currently, Syrians death toll is over 70,000. Along with two million people displaced from their homes, the lucky ones have fled to neighboring states.

Tunisia is the country that set off the revolution, now we are left wondering if they will set off the example of democracy. The country is slowing emerging from the rock it was held under for so many years. They have done a great job of keeping the protest peaceful, along with avoiding toxic politics and violence seen in other parts of the region. The citizens are now eager to enjoy the benefits of meaningful political freedom and economic prosperity. People are excited for what life can become from experiencing the restless repression and abusive of power from Ben Ali and his clan. In 2010 Tunisia ranked 184th out of 196 countries as one of the most notoriously repressed regimes. They are now left with political uncertainty in the wake of the dictator’s departure, and that has affected the already weakening economy. It’s tourism is the most affected, which over 500,000 people in the country of 10 million depend on for employment. The October elections were a critical step towards democratic development. Approaching a pivotal stage in development will require patience and support from outside democracies, like the United States, or European Union countries. The citizens are becoming antsy through, feeling that reforms are moving to slow. The regime did not come to such power overnight, so the transition to a transparent and accountable model of government will not happen overnight. The elections were carefully watched from aboard, hoping that it would set an example for other revolutionary countries to follow. The elections fell short of international standards, and domestic expectations, but nevertheless it’s a baby step. Transparent elections are important to build confidence and trust within the Tunisian Public. It’s also critical to encourage transparency among Islamist groups. For democracy to take root, Islamists must be open with political goals, open to democratic norms, including freedom of expression, respect for women and minorities. It still gives skeptics ammunition that democracy is unstable in the Arab Middle East. Since Ben Ali fled to Saudi
Arabia, the interim government did an exceptional job under such conditions. Food shortages are continuing to threaten social stability, leaving people to feel desperate. Tunisia continues to be in a post-authoritarian limbo and its reforms are no guarantee of success. There will be a lot of trial and error. Institutional change always proceeds slowly, but Tunisia shows great potential for swift gains in the freedoms of assembly and expression.

News Media has now opened to a level unfathomable under Ben Ali, thanks to recent adoption of a new press code. Major think tank corporations could become a great asset, helping provide analysis and policy innovation. Genuine political reform is also a prerequisite for altering the enigmatic economic system created by the former regime that continues to strain the country. Retrograde forces from the old regime continue to lurk in large numbers in key ministries. They unquestionably will look to exploit the vulnerable state. There is the looming danger of a crony capitalism system undermining the progress towards democracy. The first step of overthrowing the regime is complete, but there are still some skeletons in the closet. Now, it is the true test if a democratic system can be put in place. (Walker and Tucker) A wrench was thrown in the democratic plans on February 6th, when Chokri Belaid was assassinated right outside his home. This assassination exposed the weakness of their newly elected government. Belaid was a fierce critic of the Ennahda led government. He championed for a secular state. The country is now becoming divided between those who want an Islamist state and those that want a Western-Style democracy. Belaid’s brother accused Ennahda Chairman Ghannouchi of being behind it. Hamma Hammam, a close friend of Belaid said, “Now Ennahda is creating a climate of aggressiveness. The party doesn’t want democracy, but a religious dictatorship for this country.” Ghannouchi is seen as the most influential man in Tunisia. He was able to bring together Islamists and liberal Muslims, seen as much more moderate than the Muslim Brotherhood in Egypt. The Ennahda party also won the election in 2011. He blames the assassin on supporters of the old regime wanting to “unsettle the system”. He is concerned with the spread of Salafists, especially among the poverty. Salafists want to espouse a puritanical version of Islam that purports to hark back to the days of the Prophet Muhammad. (economist) Ghannouchi believes the spread of moderate Islam will help with Tunisia’s development. The Tunisian government estimates that radical Inman’s control up to a tenth of the roughly 3,000 mosques in Tunisia, and are attracting young people. The assassination is turning into a finger pointing game, with the Salafists blaming the French. Others are also blaming, the “League of the Protection of the Revolutions”. That group is what some would call “thugs”, they were most oppressed under the
regime and most spent time in prison. They claim they hold demonstrations to keep the former regime loyalists from gaining power. (Scheuermann)

Egypt is the country that is in the middle of success and complete chaos. They have held elections that have been seen to be corrupted. Egypt is the Arab world’s largest country with eighty two million people. Their economy has also declined to worse conditions since the start of the revolution. “This is one of the worst economic crises in Egypt’s history over the past one hundred years.”; said Ashrat Haguib, President of Global Trade Matters, a Cairo-based think Tank. The Supreme Council of the Armed Forces, is the military committee that ruled Egypt since fall of Mubarak. They of course ceded power to the winner of the presidency, thus allowing for the creation of the constitution. The president election had a run-off between Mohamed Morsi representing the Muslim Brotherhood’s Freedom and Justice Party, and Ahmed Shafiq a former Egyptian air Force commander and last Prime Minister to serve in Hosni Mubarak’s administration. Mohamed Morsi was able to secure the win. The Muslim Brotherhood was the best-organized group to come out of the unrest. During the three-stage election for the Parliament the Brotherhood won forty-six percent of the seats. Just behind them was the Salafists, winning twenty-one percent of seats, making it the second largest party. It can be concerning especially to the international community with such strong islamists parties incharge. The main reason for the islamists popularity is their hatred of corruption, the scourge of secular dictatorships throughout the region, and their promotion of justice and dignity. They are able to appeal to the poor by giving welfare packages at mosques. The constitution has been created and passed voting with sixty-three percent in favor. There is still much concern for the vagueness in the wording. Liberals, Christians, women, and other minority opposition groups feel they are not represented in the constitution. (Abdelaziz) Human Rights Watch said, “It [the constitution] fails to end military trails of cilivans or protect freedom of expression and religion.” Along with those vague articles, bizarre detailed policy provisions are mixed in. It lacks the check and balance of powers. The president enjoys an array of powers, including right of appointment in government and judiciary, delegate presidential powers to other political institutions, and reverse the powers of pardon. The president is seen as above every other part of government. This breaks with the Muslim Brotherhood’s promise to strengthen the parliament over the president. Protest still ring out in the streets calling for the registration of Morsi. Overall, Egyptian’s transition is still rocky, proving this isn’t going to as easy as the people imagined. (Albercht)
In conclusion, the Arab Spring is unleashing a historic time. There is still much research to be done on these countries to see how they fair. As the 1989 revolutions have proven it will take decades for the Arab Spring countries to pick up the pieces. The countries are already producing dramatically different results. Syria will most likely need much international support in the coming months. The protesting also seems to cease in Egypt with President Morsi receiving much criticism.

Bibliography

Abdelaziz, Salma. Morsy signs Egypt's Constitution into Law. 26 December 2012. 6 April 2013.


Elshinnawi, Mohammed. Would the Turkish Model work in Arab Spring Countries? 4 March 2013. 5 April 2013.


Government, Dubai School of. "92% of Egyptian social media users use the sites to get news and information, compared to 86% in Saudi Arabia and UAE." 2012 April 2012. factbrowser.com. 31 January 2013.


Protest, Policing, and the Occupy Movement

ABSTRACT

The 2011 Occupy Movement invigorated the US with righteous indignation about the degree of economic inequality in the country. Beginning in New York and then quickly spreading across the US, it changed the political discourse and offered a radical break from previous approaches to social change, economics, democracy, and political organizing through social media. Occupy also had carry-over effects on the Federal election, and arguably the handling of the debt crisis as well. However, studies of the Occupy movement have tended to minimize the effect of police brutality and the ways in which support for Occupy was galvanized. This paper examines the role law enforcement’s brutality had on the size of demonstrations in support of Occupy and also will discuss the ways in which police actions are shaped by wider power structures (the very power structures Occupy was protesting). It will also inspect the assertions that during the protests, local laws were being changed or manipulated to allow the mistreatment of and at times total disregard for the first amendment rights of the protesters. In terms of methodology, this paper will combine analyses of first-hand accounts of the occupy movement with secondary sources such as media articles and books about the movement. The paper will contribute to the discussions of civil liberties, the right to free speech and to protest, and also to the growing literature on the Occupy protests as a new social movement which is changing the US.

Introduction

The Occupy movement is the newest social movement to emerge in the US, and like previous social movements, has changed the ways in which social inequality is viewed throughout the country. It developed rather spontaneously after the democratic uprisings in the Arab Spring, and was advertised initially by Adbusters as “#Occupy Wall Street Are you ready for a Tahrir moment? On Sept. 17, flood into Manhattan, set up tents, kitchens, peaceful barricades and occupy Wall Street.”

In order to understand how and why the Occupy movement has been successful, it is important to look at the political/economic contexts of these protests.

- The effects of the financial crisis of 2008 have been horrendous and long-lasting;
- Unemployment and under-employment are continuing problems;
- Millions of people have lost their homes;
- Millions more have mortgages which are ‘under water’;
- The gap between the poor and the rich is widening;
– Banks received bailouts but their customers have been suffering and they have not shown compassion;

– Student loans are leaving many people in debt for the rest of their lives.

All of these issues have led to alienation from, and dissatisfaction with, the major parties, for some Americans. This was the economic and political background to the rise of Occupy.

It is probably not a coincidence that Occupy started in New York, the city with the highest discrepancies of wealth in the country. Occupy was motivated by economic injustice, and its message of advancing the rights of 99% of people, and challenging the 1% of wealthiest people in the country, spread rapidly.

This paper will now summarize some of the literature which has been written on Occupy, and will particularly highlight the relationships between protestors and police.

“Occupy Nation” by Todd Gitlin

Gitlin (2012) open’s his non-fiction book that explores Occupy by expressing cynicism about the new movement. While starting off by admitting his involvement with many earlier civil movements, at this time in his life he is comfortable and considering that Occupy may be nothing more than a call from “another one of those puffs of hope and cheerleaders for good causes that blow through cyberspace several times a day.” He acknowledges its differences from the social movements of the 1960’s, and while he is not an immediate fan, it is important that Gitlin does not immediately discredit the Occupy Movement once he actually encounters it. His goal in writing was to try to understand the new movement, and in doing so, he finds himself impressed, and one might even say enamored by, what he finds.

When President Obama was elected into office, not only was he the first African American to hold that office, he had also grown up poor, working his way up through college, moving through local government and helping Chicago’s poorest areas while in the senate. He spoke of a different kind of America, and for many was the physical representation of the kind of change the USA hungers for. People used social media to help elect this President. People, who had been inactive in politics, came to life in hopes of having a man in power be their voice and advocate for their needs. Record numbers within the minority population turned out to elect the President. Here we see Gitlin quickly links the Occupy Wall Street (OWS) movement with the disappointment many people had during President
Obama's first years in office. It seemed as if it was business as usual, the banking system nearly collapsing, manufacturing stood at an all-time low, unemployment at near record numbers, families were being removed from their homes in part due to unregulated and predatory lenders, and all the while the rich and powerful holding one hand out and taking aid from the FED while paying their CEO’s some of the largest bonus’s on record with the other hand. The people had had enough.

Gitlin discusses the economic crisis at length, drawing a terrific image of Wall Street being a whirl wind of wealth; fast paced and exclusive and comparing this to the “rest who call themselves middle class” which agrees with movement’s tone of “Us” and “Them”. He reviews how, after the Great Depression Era, the set of laws and programs called “The New Deal” were set into place so that in the event of another Wall Street crash, people would be protected from losing their entire life savings. This allowed the banks to be insulated from market crashes, when the market would and should reset itself. He reviews how these laws were dismantled, bit by bit, over several decades, and new types of lending institutions were created. Through this, Wall Street became self-regulating, and the wealthy turned these resources back to themselves repeatedly in a sort of incestuous relationship that left 99% of the country out in the cold. OWS claimed is banks became too big to fail, and greed churning was happening right under the noses of the majority population. While somewhat aware, and with the law makers in their pockets, these elite groups of financial titans flash of wealth and power put the populace in a sort of disgusted awe along with a powerless apathy lasting until the latest economic fall. This caused the infuriated Occupy, and other micro groups that were beginning at the same time as Occupy, to take action.

Gitlin shares that a call went out on the social medium called “Twitter” for an idea of “another dream”. Using social media like Twitter was a new way in the US to reach people in civil movements. This, along with Facebook, made the OWS movement light up and spread news quickly. They were able to communicate and share information about what was happening in the movement. Approximately 3 million Americans clicked “like” on one of the 680 OWS related Facebook pages by the time Gitlin authored his book. It was during the early times of utilizing social media that the “We are the 99%” appeared.

Gitlin also writes how this group began postings that were quickly taken down and lost their website domains. The group put out a cry for help, and the online anarchist group called “Anonymous” stepped in to help,
A=99 was born and the word was spreading. They proposed day called Operation Empire State Rebellion Day (OpESR) to protest banks, and the call went out on the internet having some success. The movement continued along akin to a pinball machine. Small groups such as Picture the Homeless, Bloombergville, A=99 and others were being started as the ball was landing and lighting them up making them aware of each other. These "grouplets", as Gitlin calls them, came together and the official Occupy Wall street movement was born.

While writing about the movement, he describes the various kinds of people that make up OWS. This group included Anarchists, political radicals, young people, some homeless people, Native Americans, white people, people that held day jobs and came at night to protest, students, union reps and many more. The movement seemed to represent exactly what they spoke about, the greater number of Americans, the 99%. Gitlin referenced an article published in Vanity Fair written by Joseph E. Stiglitz, a Noble-winning economist. He wrote that this article titled, "Of the 1%, by the 1%, for the 1%," turned the tables on the right wing notion that OWS was about class wars, and brought home that OWS was actually about economic justice and progressive taxation for everyone. "If the 1 percent was responsible for rampant inequality, then the status quo was not warfare at all, but a rout."

Gitlin (following Stiglitz) writes about how live stream feeds, and internet media, helped facilitate the movement and they connect these new technologies directly to the movement’s growth and success. These live streams and video posts of the police brutality occupiers faced protected them and engaged thousands of people to come out in support of this peaceful resistance. Perhaps Gitlin sees this as just part of the mechanics of the movement. This leaderless movement, having no headquarters or press conferences, managed to set tents, collect food and served thousands of meals. Without any designated leaders, medical care was organized, videos were transmitted, libraries were formed, a newspaper published and large group business was conducted using the human-microphone style of communication. This type of communication is noteworthy as the police would not allow the OWS people to use any sort of sound system or mega phones, so a person would speak, and then people would turn to the person behind them and repeat what had been said, passing the information to everyone. Marches were held all throughout New York, and eventually throughout the US. Some marched down busy streets, and others supported homeowners that had lost their residence in the mortgage debacle. Some squatted in homes that had been foreclosed, and others picketed mansions owned by Wall Street CEO's.
Soon OWS collaborated with unions and MoveOn.org to organize marches that had tens of thousands of people. Gitlin suggests expresses that the best “secret weapon” OWS had for growth was the violence of the New York City Police Department. Each time a violent video was posted, the OWS numbers would surge. Throughout the book he writes about several of the violent acts officers did to protestors in the context of the violence being a catalyst for support.

Gitlin does a good job of demonstrating how past movements, the Civil Rights movement, anti-war movements and the Women’s Rights movement all viewed as amazing now, were actually not popular during their time, and yet changes were still established in the social conscience of our country. This is important because OWS was popular. He tells us that while not everyone agreed with the tactics Occupy was using, what it stood for, economic justice and more balance wealth, was extremely popular to the majority of Americans. At the very least, this group was not limited to only getting people talking. The conversation was altered, in such a way, that the working class could agree on the need for change, even if not in agreement on the specific changes needed. It also brought home to many that 1% of the population is controlling the wealth, and therefore controlling the laws and the people that governed them, and was not the America many wanted to be living in any longer.

Gitlin talks about OWS’s growing pains, including a media that would title stories of “violent clashes” with police officers, but he feels that the violence was initiated by the police officers, since Occupy is strongly committed to principles of non-violent resistance. So a person who does headline readings might misinterpret the non-violent protest as something else. The majority of occupiers maintained a non-violent approach, and would in fact de-escalate situations for other occupiers if tempers were flaring. This media approach did divide the nation about the movement, and made some people stay away from the marches in order to be safe. Gitlin makes a direct historical tie to the anti-war movement here, he calls it “a fateful paradox,” where the Vietnam War grew more unpopular but so did the anti-war movement, and OWS was facing some of this as time went on.

He reviews how the hours long meetings (General Assemblies, or GA’s) are managed, and like many other authors, writes about the hand signals used to communicate group agreement, or hissing to show disapproval. People would raise their hands in a triangle above their heads if they wanted to speak, and after requesting waits to be called on by another member of the group. There is even a hand sign for blocking proposals: raised crossed fists.
and forearms. He called the OWS encampments an “oasis”, a place where many people from varied backgrounds and different thought processes carved out a place and everyone could be heard. Everyone was equal, and all basic needs were met in a collaborative way, rather than through a hierarchy filled with political maneuverings where those with wealth and power pushed item through that really only benefitted themselves and their interests. An “oasis” where the hungry were fed, people had access to medical care, literature, were educated and utilized no matter what their bank statement added up to. Setting a sort of example of what our country could be if things were more equal.

Towards the end of the encampments, things were not as buoyant as in the beginning. Gitlin refers to a mental health worker’s remarks that they had become “too intense.” Drugs, sexual harassment, histrionics and even some guns had shown up in camp. But if such things were found – violence in any form – people would either diffuse the situation themselves or report them to police. The mental health care worker said she felt relief when the riot police came into Liberty Square (Zucotti Park) and broke it all up. In fact, Gitlin writes he heard that from more than a dozen occupy people afterwards.

He finally writes about self-governing and that it can be “rewarding.” This reveals a little about his own belief system and where he is writing from. He obviously still has the dream of an America revolutionized. This is not bad in itself, but it is definitely a filter through which he was viewing the movement and its actions. Also, the book leaves a feeling that Gitlin was actually doing what he wrote the media had been doing, trying to put Occupy into a relationship with past movements. While it is important to know and see similar arch’s that each civil movement made in the past, it is also important to view Occupy as something unknown and totally unique, allowing it the opportunity to create its own identity, rather than be a continuation or remake of other social justice movements from the past.

99 nights with the 99% by Chris Farone

Farone (2012) approach to writing about the Occupy Wall street movement is not from a person with a lifetime of experience in civil movements; it is a spirited book that taps into the youthful frustration of the movement itself. He writes a play by play account of his own experience of OWS, sharing even his own drug and alcohol use during various protests. Farone uses a different tone than many of the other OWS writers; his is personal and less scholastic in approach which makes this a sort of educational adventure shared with the reader. Going from city to city, movement to movement, sharing what it is like to watch and record the movement being born in New York, then
blossom, pointing out that it took less than three weeks for the OWS to “clone itself” across the country. He immediately talks about the fact that OWS did get major news coverage, that there wasn’t a media blackout at all, but that the norm of press packets being sent out to various media outlets had not happened. While this adventurer was well aware of what was happening in New York and then Boston, he actually starts his reporting in Florida, with Occupy Miami. The people of this Occupy used the same hand movements and signals as the OWS did in New York and at Occupy Boston. Here they shared similar stories of economic hardship and frustration at a system that was for the rich and had left the middle and working classes, as well as the poor in worry and despair.

His travels took him through Boston, Washington DC, then Baltimore, where he realized that OWS would have trouble attracting people of color to the movement due to the different ways the cultures approached power structures. Faraone talks about the drum circles that were at nearly all the Occupy camps and how they were the both the rhythm for the movement as well as the rub for many, as well as the General assembly that take hours to get things approved, which while tedious was the first opportunity many people had to actually be heard and feel like they were part of a solution.

He continues to share his adventure through Occupy Portland, Philly, back to Wall Street, into Chicago. There is also coverage about Occupy Seattle, where Faraone writes that occupiers were prepared for aggressive police action, and had bandanas soaked in a mix of orange juice and vinegar to off set the police pepper spray due to the police having pepper sprayed a pregnant young woman, a blind man and an 84 year old woman the day before.

Faraone writes candidly about his distrust of the police since his youth due to his own encounters with law enforcement, perhaps this is why it seems he writes more freely than other OWS I’ve read about the friction between the police and the occupiers. He tongue in cheek writes about the police playing “whack-a-mole” with protestors in Portland, talking about the more than rough handling ordered by the mayor Sam Adams in “cleaning” up the two settled occupy camps, even purportedly having killed a young girls puppy called Chubbs. He tells the reader about Oakland CA, and how the “cops” there had nearly fractured the skull of former Marine Scott Olsen. After that, the participants carry “anti-pepper spray” gear. He does report the crowd, while physically non-violent are verbally aggressive with police officers, and the response form police is to impound the party truck for 30 days. That night Oakland is raided and cleared.
Interestingly enough Faraone finds areas of the country where police officers refuse to arrest protestors, Albany being one such place. In finding this information he finds Occupy Police, OcPO, (http://www.occupypolice.org/) where officers can speak openly about Occupy. The Boston police officer giving the information wouldn’t use his real name, which raises the question of how openly are officers really allowed to be on the site, or in general about their support of the protest. OcPo launches operation SHIELD which asks ex-police, civilians and ex-military to put themselves between protestors and cops in hopes of minimizing future confrontations. One success of the SHIELD is Iraq war veteran, Marine Corps Sergeant Shamar Thomas, standing in front of 30 plus police officers in Times Square telling them, “It is not honorable to attack unarmed civilians who carry no weapons, who have no intent or ability to harm you.” Then in a video he states, “It is not honorable to suppress the right to freedom of speech and freedom of association. You carry your badges and your guns and your authority because you are charged with protecting the innocent. We are the innocent. You are working for the criminals.”

I liked the whole book, and thought his writing style easy to follow and read, he did a good job covering Occupy the Hood in Chicago. He directly acknowledges that “some management styles are just incompatible” and that is why Boston had both an Occupy Boston hub and an Occupy the Hood hub. The Occupy the Hood was turned off by Occupy’s model; it’s horizontal democracy and the general assemblies time constraints and what he terms as “passive-aggressive undertones.”

The overall feel for this book is a little chaotic as it jumps from location to location, but its street level reporting really draws the reader into the book, and into the movement. Honest, raw and unapologetic in its youthful view, Faraone has really done well in recording and discussing OWS and in helping us see the similarities of each cities movement, even with the lack official authority in the movement. Finally, he expresses the next step of the movement not through the eyes of an old hand at civil disobedience, but someone that is seeing for the first time that the people hold much more power and authority than they know; in the hopes they will make the changes OWS gave voice to.

**Voices from the 99Percent, an Oral History of the Occupy Wall Street Movement**

Flank (2011) has brought together collections of personal stories from people who were active in the 2011 Occupy Wall Street Movement. Not being limited to a single author, these books contain many stories submitted to
editors who compiled them into these books. *Voices* has a note that all proceeds are being donated to Occupy Wall Street (OWS), and Occupy! noted that “The moral rights of the (stories) authors have been asserted.” Both books let the reader know, from the start, they are in support of the movement and the protestors.

*Voices* begins first with a call to action titled “Who We Are”, which describes how the movements organizers are using OccupyWallSt.org to connect with people all around the globe. The book embraces the global movements that had happened before OWS by saying, “Inspired by the popular assemblies of Egypt, Spain, Oaxaca and worldwide, those gathered will work to find common voice in one clear unified demand.” This statement shows that, at the beginning, even the creators of the movement had not fully anticipated what would evolve from this first posting. No single clear, official, demand has ever been issued from OWS. Perhaps, the clear demand has been implied: the demand for equality for all people regarding the financial markets; meaning an end to the political and financial situation that allows 1% of the population to control over 40% of the wealth according to Yahoo Finance. ([http://finance.yahoo.com/blogs/daily-ticker/top-5-facts-america-richest-1-183022655.html](http://finance.yahoo.com/blogs/daily-ticker/top-5-facts-america-richest-1-183022655.html))

Similar to other OWS books, there is a lot of information about the General Assemblies and the drum circles, but what makes these books unique and interesting to read is that one gains an understanding on how people were involved in the evolution of their own thinking and understanding. People expressed anger, concern and boredom. There are stories of people being inspired, then motivating others to examine the situations they find themselves, and take action, where ever they can, to forge the world they desire to live in. “Occupy something” is heard throughout the literature. These two books are also terrific at touching in with very small town movements, where other books look mostly at the larger cities. *Voices* skillfully brings in global support pieces, making it clear that the author sees OWS as part of the global movement, and not simply an issue for the USA.

Throughout both books there are stories about the police, including events that transpire between officers and occupiers. In *Voices*, there are reports about the police attacking people standing on the sidewalk, and making them move from place to place in through threat of being arrested. There are people who wrote about “police harassment”, where officers were making violent arrests on the grounds of minor infractions in order to intimidate other people into leaving the protests. There are brief personal accounts of the police arresting people for taking photos, for walking on the sidewalks and one woman wrote her account of being tricked by the NYPD on the
Brooklyn Bridge only to then be arrested by those same police officers. The book contains writings from individuals about when different Occupy Camps were raided and broken up by police in several cities. These stories seemed to have some element of anger, yet relief, as the tensions that had been building throughout the movement had finally reached some sort of conclusion.

These personal stories are not simply individual allegations of mistreatment or police brutality. A much larger study by the Global Justice Clinic (NYU School of Law) and the Walter Leitner International Human Rights Clinic at the Leitner Center for International Law and Justice (Fordham Law School) (2012) concluded:

Since the start of Occupy Wall Street in New York City on September 17, 2011, there have been reports of repeated excessive or unnecessary police use of force, massive and continuous over-policing and poor communication, obstruction of press freedoms and independent legal monitoring, police surveillance, unjustified restrictions on the ability of individuals to peacefully assemble in public spaces, arbitrary rule enforcement, and transparency failures. There has also been near complete impunity for alleged abuses.

They specifically list the following incidents of concern:

- Aggressive, unnecessary and excessive police force against peaceful protesters, bystanders, legal observers, and journalists;
- Obstruction of press freedoms and independent legal monitoring;
- Pervasive surveillance of peaceful political activity;
- Violent late-night raids on peaceful encampments;
- Unjustified closure of public space, dispersal of peaceful assemblies, and kittling (corralling and trapping) of protesters;
- Arbitrary and selective rule enforcement and baseless arrests;
- Failures to ensure transparency about applicable government policies; and
- Failures to ensure accountability for those allegedly responsible for abuses.
The most notorious incident of alleged police brutality in New York involved a police officer who pepper sprayed a group of female protestors who were standing on the side of the street, who had already been detained. One report commented:

Two videos have received the most notoriety since the incident. The first to surface shows Kelly approaching a group of demonstrators, including Elliott, macing them without provocation and then walking away. In the aftermath of that posting, another YouTube user has uploaded a video supposedly taken moments later in which Bologna approaches fleeing demonstrators and a member of the press and takes aim again. http://rt.com/usa/mace-nypd-bologna-investigation-703/, accessed April 2, 2013.

Occupy! Scenes from Occupied America

Occupy! Scenes from Occupied America, edited by Blumenkranz, Gessen, Greif and Leonard (2011), also contains firsthand accounts of altercations with the police. In addition, there are persons that write that the specific reason they came to the movement was due to seeing the police brutality, and wanting to do something about it. One of the authors, Manissa Maharawal, wrote, “...after hearing about the arrests and police brutality on Saturday and after hearing that thousands of people had turned up for their march, I decided to see for myself.” Occupy! shares information like the “Stop-and-Frisk” action, that according to the authors, Svetlana Kitto and Celeste Dupuy-Spencer, began in Harlem. They called it the NYPD policy of stop-and frisk saying it is illegal and unconstitutional, as it “overwhelmingly targets black and Latino men...” In this account, there is a very organized arrest of twenty seven protestors that had volunteered to be arrested before the march against the “Stop-and Frisk” policy began. The book includes what may seem irrelevant to some, but seems important in the context of the whole relationship with the police and the protestors: “We reconvene on the corner. Some guy- possibly hired - agitates and is arrested.” There is a mistrust of such magnitude for the local authorities expressed again and again in these books; many occupiers think the police had hired or planted spies and people to agitate the marches in order to intimidate others from joining or staying.

Both books provide superb first person accounts and records of the movement. Voices contains more global voices and information whilst Occupy! seems to have a more personal approach with art from various protestors included in it. Both show the complexity of gathering people, from varied backgrounds and persuasions, together and
give them back their voice. The pitfalls, triumphs and mundane aspects that were needed in order to be addressed and handled are completely covered in these books, providing one a much broader understanding of who is Occupy and what the people that identify themselves as part of Occupy were, and are still trying, to accomplish for the 99%.

**Conclusion**

This paper has suggested that Occupy is an important social movement which has brought new perspectives on social inequality, in particular the unequal distribution of wealth throughout the United States. It has further suggested that police brutality led to a backlash which only served to enhance the popularity of Occupy. Ironically enough, the police officers themselves are not particularly well paid – according to the analysis of the people involved in Occupy, they would be a part of the 99%, but their actions (at least inadvertently) were defending the privileges of the 1%, which Occupy sought to challenge.

**References**

Blumenkranz, Carla; Gessen, Keith; Greif, Mark and Leonard, Sarah (Eds.) (2011) *Occupy! Scenes from Occupied America*, New York, NY: Verso


In a recent paper, Paul Draper (2013) argues that Bergmann’s (2001, 2008) version of skeptical theism fails to undermine “Hume-style” evidential arguments from evil, specifically his own 1989 argument. Draper addresses, correctly, how Bergmann’s skeptical-theist theses (“ST1-4”) successfully dispel Rowe-style “noseeum” evidential arguments from evil, yet fail to address his own 1989 argument. However, Draper’s formulation of “STe”—the thesis that Draper believes the “pure” skeptical theist needs to properly address his 1989 argument—includes a crucial flaw. Although Draper’s argument for the unreasonableness of STe is sound, its success is irrelevant, as STe is not the thesis the skeptical theist needs to defend. I will propose a new skeptical theist thesis—ST5—that (like STe) implies that Draper’s argument fails, but that (unlike STe) is plausible.

In response to Michael Bergmann’s 2008 formulation of “skeptical theism,” Paul Draper’s thorough, fair, and exacting reply is nothing short of impressive. First, he assesses how Bergmann’s “pure” skeptical theism successfully (well, for the most part) dismisses the challenges presented by Rowe-style, “noseeum” evidential arguments from evil. However, contrary to the claims of Bergmann, Draper argues that a “pure” skeptical theism of Bergmann’s ilk falls short of accounting for “Hume-style” evidential arguments from evil that Draper himself champions. I’ll begin with a quick summary of the context and nomenclature that pertains to his argument.

The problem of evil—that there seems to be some sort of contradiction or tension between the belief that an omnipotent, omniscient, and omnibenevolent God (a “tri-omni God” for short) exists and the belief that evils exist—comes in two main varieties. The older version, the logical problem of evil, attempts to show that there is a logical contradiction between these two beliefs. The other, the evidential problem of evil, can be considered the logical problem’s more developed and sophisticated cousin. Evidential arguments from evil argue that the evils in our world are significant evidence against the existence of a tri-omni God. Furthermore, there are two main types of evidential

---

1 Bergmann (2008) and Draper (2013)
2 Draper refers to Bergmann’s skeptical-theism schema as “pure” in that it is defined in contrast to the “defense-based” sort of van Inwagen’s (1991), or the “principle-based” sort of Wykstra’s (1984).
3 Draper concludes at the end of his discussion of the Rowe-style arguments’ relationship to “pure” skeptical theism: “… I leave open the question of whether it ultimately refutes the strongest members of this class.” (2013, p. 102)
arguments—Rowe-style arguments and Draper-style arguments (though, other types do exist). The former, in a nutshell, argues that the failure of theodicy—the apparent fact that we cannot conceive of potential God-justifying reasons for the allowance of such evil—gives us significant evidence against the existence of a tri-omni God. The other sort deserves more explication, as it is the sort of argument we are concerned with here. For brevity and pertinence’s sake, I’ll focus on Draper’s 1989 argument.

Draper (1989) doesn’t argue directly against the existence of the theistic God by evidential probabilities a la Rowe; rather, he does so indirectly by arguing that an alternative cosmological hypothesis (the “hypothesis of indifference”) better “fits” the evidence we have regarding evil in the world. That is, Draper argues that what we know about pain and pleasure is antecedently more probable given this alternative than given theism. Letting “O” stand for the observations and testimony upon which our knowledge about pain and pleasure is based, Draper’s 1989 argument suggests that, independent of the testimony and observations reported by O, O is much more probable on the assumption that the cosmos was created by an indifferent being than it is on the assumption that it was created by a tri-omni God. Therefore, O significantly favors the hypothesis of indifference as opposed to theism. Because the hypothesis of indifference is in contention with the theistic alternative, O is supposed to create an evidential problem for theists.

Lastly, the term “Skeptical Theism”, coined by Draper himself (though he originally called it the “infinite intellect defense”), refers to a class of responses to the evidential problem of evil which appeal to our ignorance of the realm of value. Since we know so little about what goods and evils there ultimately are (and how they might be related logically to the evils we find in the world), says skeptical theism, we are in no such position to say that goods or evils represent significant evidence against (or for) the existence of a tri-omni God. Some skeptical theists (e.g., Wykstra, or van Inwagen) prefer to emphasize the gulf between human ignorance and divine knowledge, while others (e.g., Bergmann) prefer to focus exclusively on our sheer ignorance of the realm of value. Skeptical theism thus acts

---

4 Draper prefers to call argument styles of this sort “Hume-style”, as the technique was inspired by a discussion in book X of Hume’s *Dialogues Concerning Natural Religion*. For exemplary papers of these sorts, see Rowe (1996) and Draper (1989).
5 See Draper (1996)
as a defense against both sorts of the evidential argument from evil, as it claims that we are too ignorant to know what is or isn’t likely on a theistic assumption.

Essentially, Bergmann’s skeptical theism fails to dispel the problems raised by the 1989 argument because his argumentation confuses all-things-considered probabilities with antecedent probabilities. As Bergmann’s argument ignores the concept of an antecedent probability, his argument against Draper’s 1989 argument is ineffective. Later revisions of the argument, which attempt to account for this problem, render the argument to be unconvincing for various reasons that cannot be divulged into here. In any event, I find myself convinced that Bergmann’s skeptical-theist theses are unable to dispel Draper’s argument—it is the next step of Draper’s argument that I dispute.

Having illustrated the failure of Bergmann’s theses to dispel his 1989 argument, Draper turns to see if the skeptical theist can salvage a response. He formulates “STe”—the thesis that he believes the “pure” skeptical theist needs in order to properly address his 1989 argument.

**STe**: We have no good reason to believe that prima facie non-instrumental badness, goodness, or value-neutrality is correlated with ultima facie non-instrumental badness, goodness, or value-neutrality. Draper successfully argues for the implausibility of STe; however, I will argue that STe is flawed in that its success or failure is irrelevant. I will first assess Draper’s argument for the implausibility of STe, and then move on to discussing how the skeptical theist can agree with the implausibility of STe. I will argue that Draper’s focus on our ability to discern the value of specific instances of evil in O misleads him into applying this argument to his 1989 argument, which is contextualized on all of O.

---

6 There is no need to go into Draper’s discussion of the failure of Bergmann’s theses in any detail for the purposes of this short paper. This paper is to address what the “pure” skeptical theist can opt to argue in lieu of Draper’s argument for the failure of Bergmann’s theses to dispel the 1989 argument, drawn from C.

7 This is only slightly modified from Draper’s (2013) STe. From here on out, any reference to STe might as well be considered as one to STe*. Indeed, STe* actually gives STe more explicative power, as it includes negative correlation and ties correlations between all three qualities mutually. Here is the original STe:

“We have no good reason to believe that prima facie non-instrumental badness is positively correlated with ultima facie non-instrumental badness, no good reason to believe that prima facie non-instrumental goodness is positively correlated with ultima facie non-instrumental goodness, and no good reason to believe that prima facie non-instrumental value-neutrality is positively correlated with ultima facie non-instrumental value-neutrality.” (Draper [2013, 109])
Draper believes he has set up the skeptical theist with the thesis that he or she needs to reject his 1989 argument. As he explains, if STe is true, the *prima facie* evils reported by O “are no more likely, *antecedently*, to be ultima facie non-instrumentally good.” So, if STe is true, then theism does not “undercut the support that our background knowledge gives for O.” If STe is true, then the facts about pain and pleasure reported by O do not correlate to the *antecedent* probability of O on T, and the argument does not follow.

If STe is at all reasonable then, according to Draper, the “pure” skeptical theist indeed *does* have a defense against his 1989 argument, regardless of the failure Bergmann’s skeptical-theist theses. Draper, however, contends that “we have very good reason to believe that prima facie non-instrumental badness is positively correlated with ultima facie non-instrumental badness in the case of many of the evils reported by O.” His argument, despite what its prolix description might feign at first glance, is quite simple.

Consider the diagram to the right. The line on the left, labeled “IV”, plots the intrinsic value of the goods and evils that O reports; the line on the right, labeled “ATC V”, plots the all-things-considered value of the goods and evils that O reports. “All-things-considered” value is, for Draper, the mean of both intrinsic and extrinsic (non-instrumental) values. Let points A, B, C, D, and E all represent the value of (either) goodness or badness of the evils (or goods) that O reports. Let “o” represent the level value-neutrality—any points below it are of negative value, and any points above it are of positive value.

STe states that our *prima facie* knowledge of the value of evils that O reports is not indicative of the all-things-considered value of those evils. However, Draper argues that given our knowledge of the evils reported by O, we can at least establish that the intrinsic value of the evils reported by O are negative (put this at point “A” on the left.

---


9 According to Draper, the skeptical theist will need to argue in the following manner: Since, the *prima facie* negative intrinsic moral value of pain in persons reported by O is not directly indicative of the ultima facie moral value of the pain (as we are completely ignorant of their logical entailment relations by STe), there is no reason to assume that this fact about pain and pleasure reported by O is antecedently more probable on HI than on T. Ergo, if STe is true, then Draper’s arguments for C in his 1989 argument “[fail] to show that O is antecedently less likely given theism than it is given HI.”


11 I am grateful to Paul Draper for critiquing this schematic.
line in the diagram). By Draper’s “counterbalancing” move\textsuperscript{12}, we know that the extrinsic (non-instrumental) value of these evils is just as likely to be negative than positive. Given that the intrinsic value of the evils reported by O is negative (point A), and that the extrinsic value of the evils reported by O is no more likely to be positive than negative, the all-things-considered value of the evils reported by O is very likely to be negative\textsuperscript{13, 14}. So contrary to STe, we “have very good reason” to believe that our prima facie knowledge of the evils O reports give us a positively correlation to the all-things-considered value of those evils. Since STe is implausible, “pure” skeptical theism fails—Q.E.D.

I can see three potential ways to respond to Draper’s argument here. The first response would be to espouse a skepticism so strong that it claims one could never be justified in asserting a sort of “intrinsic value” to a given set of goods or evils reported by O. This concept is intriguing. Is there an objective way to measure moral “intrinsic value” in the quantitative manner (viz., in “turps”) that Draper’s argument requires? I think, perhaps, that epistemic peers might be able to come to a general consensus regarding relational statements of measures of value between goods and evils (such as “A is more positively valued than B”); but as to agreeing on how much more valuable A is than B, that just seems rather implausible. If it is indeed impossible to quantify value of this sort, then that would (seem to) entail the impossibility of creating a scale with a definite cut-off between “positive” and

\textsuperscript{12} This tactic of Draper’s is first employed in his 1989 article. Essentially, if we are truly in the dark that there are possible unknown good reasons for God to allow the evils that O reports, then we are also truly in the dark to possible unknown bad reasons for God allowing the evils that O reports. Hence, if we are truly in the dark as to these unknown reasons that God has, there is an equal chance that any evil reported by O will be for a greater evil than for a greater good. He applies this to STe on page 110: “… it is no more likely that there are unknown greater goods that entail the prima facie evils with which we are familiar than that there are unknown greater evils that entail those evils.”

\textsuperscript{13} Remember, the ATC value is dependent on both intrinsic and extrinsic (non-instrumental) value.

\textsuperscript{14} The explicit core argument here is the following. First, let’s assume that that the intrinsic value of evils A is -4 “turps.” “Ai” stands for the “intrinsic value of evil(s) A reported by O”, “Ae” stands for the “extrinsic value of evil(s) A reported by O”, and “ATCvA” stands for “the all-things-considered value of A”; a negative value indicates badness and a positive value indicates goodness, and “>!” means “very much greater than”.

1. $Ai = -4$ (premise)
2. $[Pr(Ae > 0) = .5] \& [Pr(Ae < 0) = .5]$ (premise)
3. $ATCvA = (Ai + Ae)/2$ (premise)
4. $ATCvA = (-4 + Ae)/2$ (from 1, 3)
5. $So, Pr(ATCvA < 0) >! Pr(ATCvA > 0)$ (from 2, 4)
6. We have very good reason to believe that prima facie knowledge of Ai is correlated to ATCvA. (from 5)
7. Therefore, STe is false. (from 6)
“negative” value. This may or may not be a major problem for Draper’s argument—I certainly will not pursue it any further, though it does seem to be a very promising route.

A second way would be to state that, in some form, it is impossible for us to know that there is a 50/50 chance of God allowing either an unknown greater good for an evil or an unknown greater evil for an evil—that is, argue that we cannot apply Draper’s “counterbalancing move” to God. This would be hard to argue however, as it seems prima facie question-begging; though it doesn’t seem completely hopeless to me. The third way, which I believe seems the most straightforward, is to accept the implausibility of STe though find fault with STe itself.

I contend that Draper’s argument for the implausibility of STe is sound; however, he is wrong in claiming that the “pure” skeptical theist needs STe to account for his 1989 argument from evil. I will now explicate this misconception, modify Draper’s STe into a proper skeptical theist thesis (viz., one that the skeptical theist indeed needs to defend to dispel Draper’s 1989 argument) and then illustrate its plausibility.

Draper’s STe: Why it isn’t pertinent to the Skeptical Theist

Imagine, potential paradoxes aside, that there is a religion which adheres to the belief in an omnipotent “infinite intellect” who is moreover wholly malevolent. Suppose also that they form a “skeptical malevolent theism” to answer the “evidential problem of goodness.” As it turns out, Draper thinks he can refute skeptical malevolent theism by showing the implausibility of his new “SMTe.” In fact, he can refute it in the same manner that he refutes STe; however, he would need to appeal to the prima facie goods that O reports. He would then show that since O reports goods which have an intrinsic value D (on the chart a few pages back), the all-things-considered value of the goods that O reports is positively correlated with those prima facie goods. Thus, Draper would conclude, we have “very good reason” to believe that the prima facie goods we know of are indeed probably good all-things-considered.

What is the point of this silly story? It shows that Draper’s argument gleans the all-things-considered value of evils from instances of evil that O reports, not from the entirety of O itself. The skeptical-theist of the Bergmann

---

15 Bergmann (2008) may indeed be suggesting something like this when he responds to the “Bernstein-inspired” advantage to Draper-style arguments (pp. 385-386).

16 The idea of a wholly malevolent “supreme” being has been challenged as impossible by many theologians throughout Christendom—let’s just try to allow for some willful suspension of disbelief for the time being.

17 The content of the thesis would be identical to STe, since STe discusses goodness, badness, and value-neutrality.
vein—who makes an appeal to our sheer ignorance of the realm of value—needs to dismiss C because it has too broad of a scope. Draper’s 1989 argument considers the entirety of O\(^\text{18}\) (which includes all of our background information of good and evil) on Theism and the Hypothesis of Indifference—not just information about evils in O independently, or information about goods in O independently.

In essence, Draper’s argument discussed above for the implausibility of STe delineates

(i) There is a correlation between “the intrinsic value of particular instances of good and evil included in the complex state of affairs O reports” and “the all-things-considered value of those instances of good and evil within the complex state of affairs O reports.”

It does not delineate

(ii) There is a correlation between “the intrinsic value of particular instances of good and evil included in the complex state of affairs O reports” and “the all-things-considered value of the complex state of affairs O reports itself.”

(ii), I believe, is what the “pure” skeptical theist needs to deny; what Draper’s argument shows, (i), is of no crucial concern for the “pure” skeptical theist (as will be argued shortly). Draper’s argument for the implausibility STe is drawn from the fact that our prima facie knowledge of the negative value of the instances of evil in the complex state of affairs O reports give us credence to believe that those instances are probably all-things-considered negative. Draper’s 1989 argument is conditioned on all of O—the entire complex state of affairs reported by O. Hence, to respond to the 1989 argument, the skeptical theist needs to deny that we have a good reason to believe that prima facie evils within O are correlated with the all-things-considered value of O.

Why does the skeptical theist need to deny (ii) to be able to dispel the challenge posed by Draper’s C (the statement which his argument defends)? Let’s look at C in Draper’s 1989 argument:

C: \[ \Pr(O/\text{HI}) >! \Pr(O/T) \]

“Pr(x/y)” means “the antecedent probability that x is true given y”; and “>!” means “many times greater than.” “O” stands for “a statement reporting the observations of pain and pleasure and the testimony about pain and pleasure which what we know about pain and pleasure is based.” “T” means “standard tri-omni Theism” and “HI” means the

\(^{18}\)Bracketing, of course, the “observations and testimony reported”. Draper (2013, 103)
“hypothesis of indifference” (which states that “neither the nature nor the condition of sentient beings in earth is the result of benevolent or malevolent actions performed by non-human persons.”). Thus, as Draper puts it in “quasi-English”, C states:

“Independent of the observations and testimony reported by O—but not independent of background information—O is many times more likely on the assumption that the hypothesis of indifference is true than it is on the assumption that theism is true.” 19

It is important to notice that O is contextualized on all of our background information. That means that O, as we are discussing it, is said with respect to all relevant information regarding our complex state of affairs in our background knowledge; so C is, broadly, covering all that we know about both pain and pleasure with regards to our entire complex state of affairs. Moreover, O is reporting all that we know about both pain and pleasure, not what we know about certain instances of either pain or pleasure. The “pure” skeptical theist simply denies that we know enough about the realm of value within our complex state of affairs to assert that O gives us such evidence. That is, we know so little about pain and pleasure that we have no good reason to think that what we do know about it is representative of the entire complex state of affairs. When Draper’s STe refers only to particular known instances of either good or evil, it does not account for the whole of O. However, the skeptical theist needs to contend that we are in the dark about the entire over-all balance of good and evil in our complex state of affairs reported by O.

No one would deny that we can, in some manner, have at least limited knowledge as to the intrinsic value20 of some instances of goodness and evil. Since (ii) refers to having credence to discern a correlation between “the prima facie goods and evils within O” and “the all-things-considered value of the complex state of affairs that O reports itself”—and that we know the first conjunct is true—the skeptical theist needs to deny that we have the ability to discern the all-things-considered value of all of O. If we are unable to discern the all-things-considered value of O by our prima facie knowledge of various goods and evils reported in O, then we are ultimately in the dark as to how probable, antecedently, the entirety of O is on the theistic assumption.

19 Draper (2013, p. 103)
20 And also extrinsic value, and thus all-things-considered value, if we are to go along with Draper’s argument discussed above. It is also important to remember the possibility that this statement is skipping around the objection stated in an earlier footnote.
I will now post “ST5”.

**ST5:** We have no good reason to believe that known, probable *ultima facie* non-instrumental badness, goodness, or value-neutrality *within* the complex state of affairs O reports is correlated with the *ultima facie* non-instrumental badness, goodness, or value-neutrality of the complex state of affairs O reports.21

ST5 is the thesis that the “pure” skeptical theist will need to defend in order to dispel Draper’s 1989 argument. ST5 is a very different skeptical-theist thesis than Bergmann’s ST4.22 Bergmann’s ST4 states that we are in the dark as to the all-things-considered (intrinsic and extrinsic) non-instrumental value of instances of good and evil we know within our complex state of affairs. ST5, however, states that we are in the dark as to the all-things-considered (intrinsic and extrinsic) non-instrumental value of the entire complex state of affairs itself. ST5 is compatible with saying that an evil, as considered in the complex state of affairs in which we are epistemically situated, is indeed probably all-things-considered evil (as Draper’s argument regarding STe illustrates); however, ST5 claims that even if we know that instances of evil may be probably all-things-considered evil in our complex state of affairs, this in no way relates to our knowledge of the overall quality of the complex state of affairs *itself*. On ST5, we cannot discern, even in any probabilistic sense, the all-things-considered value of the *entire* complex state of affairs that O reports. Thus, on ST5, C is false.

C is false on ST5 because we don’t get any *interesting* probabilities. C, recall, holds that O gives *strong* evidence for HI over T. When discussing a small pool of known *instances*, one can use Draper’s argument to show that *those instances* are strong evidence for HI over T, but O is not an instance. O must be considered in terms of the overall balance between goodness and badness within it.

Notice that ST5 does not preclude inductive reasoning.23 Given Draper’s argument, any *known* evils are yet *evidence* (on a relevance theory of confirmation) that O is all-things-considered (that is, overall, or higher proportionately) evil. ST5 just claims that these known evils aren’t *interesting* evidence, let alone *strong* evidence.

---

21 I am thankful to Travis Derico for a slight modification of this thesis.

22 **ST4:** We have no good reason for thinking that the total moral value or disvalue we perceive in certain complex states of affairs accurately reflects the total moral value or disvalue they really have. Bergmann (2008, p. 279)

23 Thanks to Ian Schnee for raising this concern.
(which is what C purports). Allow me to illustrate. Consider an urn filled with red and blue marbles. Let red marbles represent instances of evil, and blue marbles instances of good. Let the filled urn represent our complex state of affairs. Reaching in to the urn, you pull out five marbles—four red, and one blue. On the relevance theory, this is evidence that the urn is disproportionately red. Likewise, Draper's statement O is evidence that the complex state of affairs is disproportionately evil (or, all-things-considered evil). The question becomes, however, how much evidence are these evils? Let's go back to the urn example. If the urn is relatively small, say, the volume of a coffee mug, your drawing 4/5 red marbles is pretty strong evidence that the urn is disproportionately filled with red marbles. But consider that the urn is immense—such as, say, the volume of the Pacific Ocean. Given how irreducibly complex our state of affairs is at any time t, I think this is a fair analogy. Finding 4/5 red marbles in an urn the size of the Pacific Ocean is pretty weak evidence—in fact, negligible evidence. The same goes for our known instances of evil within our complex state of affairs. Granting how complex our state of affairs is, it would take a nearly omniscient person to know enough instances to be able to discern that these evils are strong evidence that the complex state of affairs is probably all-things-considered evil. Draper's C says that O is strong evidence, and granting our extreme ignorance about the realm of value (that is, on “pure” skeptical theism), such a claim seems implausible.

Is ST5 Plausible?

As Michael Bergmann states, “It just doesn’t seem unlikely that our understanding of the realm of value falls miserably short of capturing all that is true about that realm.”\(^{24}\) I have some deep sentiments with what this quotation is addressing. Nonetheless, one may feel obliged to object to ST5 and our inability to discern the all-things-considered value of our entire complex state-of-affairs. For example, one may be inclined to say that it is possible that a person—say a Data-esque\(^{25}\) cyborg from the future—could have prima facie exhaustive knowledge of every single instance which can have a moral value ascribed to it. If this is possible, then by way of Draper's argument, the cyborg may have credence to judge the all-things-considered value of everything—every instance in the complex state of affairs that O reports—and thus be able to discern how likely the antecedent probability of O really is on theism and the hypothesis of indifference.

\(^{24}\) Bergmann (2001, p. 279)

\(^{25}\) This is a Star Trek: The Next Generation reference.
There are multiple issues going on here, however: for one, this does not account for a “general” skepticism about our knowledge of the value realm. This relates to my earlier concern about the sheer possibility of quantifying (and thus stratifying) moral value. Also, it just seems utterly implausible to think that we could produce a truly omniscient—even in the first-order level—cyborg, who could know intrinsic values of every event occurring at a single instance of time in an entire complex state of affairs.

Even if these issues could be addressed, one would need to explain how assigning a probability on the all-things-considered value of the constituent parts of O translated into a probability on the all-things-considered quality of the whole of O. That is, one confronts the metaphysical problem associated with a tertium quid (or Gestalt), characterized by the phrase, “the whole is more than the sum of its parts.” Consider the following: if God’s allowing free will (or at least the illusion of it) is of substantial value (which, for all the skeptical theist knows, it is), then perhaps God’s allowing (or at least giving the illusion of) the free will that actualized these evils, which are indeed all-things-considered bad when viewed in isolation, nonetheless made the complex state of affairs overall good. A recent paper by David Anderson has, in fact, explicated just this point. According to Anderson,

“… skeptical theism does not imply our inability to make certain judgments of [all-things-considered] value. … There is no inconsistency [in] claiming, of some event E, both that E is bad [all-things-considered] (i.e., the world really would be a better place if E had never happened), and that, for all we know, it is better that God did not intervene to prevent E than if he had intervened.”

I haven’t enough room here to explicate and analyze his theses, but as far as my reading of Anderson’s argument can tell, it seems far from implausible.

---

26 By “first-level” omniscience I mean sort of what is meant in literary studies by a “third person, limited” narrator—one who knows the prima facie intrinsic qualities of every instance of value, but cannot go any further. For example, this cyborg might know that a person’s beating on another person has a negative intrinsic value, but they could be mistaken in that, say, the person doing the beating is sociopathic and gets pleasure out of the crime. Thus, the intrinsic good from the beater’s pleasure cannot be taken into account here.

27 Anderson (2012)

28 Ibid., p. 37

29 Anderson adroitly illustrates that the skeptical theist’s skepticism is, explicitly, about “whether there might be reasons justifying God’s non-intervention” in a complex state of affairs which includes evil, not whether there might be reasons justifying the evil(s) themselves. Thus, the skeptical theist is entirely open to accept (i). What the
Conclusion

It just simply seems strange to me to think that anyone could, in any way, grasp the all-things-considered value of an entire complex state-of-affairs, except of course God Itself. Consider the following: on your drive home one night, you spot a person stabbing another outside an abandoned building. It doesn't take a philosophically inclined individual to grasp that such an instance is one of evil. If one had read (and been convinced by) Draper's argument to dispel STe, then perhaps he or she could even come to the conclusion that the act also, when considered in isolation, probably also has negative all-things-considered value. Even though you can grant that this instance, in isolation, has an all-things-considered negative value, that consolation does not in any way mean that the entire complex state of affairs is thus affected. An obvious, and frankly banal, possible explanation is that God simply had reasons for allowing it which are outside of our ken. That is, for all we know, God has other reasons for allowing instances of evil within a complex states of affairs which contribute as a holistic good (or evil\(^{30}\)) to the complex state of affairs itself, e.g., free will (or at least the illusion of it). In any event, it is important to note that this tertium quid problem only arises if one could address my prior complaints.

Again, it certainly seems implausible to think that it could be possible to know the overall intrinsic value of goodness or evil of the entire current state of affairs (thus having the ability to discern a probably all-things-considered value, via Draper's argument). I also doubt that we could ever be able to discern a value on the “IV” line (on the chart a few pages back) to an entire complex state of affairs. Unless we can discern these values in interesting\(^{31}\) probabilistic terms, we are truly in the dark as to how likely O is on T, and thus Draper's 1989 argument fails.

I believe that both my previous concerns and Anderson's (2012) discussion have helped elucidate the compatibility of accepting (i), which Draper’s argument successfully illustrates, and denying (ii), which the “pure”

skeptical theist will be skeptical toward are the reasons justifying God’s non-intervention in the complex state of affairs. On ST5 then, the skeptical theist can claim that, for all we know, God has separate reasons (as God is far beyond our ken) for permitting the goods and evils which speak on behalf of the entire complex state of affairs’ value, and as such their justification is not directly related to the occurrence of the evils themselves, be they (when considered individually) all-things-considered evil or all-things-considered good. The reasons justifying God’s non-intervention, then, could very likely be that God’s non-intervention gave the entire complex state of affairs an overall higher intrinsic value than it would have had had God not intervened.

30 This is in anticipation of Draper’s “counterbalancing move.”

31 This means that we could predicate “low”, “middling”, or “high” to a probability. “Non-interesting” probabilities include “more than 0” or “less than 1.”
skeptical theist must do to dispel the 1989 argument from evil. If ST5 is an open, and plausible, thesis, then I conclude this paper by affirming that the “pure” skeptical theist of a Bergmann vein might indeed have a formidable response to the Hume-style evidential arguments from evil which Draper champions. In the very least, the skeptical theist has a formidable defense against Draper’s 1989 argument from evil.

Acknowledgments I am grateful for the helpful insights and criticisms of Paul Draper and Mark Satta in the conception of this paper. I am incredibly thankful to Paul Draper for his helpful critiques throughout the paper’s development.

References:
The Significance and Functions of English Education

Sir Francis Bacon once said, “Reading maketh a full man, conference a ready man, and writing an exact man,” and these three principles, examined closely, construct the department of English as it is known in education today. The practice of reading teaches students to be analytical; the ethics in the stories prepare students to become moral critics in their society. Conference is confrontation, the application of lessons learned in school utilized outside of the classroom. Writing is both an exact science and a creative expression that allows one to develop professional skills and exercise one’s own voice. Writing, reading and conference take many directions in education in America, but it is in the English classroom where the three skills converge, under the guidance of critical pedagogy, to empower students with the ability to play an active role in society. Critical pedagogy encourages activism inside and outside of the classroom so that students can contribute to the democratic society in which they live. Before students have anything to say, they must first be able to think analytically and feel comfortable questioning what seems established, a skill focused on in literature classes. Once a student has formed an original view or thought worth sharing, she must endeavor to creatively and competently spread her voice, and it is in the composition classroom where this liberating language is learned. English courses struggle with low enrollment in society today, as some critics attempt to argue that such classes are not validated and ultimately offer students no tangible skills. Teaching students to think independently, teaching students to have a voice, teaching students to speak up: these are not assets focused on in other classes, where rote memorization and multiple-choice tests can adequately measure the knowledge gained. While the nature of the English classroom has shifted continuously since its foundation, it has consistently acted as a site of social change, and it is through viewing English education as a progressive construct that its validity is confirmed.

The start of critical pedagogy in the English classroom was socio-economically both an empowering tool of liberation, and a misused tool of domination. English as a subject was founded by Adam Smith who, in an effort to advance the financial success of his native Scottish countrymen, devised an English class that would allow the Scottish to assimilate to the dominant culture of Great Britain and rise in social status (Richter 17). The English
language became a key to success for the Scottish; knowing English was liberation from poverty in Scotland. However, English was simultaneously being used to promote the dominant culture of Great Britain, and in so doing, the unique customs and practices of the Scottish people were diminishing. Still, the idea of English education as a mechanism for assimilation and sociological unification remained a popular belief that contributed to the establishment of the English classroom in America. In America, practicing conformity in the English classroom did not slow down until the 1940s and was finally halted in the 1960s (18). Sadly, many cultures and languages, including those of many Native Americans, were lost due to forced acculturation. But despite its flaws, the assimilation of traditionally non-English speaking citizens in America had been financially rewarding, just as it had been for the Scottish. Thus, English education had contributed to the creation of a middle class, and as the middle class grew, the need for assimilation as a tool to promote higher social standing decreased. When English classrooms no longer needed to focus on presenting and enforcing a dominant culture revision became necessary.

The poor in America, like the aforementioned Scottish who sought to assimilate with Britain, used English education to elevate in social standing; eventually the middle class became the largest social class and at the same time made a pedagogy that pushed for attaining a middle class standing outdated. The old ideologies for teaching English could no longer help the majority of students who were already a part of the middle class, and therefore it was failing to provide genuine opportunity for these students. However, the pedagogy pushing for conformity with the middle class did not readily vanish despite becoming antiquated, and as a result it merely maintained a social mobility, keeping class status stagnant. If the middle class is crowded and incapable of climbing the social ladder, it creates a situation in which the poor class is unable to merge with the crowded middle class. Whether an English classroom is maintaining or promoting social standing can be directly linked to teacher expectations. Sociologist James Henslin affirms that “Schools for the middle class... stress ‘proper’ English... teachers in inner city schools... allow ethnic and street language in the classroom” (349). The students, by receiving more or less strict education, are being conditioned to a self-fulfilling prophecy, where students who are expected to fail will fail, and those trained for success will succeed. This practice is undemocratic and neglects the goal of providing equal opportunity for all students.
Another factor contributing to limitations of educational success and thus equality of opportunity is the biased overrepresentation of dominant culture in mandated tests and canonical literature. Since standardized tests often exhibit a cultural bias that discriminates against poor and minority students, the overwhelming amount of emphasis now placed on IQ tests makes social advancement for minorities more difficult (Henslin 350). Just like standardized tests, the books taught in English literature classrooms can be viewed as culturally biased, catering to the “classics,” written mostly by white, deceased, European males (Richter 131). One possible way to alleviate the underrepresentation of minorities in school work would be to simply include more literature and test questions that are culturally relevant to minorities. The minorities, including blacks, Hispanics and women are, in actuality, often numerically the majority of students in a middle class school--however, as long as minorities do not have social power they will continue to face standardized discrimination.

In order to have a voice and strive for equality of opportunity, minorities and the oppressed must be empowered first through a pedagogy of questioning that promotes critical analysis, a layered thought process, and the constant curiosity to always ask “why.” Henry Giroux provides an example of dual layer of thought, one that urges students to think critically on both “what [students] know and how they come to know [it]. . .” (311). In other words, a pedagogy of questioning urges students to investigate even what they already believe they know by asking them to examine the sources of their knowledge.

Once a student finds a source of knowledge, that student should be taught how to adequately gauge the validity and credibility of a source by applying research skills such as studying the author, the intended audience, any sponsors behind the information, the date of publication, and so forth. These skills are practiced diligently in both English literature and composition classes; in literature students analyze authors and the historical time period in which texts were written, and in composition courses students write essays dependent on finding reliable sources. It is worth mentioning that the requirements of literature and composition classes often overlap. According to the renowned Dr. William Ayers, a pedagogy of questioning will enable students to overthrow stagnant social norms by encouraging students to “live in search of rather than in accordance with or in accommodation to” (Ayers 32). What are students in search of? Students are in search of a chance for self-expression, self-fulfillment and self-
improvement. However, these goals cannot be attained by an individual; it is only through an alert and active society that a questioning pedagogy can actually improve the standards of society.

When a pedagogy of questioning is used to change society it becomes a revolutionary pedagogy, and there is no better place to start a revolution than at school. Those who teach revolutionary pedagogy must understand that they are leaders with knowledge but also know that this power can easily be corrupted (Giroux 311). How is it possible that a professor teaching towards freedom can be a liberator but also the dominant force in the classroom, pushing the class towards freedom? Gloria Watkins, commonly known as “bell hooks,” stresses that educators must allow the fact that they are not all-knowing but that they are still amply prepared to teach; this honesty should be presented in such a way that it establishes a necessary respect and trust between educator and students (hooks 82). Furthermore, the classroom must be where a student first develops her or his public voice, voice for debate and voice for equality. Watkins notes the importance of class attendance and the need to call on every student for answering, so students become comfortable in an open social setting (83). There is no purpose in teaching students to strive for a voice if students have no practice using their voices. The final step for teachers is to work together—even between departments—to form a social network at schools in order to share good and bad methods of spreading a revolutionary pedagogy throughout a school system.

There is a fear among some educators that those teachers choosing to be advocates—usually for the empowerment of the disenfranchised—and the concept of “questioning everything” is nothing more than indoctrination and will ultimately send students out of classes having learned no tangible, valuable facts. Gertrude Himmelfarb is one critic of questioning pedagogy, and she claims that there it causes a lack of emphasis on the formalities of English, and promotes the treatment of historical facts as lies written by a ruling class (Himmelfarb 87). The idea that students go to school to acquire lists of facts and particular skills, however, borders on the treatment of education as a commodity. Dr. Ayers states that “[viewing] schools as businesses, teachers as workers [and] students as products... has taken firm hold in the culture and has led rather easily to thinking... that relentless standardized testing is sensible” (Ayers 31). I have already stated that standardized testing as well as class material can be culturally biased and thus limit the quality and equality of education that students receive. Himmelfarb does make a valid point that some revolutionary teachers may not enjoy, but should accept: in order to give a truly rounded and
revolutionary education, all viewpoints, even that of the dominant class, should be included (Himmelfarb 86).

Traditional teachers who are against advocacy are in fact advocates for the teaching of dominant culture in classrooms. This very contradiction can easily conclude that a true revolutionary pedagogy, that presents all sides, is the only way to give students the opportunity to decide for themselves how to interpret the facts. Students can develop a voice and gain awareness for their surroundings as they follow one path or another.

Of literature and composition English classes, classes of literature seem to viewed negatively as courses of little importance; this is no doubt the result of a failure to understand a paramount function of a literature classroom--to learn critical thinking skills. When a text is to be analyzed--and it is important to note that text includes fiction and nonfiction, novels, poems, movies, advertisements and more--there are many real-world skills being learned. If a classroom is studying a novel, the first step is to analyze the author. The first step in critical thinking is evaluation. Knowing the author allows the reader to find out the time period in which the book was written as well as who it was written by, giving the reader valuable context on any biases that could exist in the novel due to the writer or the time the book was published. Easily these skills can translate to identifying the sponsors of TV channels, newspapers and politicians and ultimately give the observer a better sense of a source’s credibility. A second skill learned is one of good composition by examining writers worthy of classroom attention. The formal elements of writing--such as symbolism and point of view--are also studied in literature classrooms, and the knowledge of these skills, as well as the exposure to acclaimed authors, contributes to the voice that students will eventually form as their own.

With the vast umbrella of cultural studies guiding the English literature curriculum, there is no better class in which to transfer critical thinking to real world action. Cultural studies encourages all mediums, from all cultures, to be studied. Songs, commercials, the evening news and video games are all possible sources of study. Not only can this variety of texts be more appealing to students than the sole critiquing of written text, but it also allows students to critically analyze aspects of media that they are likely to encounter on a daily basis. Gerald Graff developed his passion for literature due solely to the analytical aspects of literary theory and debate, and through love of debate he formed a voice that was capable of reaching out and creating change, as evidenced by his becoming a successful writer (Graff 42). Critical thinking and critical analysis, applied to a wide spectrum of media, can allow students to learn the skills necessary to see the world through eyes that are free from the bias and presumptions often exhibited
in the headlines of newspapers and television and uttered from the lips of the wealthy and the politicians—in other
words, those who often represent the dominant culture.

The composition classroom enforces and refines skills learned in the literature classroom and also
introduces a new powerful element: the crafting of a student’s voice. Composition classrooms require students to
practice presenting their voice in different formats over a wide variety of issues. Much focus is placed on teaching
students to write persuasively, authoritatively, and with much research. Before students practice the application
learned under a pedagogy of questioning, they should be able to present themselves professionally and properly.
This is not to say that one style of writing is correct. A novel can be a powerful tool for the promotion of social
change, and yet many successful and revolutionary novels are not written within the boundaries of tradition style.
However, professionalism must not be overlooked, and anyone hoping to make an impact in society must know how
to write with proper spelling, grammar and punctuation. These skills can be applied to something as practical as a
job application, or something as abstract as poster for a protest. Persuasion is an essential skill, for without
persuasion it is unlikely any change will occur. Evaluation as a skill is practiced in literature, and while texts are often
the subject of evaluation, other things, such as merchandise, politics, and the system of education are often the
subject of evaluation. Research today is perhaps the most important and most controversial element of a
composition course. While some educators like Gertrude Himmelfarb are worried about too little facts being taught in
school, others, like William Ayers, are worried about an over-emphasis on facts. Ayers fears that a dependency on
research is designed to eliminate discussion and to nullify theories before they have a chance to be formed;
research, according to Ayers, always takes a side based on the time period or sources from which it is found (Ayers
33). The skill of research is one that belongs in the English composition course—it is through research that a student
can not only establish ideas but also glean lessons from other sources on how to form a voice. However, research
must not be the end-all of debate and educators must stress that the thesis of each essay is arguable, or else the
topic would not be part of the classroom curriculum.

In addition to the fear of English classes quelling debate, many worry that English is becoming an
unattainable major for poorer social classes. Dr. John Dewey argued that the ideal focus democratic education is
based on the interaction between different social groups and the ability for schools to provide a sanctuary where all
social classes can mingle and choose to receive the same educational opportunities (101). One issue that opposes
this ideal is the amount of funding that schools receive. William Ayers argues that “the existence of one school for
wealthy white kids funded to the tune of $30,000 per student per year, and another school for poor kids with access
to only $5,000” is immoral, and contradictory to the core values of a democratic education. One value of democratic
education is equality of opportunity, or the implementation of providing equal access of knowledge to every student
so he or she may seek out whatever career she or he desires. Richard Ohmann argues that equality of opportunity is
an “illusion” and merely exists to justify any student’s failure to advance in society as a “personal failure rather than a
systematic one” (91). With wealthy schools consistently receiving the most funds, one can begin to witness how
English literature becomes a discriminating field.

Viewing education as a commodity is at the heart of the decline of English literature, and there is certainly a
decline worthy of worry. Richard Ohmann stated in the year 2000 that Majors in the Humanities were down “50
percent or more in two decades . . . [and only] 15 to 40 percent of job seekers in [English fields] find permanent
employment there” (92). Again, the factors of socio-economics appear to create an environment that is not placing
the welfare of students first, but is instead catering to business that enforces educational policies that create workers
ideal for companies, not workers capable of great career advancements. In other words, students are being herded
down paths that are not personally rewarding—and often times not even financially rewarding—but these paths are
beneficial to business; these businesses can ensure that schools push students to follow a specific path by providing
much needed funds to underfunded schools and by encouraging colleges to raise or lower the tuition costs on certain
subject areas to essentially bribe students to strive for a certain future career. It is no wonder that emphasis is being
taken off of English, where critical thinking is so highly valued. If more students realized what forces were at play
concerning their education, there would likely be much more action against the idea of corporations getting control
over and sometimes privatizing schools. Ohmann reveals that in prestigious universities English literature is still a
perfectly valid major to choose because there is no risk or penalty for pursuing a job that may not be financially
sustainable; this freedom is not available for poorer students. Ohmann claims that “[Wealthy students] have a
reserved place waiting for them in either the professional-managerial class or the ruling class . . . even if they think
they are risking downward mobility by studying Shakespeare” (94). The reason that equality of opportunity fails,
then, is because students have no choice other than to pursue a career that can ensure a decent enough wages so that students can pay off loans and start becoming independent adults. As education stands today, there is much work to be done. A good way to start improvement is by placing more importance on English classes that meet the criteria necessary for teaching a critical, independent and democratic way of thinking.

A full man is a man with morals, and man with morals must be socially aware and conscious. It is through reading a wide variety of texts critically that students can learn the talents necessary to see all things through educated eyes. However, writing and finding reliable sources also teaches students how to look beyond the surface, while at the same time finding the proof needed to make a solid argument or knowledge necessary to establish a fact. Therefore, writing makes a man punctual and sure. However, without application of confident writing skills to the real world, they are hardly worth having. John Dewey stressed how the isolation of any voices in society can only lead to wider gaps between the rich and the poor, the educated and the undereducated, and how culture suffers from this breach (Dewey 99). Bringing the skills of independent thought and fine research to the forefront of issues in society can help improve the democracy in which we live by providing a genuine equal chance for opportunity. It is not easy to bring about change when competing against a dominant force; while the union betwixt teachers and students in the classroom is the right place to start, education must extend beyond the walls of a school or university and spread through communities. English teachers who form revolutionary pedagogies, as they should, must never forget to be students eagerly asking questions and seeking ways in which to improve their own classrooms; the students must never let slip a chance to apply the skills learned at school to teach freedom to those who have not had the privilege to hear the lecture firsthand.
Works Cited


Darwin’s Destruction and Recreation of Meaningfulness: The Shift in Symbolic Immortality

Charles Darwin is widely known for his abstract On the Origin of Species and his theoretical development of evolution and natural selection. When one thinks of Darwin, he or she is encumbered by thoughts about the scientific origins of species and potentially the vast moral conflict that his On the Origin of Species created in society. These opposing beliefs created a great debate between followers of science and religion. For devoted religious members, Darwin’s theory of evolution destroys the meaningfulness that their theology provides. For academics of science, Darwin’s theory contributed to the scientific field by providing a new understanding of the world. Darwin’s theory of evolution through natural selection is the idea that nature develops on its own accord through the accumulation of traits that are beneficial to a species. Among the vast amount of religious followers, Darwin’s theory created an upheaval since he was suggesting that a divine creator is unnecessary for the world to exist and develop. This ongoing conflict began with the publication of On the Origin of Species and can be traced historically to present time. For part of this essay, I will be analyzing the conflict between science and religion with the aid of theories from the psychiatrist Robert Lifton. By exploring the impact that Darwin’s On the Origin of Species had on society, I will identify this impact as a cultural crisis using Lifton’s ideas on death and death anxiety.

In an attempt to rectify the cultural crisis that was bound to arise out of the publication of On the Origin of Species, Darwin formulated a new basis for meaningfulness. His attempt to remedy the issue can be attributed to the internal conflict that Darwin himself had when writing his abstract. Darwin, like most Victorians, was from a religious background, which caused him to be wary about what he was proposing. Janet Browne discusses in her book Charles Darwin: The Power of Place that, “often he worried about the sheer magnitude, the philosophical effrontery, of what he was proposing...The tension partly expressed itself in his health” (Browne 66-67). After Darwin’s trip on the H.M.S Beagle, he had a constant stomach illness that he could not be cured. This could be attributed to a physical reaction to the stress he was feeling about his discovery. Another problem fueling his unease about his own theory was of his concern about how this would affect his wife, Emma. Darwin “was worried
about Emma’s feelings as well. He sensed that she was concerned about the implications of his views…” (Browne 67). Knowing what kind of negative affect this could potentially have on the world and his family, Darwin was extremely conflicted about the publication of *On the Origin of Species*.

Darwin, understanding the issues that would arise by destroying the meaningfulness found in religion offers a new basis for meaningfulness in *On the Origin of Species*. Throughout his abstract, there are instances where one can see Darwin to trying to provide a new meaning to life, in nature. Browne explains that “he was rewriting the greatest story ever told, offering his contemporaries another Eden, a secular testament for the times” (Browne 66-67). My essay is divided into four parts: defining Lifton key terms, Crisis caused by *On the Origin of Species*, Historical symptoms of the crisis, and Darwin’s Protean quest: the nature mode of symbolic immortality. The first three parts set up for the fourth, which acts as a resolution to the crisis. I will be proving that Darwin’s publication of *On the Origin of Species* may have destroyed the basis for meaningfulness found in theology, but it also offers a new basis for meaningfulness that can be found in the natural world.

I. **Defining Lifton Key Terms**

Lifton, author of *Living and Dying* provides an analytical tool to help explore Darwin’s destruction and new offering of meaningfulness. His terms will help explain why it had such a powerful impact on society. Each term will be used later in the paper to aid in articulating my argument.

To begin with, Lifton explains that life and death imagery are innate and develop throughout our lives. Lifton believes the goal in our lives is to achieve experiences that provide life imagery through connection, movement and integrity while avoiding those that give death imagery through separation, stasis, and disintegration. Life imagery is incorporated with the idea of being alive, while death imagery is associated with death. Our understanding of life imagery changes as we age (Lifton 49).

Life and death imagery are explained as being three pairs of opposites:

1. Connection and Separation
2. Movement and Stasis
3. Integrity and Disintegration
Lifton explains that the life imagery of connection can be shown when a baby’s needs are met, making him/her feel safe and secure. When a baby’s needs are not being met and he/she is left alone, that connection is not being made so the baby is experiencing separation. Separation is when we feel isolated and unsafe, lacking meaningful connections. As we grow older, our idea of connection changes; it becomes to mean so much more than feeling secure. We strive to make meaningful relationships with the people around us and the beliefs we hold. For example, a teenager experimenting with his/her belief system is illustrating him/her trying to figure out the meaningful connection between their life and the belief system (Lifton 46 & 54).

Life imagery via movement for a baby is energetic motion and play. Young children avoid its opposite, stasis. When held down they become upset because the incapability to move is associated with death. However, as we get older, movement is more than just physical motion: it becomes our development intellectually and emotionally. We strive to avoid stagnancy, constantly seeking improvement in our lives, such as furthering our education (Lifton 46 & 54).

Life imagery via integrity at a young age means keeping ourselves intact physically. It is the avoidance of disintegration; often when a child gets a cut, he assumes that he/she is dying. The sight of blood or an open wound evokes such a powerful response because disintegration is linked so closely with dying. When we get older, bodily ailments still upset us; however, we are also concerned the integrity of our ethical choices. Lifton refers to this idea of ethical intactness as “getting your head together,” integrity needs to be affirmed to us as what is personally right (Lifton 54).

When death imagery becomes so overwhelming and prominent in our lives, Lifton believes that people develop something called death anxiety. It is the anxiety we feel after repressing and not accepting the inevitability of it. The only solution to death anxiety, Lifton suggests, is to create meaningful connection, movement, and integrity in our lives.

Symbolic immortality is the accumulation of life imagery throughout our lives. It is the idea that we can live on symbolically after our death. It is the psychological process of creating meaningful images based on historical connection beyond life and maintaining a feeling of ongoing connection, movement, and integrity, while at the same time, accepting the finality of death. An example of symbolic immortality is a man looking back on his
family history to see how a certain tradition has been passed down. When he looks forward, he sees his daughter
teaching his grandson that same tradition, illustrating that he, and everyone before him, will live on symbolically in
the family through that tradition. Symbolic immortality is expressed in five modes: biological, creative, natural,
thematic, and existential. For the purpose of my paper, I will only be discussing two of them: the theological
mode and natural mode of symbolic immortality.

As Lifton explains, the theological mode of symbolic immortality is the idea that one transcends death
through spiritual attainment by connecting with a specific theology’s ethical principles. The idea is that when one
dies, their connection to the moral teaching of religion will live on. Lifton explains that Christ, Buddha, and
Muhammad are excellent examples of transcending death through their moral teachings. However, we do not
need to be well-known figures in order to be symbolically immortalized, it is the idea that we contributed to the
ethical teaching of the theology that give us a sense of living on after death. The natural mode of symbolic
immortality is the idea that the earth lives on, so when we are buried in the earth we live on through nature. Our
bodies decompose and become soil; the soil sustains plant life and continues to grow. We live on through the
earth and in nature. Lifton also brings up how we go back to nature for refreshment spiritually, which relates to this
idea because it shows being around a form of symbolic immortality soothes us. (Lifton 79 & 81).

The modes are shaped and influenced by what is defined as meaningful by our culture. Cultural values
are what give the support to the individuals in establishing what it means to live a meaningful life. However, the
idea as to what provides a meaningful life adapts and changes over time, potentially causing shifts in the modes.
For example, Lifton discusses how what was meaningful to the Ancient Greeks will not provide the same
meaningfulness for our culture. In order for the culture to provide a deep psychic reinforcement of life imagery, at
least one of the modes of symbolic immortality needs to be offered in society (Lifton 96).

Symbolic immortality can become compromised, creating impaired symbolic immortality. Impaired symbolic
immortality is the threat of losing or the loss at the individual and the cultural level of symbolic immortality which
creates separation, stasis, and disintegration. Impaired modes require either revitalization via life imagery or a shift
in the modes to reestablish the meaningfulness originally found in the mode. This goes back to how the modes
can change over time. The revitalization comes from a Protean, a person who can renew and give new meaning
to the modes of symbolic immortality. To be a Protean, he/she must have physically or symbolically touched death in some way. This person also desires the new and goes on a quest for the new, which ultimately leads to the revitalization of the modes of symbolic immortality as this person shares their discovery with others and their findings provide life imagery.

II. Crisis Caused by *On the Origin of Species*

The publication of *On the Origin of Species* was during an era where religion, specifically Christianity, reigned over society. British society and culture and the Anglican Church were interwoven; one was usually not found without the other. Before and after the publication of *On the Origin of Species* during the nineteenth century, “the Anglican church...lay at the heart of the British nation’s daily life and provided the framework in which most people operated...” (Darwin’s *Origin of Species*, Browne 85). The church was Britain’s most meaningful symbol, providing life imagery through connection, movement, and integrity. Connection is illustrated through the Christian idea that all followers of Christ are linked, being brothers and sisters in Christ. This connection transcends the limits set forth by biology and location and creates a unique community of people who all have one thing in common: their religious ideals. This type of community can also offer security because one feels acceptance within his/her moral beliefs. Connection in this case relates very much to the concept of integrity in Christianity. The Christian philosophy is to strive to please God, which creates a constant ebb and flow of decisions. A Christian tries to make meaningful decisions that are considered moral, which creates integrity because he/she is affirming what is personally right to him/her through religion. The movement of Christianity can be observed in the constant efforts to spread the word of God. By bringing people to God, Christianity can continue to develop. These are just a few examples of connection, movement, and integrity; however these strong forms of life imagery and the devotion that nineteenth-century Victorians had for the Anglican Church suggest that religion created meaningful images. These images are based on a historical and futuristic connection that goes beyond one’s life, thus suggesting that religion was the main form of symbolic immortality.

*On the Origin of Species* caused quite the uproar among nineteenth-century British society and the world. Darwin’s abstract shocked the Victorians, not only from a scientific standpoint, but from a spiritual one as well. The
“Victorians found it nearly impossible to accept the idea of gradual change in animals and plants, and equally hard to displace God from the creative process” (Browne, 84). The omission of a divine creator deterred Victorians from believing Darwin’s theory; however, it still put a rift in their form of symbolic immortality. The text was disproving the Creation story and God’s hand in creating the world, creating death imagery through separation, stasis, and disintegration within the Victorian’s symbolic immortality. Darwin’s abstract proves that there could be another possible explanation for how life was created on earth, creating disintegration within religion. A world that is capable of creating itself means that religion falls apart at the seams; without a God, there is not a purpose to religion. Christians become separated not only from one another, but from a God that could possibly no longer exist. The community of brothers and sisters in Christ can no longer exist without the commonality of Christ. Stasis also presides; movement is no longer achievable if God doesn’t exist because there would not be the goal of spreading the word of God. Darwin’s impairment on the theological mode of symbolic immortality created long-lasting effects of death anxiety, which thus created a crisis among Christians. The crisis is an attempt to preserve the theological mode of symbolic immortality. The preservation can be shown through historical events. The responses of the crisis act as symptoms—showing that there is indeed an issue. These symptoms are capable of being traced from the publication of On the Origin of Species to present day.

III. Historical Symptoms of the Crisis

The publication of On the Origin of Species caused momentous controversy between religious organizations and scientists. Immediately after publication, it became a widely debated topic: What was the true origin of species? It became “one of the first genuinely public debates about science to stretch across general society” (Browne 85). While there were numerous public debates addressing On the Origin of Species, one in particular “became an enduring symbol of an angry clash between science and religion over the origin of species” (Browne 95). This debate was between zoologist and anatomist Thomas Henry Huxley and the Bishop of Oxford Samuel Wilberforce. It took place in 1860, seven months after the publication On the Origin of Species at the Oxford University Museum. While there are no precise records on this debate, Wilberforce asked Huxley whether it was through his grandfather or grandmother that he was supposedly a descent of monkeys. Huxley supposedly replied that he would rather be a descended from monkeys than be connected to Wilberforce. While
there was no clear winner for this debate the “audience had witnessed in miniature a titanic confrontation between church and science—two utterly incompatible views on the position of mankind in the natural world” (Browne 96-97). It could be said that this debate shows a symptom of the crisis because Wilberforce was attempting to defend his symbolic immortality from being impaired; however, this debate alone does not prove that there is a crisis, it is just the beginning.

The next main symptom of the crisis does not occur until 1925; however it is a culmination of years of unease. The Butler Act was a law that prohibited the teaching of evolution that was originally signed in Tennessee. It states in section one of Tennessee’s Butler Act that:

> Be it enacted by the general assembly of the state of Tennessee, that it shall be unlawful for any teacher in any of the Universities, normals, and all other public schools of the State which are supported in whole or in part by the public school funds of the state, to teach any theory that denies the story of the Divine Creation of man as taught in the Bible, and to teach instead that man has descended from a lower order of animals. (House Bill 185)

Laws similar to the Butler Act were passed in 1926 and 1927 in Mississippi and Arkansas. These show man trying to preserve his theology by omitting the teaching of any other theory that denies divine creation. The denying of another theory of how the world was formed demonstrates the crisis because it is showing man’s attempt at eliminating the other possible answers. By eliminating all other possible ways of creation, religion becomes the only possible answer. The antievolutionary laws were long lasting, however, the laws were finally declared unconstitutional in 1968.

The Butler Acts instigated the next symptom of the crisis—the Scopes Monkey Trial. The trial was also in 1925. The American Civil Liberties Union had heard about the law and “sought to launch a test case against the "monkey law" and advertised in Tennessee newspapers for a willing plaintiff” (The Scopes Trial: A Brief History with Documents Moran 24). John Thomas Scopes was that willing plaintiff; however, he was later to regret his decision. Scopes was a science teacher at Dayton High School, and when asked if he would stand in for this case, he agreed only if it could be proven that he had taught evolution. Scopes was charged on May 25, 1925 of teaching the theory of evolution to his students. The publicity of this trial is what shows the symptom of the
crisis: full dialogue reports of the trial were being reported in newspapers, journalists traveling miles to cover the story, and even a play being published based on the events of the trial. The trial was referred to as the “trial of the century.” Moran states that:

Nearly 200 journalists from throughout the United States and abroad file[ing] on the order of 135,000 words daily during the trial…[it’s] estimated that the reportage would fill 3,000 volumes of 300 pages apiece. Every day, newsreel crews sent out miles of film from Dayton… (Moran 2)

After eight days of trial, it only took the jury nine minutes to find Scopes guilty, in which he was charged $100. In 1955, a play based on the Scopes Monkey Trial was published. Written by Jerome Lawrence and Robin Edwin Lee, “Inherit the Wind” is an over-dramatization of the Scopes Trial. This, combined with the publicity of the trial, shows the long affect that the Scopes Monkey Trial had on society, illustrating the obsession society had with this trial.

The final symptom that will be discussed deals with present day issues in Kentucky: The opening of a Bible-based theme park that was encouraged by the Kentucky state government. The main attraction of the theme park, called Ark Encounter, is going to be a replica of Noah’s ark. The park will also include a:

100-foot Tower of Babel, a first-century Middle Eastern village and a journey through the Old Testament, with special effects depicting Moses, the 10 plagues and the parting of the Red Sea. For children, there will be a petting zoo, live bird and animal shows and a play area with ziplines and climbing nets — all Bible-themed. (Goodstein)

The theme-park is projected to open in 2014. The theme park is being created by a group called Answers in Genesis, to which the state has promised generous tax incentives for their project. Answers in Genesis also founded in 2007 the Creationist Museum in Kentucky. The Creationist Museum is an interactive museum, which is meant to “bring the pages of the Bible to life” (Answers in Genesis). The museum’s sole purpose is to show how God created the earth, showing how dinosaurs and humans could have coexisted while God was in the process of creating the world. Both the theme park and the museum are showing symptoms of the crisis because both are attempts to reestablish God’s place in creating the earth and omit the idea of evolution.
The historical symptoms to the crisis illuminate the fact that there is a fear of losing the theological mode of symbolic immortality. The fear creates death imagery in the mode, causing the mode to become impaired.

IV. Darwin’s Protean Quest: The Nature Mode of Symbolic Immortality

As I have mentioned before, Darwin was aware of the severity of the problem he was going to cause, although not in the specific terms that I have helped define it. He was, however, aware that the publication of *On the Origin of Species* was going to create serious issues among religion. That is why he tries to replace the meaningfulness he is destroying with a new basis of meaningfulness. Throughout *On the Origin of Species*, Darwin has integrated his new basis of meaningfulness found in nature with the same nature that is destroying the theological basis for meaningfulness. The ability to create a shift and revitalize the modes of symbolic immortality is a very special attribute—only a select few are capable of achieving it. When one does achieve this, Lifton discusses that they are called a Protean, which was discussed above in Part I. Darwin shatters the theological mode by surrounding it in death imagery; however Darwin the Protean creates new meaningfulness in nature by showing the connection, movement, and integrity through nature. Darwin is providing symbolic immortality through nature, providing life imagery for the shift in the modes.

a. Connection

Darwin’s *On the Origin of Species* demonstrates connection, or the idea of having a purpose or a meaningful relationship. I gave the example of Christianity’s idea of connection: the thought that every follower of Christ is linked as a brother or sister through Christ, creating its own community. Darwin’s new mode of symbolic immortality does something similar, except on a grander scheme—instead of an exclusive community of only followers of God, Darwin is illustrating that we are all connected through nature. If we all came from nature, then that means we are all connected through nature. While Darwin does not explain any of the human connections, he does illustrate in several instances other organisms’ connection to each other through nature. Darwin explains that while organisms struggle to exist, they learn to adapt. These organisms are adapting not only to survive, they are also adapting to each other, which Darwin calls coadaptation. Darwin explains that:

> We see these beautiful co-adaptations most plainly in the woodpecker and missletoe; and only a little less plainly in the humblest parasite which clings to the hairs of a quadruped or feathers of a
bird; in the structure of the beetle which dives through the water; in the plumed seed which is
wafted by the gentlest breeze; in short, we see beautiful adaptations everywhere in every part of
the organic world. (61)

Darwin’s examples of coadaptation demonstrate the connection between different organisms. He is explaining that organisms adapt to one another in order to better survive—showing a distinct connection between the organisms.

Darwin discusses his observations on codependency within certain ant species. A particular type of ants that he observed had what he refers to as the “slave-making instinct.” He describes how the master ants are completely dependent on the slaves—they cannot feed themselves, build their own nests, etc. Darwin is in awe of this dependency, saying that “such are the facts, though they did not need confirmation by me, in regard to the wonderful instinct of making slaves” (223). Darwin is marveling at the idea of codependency, and how even this minute connection within the species demonstrates the interconnectedness with all of nature. With this specific example, Darwin begins to play with the idea that it is better to believe that this instinct developed on its own rather than a creator designating it. Darwin states that:

Finally, it may not be a logical deduction, but to my imagination it is far more satisfactory to look at such instincts as the…ants making slaves…not as specially endowed or created instincts, but as small consequences of one general law, leading to the advancement of all organic beings, namely, multiply, vary, let the strongest live and the weakest die. (244)

Darwin is saying that he would much rather believe that it was the laws of nature that caused the slave-making instinct than a deity. This idea relates to connection because it is showing that no organism is singled out under the idea that nature is the creator; all organisms are required to follow the laws of nature because it is one whole community, bringing connection to all organisms.

Darwin discusses the importance of coadaptation on numerous occasions. He points out on one that he “…can see no limit to the amount of change, to the beauty and infinite complexity of the coadaptations between all organic beings, one with another and with their physical conditions of life, which may be effected in the long course of time by nature’s power of selection” (109). Darwin is explaining that through nature, the world can be
changed in an infinite amount of ways. He is personifying nature by giving it a creative power. In doing so, he is creating a new meaning for nature. The new meaning is a purpose; before, nature was believed to have been designed by God, but now it has the ability to design itself. In the religious viewpoint, nature had nothing to do with the designing of the world—that was the Creator’s job. Now, however, Darwin is giving nature the role of creative designer, offering it a new purpose.

b. Movement

On the Origin of Species also illustrates movement or the idea of development. I gave the example of how Christians are always striving to spread the word of God as one example of their movement. Darwin offers a different type of movement in his theory—the idea that nature causes the development of organisms. Darwin’s entire theory of natural selection shows the development and movement of nature. Darwin explains that:

All that we can do, is to keep steadily in mind that each organic being is striving to increase at a geometrical ratio; that each at some period of its life, during some season of the year, during each generation or at intervals, has to struggle for life, and to suffer great destruction. When we reflect on this struggle, we may console ourselves with the full belief, that the war of nature is not incessant, that no fear is felt, that death is generally prompt, and that the vigorous, the healthy, and the happy survive and multiply. (79)

The idea that the weakest will perish and the strongest will continue on promotes the idea of development. Even though this evokes death imagery, the tragedy of the weakest dying is minimized by the growth, strengthening, and adaptation of a species.

Darwin explains the movement as the ongoing build-up of differences that are advantageous to the species. Darwin explains that:

Whatever the cause may be of each slight difference in the offspring from their parents—and cause for each must exist—it is the steady accumulation, through natural selection, of such differences, when beneficial to the individual, that gives rise to all the more important modification of structure, by which the innumerable beings on the face of this earth are enabled to struggle with each other, and the best adapted to survive. (170)
The subtle differences in a species slowly, but surely, accumulate to create an extravagant difference in a
cpecies to aid in its survival. This type of movement is meaningful because it assures the survival of the species
and promotes the development in order to achieve survival.

c. Integrity

The integrity, or completeness, in On the Origin of Species is exemplified several times throughout the
text and in Darwin's theory. The religious idea of integrity that I had mentioned earlier was how to make
meaningful decisions that are considered moral, which creates integrity because he/she is affirming what is
personally right to him/her through religion. Darwin's provides integrity by keeping every idea of nature intact;
each part a piece of an entire whole. Darwin states that:

> It is interesting to contemplate an entangled bank, clothed with many plants of many kinds, with
> birds singing on the bushes, with various insects flitting about, and with worms crawling through the
damp earth, and to reflect that these elaborately constructed forms, so different from each other,
and dependent on each in so complex a manner, have all been produced by laws acting around
us. (489)

The entangled bank represents his entire theory—organisms living together, so different but so reliant on each
other in order to survive. Darwin attributes this to the laws of nature. By connecting each organism—plants and
animals alike—Darwin is creating a whole and completed world. The intricacy of our world is like a watch—if
one gear or spring is taken out of it, the watch will eventually stop working because it is incomplete. If one
species were to immediately disappear, that would affect the entirety of the natural world. While this idea does
not give us a motive to be a genuinely moral person as religion does, it promises the species to develop and
flourish as a result of natural selection. However, in the world Darwin has created, the ideas of the movement of
natural selection and our desire to strive to be moral are not mutually exclusive. We can still attempt to be moral
people while still acknowledging natural selection. Certain views of Christianity, however, will not allow both.

d. Tree of Life
While Darwin’s construction of the natural mode of symbolic immortality was shown primarily through life imagery, he also gives new meaning to a symbol that he impaired with the publication of *On the Origin of Species*. Darwin describes his new Tree of Life by expressing that:

> As buds give rise by growth to fresh buds, and these, if vigorous, branch out and overtop on all sides many a feeble branch, so many a generation I believe it has been with the great Tree of Life, which fills with its dead and broken branches the crust of the earth, and covers the surface with its ever branching and beautiful ramifications. (130)

Biblically, the Tree of Life is in the Garden of Eden and is said to have given immortality to the eaters of the fruit it bore. This idea can be related to the notion of an afterlife in Heaven—the immortality of the soul. It is also said by some scholars, including Tryggve N.D. Mettinger, author of *The Eden Narrative* that the Tree of Life and the Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil are one in the same. When looking at Darwin’s metaphor with this idea in mind, it seems as if Darwin is siding with the idea of the Tree of Knowledge. He is informing the public about a phenomenon that has been occurring essentially since the dawn of time, providing new knowledge for his audience. While he may be taking away their hope of an eternal life (an afterlife) by taking away a divine creator, he is providing them with something that he believes is much more important: the knowledge of what is actually happening instead of blindly living in ignorance.

Darwin’s Tree of Life is also providing life imagery through connection, movement, and integrity. The relationship of the new branches replacing the older branches illustrates the idea of connection. It shows a meaningful relationship between the dying and developing species—the dying individuals of a species will not be dying in vain, they will be contributing to the further development of the species. This also relates to the idea of movement because the Tree of Life metaphor discusses how the dead and broken branches will be replaced by new beautiful branches. The Tree of Life will keep developing because it is the further continuation of a species and nature; the progress never ending. The integrity of the tree is shown in the tree itself—the tree is all of nature. The tree represents every organism: past, present, and future. Even though the extinct species have been overtaken by the new species, it is because of the extinct species that the new species was able to develop and live on.
Darwin sees grandness in this way of life and wants his audience to also. Throughout the entirety of the book, Darwin has buried golden nuggets of hope for the reader to stumble upon. At the end, however, he becomes very straightforward about his feelings on his new basis for meaningfulness. He explains that:

Thus, from the war of nature, from the famine and depth, the most exalted object which we are capable of conceiving, namely, the production of the higher animals, directly follows. There is grandeur in this view of life, with its several powers, having originally breathed into a few forms or into one; and that, whilst this planet has gone cycling on according to the fixed law of gravity, from so simple a beginning endless forms most beautiful and most wonderful have been, and are being, evolved. (490)

In this final quote, Darwin is leaving his readers with a new way to look at nature—that one should revere its intricacies and ability to adapt to keep surviving. This is grand, he says, implying that this connectedness is more wondrous than a creator who simply placed every being into existence. On the Origin of Species provided the answer to the problem Darwin had created: What will give meaning to our lives now that God is taken away? The answer, Darwin says, is nature. Nature can now be the new basis for meaningfulness because it provides life imagery.

Even though Darwin impairs the theological mode of symbolic immortality, he creates a new basis for meaningfulness through the natural mode of symbolic immortality. The impairment of the theological mode can be shown historically, demonstrating the effect that it had on culture. However, Darwin does provide a fresh, meaningful way to examine nature, providing life imagery and symbolic immortality. His ability to prove nature’s origins can be viewed as similar to the way that theologian William Paley asserts nature’s origins—except both provide a different answer. Paley’s argument Evidence by Design discussed in his book Natural Theology is based on inductive reasoning. Paley used the argument that if one were to find a watch on the ground, one would instinctively attribute its craftsmanship to a watchmaker. Paley argued that the world must be considered like the watch—such an intricately designed specimen must have a creator. Darwin uses the idea of intricacy in his abstract to explain that the world being so perfect proves evolution. It is through Paley that Darwin is able to bring
his Christian readers into his text, using Paley’s meaning as a way to show how nature has meaning. Through his detailed and intricate abstract, On the Origin of Species, Darwin illustrates that the maker is nature, using the Paley idea of inductive reasoning to prove his theory. The parallels show how Darwin wanted to keep the meaningfulness of Christianity, so he used a theorist that he believed showed meaning. This brings religion full circle; its meaningfulness was destroyed, but without it, Darwin would not have had anything to base his theory off of. Darwin showed the world that he cared about it by creating a new basis for meaningfulness that could replace the one he knew he was destroying, while still incorporating ideas from theology.

Works Cited


Staying Together While Apart: The Unexpected Success of Long Distance Love

“Hey there Delilah don’t you worry about the distance. I’m right there if you get lonely; give this song another listen. Close your eyes, listen to my voice it’s my disguise. I’m by your side” (Higgenson, 2006). Long distance love is a popular topic in literature, movies, and music, and like “Hey There Delilah” by the Plain White T’s, many of those works attest to the pain and difficulty involved in being part of a long distance relationship (LDR). Couples in LDRs face numerous challenges that couples in proximal relationships (PRs) don’t have; loneliness, lack of physical intimacy, and communication barriers are just a few examples. With those troubles in mind, it seems counterintuitive that distance relationships could be more intense and satisfying than proximal relationships, yet research reveals that they often are. In this paper, I use Robert J. Lifton’s theory about death anxiety presented in his book *Living and Dying* and psychological research by relationship experts to do two things: first, to explain the most important reasons why LDRs are expected to fail, and second, to show how the same factors that are harmful to LDRs can actually contribute to their success; finally, I will conclude with some lessons I learned from this analysis to help people in both long distance and proximal relationships find ways to make their relationships more meaningful and successful.

There are four important concepts from Lifton that I will use. The first is life imagery. Life imagery refers to any experience that provides feelings of meaningful connection, movement, and integrity. When one has an experience of life imagery, it results in positive feelings such as meaningful connection with another person, movement in one’s development and skills, and integrity in one’s self as a person. Lifton argues that experiencing life imagery is an innate goal for us all. The second concept is death imagery. Death imagery, the opposite of life imagery, is related to any experience of separation, stasis, or disintegration. Lifton argues that experiences of death imagery arouse death anxiety, which is the third concept I use from Lifton. Death anxiety is a reaction of fear and discomfort aroused by the fear of death itself, but it is also provoked through any experience of separation, stasis, or disintegration, because those experiences give us a little tiny taste of the complete separation, complete stasis, and complete disintegration that death would bring. The way we experience life imagery and death imagery evolves
throughout the life cycle. As babies, we experience the elements of life and death imagery only physically; when babies are held by their caretakers, they feel life imagery through the physical connection to the caretaker’s body, and movement through being rocked in their arms. Integrity is experienced in the physical wholeness and well-being of the body. Death imagery may be felt through physical separation from the caretaker, stasis of being restrained in a car seat, or disintegration of the body when the child gets a cut or an injury. As we get older, we gain the capacity to experience life and death imagery not only through our own bodies, but through our relationships with others. We can feel connected to other people through common interests, movement through the development of our abilities, and integrity through inclusion in our community. Once we reach an age beyond adolescence, we are capable of experiencing life and death imagery through concepts and ideas. One can feel connected to intangible things beyond the self, such as meaningful philosophies, movement through working toward a goal or ideal, and integrity through developing one’s self intellectually and emotionally. The fourth concept I will use from Lifton is numbing. Numbing is a condition of desensitization which occurs when we cannot give meaning to our important life experiences. Lifton examines numbing only in circumstances of extreme, broadly based social turmoil, but for the purposes of my research I have customized Lifton’s idea of numbing to apply to individuals and their personal turmoil. I will call this selective numbing.

In addition to Lifton, I will draw on psychological research in the field of relationships. There are four ideas that are important to understand: (1) idealization, (2) the attachment system, (3) separation protest, and (4) attachment styles. First, Stafford and Merolla (2007) define idealization as “the tendency to describe the relationship (and one’s partner) in unrealistically positive terms” (p. 39). According to Stafford and Merolla, idealization results from a lack of face-to-face communication; therefore, it tends to be more prevalent among distance relationships.

Second, Pistole and Roberts (2009) introduce the attachment system. The attachment system is a biological and psychological system that compels most people to seek protection from loneliness through an enduring emotional bond with another person. The proximity and security provided by the partner satisfies the attachment system (Pistole & Roberts, 2009). Third, Pistole and Roberts also talk about separation protest. When partners are physically separated, the attachment system is frustrated and causes separation protest, reflected in responses of sadness, anxiety, yearning for the partner, and attempts to regain proximity (Pistole & Roberts, 2009 p. 6). Fourth,
Chapman, Pistole, and Roberts discuss attachment styles. The attachment system compels us to form an emotional bond with another person, and the attachment style we use determines the type of bond we form. Avoidant attachment is a style that results in a bond which uses “emotion regulation strategies that suppress attachment-related stress” and reflects a preference for low emotional involvement (Chapman, Pistole & Roberts, 2010 p. 537). More simply, avoidant attachers try to suppress their feelings for their partner, both positive and negative. Secure attachment contrasts dramatically with avoidant attachment; securely attached individuals express their emotions for their partner with confidence and “have positive views of the self and partner” (Chapman, Pistole & Roberts, 2010 p. 536). Secure attachment is associated positively with relationship satisfaction, perceived love, and quality of communication. In addition, Chapman, Pistole and Roberts also identified three types of relationship enhancing behaviors. These behaviors are tools that couples in distance relationships use to “create meaning for, and bridge periods of, separation” (Chapman, Pistole & Roberts, 2010 p. 537). They found that securely attached individuals use the enhancing relationship behaviors more frequently than avoidantly attached individuals.

I will now explain in depth a few of the main reasons why distance relationships are expected to fail by applying some of Lifton’s ideas. There are many reasons why people might expect distance relationships to be less satisfying, stable, and intense than proximal ones; LDRs must overcome challenges that PRs don’t have, such as emotional, social, logistic, financial, trust, and intimacy issues (Gardner, 2005). Of those concerns, intimacy is most often cited as the reason why LDRs are expected to fail. Due to the distance, LDR couples have fewer opportunities to bond and develop physical connection and intimacy than proximal couples. The lack of proximity also frustrates the attachment system, which leads to the feelings of sadness, anxiety and yearning which are characteristic of separation protest.

While feelings of sadness, anxiety, and yearning may seem obvious to those who have been in an LDR, I can describe the reaction of the attachment system more deeply by applying Lifton’s ideas to the situation. Romantic relationships can be a source of life imagery for a couple through emotional and physical connection to each other, movement of the relationship toward intimacy and closeness, and integrity of the couple as a unified whole. However, distance relationships cannot provide all of those types of life imagery to a couple as proximal relationships; in particular, they offer only limited physical connection. It may also be more difficult for long distance couples to feel...
movement in their relationship toward intimacy and enmeshment when they lack frequent face-to-face
communication, and it is probably tougher to feel the integrity of being a unified couple when one is physically
separated from one’s partner. I would argue that the separation protest that results when the couple is apart reflects
a kind of death anxiety caused by physical separation, stasis in the quality of their relationship, and the threat of
disintegration of the couple as a unified whole.

Idealization, another reason why distance relationships are expected to fail, is usually only cited by
professionals in the relationship field. Idealization tends to be prevalent in LDRs due to the lack of face-to-face
contact (Stafford & Reske, 1990), but it becomes a problem when the couple spends time together. If the couple is
extremely idealized, they discover when they are together that their idea of the relationship is not consistent with
reality, because they only acknowledge the good aspects of the relationship and ignore the less perfect ones
(Stafford & Reske, 1990). Too much idealization sets high standards of perfection in the mind that the partner and the
relationship will never be able to fulfill; when that happens, the relationship becomes disappointing to one or both
partners and will most likely end.

For my analysis of the potential problem, I will use Lifton’s idea of numbing. Lifton only discusses the
occurrence of numbing in circumstances of broadly based social turmoil, but I have modified the term to apply to
LDRs in a way that I call “selective numbing.” In response to personal relationship turmoil, I will argue that
idealization is selective numbing. To control the pain of separation, idealized individuals numb themselves to
negative feelings about their relationship and only allow themselves to feel the positive ones. That type of selective
numbing, only acknowledging the positive aspects of the relationship and the partner and suppressing the negative
ones, is not healthy for relationships because it is unrealistic. No matter how great the relationship is, there is no such
thing as perfection, and selectively numbed individuals don’t accept that. In order to resolve any issues a couple may
have, they must recognize the issues and attempt to work through them, but idealized couples cannot do that
because they ignore all negative feelings for each other.

Too much numbing is another problem that can occur in distance relationships. If the stress and pain of
separation becomes extremely difficult for an individual in a distance relationship, the individual may go beyond
selective numbing and begin to suppress all emotions for the partner, both positive and negative. Too much numbing
is characteristic of avoidantly attached individuals, and it is more closely related to the type of numbing that Lifton discusses. According to Chapman, Pistole and Roberts (2010), avoidant attachers try to suppress all emotional feelings toward their partner in order to prevent the negative feelings associated with separation protest. In trying to control the pain of separation, avoidant attachers destroy all means of connecting emotionally with their partners, essentially dissolving the relationship.

In spite of all the challenges and hardships that distance relationships must deal with, research shows that they tend to be just as satisfying, stable, and intense as proximal relationships, and sometimes even more. For example, a study conducted by Stafford and Merolla (2007) revealed that “Long distance dating relationships scored significantly higher than geographically close dating relationships” (p. 44), in all five dependent variables they studied, which included love, healthy levels of idealistic distortion, positive reminiscences, perceived agreement, and communication quality. In a separate study by Stafford and Reske (1990), the results revealed that distance individuals “report being more satisfied with their relationships than the geographically close individuals” (p. 277). The LDR individuals also reported being more in love than their PR counterparts (Stafford & Reske, 1990). Again, I’d like to provide a deeper explanation for these findings by bringing Lifton back into the conversation. I’ll return to his ideas of death imagery, life imagery, and selective numbing, and I will use these three ideas to provide an explanation for the unexpected success of distance relationships.

First, I would argue that Lifton’s concept of death anxiety gives insight into how distance relationships can be just as satisfying and intense as proximal ones. Death anxiety is normally a negative thing, but it works in complex ways in LDRs. Couples in distance relationships know that their time together, when they have it, is limited, and they will eventually have to experience the death anxiety caused by physical separation, stasis in the intimacy of their relationship, and potential disintegration of the relationship when they are apart. Kelli Gardner (2005) observes that “members of long distance couples often dread the impending separation” (p. 2) which creates an urgency and appreciation for the relationship which might not have otherwise existed. This can motivate the couple to make the limited time they do spend together more meaningful and intense. In addition to a greater appreciation for the time they have together, members of distance couples often have a special appreciation for their partners that proximal couples may not have. LDR couples “tend not to take their partner for granted” (Lin & Mietzner, 2005 p. 193). They
are aware of the death anxiety and separation protest that occur when they are separated, so they can more fully appreciate the life imagery that they feel when they are together.

Second, Lifton’s concept of life imagery can explain how distance relationships survive and are equally as satisfying, stable, and intense as proximal relationships. LDR couples must act creatively to experience life imagery in their relationships. PR couples can use simple activities to experience life imagery in their relationships, such as doing small tasks together, taking a walk or playing a game, or even just sitting together and talking about nothing. Performing activities together allows them to feel life imagery through physical connection, movement in the shared activity, and integrity as a couple. People in LDRs cannot use the same activities to put life imagery into their relationships because the physical proximity or togetherness is not available to them, so they must move beyond the physical stage of life imagery and use creativity to experience life imagery in its more advanced stages, the relationship stage and conceptual stage. There are many ways that LDR couples are doing that, and each couple can figure out the ways that work best for them.

The relationship enhancing behaviors identified by Chapman, Pistole and Roberts (2010) are one technique distance couples use to create life imagery in their relationship. As I previously stated, distance couples use these tools to help get through, and give meaning to, long periods of separation. There are three tools for creating life imagery: prospective, introspective, and retrospective behaviors. Prospective behaviors “address anticipated separation.” Prospective behaviors include hugging and kissing goodbye, a physical connection, and making plans for the next meeting, which confirms movement in the relationship toward a goal. Introspective behaviors help “maintain connection during separation.” These behaviors include activities such as writing letters to each other, Skyping each other, or talking on the phone. These activities continue the emotional connection while the partners cannot be physically together and allow them to maintain movement in their enmeshment in each other’s lives. Video conferencing programs, such as Skype and Facetime, drastically improve the quality of introspective behaviors because they allow partners to see and talk to each other in real time, almost as if they were together. While it is not entirely the same as physical proximity, it is better than simply talking on the phone or emailing because it allows partners to feel connection, movement, and integrity through body language, eye contact, and shared experience. Finally, there are restrospective behaviors, which “reaffirm connection after separation.” Retrospective behaviors
include activities such as talking face to face when partners are reunited, which confirms the integrity of the couple after a long period of separation (Chapman, Pistole, & Roberts, 2010 p. 537). By using these tools, couples can experience life imagery in their relationship through more than just the physical avenue; they can experience connection, movement and integrity through their shared interests and by connecting themselves to ideas larger than themselves, even when they are miles and miles apart.

Stafford and Merolla (2007) note that the reminiscent thinking is a “desirable aspect of LDRs that is often lost upon becoming proximal” (p. 39); Reminiscent thinking is another possible way that LDR couples put life imagery into their relationships without being geographically close. Reminiscent thinking is ruminating on positive memories and thoughts about the relationship, which could enhance the relationship (Stafford & Merolla, 2007). Even though all couples engage in some reminiscent thinking, it is especially effective for distance couples because “such ruminations are more pervasive when partners are not in each other’s presence” (p. 39). Thinking positively about the relationship, especially when one knows that one’s partner is also thinking about the relationship, offers LDR couples integrity as a couple. The mutual reminiscence on fond memories confirms the partners’ status as a couple and can add to their feelings of connection and wholeness.

The most important and surprising factor that contributes to LDR success is the selective numbing which I mentioned earlier. This may seem contradictory, since numbing is one of the reasons why LDRs are expected to fail, but numbing works in LDRs in complex and creative ways. As previously mentioned, numbing in the form of extreme idealization or avoidant attachment is bad for the health of the relationship. However, a small amount of numbing in the form of idealization is actually good because it helps reduce the pain of loneliness and separation, and keeps people together in a difficult situation. According to Stafford and Merolla (2007) “some idealization is good, if not necessary, for relationships” (p. 50). It isn’t about getting rid of all emotional feelings for one’s partner or thinking about the relationship in a completely positive, unrealistic way – it can be used in a healthy way by reducing the pain of separation and enhancing the excitement and anticipation for the couple’s next reunion.

Even though LDR couples manage to have high levels of satisfaction, intensity, and stability, most people would choose to have a geographically proximal relationship, if they could (Stafford & Merolla, 2007). Ironically, for many of those couples, being apart is what keeps them together. High levels of idealization are common in many
distance relationships, and while that may keep the relationship exciting and intense while it is distal, it can cause problems for the couple once they become permanently proximal.

To counteract the possible negative effects that idealization in long distance relationships can have, it is important that LDR couples become aware of the idealization that exists, and work to balance idealization with realism for the sake of the relationship. They should not try to get rid of all idealization; some idealization is good for couples because it allows partners to focus on each other’s best, most valuable traits, and keeps the relationship exciting. Even proximal couples should have some idealization in their relationships so they don’t forget the special qualities that they most admire in their partners or take their partners for granted. Finding the right balance between too much idealization and not enough is the key to success and satisfaction in both long distance and proximal relationships; distance couples must make sure they are not so idealized that their idea of the relationship is unrealistic, and proximal couples must make sure to maintain some idealization in the relationship to keep it exciting.

For LDR couples, there are a few ways to reduce the amount of idealization that exists in a relationship. One of the easiest ways is to be as honest as possible with one another. That may seem obvious, but when two people don’t see each other very often, it is easy to bend the truth or leave parts of it out to maintain a positive image to the partner. Telling stories in the most realistic way possible is a great way for partners to reveal their true selves and find out if they really are a good match. Talking about the little things is another way to reduce idealization; discussing every day, mundane topics such as what they ate for lunch, what homework they have due that day, a funny story from class or work, or just updating each other on their daily schedules, is a good way for LDR couples to get a realistic picture of what it would be like to actually spend the day with their partners. I am currently in a distance relationship myself, and I personally find these techniques helpful. When I talk to my partner, I like to ask him specific questions about what he did that day so I can get an idea of what it would be like to spend a day with him. That way, if we ever do end up living near each other, I will know what to expect because I have a realistic idea of his daily life.

For proximal couples, putting some idealization back into the relationship is the challenge. One way couples can do this is by writing letters to each other about all the reasons why they love each other. Focusing on their favorite aspects of the partner helps proximal couples remember why they fell in love in the first place and can bring back some of that original passion and excitement. This technique helps the couple bring the more advanced stages
of life imagery back into the relationship by feeling connection, movement and integrity through their relationship with each other and the ideas they share, rather than just through their physical connection. Being able to experience life imagery in its more advanced stages could help the couple enrich their relationship with each other. A second technique couples could try is to spend an extended period of time away from each other. The partners can then focus on the things they miss about their partner, and what they enjoy most about being with their partner that they cannot do while they are apart. That period of separation will give the partners a small taste of death anxiety caused by the physical separation, stasis in the relationship, and disintegration of a physically unified couple. Experiencing a little death anxiety can help partners appreciate the time they spend and the things they do together.

By employing some of the techniques I mentioned, or even coming up with some of their own, both proximal and distance couples can gauge the amount of idealization that exists in their relationship and work toward healthier levels. Regulating idealization levels in the relationship could help couples in all geographic situations find happiness and satisfaction in their romantic relationships.
References


Erin Foreman  
Wilmington College

A Journey Toward Druidic Sacrifice in *Tess of the d’Urbervilles*

Religion and sexual power produce tension, debate, and cultural strife because many individuals perceive the world around them and the people in it through these lenses. Societal and national suppression and persecution have often resulted from these issues. Conflicting religions and sexual dominance are acted out in Thomas Hardy’s novel *Tess of the d’Urbervilles* through the sacrifice of Tess’s body. Tess’s sacrificial nature takes on various forms and religions through which a conflict arises between Tess and her Druidic religion and the Victorian patriarchal society and its religion, Christianity. She sacrifices her virginity and ultimately her life to male desire and a patriarchal society for her family’s benefit, and her journey through these trials takes her toward the realization of her own pagan religion based in Celtic tradition.

Critics often equate Tess with Greek mythology and tragedy, but Celtic religious worship practices and beliefs parallel Tess’s sacrificial life more closely. Henri Kozicki concludes that *Tess of the d'Urbervilles* is written in the pattern of a Greek tragedy with a pagan Tess as a hero and a sacrifice (151). Additionally, Nicole Harris claims that Tess has a connection to Greek myth through her sacrifice to Apollo at Stonehenge (18). However, she is not sacrificed to Apollo because Stonehenge is not connected with the Greeks. Hardy was influenced by the belief that the Celts worshiped at Stonehenge, and logic leads to the theory that he associated it with the Celtic religion.

A close inspection of how druidic beliefs affect reading *Tess of the d’Urbervilles* argues that assumption. The Druids, a priestly subset in the group collectively known as Celts, illuminates many of the settings in *Tess of the d’Urbervilles* and the decisions she makes. Traditional Druidic practice worships nature through its deities and worship centers emphasizing sacrificial substitution. According to Roy Willis, in *World Mythology*, deities in this ancient religion represent the seasons, the sun and fertility, highlighting maternity. One such instance, a statue of three females a maiden, a mother and an older woman, supports the idea of a triune goddess representing fertility, reproduction and maturity (178). These goddesses are a way to worship the female body and its contributions to society through procreation and wisdom.
In addition, the most prevalent aspects of the Druidic gods are their connections to aspects of female fertility. Specifically, Scott Littleton writes that Belenus, a male god associated with agriculture through the sun, was celebrated in the spring when everything blooms and recovers from winter (256, 258). While the majority of the deities are female, the males are valued for what they contribute to female processes. The Celts placed importance on life and birth through what their deities represented. This society deified and valued its women as the Victorians, historically patriarchal, did not.

Surrounded by Mother Nature, the Druids worshiped according to the rhythms of the earth. In The Druids, Stuart Piggott explains their places of worship: “The concept of the temple [...] was as alien to the Celts as to their predecessors in barbarian Europe” (48). In essence, the Druid’s worship atmosphere did not include immense structures. Instead, they preferred “woodland clearings” and “groves” where they could be closer to the deities they honored (Piggott 48). A word in Gallo-Brittonic for these places of worship, “nemeton,” denotes a sanctuary or shrine linked to groves, clearings and woods. One example, Drunemeton, means sacred oak-grove (63-64). Since place names are a vehicle for cultural expression, sacred groves held significance in Druidic society.

Ceremonies in these “nemetons” varied, but some included human sacrifice of one or more people to gain divine favor, a model for Tess’s sacrifice. Archeological evidence points to animal and human sacrifice. Piggott writes that human bones have been found inside sacred groves and earthen enclosures (67). Kenneth Davis cites specific human remains, known as Lindow Man, found in a peat bog. He writes, “His skull was flattened with three blows of an ax; he was strangled by a cord knotted three times; and his blood was emptied with a slice through his jugular” (277). The systematic way in which this man died points to a ritual killing while the slit throat suggests the sacrificial nature of the ritual. The man had eaten a cake made with mistletoe, a sacred plant of the Celts. Davis writes that some Celtic experts believe he may have offered himself to appease the gods and procure a victory over the Romans (278). Additionally, Scott Littleton remarks that “Tollund Man” was found in a bog in Denmark executed exactly the same way as Lindow Man (267). This kind of sacrifice was not an isolated practice but spanned the English Channel.

Druidic corporate festivals coincided with the seasons and focused not on sacrifice but life and birth. One such celebration sure to have existed in Celtic tradition is called Beltane, meaning “bright or goodly fire.” It was held
on May 1 and involved lighting fires and leading herd animals past them in purfication and protection rituals (Davis 281). The celebration’s placement during the year holds significance because it is at the beginning of the growing season and honors the sun god who controls its and life-giving power.

The Druids and Stonehenge have a controversial and ambiguous history that oscillates between the Druids building it as a temple and a separation of thousands of years between the building of Stonehenge and the start of Celtic domination in Britain. An eighteenth century researcher slightly before Hardy’s time, William Stukeley, popularized the idea that Stonehenge and the Druids are connected (Grinsell 5). Piggott contends, “The association of the monument and the priesthood has become so established a piece of English folk-lore that it is too often forgotten that its origins lie no earlier than the late seventeenth century” (136). While many people think that the Druids used Stonehenge, the idea that the two are connected did not emerge until the 1600s nor did it become popular until the 1700s.

Since Hardy published *Tess of the d’Urbervilles* in its entirety in 1891 and serially before that he wrote under the influence of this connective thought. Celtic and Druidic traditional worship practices appear throughout Hardy’s novel in such a way that Tess dances in the festivals, follows the calendar, and worships on altars consecrated to those pagan gods. From the beginning she portraits a priestess in Druidic tradition at a May-Day Celebration. Hardy’s portrayal of Tess begins in a setting where she celebrates this festival. The narrator states, “the country was densely wooded [. . . and . . .] traces of its earlier condition are to be found in the old oak copses and irregular belts of timber” (36). The description points to the country’s history as a wooded area, but particularly mentions that sacred oak groves are present. Since this is also the place where she grew up, Tess is brought up in Druid country and, as the narrator puts it, is observing a celebration that has descended from the May-Day dance (36). Also Tess is dressed in white, carrying and waving a branch in one hand and flowers in the other, walking in a group dressed the same, and marching toward a bonfire around which she and the others will dance in May (37). This imagery suggests that Tess dressed like a young priestess is worshiping Belenus at his May-Day celebration. She begins her life worshiping a pagan god during a pagan holiday. Ironically, not participating in the patriarchal Christian system on the day it intervenes, through a minister, and reminds her family of its position in it.
While living with and working for the fake d’Urbervilles, the new bastions of patriarchy, Tess is forced to sacrifice her virginity. The rape occurs in a sacred druidic grove. Alec takes her deep into the woods called “The Chase - the oldest wood in England” (92). The ancient wood’s status as the ‘oldest’ immediately connects it to Druidic worship. In these woods, Alec reveals that he has showered her family with gifts: a horse so they can survive and toys for the children so he can use them as leverage to assert his patriarchal dominance (92-93). She now feels indebted to Alec. When he rapes her, he finds her, “sleeping soundly, and upon her eyelashes there lingered tears” (94). She cries herself to sleep because she knows she has been put in an obligatory state. He seduces and coerces her into sex by assisting her family and catching her while she is sleeping. He carries her to her religion's most sacred place and violates the most sacred sanctuary of her body. Because the sacrifice is not her choice, her faith is perverted into a travesty.

After this desecration, she tries to find solace for her dying son but cannot get satisfaction from Christianity without altering it. Her father prevents the parson from christening her child, so Tess performs the ceremony (113). Her attitude about this subversion is telling of her true belief: “If providence would not ratify such an act of approximation she, for one, did not value the kind of heaven lost by the irregularity” (114). She does not want to be part of a religion that will not accept her best efforts. When she later tries to get her son buried in the cemetery since she had baptized him, she finds that her efforts have been fruitless, so she forsakes the proper channels and buries her son by bribing the sexton (Hardy 116). She seeks consolation, but institutionalized Christianity turns her away refusing to make concessions for circumstances beyond her control.

Once past this religious experimentation, Tess returns to living her life by nature, as she had at the May-Day celebration. She contracts her employment according to the seasons, coinciding with druidic ceremonial days, inadvertently bringing her back to her religion. At a farm in Flintcomb-Ash a farmer’s wife, “made no objection to hiring Tess, on her agreeing to remain till Old Lady-Day” (282). She returns to matriarchal hierarchy and acquires her employment from a female. Also, Tess agrees to work at this farm until April 6, “Old Lady-Day.” According to a footnote, this is the same as the Feast of the Annunciation as it was on the calendar before 1752 and coincides with the spring equinox around the same time as Beltane. She is back to following her Druidic religion by aligning her life with a Druidic timetable.
Tess encounters patriarchal Christianity again through Alec after he converts to evangelical Christianity, but his new faith does not protect her. He immediately breaks faith to pursue her. After Tess is pushed to the limits of her endurance, she gives into patriarchy and becomes Alec's kept woman later escaping regardless of the consequences. When she kills Alec, she gains power as never before. She regains her matriarchal religion by empowering herself, emasculating Alec, and taking the masculine role of executioner for his crimes. When she catches up with Angel on the road, she says to him, “I feared long ago, when I struck him on the mouth with my glove, that I might do it some day for the trap he set for me in my youth” (Hardy 372). Apparently, she has been thinking all along about killing Alec. When she does, she gets justice for the desecration of her sacred alters and sanctuaries by enforcing her own will and acquiring power for herself, returning to her Druidic roots through an escape into the countryside.

In her personal sacrifice at Stonehenge, she offers her life in exchange for her sister in true Druidic fashion. When Tess and Angel get to Stonehenge, she says, “One of my mother’s people was a shepherd here-abouts, now I think of it [. . .] So now I am at home” (Hardy 380). She relates herself directly to her matriarchal druidic ancestors. Adam Gussow argues, “Stonehenge is Tess’ [. . .] terrainian point of ancestral and spiritual convergence, Home Base” (19). Through her life’s journey, she finds her connection to her land, ancestors and spiritual center. Since nineteenth century scholars connected this monument with Druids, and her mother’s family lived there, the implication is she has descended from Druids. This is the basis to her assertion of coming “home,” while reclaiming her faith and peace. Though she knows she is lying on an altar, she speaks contentedly. She asks Angel to take care of her sister so that she will have lived and died as a substitution. She peacefully and willingly becomes a sacrifice for her sister, a Druidic practice according to the evidence of the bog burials.

Tess, as a woman, embodies the struggle between pagan matriarchy and Christian patriarchy. Since she does not follow Christian belief, she becomes an outcast to the system in which she no longer participates. Now, she must either be forcibly converted back to Christianity or killed. Nina Pelikan Straus’s article concerning three late nineteenth century female characters that die illuminates this struggle by applying an analysis that focuses on the Victorian ‘woman question.’ She writes that the “heroine carries questions about the relation of mind to world that is answered only to the degree that female skepticism leading to suicide affirms male self-trust” (74). For Straus, these
questions only relate to how male and female perspectives on the world are at war with each other, and the only way for males to feel confident that they are correct is for the female to self-destruct. Applying this interplay to the relationship between Christianity and Paganism, Tess represents paganism that is persecuted out of existence and forced to self-destruct.

This persecution is accentuated by a conflict between faith and institution represented by Tess’s instinctive behavior and values and those of Victorian society. The narrator says, “Most of the misery had been generated by her conventional aspect and not her innate sensations” (Hardy 110). “Her conventional aspect” is that she views herself through the eyes of society, and “her innate sensations” are the intuitions derived from her heritage. If she could eliminate viewing herself according to the conventional moral code, she would not be so miserable because her gut would tell her that she has done nothing wrong. The narrator asserts multiple times that Tess is never indicted by nature rather by a hypocritical society that places her in situations making it impossible to act appropriately and survive.

The absence of social justice for women and minority religions from institutionalized Christianity in patriarchal Victorian society centers on Tess. Deanna Kreisel writes, “Tess of the d’Urbervilles consistently affects a process of internalization wherein natural, social, economic, and even rhetorical operations are envisioned as taking place within the individual, and are in turn relocated physically within the human body” (182). Internalization is a method for creating a character and placing larger social issues into it. Tess, as the protagonist of Hardy’s novel, is the medium into which social issues are transported so they can be analyzed. The ministers, Alec, and Angel are the agents of suppressive patriarchal Christian society in her life. The ministers condemn her; Alec rapes her; and Angel deserts her. Because of her status as a woman shunned because she is raped, the consequences society doles out on fallen women are unjustly applied to Tess. One also understands that Tess believes in a marginalized and previously eradicated religion, and institutionalized Christianity’s war on other belief systems is transferred into Tess’s body.

Because Tess embraces the power of her femininity and her pagan religion by actively choosing to kill Alec and sacrifice herself at Stonehenge, she dies; therefore, her choices are not recognized as a rebellion against the oppressive Christian society that holds her captive. Her journey leads her toward final liberation in accepting Druidic
paganism. Even though she is not strong enough to prevail and live, Tess still sees herself dying in the place of her
sister and for what she believes in, but the institutions based on Christianity kill her for being one more dangerous
nuisance that must be eliminated along with all the fallen women and Pagan religions that threaten the male-

Works Cited


Within post-modern society there is a greater ability for the individual to expand beyond traditional societal constructs. John Harrop describes the situation as, “twenty-first century society lacks faith and is broken into heterogeneous, individual units,” (326). This individualistic break leads to a problem within the theatre. The theatre experience seeks to create a commonality within its audience, a commonality that becomes harder to create given the many different belief systems in existence today. Theatre theorist, Jerzy Grotowski suggests that through myth the lost commonality within the audience can be recreated. By analyzing Vaclav Havel’s *Temptation* and Martin Crimp’s *Attempts on Her Life* through Jerzy Grotowski’s theory of myth as a means to audience commonality I will show that hieroglyphs, classical writing techniques and traditional theatre subject matter are the building blocks of the theatre experience within post-modern society.

Grotowski used myth as a means to create alienation and in turn use that alienation to create a commonality within his audience. According to Harrop, “This form of theatre is avowedly idealistic; it is a search for human identity through the confrontation of the myth and rediscovery of ritual” (326). Through the confrontation of the myth Grotowski sought to leave the audience with a profound realization. On the issue of the audience realization Grotowski comments, “The spectator thus had a renewed awareness of his personal truth in the truth of the myth, and through fright and a sense of the sacred he came to catharsis” (Grotowski 22). To Grotowski theatre has always been part of ritual, and even though the rituals have faded the energy that once was released in ritual was still there, still available to be tapped into given the right provocation (Grotowski 22). Grotowski sought to explore the roots of drama and ritual as a means of uncovering the essentials needed to tap into that still present but latent energy. Grotowski saw this untapped energy as the catalyst to create commonality even in the most diverse audiences.

Grotowski’s ideas of myth were influenced by psychiatrist Carl Jung’s theory of the collective unconscious. Hall describes the collective unconscious as, “a reservoir of latent images usually primordial images…a primordial image refers to the earliest development of the psyche” (39). Jung believed that there was a part of the psyche that
was inherited much like other inheritable traits within the body. As the evolved over time parts of the psyche developed as well. Hall explains,

> The mind, through its physical counterpart, the brain, has inherited characteristics that determine the ways in which a person will react to life’s experiences and even determine what types of experiences he will have" (39).

Jung called these characteristics archetypes, Grotowski renamed these characteristics hieroglyphs and considered these characteristics the key to creating the much-needed commonality within his audience.

Within Havel’s *Temptation* the character of Fistula creates a hieroglyph within the play. Fistula, on the surface is the name of an abscess, an unhealing wound that can turn necrotic and kill. Though out the play and most clearly in Scene 2 it becomes clear that the character of Fistula has is not some outside force acting upon Foustka but, an internal lacking that has slowly built up to this point. As Foustka admonishes Fistula for approaching him, Fistula appears to repeatedly tempt Foustka with the knowledge that Foustka seeks. In actuality, this scene is the final hemorrhage, the point in which Foustka takes that final step onto the road that will lead to his ruin. When Foustka says, “You’ve missed my meaning,” (Havel 20) he’s the one that is truly lost. Within this scene Fistula comes to represent the Jungian archetypes of “magic”, “the trickster”, and “the demon” (Hall 41).

While the hieroglyph within *Temptation* is a character; within Crimp’s *Attempts on Her Life* the hieroglyph is an object, Annie’s red knapsack. The red knapsack within the scene “Mum and Dad” can come to represent “death”, and “power” (Hall 41). Annie carries her red knapsack all over the world and it is also the tool she uses to attempt suicide. The knapsack filled with rocks becomes her means to take power and death into her own hands. Annie controls when and where she will die. As one voice says,

> In other words she’s planned all this, she’s planned on thrashing, she knew she’d thrash, and equally knew that the bag would go on dragging her down regardless. So there’s never at any point any question of the attempt failing (Crimp 27).

With the knapsack Annie is able to take both the power she has been denied and her death into her own hands. The voices tell Annie’s story, trying to take back the power that Annie’s attempt has taken.
Within Grotowski's theory of myth the issue of the original subject matter of drama arises. Grotowski searched for the original roots of drama, the history of drama in ritual. Harrop says,

> The earliest human rituals were concerned with hunting and sexual activity- with the main events and cyclical process of life. Killing and restoring life, nakedness and fertility, the passage from boyhood to manhood, from child to warrior- it is from these that drama takes its preoccupation with violence, love and death. (326)

Grotowski believed that through the exploration of these themes he would be able to connect with his audience's collective unconscious and create the commonality that he saw as the main goal with his Poor Theatre.

In Havel’s *Temptation* the basic themes of love and violence are present within Scene 4. In Vilma’s apartment the couple’s fight displays both love and violence. Vilma and Foustka show their love through the games they play while the violence only comes in when Foustka physically attacks Vilma. The violence comes to a head when the dancer has left and Vilma kisses Foustka. With her “I love you” (Havel 45), the attack begins, the violence and love within this scene create a tension within the audience especially within a modern culture that sees the two themes as opposition. Within this scene Foustka voices the type of catharsis that Grotowski is seeking in his audience, “It’s as if something dark inside of me were suddenly beginning to flow out of its hiding place and into the open” (Havel 43). The death of Foustka in Scene 10 highlights both the themes of violence and death. The death of Foustka after he is exposed plays out as a ritual, a very Grotowskian idea.

Crimp’s Attempts on Her Life uses the basic themes to create a performance peace that explores the different faces of a person living in post-modern society. In “The Tragedy of Love and Ideology” Crimp creates a scene of love, while the voices painting this scene repeatedly state, “these are the basic ingredients” (9). Crimp presents to the audience exactly how common this story truly is. Love becomes on of the most overused, simple themes to the voices within this scene. One voice says,

> A whole, exactly tragedy unfolds before our eyes in Paris, Prague, Venice or Berlin to name but four, as the moon, vast and orange, rises over the Renaissance domes, Baroque palaces, nineteenth-century zoos and railway stations, and modernist slabs of social housing exemplifying the dictum form follows function” (9).
In the scene "Faith in Ourselves" violence and death take center stage; the juxtaposition of the originally harmonious valley and the violence and death that the soldiers bring the primal need for violence is satisfied in the present day audience. The graphic depictions of violence, “Burying them alive up to their necks, in the fertile earth, then smashing their skulls open with a spade. They have a name for this. ‘The Flower’” (14), satisfy the audience’s primal need for violence while also making them aware of that need. The graphic violence shocks the audience. This shock creates the catharsis and alienation that Grotowski was searching for in post-modern works. By representing the destruction of the harmonious past in such a violent manner, Crimp can represent the primal instincts that still within the audience.

Throughout Crimp’s *Attempts on Her Life*, there are no real characters. Ann repeatedly is mentioned but is never onstage. This technique creates a play of voices, varied voices that reflects back to the historical Greek chorus, the group experience that was the basis of the early theatre experience. The play takes place in other’s minds and through other’s words. The performance becomes a secondhand reiteration of another’s story, a retelling, and a new myth. On the creation of the new myth Wiles writes, “the idea that ordinary, petty men unconsciously enact the mythologies and archetypes which stand behind their tradition” (146). The story of the faces of Ann then creates a new myth, a myth built on the already existing modern mythology.

Havel employs a classical story as a means to comment on a modern situation in Temptation. The Faust myth goes back centuries. The idea of a tragic hero goes back even further. Foustka’s flaw is hubris; he believes that he can outsmart the system. The commentary on the system is a modern one; the tragic hero that believes that he can outsmart the system is not. Through the retelling of the Faust myth and the utilization of the tragic hero myth, Havel is able to create a play that both comments on a current situation while effecting both those who have and have not been exposed communism. When discussing modern theatre Peter Brooks writes, “But a shifting, chaotic world often must choose between a playhouse that offers a spurious ‘yes’ or a provocation so strong that it splinters its audience into fragments of vivid ‘nos’” (39). The structure of Temptation offers a story that any audience member can connect to, and then it creates the splinters within the audience that Brooks looks for.

By creating situations that become a type of hyper-myth the playwright is able to create commonality within the audience through alienation. Within *Attempts on Her Life* Crimp alienates his audience through the portrayal of
the primitive aspects of humanity that still exist today. In *Temptation*, Havel offers a commentary on the evils of a system that has lost sync with its humanity. The audience becomes more aware of their present situation by being forced to compare themselves to their mythic counterparts. Crimp presents the brutality that modern audiences think beneath them while Havel presents the consequences of what happens when humanity is lost.

Works Cited


The Satan Phenomenon

Who is Satan? Although it may seem so, this question is not easily answered. Satan has worn many faces over the course of history. These changes in Satan as a character are a reflection of philosophical, political, religious, and scientific changes in local and global society, and can be traced best through literature. This paper is an attempt to briefly overview the main changes of Satan's characterization by looking at the point of origin and analyzing both British and American literature to get a 360 degree view of the variations in his personality. John Milton's *Paradise Lost* was the catalyst for this still occurring change, and William Blake and Mark Twain used the ideals of their societies to twist Satan further away from the face of evil; nostalgia for this original version of the devil causes satiric literature and consumerism of the devil in the educated masses of modern society.

Perhaps one of the most widely-accepted descriptions of Satan is that of a fallen angel, which is commonly cited from the Bible. The idea that this depiction of Satan is centered in the Bible is a common misconception. In fact, there is no biblical account of Satan as a fallen angel. The portrayal of Satan, the face of pure evil, as a fallen angel is first seen in Book VI of John Milton's *Paradise Lost*. In Book VI the reader is thrown into a war-zone. Satan, still Lucifer at this point, and his followers, meet to fight Abdiel and the forces of Heaven. Satan and Abdiel have a few words before Satan loses to him (although it was supposed to be impossible for Abdiel to win) and falls nine days through chaos into Hell (Milton 6.1-905). This is the first account of Lucifer falling into Hell and becoming Satan.

In this portrayal, Milton created a sympathetic character in the devil. The change that took place was not purposeful, but a result of the use of epic conventions and Milton's attempt to give the general population an explanation for a harsh God by writing *Paradise Lost*. As a result of the protestant reformation, Christianity during the 17th century had become a harsh and strict religion (Ward, Prothero, and Leathes 447). Milton decided to write *Paradise Lost* in the form of the epic because, not only was it one of the most respected forms of literature at the time, but because he thought it was the best way to explain why the rules of Christianity were so strict. In using epic
conventions, Milton began the reversal of the classical Satan into the satirical object he is viewed as today. The agent that begins this change is the epic convention of the flawed king. Logically, Milton would have to write God as king, and throughout his entire collection Milton wrote him as a jealous God who wanted humans (Adam and Eve) to prove that they loved him above all else (Milton 2). God as a flawed king leads way to the epic convention of a perfect hero, and logically, the only true adversary to God is Satan. By way of exclusion, Satan accidentally becomes the hero of Paradise Lost.

Before we discuss popular philosophies of the 17th century however, we must compare Milton's humanistic Satan of fallacy to the Satan of the Bible. Although not described as a good character, is described in a charismatic way:

"Bright morning star, how you have
fallen from heaven,
thrown to earth, prostrate among the
nations!" (Isaiah 14:12).

There is not many accounts of Satan in the Old Testament, but the few passages it does have shows God doing most of the punishing. In the story of David's Census recounted in both the first Chronicles and the second Samuel, God sends pestilence across Israel because he was angry at David for taking a census. "The Lord sent a pestilence throughout Israel and 70,000 Israelites died" (1 Chronicles 21:14). This angry God is not present in the New Testament.

Satan as a hero had an immeasurable effect on the change in interpretation of Satan as a character. This does not seem to be the case for Satan, as although he feels pain and despises it, he does not seem to falter. Pallister argues that Satan, although he falls, still has many of the heroic powers he had as an angel. "This was Satan as Renaissance theology inherited him from late antiquity and the Middle Ages"(Pallister 151).

This reflects a philosophy that was popular at the time of the publication of Paradise Lost, empiricism, defined by knowledge that can only come through experience. There are major philosophical ideas that Milton touches upon by creating this new Satan. The idea that guilt, shame, and fear are innate; and, although he was not an empiricist himself, Milton's Satan was. "Satan is the clearest type of an empiricist who appears in any of Milton's
poetry..." (Fried 130). However, while there are inarguably empiricist values shown by Satan, they are perverted. "[Milton's] prose works give plentiful indications that he shared empiricist assumptions regarding epistemology and linguistics" (Fried 124). These empiricist values, although not implicit, show through in Satan's love to twist word meanings and a character's ability to judge through experience. Or, as Fried argues, a difference between sign and referent (125). It was the goal of empiricists to work hard to make sure this difference never occurred; however, Satan uses this fallacy between sign and referent to make his divine perversions seem like the truth. This perversion of truth and knowledge is shown in the quote below:

"err not that so shall end
the strife which thou call'st evil, but wee style
The strife of Glory; which we mean to win,
Or turn this heav'n itself into the Hell
Thou fablest, here however to dwell free,
If not to reign: meanwhile thy utmost force,
and join him nam'd almighty to thy aid,
I fly not, but have sought thee far and nigh." (Milton 6.288-95)

It was not until the 18th century, during the height of The Enlightenment that this perversion of Satan was used to further an argument that William Blake and other writers of the time had with institutional Christianity. During this century the belief of Satan in the educated masses had all but disappeared (Schock 441). Blake, along with many other writers of the time, had taken up an argument with that of religious institutions, using their writing to talk about corruption and inaccuracies. This particular group of writers was circled around the publisher and owner of a London bookstore, Joseph Johnson, and all established a reputation of revising the myth of Satan (Schock 442). These revisions gave Satan a range of functions that were categorically human. Blake and the other writers of the Johnson circle were the first ones to give Satan the use of irony and satire in order to express rebellion against conventional political, moral, and religious values (Schock 441). A prominent example of these revisions to the Satan myth is in The Marriage of Heaven and Hell by William Blake.
The Marriage of Heaven and Hell is not Blake’s first work to take on the revision of the Satanic myth, but it is one of the most extreme. The reversal of religious values, paired with the use of irony, is supposed to shock readers into viewing the inadequacies of moral institutions of the time (Greenblatt 148). In The Marriage of Heaven and Hell, Blake reverses the position of typical religion and takes on a diabolic persona. This is clear throughout the entire work, but is condensed in the "Proverbs of Hell," where Blake reverses the Christian proverbs, with his own complicated irony, to show the corruption and fallacies of religious institutions. Perhaps one of the most humorous examples is that of "The most sublime act is to set another before you" (Greenblatt 147). The irony in this is in the actions of religious institutions at the time, whose corruption could not even allow them to follow a diabolical proverb.

Blake also introduces his theory of "contraries," along with his use of irony. The idea of contraries can be best described as a cluster of maxims with no fixed, unchanging truth that is accepted above any other truth (Greenblatt 148). This idea can best be described in the proverb of hell, "The crow wish'd every thing was black, the owl that every thing was white" (Greenblatt 153). Blake condenses many meanings into a single line of his poetry. If there is no concrete abstraction of a truth accepted above any other truth, that creates a relationship between the two things being compared. Specifically, in the world of Blake's contraries, there is no such thing as pure evil and perfect goodness. They have a relationship with each other and both maxims have positive and negative qualities to them. To analyze this proverb further, one must look at the symbolism in both the crow and the owl, and the colors of black and white. With the ideals of the enlightenment in mind, it can be deduced that black and white could mean ignorance and knowledge.

The effects of the enlightenment crossed the Atlantic ocean and found themselves rooted in American Soil. With the growth of scientific research and industrialization that the enlightenment brought, paired with the educated masses distrust of religious institutions, philosophies at the turn of the 20th century started to sprout a fear of what Andrew DelBanco quotes as a, "speechless, pointless death" to end our existence in a meaningless world (DelBanco 157). The competition between religion and science left a hole of blame where Satan used to be. We start to see this fear in many of the Gilded Age and Modern authors. Being that this is a brief overview leading up to the satire and consumerism surround Satan, the most prominent of authors who deal with the change of Satan as a character is Mark Twain.
Specifically, *Letters from the Earth*, published posthumously by Mark Twain gives readers the clearest depiction of Satan as a character. Twain does this in a humorous way, by using Satan as an objective source of analysis for the actions of all human kind throughout history. The picture he paints of mankind is not a pleasant one, where even Satan is horrified by the way mankind lives and works.

"Man is without any doubt the most interesting fool there is.

Also the most eccentric. He hasn't a single written law, in

his Bible or out of it, which has any but just one purpose

and intention -- to limit or defeat the law of God." (Twain 14)

The quote above summarizes the point that Satan makes over and over again with different circumstances in human life. The man kind's imagination created their version of God and Heaven and the rules of how to gain access to both of those things, but no one actually follows those rules. Even though God's divine plan is made by humans they cannot follow through with any of the rules they have created for themselves. This is the foolishness that Satan discusses throughout his letters to Michael and Gabriel back in actual heaven.

This harshness towards human kind is a product of a time period where many great catastrophes were beginning to appear in industrialized society. It is important to understand the many changing ideals that occur through history around the author because it is only when the socio-economic status, the religion, politics, and philosophy that surround an author are understood that a reader can see where the writer is coming from. This fear that Delbanco mentioned in his book, *The Death of Satan*, has fully taken hold in society today.

In a contemporary look at the change of Satan we will look at *Good Omens* by Neil Gaiman and Terry Pratchett to fully understand the place that Satan has in literature and consequently our society today. *Good Omens* is a satire of The Book of John, the last book of the new testament, also known as the revelations. It is a book about the birth of the Anti-Christ and the network of heaven and hell that surrounds these prophetic happenstances. Delbanco notes an important literary theory of contemporary time in saying that "some of the metaphors we once used have withered away." With the idea that all metaphors do not last forever, it is curious to point out that there is no character of Satan used in *Good Omens* (223). He is mentioned in the Dramatis Personae as "Satan (A fallen angel; the Adversary)", but he never once plays a role in the story itself (Gaiman and Pratchett 7). Where even less
than two centuries ago, Satan would of purposely been the main character in a piece of literature about the apocalypse and the coming of the Anti-Christ, he is only mentioned by name once in the introduction to the story.

This lax view of Satan as a character, paired with the fact that he has started to go missing as a character of true evil in our culture reflects the changes of social, political, religious, and philosophical changes throughout history. This change that started with the romantics during the Enlightenment is still affecting our society today. Delbanco states that this deficit of Satan has left a nostalgia in our culture for something society once had (220). The fight to reign between religion and science has left society unsure of the correct place to put characters like Satan. It tries it's hardest to replace the hole left by an evolution of the ideology of the general, educated masses. As a result, the use of sarcasm, satire, and consumerism are evoked. Colin Campbell states in his book *The Romantic Ethic and the Spirit of Modern Consumerism*, that the romantic culture cultivated in the Enlightenment plays a crucial part in modern consumerism (2). Satan has become an object of consumerism, fascination, and humor because that is what the population demands.

The society that used to believe that the supply of evil came from the devil is long gone. According to a report by Kenneth Woodward, only 26% of Roman Catholics believe in the tangible existence of the devil (2). The reign of Satan as the face of pure evil is dying as our culture changes and our demands and ideologies change. Satan is becoming "an old religious metaphor" (Woodward 2). We no longer experience daily evil with the name of the devil on our tongues, but instead shrug our shoulders and state "shit happens" (Woodward 2). Evil it's loosing the face it once had--the face of Satan.

While this is only a very brief overview of only two major literary canon figures from both British and American lit, and John Milton who started documenting this change in literature, one can see a clear pattern of the loss of metaphor between evil and Satan in almost any cannon work. In order to fully understand the depth and complexity of this change in society, as most accurately analyzed through literature, would take a life time. In short, the devil turned hero, turned human, turned joke and it was through no fault of his own.

[207]
Works Cited


Joyce’s Lotus Eaters: The Epic Tradition in Ulysses

In *Conversations with James Joyce*, Joyce was quoted saying “[w]hat makes most people’s lives unhappy is some disappointed romanticism, some unrealizable or misconceived ideal…In Ulysses I tried to keep close to that fact” (qtd. in Johnson xxii). In Ulysses, Joyce makes this belief apparent by employing a cunning subversion of Homer’s epic tradition, presenting the idealized heroism of Odysseus as an unattained goal of the modern world, driving its citizenry into a state of depressed escapism. Nowhere is this subversion of the epic ideal more visible than in *Ulysses*’s fifth episode, *The Lotus Eaters*. Framed as a narrative account of Leopold Bloom wandering the streets of Dublin, running errands before the funeral of Paddy Dignam, the episode is among the most Homeric within *Ulysses*, in that it deals fairly closely with some of the same subject matter that Homer deals with in his corresponding segment. While most the episodes of the text have a certain anti-epic quality to them, *Lotus Eaters* seems to do the most to specifically call the structure and assumptions made by the Homeric epic into question. Even though Leopold Bloom serves as our anti-Odysseus throughout the entirety of *Ulysses*, it is in the Lotus Eaters, where his actions seem to most directly call the actions of the actual Odysseus into question.

Homer’s *Lotus Eaters* represents the shortest episode in *The Odyssey*, accounting for only 23 lines of poetry. Odysseus and his men land on an island and are greeted by the native tribe, referred to as the Lotus Eaters. While on the island, the natives offer Odysseus and his men lotus to eat, which makes those sailors who do eat the plant lose their interest in returning home, instead they become content to lie around on the island for the rest of their lives. Odysseus then takes the men who ate the lotus, drags them back to the ship and the episode concludes as they sail off towards Ithaca once more. Like most of the episodic adventures that Odysseus recounts to the Phaeacians, the Lotus Eaters represents one of the challenges that Odysseus had to overcome in order to return home to Ithaca; in this case, the desire to simply give up
on his quest and live a life that is not wrought with the challenges of attempting to return to his family. In addition, the story serves to frame Odysseus as an idealized leader figure, a man who takes charge of a situation and does what is right for his men, even if they object to his actions.

Joyce, by contrast, turns his *Lotus Eaters* episode into a complex rejection of Homer, by placing the lotus not as a food offered to the tired sailors who must be saved from their own idealized lethargy by our epic hero, but instead by framing the lotus as a series of romanticized ideals, simple distractions or in some cases both, that help the citizenry of Dublin to escape the mundane disappointments of their urban lives. The key change, however, is that in *Ulysses* there is no epic hero to drag these poor, misguided souls back to the ship so that the epic journey to Ithaca may continue. Instead, our protagonist is just as lost and misguided as anyone else in Dublin, himself searching for the specific kind of lotus that will dull of the pains of his own failing marriage and sense of loneliness. To this end, Joyce is not only calling into question all the specific kinds of romanticized idealistic fantasies put for as means of escapism, but also the ideals and vision of the epic tradition in which the episode (and the whole of the text) is so deeply steeped in.

*Lotus Eaters* is the closest Joyce gives us to an uninterrupted monologue on the part of Leopold Bloom in the vein of *Proteus* or *Penelope*. *Lotus Eaters* opens with Bloom wandering the streets of Dublin, running errands prior to attending the funeral that will make up the bulk of the next episode. Having spent the last episode contemplating the fact that his wife is most likely having an affair, his mind immediately begins to wander, giving him time to contemplate a series of romanticized fantasies that help distract him from the real world. First, his mind turns to a romanticized image of the Far East that many turn of the century urbanites would have conjured up when imagining what the non-industrialized world looked like at the turn of the twentieth century. Language of lethargy abounds in this passage: “Not doing a hand’s turn all day. Sleep six months out of twelve. Too hot to quarrel. Influence of the climate. Lethargy. Flowers of Idleness” (Joyce 69). Bloom goes further and conjures up an image of himself spending his days lying on a
flower, floating down a lazy river, free from the troubles of modern living, too tired to be bothered to care about anything else. It is a simple fantasy, but it is a powerful one. Confronted with the fact that his wife is likely going to be sleeping with another man while he is away mourning the death of a friend, Bloom’s first response is to conjure up a fantasy in which he is simply too tired and well-off to care about any of those problems.

Shortly thereafter, Bloom finds himself in the post-office, having received a letter from a woman with whom he has been having correspondences. Choosing to not immediately read it, he instead continues upon his errands, but his mind remains pre-occupied with his minor flights of fancy. During a conversation with an acquaintance regarding the funeral Bloom is headed to, our access to Bloom’s internal monologue reveals that he is not particularly interested in the conversation at hand. Instead, we find him fantasizing about a woman he sees getting out of a nearby carriage, hopeful that he will catch a glimpse of her underwear as she exits the vehicle.

Coupled with the letter that Bloom will later read, this keys us into the second major form of failed idealization that pervades this chapter: Non-committal sexual idealization. One of the most important driving forces behind Bloom’s character is the fact that he is a cuckold, and in this segment we see that he addresses this rather large problem through fantasies of sexual trysts with random women (a theme that will reoccur in both Nausicaa and Circe), or in the case of his letter writer, an unknown woman seeking the same kind of non-committal sexual fantasy that allows them to live out their idealized sexual desires without actually doing anything sexual or adulterous. Bloom’s response to his rather unpleasant lot in life (which runs far deeper than simply having an adulterous wife as Cyclops and Hades demonstrate) is to create these elaborate fantasy worlds that allows him to temporarily escape the reality of his situation, much in the way that consuming the lotus allowed the lost sailors to escape the reality of their own seemingly hopeless situation. In Joyce, idealized fantasies like these take the place of the physical lotus plant, draining away
the urban Dubliners, leaving them lethargic and complacent in their daily lives, unable or unwilling to move forward.

Joyce makes the comparison between the letter and the Homeric idea of lotus much clearer by including a single yellow flower in the envelope. The language of the passage describing the flower seems to imply that Bloom’s response to the letter has more to do with the idea of the secret correspondence, as opposed to any actual sexual gratification that may come about from the woman in question. When Bloom smells the flower, he “[s]melt its almost no smell” and thinks that the smell, like the letter, is of the “language of flowers. They like it because no-one can hear” (75). The text also goes on to make it rather clear that Bloom does not believe (or even wish) that anything will come of the letter writing, thinking of the girl that she is “[d]oing the indignant: a girl of good family like me, respectable character. Could meet one Sunday after the Rosary. Thank you: Not having any” (75). These passages make it rather clear that Bloom isn’t really interested in the sexual side of the relationship (Nausicaa addresses this issue in greater depth). Rather, it shows that he is more interested in the elaborate fantasy that he has built up around the letter than he is in the actual contents, and when we look to the later episodes dealing with Bloom’s sexual frustration, we see how little this romantic fantasy does to improve Bloom’s disposition regarding his wife’s ongoing affair.

However, unlike many other episodes of the text, Bloom appears to play a dual role in Lotus Eaters. Even though he is generally regarded as the Odysseus stand in, the two schemata of correspondences disagree on whether or not an Odysseus figure is actually present in the episode. The Lanati schema does list Ulysses as being present in the text, whereas the Gilbert version simply lists the citizens of Dublin as ‘Lotus Eaters’. Throughout the first half of the episode, Bloom either serves the role of Ulysses, having failed to overcome the challenge that the Lotus Eaters present, or he is simply wrapped up into the Gilbert category of the crewmen who have partaken of the lotus and thus wander lethargically through their lives. I however, argue that as far as Joyce is concerned, the two are one in the same.
Owing to the episode’s seeming desire to subvert the Homeric epic, it is fitting that this episode would lack a character corresponding to the heroic epic figure, or at the very least, show the tangible failure of the epic hero to overcome an obstacle that he was able to easily bypass in the original text.

The significance of this role shift becomes apparent in the second segment of the episode. Upon entering into a Catholic Mass prior to Paddy Dignam’s funeral, Bloom shifts from the position of a man seeking his own kind of romanticized escape from the reality of modern Dublin to the position of a man watching others engaged in their own romanticized escapism. Joyce’s presentation of the Catholic mass is one of a group of Dubliners desperately trying to escape the reality of their lives through the shared belief that the church watches over them. Bloom muses on the absurdity of the rituals of the Catholic faith, considering them to be largely meaningless shows designed to create the illusion of comfort. On the subject of the communion, he thinks, “[g]ood idea the Latin. Stupefies them first. Hospice for the dying. They don’t seem to chew it: only swallow it down” (77). Further, he compares the faces of the congregation to “blind masks” (77) and he makes a rather poignant remark about the sense of false community generated when he thinks to himself “[t]hen feel all like one family party, same in the theatre, all in the same swim. They do. Not so lonely. In our conformity” (78).

In addition, Joyce characterizes the religious service as the abdication of self before a higher celestial power, so that the individual may be protected and guarded over throughout eternity. The prayer being uttered specifically deals with the invocation of the Archangel Michael to protect the flock of Christians from the forces of evil. The entire passage focuses on the dulling effect that it has on the crowd, essentially building a complex shared fantasy for the religious followers of a world in which their suffering and their strife on this earth are inconsequential because there awaits a greater reward in the afterlife, and more specifically there exists a greater reward in the afterlife that is attained by simply following a number of largely non-committal rituals. Blooms even comments on the act, saying that the mass is a kind of “[b]lind faith. Safe in the arms of kingdom come. Lulls all pain.” (78) In a way, this segment of the episode
in the Mass has the interesting effect of turning the archangel Michael (and by extension the Christian God) into an epic hero in his own right. He is presented as a protector of downtrodden masses, riding into save the population of the Earth from the grips of Satan, much as Odysseus served as the protector of his own men, riding in to save them from the grips of their own lethargy.

The segment in the Mass draws an indirect parallel between the lotus imbibed by Odysseus’s crew and the rites of the Catholic Church. Joyce presents the rites of communion as a completely symbolic fantasy that people romanticize into the literal consumption of the flesh and blood of a divine figure in order to legitimize the shared group fantasy of a higher authority which purports to make the lives of its followers easier, or at the very least, to remove or diminish their suffering and strife. Just as Odysseus’s followers eat of the lotus and lose all desire to address the reality of their situation, Joyce seems to be implying that the followers of the Catholic Church eat of the communion and lose all desire to address the unpleasant realities of their situation, as they now have the blessing of the church watching over them. Similarly, just as Bloom uses his romanticized sexual fantasies and his rather absurd escapist notions of confront the disappointments of his own life, the congregation uses the shard notion of a higher power watching over them to confront their uneasiness and unhappiness with their stake in the modern world.

The major subversion to the epic tradition in *Lotus Eaters* however, is that Joyce adds an interesting layer to the text wherein the Homeric ideal is itself presented as a kind of lotus that numbs and dulls the population. Joyce’s argument that all human unhappiness comes from a failed ideal is equally as applicable to the Homeric ideal. To this end, Joyce’s answer to Odysseus is not a hero, and even when he witnesses the other citizens of Dublin gleefully partaking in a massive fantasy structure designed to keep them sedated and happy as their lives crumble around them, he is not only unable to do anything to drag them back to the ship of reality, he is himself unwilling to do so, either because he does not care enough, or he is aware of his own inability (in this version of the story, the lotus in question has had nearly two millennium to seduce the population, and neither Bloom nor any other modern non-hero would be capable
of dragging his men away). When taken alongside the fact that Bloom himself is eagerly consuming his own personal variety of lotus, we are left with an image of the epic hero as a failed one.

Here is where Joyce’s critique of the Homeric epic becomes clear. In the Lotus Eater segment of Homer, Odysseus is presented with two simple tasks: resist the temptation of the lotus, and safely get as many of his crewmembers away from the island as possible. In Homer, he effortlessly succeeds at both tasks, establishing his initial qualifications for being a leader and further building him up as a heroic figure. By contrast, in Joyce, our Odysseus analogue is presented (in a rather qualified way, as he is never placed in a situation where he has the drive or power to help the people around him) with the same two tasks, and he manages to fail both of them miserably (one by weakness, the other by lethargy or inability). He spends the bulk of the first half of the episode allowing his mind to wander, contemplating the various distractions and romanticized frivolities that will assist him in escape the pains of his current situation, essentially seeking out the same lotus that would have doomed Odysseus. Then, in the second half of the episode, he is placed on the outside, witnessing his fellow Dubliners happily partaking in their unique flavor of lotus, and he is forced to sit there, unable to do anything but contemplate the totality of their lethargic stupor.

At the conclusion of the episode, the idealized, romantic image of the heroic figure has failed on no fewer than three separate occasions (and this theme will reoccur in later chapters, such as Ithaca) and the people of Dublin find themselves no better off than they were at the onset of the episode. To this effect, Joyce is demonstrating that not only does his statement about the disappointed romanticism that causes unhappiness apply to the various kinds of grand fantasies that the citizens of Dublin use to escape their lives in the bleak world of early 20th century Ireland, but it also applies to the epic tradition on which Joyce builds the novel. The idea that there exists some kind of grand hero (either in the form of the religious figures that Bloom himself calls into the question or the form of our failed Odysseus stand in) is simply another kind of misplaced idealism that only serves to make people more unhappy when the reality of the world fails to meet the heroic ideals that we strive to place upon it.
Work Cited


History and Memory in Cielos de barro by Dulce Chacón

In the years since the death of Francisco Franco, government and popular interest in the Spanish Civil War have increased dramatically. The creations of the Law of Historical Memory and of the Association for the Recuperation of Historic Memory are excellent examples of this change in the political climate. This law and this organization serve as reminders of the terrors of the Civil War and of its victims, many of whom have been exhumed in order to be given an honorable burial. Dulce Chacón was a part of a generation of writers who “revisit the traumatic Spanish past not with the intention of reiterating the trauma in a melancholy manner, but to move forward in the work of mourning,” because the process of telling and lamenting the stories of the horrors of the War is essential for the healing and the advancement of the country (Portela). Part of looking to the past is hearing the stories of those who lost the Spanish Civil War, so that they can be honored and included in history.

After the Civil War, Franco’s object was to unify Spain and maintain his power over it by controlling and regulating the actions of the Spanish people. With the help of the Catholic Church, he did this by repressing liberal ideas in Spain and regulating foreign influence. Those who rejected the power of the Church and its alliance with Franco’s government could not express this because “[d]issenting voices that had called for a rethinking of the position of the church were largely silenced. The few Catholic republicans were effectively denounced as traitors to a cause under siege” (Grugel and Rees 129). The voices of liberals, marxists, non-Castilians, and others were silenced, and authors and film directors often came up against censorship.

During the transition from Franco’s dictatorship, there was less censorship, and although those in power said little of the War, “scholarly research was a form of political activism whose target was the official Franquist memory of the war as a crusade against the godlessness, anarchy, and antipatriotism of the Second Republic” (Boyd). After Franco’s death and the end of his dictatorship, those whose suffering was not acknowledged had to continue in silence for fear that another conflict would arise. Nevertheless, many authors have shown interest in the unofficial history in recent decades. According to Helen Graham, who researched Republican memory in the Spanish Civil War, seventy percent of the Spanish provinces had been investigated in the nineteen-nineties. Writers,
historians, and others have begun to seek information about the complete history of their country and of those who were once silenced but are now being recognized.

It was during this time of investigation of the past that Dulce Chacón began her literary career. Though she came from a landowning family from Extremadura, which probably supported Franco, she was interested in the untold stories of the war. When asked about the stories she was told in her childhood and the ones she discovered in adulthood, she said:

The victors hid a great part of the history that they did not want discovered. This hidden, shadowy part is what many of us are trying to recuperate, through novels, cinema, and documentaries. In Spain, there is unease about putting ourselves in this period. Memory must be given the place that it should occupy. (Velázquez Jordán)

As is seen in Cielos de barro and in other works such as La voz dormida, the author believed in the importance of knowing the recent history of her country, and her writing, which deals with the themes of the marginalized and the silenced, demonstrates this goal of telling the other side of the story of the Spanish Civil War.

Cielos de barro deals with the theme of the memory of those who lost the Civil War, whose voice has been silenced by the government and its “official history.” The story takes place in a rural town in Extremadura, which was the place of the latifundios, the farms owned by the upper class. It is a place that “somewhat forecloses the individual's capacity for resistance,” where conflict often happened between the aristocrats and the lower class over the lower class’s poverty and the aristocrats’ abuse of power (Ryan). In every other chapter, the novel recounts the investigation of a murder in which the principal witness is a poor, elderly potter named Antonio. His testimony becomes very personal as he speaks of the terrible suffering of his family as members of the lower class during and after the war. In the other chapters, an omniscient narrator tells the story of a Catholic novice named Eulalia and her family, the Albueras, who are rich, landowning, and powerful. Their story shows the crimes of the upper class, and eventually is seen to be very closely related with Antonio’s testimony.

Antonio represents the members of the lower class in his town. Late in the story, the reader learns that the dead man was taken and mistreated by the Albueras family, who have employed many of the poor in the town. He tried to escape from them and from his past by moving abroad. According to M. Edurme Portela, who researched the
specter and memory in Cielos de barro, there is “the sensation that this person is erasing himself little by little from existence and that he belongs more to the world of the dead than to that of the living,” because Chacón immediately presents him as the man who “returned to die” (Portela, Chacón 9). This man symbolizes the victims of Fascism because he and his family have been mistreated by those in power in Spain at the time. Antonio gives a voice to the man, acting “as a medium, that is to say messenger and interpreter for the person without a name” when he reads his letters to the investigator (Portela). Another example of the silence of the Republican lower class is Isidora, who loses her honor because of the actions of a Nationalist soldier. When she recounts the tragedy of her rape to Doña Carmen, a member of the Albuera family, Carmen orders Isidora not to speak of it, saying that “what no one has seen is that which has not happened” (Chacón 151). This attitude testifies to Franco’s goal to hide the stories of his opposition. The dead man and Isidora, like the silenced victims of the Civil War that they represent, are given a voice through Antonio.

The relationship between the peasant and the investigator demonstrates the great difference between the upper class’s and lower class’s ways of life, and the tension between these two groups which the War augmented. Antonio tells the investigator that “it is unimportant to be educated where you live... it is easy to be refined when you live well” (Chacón 145). Their relationship also shows the tension that exists between those who have power and those who do not. Although Antonio tells the investigator a great deal about his own life as he gives his testimony, their relationship nevertheless demonstrates the mistrust between the state and its oppressed people. Antonio tells the investigator that “time will tell if I can trust you, and if you can trust me” (Chacón 145). The style of the chapters that deal with the story of Antonio and the investigator seem very crude, as they reflect Antonio’s lack of education. This reinforces the sense of difference and tension.

The relationship between investigator and witness is a significant part of the literary genre of the novela negra, with which Cielos de barro has much in common. In this genre, the main character is an investigator who uses the testimonies of various other characters to solve the mystery. The witnesses’ testimonies, although they are part of the resolution of the story, are of relatively little importance. This popular genre began in the 20th century, shortly after the end of the Spanish Civil War. According to the Dictionary of Literary Terms that Glen S. Close cites in Hispanic and Luso-Brazilian Detective Fiction, the novela negra is “a narrative sub-genre (related to the detective
novel), that appears in North America at the beginning of the 1920s and in which its authors attempt to reflect, from a
critical consciousness, the world of gangsterism and organized criminality stemming from the violence and corruption
of the capitalist society of the era” (qtd. in Craig-Odders, Collins, and Close 143-144). Since its beginning, the novela
egra has changed significantly in reaction to the political and social situations of the various countries where it is
popular. It focuses on the investigator as a reflection of the political and social climate, and takes interest in
discussing the social problems of the time in which it is written. Renée Craig-Odders states that the Spanish novela
egra “participates in attempting to recuperate the true history of the dictatorship and also in chronicling those of the
Transition and the consolidation of democracy following Franco’s death” (Craig-Odders, Collins, and Close 2). In this
manner, the novela negra is used as an investigation into the case of recent history.

The characters, themes, and plots of many examples of the novela negra demonstrate some of the social
changes that have occurred in Spain. The works of Alicia Giménez Bartlett, for example, rebel against the nationalist
norms of the “perfect” woman’s role by focusing on a female detective who has been married three times, which was
unheard of in her time. As an investigator, she has power over others and over herself, which could not be said of
women during Franco’s dictatorship. Many authors have changed the form of the novela negra as a subtle means of
contesting the traditional values that Franco enforced. Francisco González Ledesma, who has written since the
1940s, has experienced the prohibition of his works. The author stated in an interview, “I wanted to talk about my
city [Barcelona], about the war, about the post-war period, about the Francoist repression... In the Transition, I
learned that the novela negra would offer me instruments to investigate what was happening.” The authors who
wrote during the dictatorship of Franco used the genre to conceal their objectives, but authors today, who do not
have as many conflicts with censorship, continue to use the genre to subtly communicate their opinions and
observations.

In a similar manner, Dulce Chacón deals with the problem of silence which Franco’s dictatorship left in
Spain. The relationships between social classes which are revealed throughout the course of the investigation testify
to the abuse of power committed by the Francoist upper class. Although they are religious and involved in the
church, the Albuera family is characterized by their hypocrisy and cruelty. This family’s actions and those of the
upper class directly affect Antonio and his family. For example, after she is raped by a Nationalist, Antonio’s
daughter dies in childbirth. The novel reflects the fact that the rape of Republican women was common, and was another tactic used to dehumanize opposition to the Nationalist cause.

Nevertheless, there are important differences between Cielos de barro and the novela negra that also contribute to the novel. Dulce Chacón changes many of the elements of this literary genre. For example, it is significant that the main character and narrator is not the investigator, but a poor, illiterate man from the country, who belongs to one of the most marginalized groups of people. When the genre first appeared, the protagonists tended to be well-educated city-dwellers. It can also be noted that what the investigator says is only revealed through Antonio’s narration; the investigator, who represents the official power of the government, and who should be the most important character in the story, does not have even one line of speech in the text. This change in narration and focus creates the effect of silencing the silencers and giving the marginalized a kind of authority they have not had before. By giving the victims of the Civil War and of Franco’s regime the opportunity to speak, these conversations reaffirm their humanity and the importance of their part of the story.

Franco and the Nationalists had the vision of a Spain that was “one, grand, and free,” and he accomplished this by silencing the voices of his opposition. The Republicans tended to be marginalized and given the least amount of influence in post-war Spain. After Franco came to power, those who lost the Civil War could not even remember the dead or their experiences. Their story was ignored by those in power, including the government and the upper class. The novela negra reflects this dynamic because it shows the relationship between the investigator’s official history, and the witnesses who reveal their memories of the crime but ultimately have little say in the investigation's resolution. Chacón’s focus on the experiences of the marginalized helps her in her goal “to foreground and legitimize the hitherto largely unarticulated memory of the losers,” because it gives Antonio’s personal narrative a privileged place in the story (Godsland). Through Antonio’s narration, those who lost the Civil War have a voice in the official history, because “[r]esolution of the crime at the centre of the narrative does not lie in the intellect or rationale of a latter-day Poirot... but in an investigation or interrogation of the nation’s recent past” (Godsland). Chacón uses the narration of a representative of the recent past to explore the history of the Civil War and the period that followed it.

Dulce Chacón stated in an interview that she wanted the Spanish people to remember their history, because “forgetfulness is an illness. He who does not have memories, does not have himself.” Cielos de barro reaffirms the
importance and relevance of the experience of all people, not only the winners of the war, and now Spain is trying to remember its recent past. Spain must remember the memories and experiences of its people so that they can be lamented, so that victims can receive justice, and so that the wounds of the past may be healed. Unless otherwise indicated, translations are those of the author.
Works Cited


Gowoon Hwang
Taylor University

Strategies for Successful Integration of Korean Students at American Universities

Abstract

According to the news article from USATODAY, the number of international students at U.S. colleges and universities is increasing. I am one of the international students who are studying English as a second language in the USA. During the first month after I came to America, I had some problems adjusting. I had a problem with roommates caused by misunderstanding, so I moved to another dorm, and it was a hard time. My experience made me think about the things that would be helpful for international students’ adjustment abroad. In the research, I referred to journal articles through the library’s web site about the international students’ stumbling blocks in the USA and solutions for them. I also used book resources and a newspaper article from a trustworthy website. I interviewed eight students at Taylor University. Some of them were American students who have experiences with Korean students, and the others were international or Korean students who already adjusted very well as regular students. Through this research, I found that barriers international students face include language, cultural difference, food and emotional challenge. My research suggests that successful strategies for integration include asking, modeling, programs and activities to adjust very well. Also, the research suggests that a program matching international students with American partners for activities can be helpful.

Since I came to Taylor University, I moved from Swallow to English Hall. I had a hard time adjusting to life in the dorm and being close to my floor friends. I had two roommates who were best friends, and they had a similar lifestyle that was different from my lifestyle. I had a difficulty with language, so I could not communicate very well with them. Every time when I went back to my room, I felt lonely. It made me scared, so it was hard to participate in dorm events and hang out together. Also, there was a misunderstanding with them, so I changed my room to another dorm. My experience made me think about the things that would be helpful for Korean students’ adjustment. To help other Korean students who will come to Taylor, some things need to be provided that can be useful for their adjustment. This paper talks about three things: The barriers that Korean students face at Taylor, the perception of Americans about Korean students and the suggestions for adjustment of Korean students.

I referred to journal articles through the library’s web site, and these were about the international students’ stumbling blocks in the USA and solutions for them. Also, I used book resources and a newspaper article from a trustworthy website. I interviewed eight students at Taylor University. Some of them were American students who have experiences with Korean students, and the others were international or Korean students who already adjusted very well as regular students. I asked them the barriers that Korean students face and the perception of Americans about Korean students. The perception of Americans means how they think and feel
about Korean students. These questions will help us to understand each other and to find suggestions for the adjustment for Korean students.

There are four common barriers which Korean students face in the USA: language barriers, cultural differences, food, and emotional challenges. The language barrier is the most difficult thing for Korean students. All Korean interviewees said that they could not have a conversation with American students very well, and it made them frustrated. It affects not only communication, but also their academic success. Like Gebhard said, many international students, especially from Asian countries, have consistently reported that it took a long time to read textbooks and assignments for a class (2010).

Korean students are faced with cultural differences in their daily experiences. They are required to spend a long time and a lot of energy to adapt to different circumstances (Gebhard, 2010). Like Sarkodie-Mensah said, these cultural differences and shocks from them can be problems for international students to adjust abroad (1998). In Sangwook’s case, it was hard for him to be a friend with an American who is younger than him, because Korea is a country that is age oriented. According to Kyungeun, it was shocking that people talked with their friends when they go to take a shower even if they wore only a big towel.

Food is another barrier for Korean students. “Most students expected to have some problems with American food, but many were surprised by how difficult it was to get used to it” (Gebhard, 2010, p.11). Yeeun said that her body was not familiar with American food, so it made her stressed.

Emotional challenges underlie and compound the other factors (Barna, 2007). Like Gebhard said, the efforts required to adapt can bring up unexpected emotions to international students like anxiety, depression and homesickness (2010). All Korean interviewees reported emotional problems that are related to other factors. They felt frustrated, stressed and not confident because of language barriers, food and cultural differences. According to Sarkodie-Mensah, these emotional problems cause many mental conditions that frustrate the academic achievements of international students and affect many other things in their lives (1998).

Then, what is the perception of Americans about Korean students? In general, all of the American students who I interviewed have a positive perception about Korean students. Also, they think that Korean students have a close community and strong relationships. However, Pei-Chen said, “Sometimes, whole group is exclusive and do not interact with other people.” Korean students always eat meals together. Like Vanessa said,
“It can be intimidating to go and sit with such a large group of Koreans.” Also, Erin said, “Other students can think that Koreans do not want to be with us, because they are always be together.”

American students have a question about the respectful culture of Korea too. In Vanessa’s case, she made a joke to her Korean friend a lot, but her friend took it as disrespectful. She said, “It is a cultural difference, but many Americans can not understand.” Others think, “Oh, Korean students don’t want to be friends with me.” Pei-Chen said, “Sometimes, too respectful. I think it makes more distance.”

Through my research, I found three big suggestions to help Korean students to adjust in the USA: asking, modeling and programs. Asking questions is the first step for Korean students to adjust. Erin said, “Ask for anything even if it is little. Don’t be shy.” If there is something that Korean students cannot understand the meaning, they can ask American friends. Amber said, “It prevents misunderstandings between Korean and American students.”

Another suggestion is participant modeling. This means that people can learn about something from observing and imitating other’s behavior (Shiraev and Boyd, 2001). Korean students can observe how American students behave in a specific situation and can copy their behaviors. According to Gebhard, “Many students reported that they observed the way American students eat, walk on crowded streets, chat at coffee shops, greet each other, enter a classroom late, sit in class, interrupt each other, take a turn in a group discussion, and more” (2010, p.17). In Kyungeun’s case, she tried to follow what they did and what they said, and it was really useful for her. In my opinion, it is a very good way to help international students to overcome barriers, especially for someone who feels shy and has a hard time asking Americans about their culture.

There are various programs and activities on campus that Korean students can get helps. Like Sarkodie-Mensah said, international students can participate in many programs on campuses that support them while they are adjusting to life in the United States. Also, universities provide a chance for domestic and international students to share information that is helpful for international students’ adjustment to University and life in the USA (1998). Amber said, “Taylor has a lot of relational opportunities.” Korean students can get helps from a lot of programs such as an orientation, wing worship, ISS events and floor dinners. If we look carefully at a bulletin board or email, we can find announcements about events on campus. So, like Amber said, “Taking more initiative” to participate and get to know people by doing some activities.
I got new suggestions from some interviewees for the adjustment of Korean students, and it was interesting. Four people gave their idea about the matching program that matched one Korean student with one American student. Erin said, “It will be helpful to train leaders and American students about Koreans and their culture.” According to Sarkodie-Mensah, many universities have experts who help and support students to deal with their problems (1998). However, like Kyungeun said, they just help with academic things. She said, “We need the faculty who spend time with us, ask about we are doing well and share personal interaction like host family.” She thinks that because Taylor has a lot of faculty, it will be possible to provide that kind of faculty for Korean students. In addition, Vanessa gave her idea about having a ‘Korean pick-a-date.’ Like the other pick-a-dates at Taylor, Koreans can pick an American friend and hang out together. She said, “They can bond with each other through this. All the other Koreans can meet American friends too!” Also, it can be a good opportunity to introduce our culture to them.

The number of international students in the US continues to increase (Marklein, 2011). So, the efforts to find and provide useful information for international students to adjust are required. We can know from the research findings that there are a lot of ways for Korean students to make American friends and to adjust at Taylor. Though the research, I got very important points for Korean students. I looked at the possibility of making successful relationships between Korean and American students. American students want to get to know about Koreans. Also, Pei-Chen said, “They already know you guys from the other culture, so they understand you even if you make a mistake.” So, Korean students don’t need to worry about making mistakes. Lastly, like Vanessa said, Americans are scared of Korean students, because Korean culture is new for them too. I have never thought about it this way, and it gave me an opportunity to think about Koreans in a different way. Therefore, Korean students have to keep the suggestions above and be confident with American students. That is the way for Korean students to adjust very well in the USA.
References


Appendix

Interview Questions

Korean regular student at Taylor

1. What are the difficulties (barriers) that you have (had) at Taylor?
2. Have you ever had something that you could not understand about American culture? If yes, what?
3. What was the way that helped you to adjust well? (Or Successful experiences with American students)
4. What suggestions can be helpful for Korean students to adjust well?

American and international students

1. What do you think about Korean students at Taylor? (Atmosphere, the first impression and so on)
2. What was the thing that you could not understand about Korean (Or Korean culture)?
3. Do you have any experience with Korean students? If yes, what? (Conversation, hanging out, in a class and so on)
4. What suggestions can be helpful for Korean students to adjust well?

My interviewees

The first group: Amber Holderbaum, Erin Slater and Vanessa Tabor

The second group: Pei-Chen and Phyllisa Barne

The third group: Kyungeun Ha, Sangwook Lim and Yeeun Lee
Cassandra John  
Purdue University Calumet

Effects of Inequality in the Juvenile Population

One teen dead, another locked up—and there goes one selling drugs to his friend. The juvenile population is threatened with a new wave of delinquency and criminal behavior. Many are out of work and living in urban, low income areas. Many struggle to get by using illegal methods as a way to sustain their lives. Many are uneducated, roaming the streets or already locked up in juvenile facilities. What exactly makes these youths turn to a life of delinquency and crime. What are the factors that lead to juvenile delinquency? A good reason to find these inequalities is so we can understand how these urban areas work and how we can reform them to help the juvenile population. Another good reason is if the factors are identified early, then fewer youths will be in jail, which means more youths can be educated and be placed into jobs, raising the economy. These factors also help sociologically because the factors will also help define the inequalities that the justice system faces. If these inequalities can be explained and categorized then an attempt can be made to lessen or remove the inequalities and make sure that the justice system is fair to all youth populations (and society, as a whole), and that all individual rights are protected.

Many people do not think about the affected people of the inequality that can be seen in the criminal system right now. This is often the case because it simply does not affect them, they do not have to worry if they will be treated fairly or not if they were to enter the justice system. But, it could. One day, it simply could affect another group or class of people, to the point where the people would fear its justice system because they were not being treated fairly or equally. This is why it is important to find the factors that lead to crime and inequality, especially when focusing on the youth population, wherein the foundation of society is built. In order for the justice system to truly be part of the solution to create a more fair and less prejudiced society, inequalities must be found and eradicated. Finding these factors of inequality that lead to both crime and injustice—specifically, in regard to the juvenile population—can help prevent crime or, at least, lower rates of recidivism.

There are many factors that lead a person to commit a crime, but the ones that show up in research over and over again seem to be race, education, supervision, class, and employment. There are other factors, but
predominantly these factors listed show up in different research across time. Race seems to be the biggest factor of crime today. Offending rates of African Americans were seven times higher than that of Caucasians; the Bureau of Justice Statistics also shows that 52.2 percent of all homicides and nonviolent crimes were committed by African Americans (Bureau of Justice Statistics, 2013). Dr. Tonry states, in his book *Malign Neglect* (1995), that African Americans are already predisposed to commit crimes because of—as he described—their violent and aggressive pasts. His reasoning is that because of slavery and the Civil War, in which African Americans fought for their freedom, they have a violent streak they will never be able to get rid of. Further, he stated the savage blood line in them, caused partially by their countries of origin, will never die, so they will always have a savage part in them (Tonry, 1995). This is biased against Black youth and makes them a target for racial profiling.

Black youth are seen as part of the lower class. They are often perceived as living in poverty, in urban areas or even “ghettos,” many without adequate income or many material possessions. They become stereotyped—seen as drug dealers, gun traders, or robbers—simply because they are in ghettos with very limited jobs, where illegal activities are a lucrative option. Race, especially for those in the lower socioeconomic class, is a strong predictor of nonviolent crimes, such as robbery and property damage (Calley, 2011). Property crime increases when the population turns over and more minority families make up the population (Kelly, 2000). More African Americans, it is thought, are likely to commit robberies and property damage because they are in poverty, and—as a result—are likely to do anything for money (Heumann & Cassak, 2003). Therefore, urban African American youth, for many of these reasons, find law enforcement treats them differently than young Caucasians, holding Black youths to a different standard, which is more stringent.

Education is another leading factor in crime; more drop-outs will commit crime than high school graduates in a given year. Additionally, in order to get a job, a certain level of education is needed (Ore, 2011). Many inner city youths are, unfortunately, not getting the education they need to succeed in the labor market and are not obtaining employment. They are leaving schools at an earlier age and are not receiving diplomas or other certificates that would make them desirable in the work force. Attending school is important in a youth’s life in part because it provides a safe place for them to not only receive education, but to adapt skills needed to create a better life.

[231]
Education also provides a stable supervised environment where they are watched and, more importantly, given guidance (Jacob & Lefgen, 2003). They are off the streets and, often, out of trouble—at least several hours a day. However, many youths are not getting the supervision they require and are able to spend more time on the streets than in a structured environment. They pick up street skills and get into trouble. Some may even start committing petty crimes, and start skipping school all together (Jacobs & Lefgen, 2003). An old saying is that idle hands do the “devil’s work,” means that these kids that no longer go to school are likely to engage in dangerous, harmful, and even criminal behavior. Without education and supervision, these youths will be unemployable and will not have the skill set or drive necessary to complete their goals. Instead, they will continue to run wild on the streets. As Calley (2011) observed, they will be considered an uneducated, unneeded part of society, and will enter into a pattern of being locked up—typically, longer than a more educated person.

A lack of education leads to the employment issues. If these youths have no jobs, then they have no way of supporting themselves or others, and this turns them to a life where making an illegal dollar is far easier than trying to find legitimate work (Wang & Minor, 2002). Another reason for the lack of unemployment is a lack of literal access to jobs. Dr. Wilson stated, those neighborhoods with poor job access are also likely to be neighborhoods with high rates of poverty, and high rates of criminal activity (Wang & Minor, 2002). In many inner cities, people face spatial mismatch between job locations and where potential workers reside (Ore, 2011). Public transportation can get workers only so far, and many families are too poor to be able to afford a car to get them to work. This is just another factor stacked against these youths who are not employable in the city because they lack the education to work in most places. Additionally, businesses frequently won’t hire them because of the poverty stereotypes, wherein businesses are less likely to hire those in the lower socioeconomic status because they are thought to be lazy and unreliable (Ore, 2011).

It is this situation that ends up turning many youths to the street for illegal income, because the frustration of this vicious cycle is not enough to keep youths on the right path. This also helps further define the inequality that we see in the justice system, in which those of a different race and in the lower class are perceived to—whether they are actually or not—be more likely to engage in criminal activities. The strain theory explains that a person will turn to
acts of crime when they feel the pressure of not being equal to the rest of the surrounding population (Kelly, 2000). When unemployed, it is hard to have money to buy possessions or get the things needed to run a household. It is even harder to move out of poverty and into the middle class. Being below the poverty line and having the bare minimum will drive youths to do anything possible in order to obtain money for personal things (Calley, 2011). This is why the inequality exists, if less African American youths were out committing crime—and were working, instead—the police would not be able to negatively racially profile a youth and just assume they were committing crimes. The police are less likely to harass a working youth then they are to harass a youth they know is unemployed and poor (Heumann & Cassak, 2003).

In order to curb these factors, an abundant amount of improvements need to be made. Many plans and reforms have to be enacted in order for the system to change. Teachers, parents, and lawmakers will have to work together in order to create a brighter, more equal future. By giving African American youth a better start and, hopefully, it will lead to a successful future, instead of another crime statistic. The first thing that can be done is to eradicate racism as a whole, although it is easier said than done. More specifically, racial profiling needs to be reformed and the ways it is used needs to be changed. Racial profiling should only be used by those in law enforcement that understand its exact uses and procedures (Heumann & Cassak, 2003). Another idea for diminishing the inequality would be to instill more sensitive training courses, especially those addressing race, into the law enforcements training regime to help diminish the prejudiced idea that all African American urban youth are poor and delinquent.

Fixing the education system is going to take years and will be a struggle to fix. Teachers and lawmakers will have to work side by side in order to revise the education system to create a situation that will keep youth engaged in learning and off the streets. One way of doing this would be to have more scholastic options and after school programs available to the high-risk youth population (Jacob & Lefgen, 2003). With additional schools, more students would be able to receive the education they require to be successful. If more teachers were employed to keep youths interested, and give them the drive they need to accomplish their goals, then not only would they gain the skills they need but also gain a sense of confidence. There is a growing recognition that school-based and community-based
after-school programs represent an important context for positive youth development, and that involvement may be especially important for young people living in high-risk, low income neighborhoods (Mahoney, Larson, & Eccles, 2005).

More after-school programs would keep youths off the streets and would help curb the thought that uneducated, or undereducated, youths commit more crimes. These urban youth would learn more social and networking skills that can be vital tools to employment, having a good education and skill set is the foundation of finding good employment (Jacob & Lefgen, 2003). There are several after-school programs set up already, as well as daycares that focus on socialization and education, such as the YMCA and The Boys and Girls Club. The Boys and Girls club is one of the oldest and largest organizations for children. They have great programs in five core areas, including: character and leadership development; education and career development; health and life skills; the arts; and sport, fitness, and recreation (Fredricks, Hackett, & Bregman, 2010).

In order to help the high-risk youth population find jobs, job access must first become easier. Lawmakers and city officials will have to work with the community in order to make public transportation more readily available and public sector jobs more functional. If the public transport system were to function properly and become efficient then more youth would be able to travel safely to a wider variety of jobs, opening a new set of options for legal employment. This would leave fewer youth to cause trouble on the streets (Wang & Minor, 2002). Public sector employment, such working an as assistant in an office or as a healthcare agent, needs to be redone, as well as, instilling more public sector jobs in the inner city. These public sector jobs need to be organized and ran more efficiently, with entry level positions added so that youths can enter the work force early and work up their way up to higher positions. Many youths would be able to work in public sector jobs and learn the skills necessary to advance into private sector employment (Ore, 2011). Places like Job Corps and Work One are great programs that educate youths to be successful in their future careers and help place youths into jobs after training. Job Corps is set up as both an academic and workforce program, wherein those involved start out the process by leaving home and living on-site with classrooms and workshops. They are given responsibilities and chores, along with homework and other tasks to build skills and keep them interested in going into the workforce. Throughout the program, youths learn how
contribute meaningfully to their places of employment, dress for interviews, draft resumes, and are—most importantly—in a core area that will lead to future employment. For example, someone studying at Job Corps could train to be a plumber or pharmacy technician. Many participants receive certificates and degrees that they can use to obtain jobs in the future (Job Corps, 2013). This would help keep high-risk youth in higher paying jobs, meaning they would no longer feel the strain of failing to compare to their middle class counterparts (Kelly, 2000).

It will take hard work, commitment, and time to be able to change the factors that lead to crime committed by urban youth. If these factors are curbed more urban, minority youth would have a chance to have a productive, successful life, rather than being arrested and put into an unequal justice system (Heumann & Cassak, 2003). Curbing these factors will likely boost the economy and lower crime rates. Urban youth would finally be able to prove that they are not just drug dealers, gun traders, and gang bangers, and that the criminal system is flawed (Heumann & Cassak, 2003). High-risk youth who become successful will help illustrate that racial profiling and stereotyping are only harming the justice system. By deterring inequality and providing more opportunities for these youth, it will make it less likely for them to commit crimes, and even less likely that they will reoffend (Calley, 2011). As a result, the justice system would begin to dissipate and provide a better image of these youth, as well as the justice system.
References


Effects of Color and Music on Cognition

ABSTRACT

This study examined the effects of bright and neutral color and preferred and non-preferred music on overall cognition. This topic is important due to the fact that music and color appear everywhere and these two factors combined could affect someone’s way of thinking, subconsciously or otherwise. This study required the use of eighty total participants and the participants chosen were of different race (Caucasians, African-Americans, Asians, Native Americans, and Hispanics) and different ethnic subgroups. All eighty participants were separated into four groups, placing twenty participants in each group. Twenty were exposed to preferred music and a bright color; another twenty were exposed to non-preferred music and a bright color; another twenty were exposed to preferred music and a neutral color, and the last twenty were exposed to non-preferred music and a neutral color. The participants were then tested on a basic knowledge exam to measure their cognition after being introduced to these specific stimuli. It was concluded that being exposed to music alone or color alone will have an effect on the cognition of the participants; however, the music and color together showed significantly little effects on cognition. Considering both color and music are everywhere, it is important to fully understand the effects these stimuli have on humans and their cognition. It would be vital to further test the concept of the effects of music and color on cognitive abilities, but this study is an excellent start in discovering those effects.

Introduction

There are many examples of different studies that have recognized the relationship between color and sound. Color and how it can affect cognition, performance, motivation, and so on has always been researched. This study would like to extend the findings of previous research done on this topic in hopes of sparking new ways of thinking on how every day colors and music can affect someone. The results of this study could logically make sense both theoretically and practically. Color and music affect everyone whether or not they realize. The research found in this study will not only make sense on paper, but in real life scenarios.

Lesiuk (2010) examined the difference of preferred music on mood and performance in a high cognitive demand occupation. The study showed how different people’s mood changes according to the song they listen to. The participants either listened to a song they preferred and actually liked, or they had to listen to a song that was chosen for them. Also, they had to either listen to the song at their convenience, or whenever they were instructed to do so. The study helped explain how positive and negative moods are dependent upon a person’s want and desire to listen to music at a given time. Cognitive skills were also improved by this study’s research and its discussion on problem solving and an individual’s preference.
There were 24 participants from a computer company located in North America. Each participant had work experience ranging from 1-25 years. The formal musical education experience was a wide range from 0 to 10. Reported daily music listening time at work was also a wide range from either no time spent at all to the entire day (Lesiuk, 2010).

The participants used a total of 5 different questionnaires for this study. These consisted of cognitive performance, music listening, stating the mood, narrative work stress, and participant demographic questionnaire. Participants could either choose ear buds or a headset. There were a total of 65 CDs to play the music from that were supplied by the researcher. It was also allowed for people to use music from their own personal library.

For the experiment, participants were asked to complete a 3 week music listening study. It measured demographics, stress, state positive and negative affect and quality-of-work. Surveys were given to the participants a few days before the study took place. During week 2 of the study, participants were not allowed to listen to music; this was because researchers were trying to see the mood changes that occur in individuals. In order to have no interference with daily work routines, measures were kept to a minimum. A final music listening questionnaire was administered at the end of the study. At the beginning of the study, the 65 CD’s were set up in front of the participants to choose which music they wanted to listen to. The different styles were: Alternative, Classical, Country, Heavy metal, Light Jazz, New Age, Pop and a category that was labeled other. The participants could listen to the music at their own convenience. For weeks 1 and 3 of the study, participants were instructed to listen to music whenever they wanted (for a minimum of 30 minutes a day).

In the examination of stress, the participant’s job was to share what they felt was most stressful. The recurring themes in response to the work stress question addressed time pressures, unrealistic deadlines, volume of work, not knowing how to do something, co-worker problems, client problems, and layoffs of co-workers (Lesiuk, 2010). Statistics were shown that mood is definitely affected by listening to the presence of music. The State Positive Affect, which is an individual’s degree of positive mood, was higher during the first and third weeks of music, compared to the no music week. All participants mood was less positive and the Positive Affect was lower without listening to music in week 2. Music was said to influence mood and have a positive effect when it was preferred
music that was being played. As far as cognitive performance, in week 2 without music, the quality-of-work was significantly more negative.

The most stressful part of the participant’s jobs were reported to be time pressures, unrealistic deadlines, volume of learning requirements, not knowing how to do something, co-worker problems, client problems, and layoffs of co-workers. During a person’s work hours, these are the things that cause stress and create physiological and psychological problems. They elicit missed information and decrease in attention when it comes to decision making. The first research hypothesis was proved correct, and preferred music listening did, indeed, improve state levels. All of the results came to show that music listening plays a main role in times of stress. Comments were given by participants stating how the music helped them and how it made them feel. Most comments said that music was relieving, relaxing, and made them feel calm.

Perham and Sykora (2012) examined the effects of generally liked music, disliked music, and silence on serial recall trials. This experiment called for twenty-five participants, whom were undergraduates from a southern Wales university and aged eighteen to thirty. These participants were chosen based on their taste in music. The study only needed those who disliked thrashcore metal music. These trials required the use of Microsoft Powerpoint software. Each slide would feature one-syllable consonants paired with alphabetically familiar, adjacent, or phonologically similar letters for one second with a one second blank slide separating them. The specific combinations of consonants were chosen to make sure that participants were only using the method of seriation and no other mnemonic strategies. The authors of the study had chosen the music (liked and disliked) to present to their participants. The song “From Paris to Berlin” by the group Infernal was chosen to represent the “liked” music due to its high popularity on the Billboard charts and a compilation of songs from the thrashcore band Repulsion was used to represent the “disliked” music.

These trials were completed in either small groups (up to 5 participants) or individually. A set of instructions given to the participants indicated that they were to view 30 different lists (in groups of 10) of eight letters. These letters were to be recalled in the order in which they were presented. Each participant had twenty seconds to recall all the letters.
The results of the study found that performance was best in silence, poorer with the disliked music, and the poorest with the liked music. Thrashcore music, being the disliked condition, incorporates many aspects of guitar distortion and rapid drumming, in turn blending most of its individual instrumentals together to create a smooth sounding song. This is why performance was slightly elevated when the participants listened to the disliked music condition compared to the liked music condition. It could be theorized that the liked music of the group Infernal created a distracting atmosphere for participants because the music was familiar and made it hard for the participants to concentrate on the Powerpoint slides of letters. Overall, this study found that familiar and liked music causes more distractions when performing serial recall.

Based on these findings, the current study hypothesizes that music will benefit a person and improve cognitive functioning and that bright colors will induce more positive emotions than neutral colors. Anyone could take this information and learn something valuable. This is why this topic of color and music and their effects on cognition is so important. Simple colors in offices or basic music that plays in subway stations could affect people. This study has chosen to explore preferable and non-preferable music, along with bright and neutral colors and their effects on cognition. For the above reason, this study follows a 2X2 factorial design. Cognition represents the dependent variable as both music and color represent the independent variables.

Method

Participants

One hundred and thirty adults (N=130) were randomly recruited and willing to contribute to this study. Eighty (n=80) participants were randomly chosen to actually participate in the study. All of these subjects were traditional college aged students, ranging from eighteen years to twenty-four years, from Purdue University Calumet. All participants had normal hearing and vision and none were color blind. Forty-nine females and thirty-one males were randomly selected to participate in this study. The testing sample included a wide variety of races and ethnic subgroups. The above participant selection is adequate for the purposes of this study due to the fact that four threats to external validity were acknowledged and prevented. External validity refers to the extent to which the results of a study can be generalized to others.
Biased sampling (a type of bias where some members of a population are less likely than others to be included in a sample) was never an issue because the participants were randomly chosen from the entire population of Purdue University Calumet students. Reactivity (the influence of a participant’s performance when they are aware they are being observed) was accounted for in that the participants were unaware of the true topic of the study. They were told they would be participating in a study on college stress and how well they manage it. This study never required participants to complete a pretest therefore; pretest sensitization was never an issue. Multiple treatments were also not needed for the purposes of this study.

**Materials and Apparatus**

A paper and pencil pre-qualifying survey was given out to all prospective participants to isolate those who were eligible to be tested. This was a broad questionnaire that contained five basic questions regarding age, gender, race/ethnicity, and whether the participant enjoyed thrashcore music (*Appendix A*). Participants who were found to be between the ages of 18-24 and noted that they were not interested in thrashcore music were selected for this study.

Two separate, yet identical, rooms were used for this study. Both rooms were fully enclosed and contained no windows. A round table was placed directly in the center of each room, with five chairs around it. Headphones and Apple brand ipod nanos were set on the table directly in front of each seat. The only difference was the color of the two rooms. One room was painted a dark gray color, a neutral color stimulus, and the other room was painted canary yellow, a bright color stimulus. The temperatures of each room were set at approximately 70 degrees Fahrenheit and the two rooms were lit by fluorescent light bulbs of 100 watts. This was to ensure that the lighting in the rooms was not too strenuous for the eyes of the participants during testing.

There were two types of music that were used for this study: preferred music and non-preferred music. For the preferred music stimulus, the Pop song “One More Night” by Maroon 5 was played, due to its popularity on the American Billboard music charts. For the non-preferred music stimulus, a thrashcore song “Chelsea Smile” by the band Bring Me the Horizon was played. This song was considered to be a non-preferred type of music since all participants noted the fact that they disliked the genre on the pre-qualifying survey.

During the study, a pencil and paper basic general knowledge test (*Appendix B*) was given out to the participants by a male student, who wore the same attire each day of the study to keep each testing environment
identical. This test had ten multiple choice questions with answers ranging from option A to D. This study also required the use of a paper and pencil mood rating survey to measure positive or negative moods (See Appendix C). Participants were asked to choose their mood and rate it on a 7 point scale (0 being not at all and 7 being very much).

The order of testing varied from day to day. Each day the study tested the effects of color and music on cognition in four different categories: preferred music and bright color, preferred music and neutral color, non-preferred music and bright color, and non-preferred music and neutral color. Each day, ten participants were tested in each room (a total of 20 participants were being tested a day). The study accounted for the possible problem of technology failure by changing the instruments on a daily basis.

Procedure

After having advertised a need for participants for a study on stress, Purdue University Calumet students arrived in the CLO conference room to learn more information on the study. Students were unaware of the study’s actual purpose. All students who attended this informational were given a prequalifying questionnaire to fill out and an informed consent sheet. After the informational, the experimenters of this study looked through all the questionnaires and found those students who would be needed for the study; those who disliked thrashcore music and those who were aged 18 to 24. At this time, eighty students' names were chosen at random to participate. The study required data to be gathered over a period of four days. Twenty participants were needed each day. Participants would be tested every 30 minutes (refer to Table 1).

For the first day of the study, the first five randomly chosen participants arrived in a room that was painted canary yellow. When the participants entered the room they were greeted by a male student dressed in business attire. The male student gave each participant verbal instructions on what they would all be doing. The participants were told that they would be given a basic general knowledge test, a mood rating survey. The basic knowledge test was passed out upside down and each participant was told to put their headphones on, begin playing the music on their assigned ipods, and begin the test. The music being played was the preferred music stimulus, the song "One More Night" by Maroon 5.
The participants were asked to keep listening to the music after they were done taking their tests. The male student came around and collected all the tests when everyone was completed. He then passed out the mood rating survey. At that time, the participants were debriefed, being told the true purpose of the study. The participants were thanked for their time, dismissed, and told not to talk to anyone about the study for four days’ time.

The male student then moved to the room right next door, which looked exactly the same as the previous room except the color of the room was dark grey. All other characteristics were the same. Five more randomly assigned students arrived in that room at 10:30am and were greeted by the same male student, given the same instructions, and asked to complete the same tasks. The music playing for these participants was the non-preferred music stimulus, the song “Chelsea Smile” by Bring me the Horizon. After completing the basic knowledge test and the mood rating survey, the participants were debriefed, dismissed, and once again told not to talk to anyone about the study for four days’ time.

At 11am, another five participants arrive in the canary yellow room. They were given the same treatment as the other two test groups but this time they were to listen to the non-preferred music stimulus. Finally, at 11:30am, the final five participants for the day arrived in the dark grey room and listened to the preferred music stimulus as they completed their test and mood survey. Each day the participants were told not to discuss the experiment with anyone until the four day time span of the study was completed. The next day the same four tests were done with another twenty participants. Each day the order of testing changed (refer to Table 1). This study utilized a block counterbalancing design.

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Group 1 (10am)</th>
<th>Group 2 (10:30am)</th>
<th>Group 3 (11am)</th>
<th>Group 4 (11:30am)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Day 1</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Day 2</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Day 3</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Day 4</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Note: Condition A refers to the bright color and preferred music stimuli. Condition B refers to the neutral color and non-preferred music stimuli. Condition C refers to the bright color and non-preferred music stimuli. Condition D refers to the neutral color and preferred music stimuli.

For each day of the study, the participants were treated the same way. The male student wore the same clothing and spoke in the same tone of voice each day. The only factors to change from experiment to experiment were the participants, the music stimuli, the colors of the rooms, and the order in which the participants were tested.

The order of testing, the order in which each test is done, (shown above) changed from day to day to account for the time in which each condition was exposed to the participants. Certain times of the day could influence a participant’s concentration, alertness, or interest. Manipulating the order of testing from day to day helps to determine whether the results from the experiment were truly from the stimuli or if they were due to the conditions being presented at a certain time of the day. Diffusion of treatment, the issue of when participants from the study group share information with the control group that was not intended for the control group to know, was slightly harder to control for. Each group of participants was told not to disclose any information from the study to anyone until the study was completed however, it cannot be known for certain whether they obeyed this rule.

*Research Design/Experimental Manipulations*

For the purpose of this study, the 80 participants that were tested were randomly chosen, 20 participants were tested each day for 4 days. This was to evenly distribute half of the participants to be tested under the same conditions. The color of the rooms varied between yellow and gray to test the moods of each participant and decide if possible positive or negative moods were caused by the color of the room. The preferred or non-preferred music was played to see whether a participant would cognitively perform better or worse.

The research design used for this particular experiment was the between subject design. Different groups of subjects served in different parts of the study. All participants used in the study were only each tested one time, not multiple. Since this was a one-time test, each participant was only tested under one level. The participants were tested on two different IV levels, to see if there was a correlation between color and music and an effect on overall performance. To control for eight extraneous variables, numerous things were taken into account (refer to Table 2).
Extraneous Variables Controlled

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Extraneous Variable</th>
<th>Possible Issues</th>
<th>Controlled</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Selection Bias</td>
<td>No variation in race, ethnic subgroups, gender etc.</td>
<td>Participants were randomly selected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differential Attrition</td>
<td>Participants drop out of the study</td>
<td>Ensure participation by signing a detailed written consent form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diffusion of Treatment</td>
<td>Sharing information with others</td>
<td>Made sure the participants were separated between studies and they were told not to discuss any information with the study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Order of Testing</td>
<td>Timing of test</td>
<td>Block counterbalancing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instrumental Change</td>
<td>Changing of instruments during experiment</td>
<td>Ensure all instruments and variables in the study are kept constant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>Differences in conditions</td>
<td>All events during testing are kept constant for all participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maturation</td>
<td>Short or long term changes in participants that may affect DV</td>
<td>The testing time is kept to a maximum of 30 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regression Toward the Mean</td>
<td>High and low scores regressed toward the mean</td>
<td>Ensure reliable valid measures are taken</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results

According to Table 3, labeled Descriptive Statistics for Cognitive Testing, the mean score for bright vs. neutral color stimuli is M= 1.50. Mean is defined as the average number of scores obtained by adding the scores to find the sum and dividing by the number of total scores. This was obtained by taking the two numerical values for bright (1) and neutral (2) colors, adding them to equal 3, and dividing them by the number of total values, which were two, to equal 1.50. The mode (the number that occurred most frequently in the results) of the bright vs. neutral color stimuli was indicated as being 1. For this column, both numerical values of 1 and 2 were used an equal amount of times (both being used 40 times), however, for the purposes of displaying data, the lowest value was shown for mode, being 1. The median, the middle value in a set of scores, of the bright vs. neutral color stimuli is 1.50. This value is shown as 1.50 because 1.50 is directly between 1 and 2. The range (the highest score subtracted by the lowest score) of the bright vs. neutral color stimuli is 1. The standard deviation (the measure of the distribution of scores around the mean) of the bright vs. neutral color stimuli is .503. Since the mean is 1.50, the other scores for the bright vs. neutral color stimuli are around the mean by either falling below or above 1.50 by roughly .503.
The mean score for preferred vs. non-preferred music stimuli is 3.50. The mode of the preferred vs. non-preferred music stimuli is 3. As with the bright vs. neutral color stimuli, since both preferred (3) and non-preferred (4) were used an equal amount of times (40 times) throughout the study, the lowest value of 3 is shown in the data. The median of the preferred vs. non-preferred music stimuli is 3.50. The range of the preferred vs. non-preferred music stimuli is 1. The standard deviation of the preferred vs. non-preferred music stimuli is also .503.

The last column in Table 3 refers to the scores obtained from the Cognition, which ranged from 1 to 10 and was conducted a total of 80 times. The mean score of the Cognition is M= 6.74. The mode and median scores are both 7. The range score of Cognition is 9 and the standard deviation is STD= 2.115.

Table 3

Descriptive Statistics for Cognitive Testing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statistics</th>
<th>bright vs neutral</th>
<th>preferred vs non-preferred</th>
<th>Cognition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>6.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>7.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode</td>
<td>1&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>7&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. Deviation</td>
<td>.503</td>
<td>.503</td>
<td>2.115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Multiple modes exist. The smallest value is shown
It has been predicted that the type of color and the genre of music will affect cognition. As shown in Table 4, an analysis of variance test (or ANOVA test) revealed that a significant main effect was obtained for bright colors, $F(1,76)= 130.514, \ p=.000, \ n^2 = .632, \ power = 1.00$. Power is used to determine a significant difference when a real difference exists; likewise, the power of a study is determined by three different factors: the sample size, the alpha level, and the effect size. An F- value is used to show that all means are not equal and that the $H_0$ (null hypothesis) is rejected. As displayed in Table 5, color has a slightly higher mean value ($M=8.05$) than did the mean value for music which is ($M=5.43$). There is a moderate difference ($\text{Partial Eta Squared}=.63$). Partial Eta Squared is the amount of total variability attributable to a certain element. The effect size indicates the measurement of an obtained effect and how important it is. If an effect size is larger than 0.8, it is considered to have a significantly large effect. The given effect size ($d= 0.632$) is below 0.8 which means that color has only a medium effect on cognition. This effect size has a high probability of correctly rejecting a false null hypothesis due to its high power.

An ANOVA test revealed that a significant main effect was also obtained for music, $F(1,76)= 125.590, \ p=.000, \ n^2 = .623, \ power= 1.00$, (as noted in Table 5) indicating that the preferred music subgroup had a significantly
higher mean value (M=8.02) than the mean value for non-preferred music which was (M=5.45). This is a moderate difference, being that (Partial Eta Squared = .63). Similar to color, music also displays a medium effect size (d= .623).

Another ANOVA test was conducted on color*music and revealed that the interaction between music and color was not significant, F(1,76)= 2.664, p=.107, n²= .034 with a power of .364 (as noted in Table 3). Although the effect size is very weak, (Partial Eta Squared= .03), this is the most interesting part of ANOVA because this indicates that, despite the music and color having a medium effect on cognition when they were presented separately, music and color together have basically no effect on cognition overall. This small effect size (d= .034) has a low probability of correctly rejecting a false null hypothesis.

Table 3

**Effects of Tests**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Partial Eta Squared</th>
<th>Observed Power</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corrected Model</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>86.256</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.773</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3439.189</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.978</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>color</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>130.514</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.632</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>music</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>125.589</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.623</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>color * music</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.664</td>
<td>.107</td>
<td>.034</td>
<td>.364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Error</td>
<td>76</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>80</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corrected Total</td>
<td>79</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4

**Bright vs. Neutral Color Stimuli**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>bright vs neutral</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Lower Bound</th>
<th>Upper Bound</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>bright</td>
<td>8.050</td>
<td>.162</td>
<td>7.726</td>
<td>8.374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>5.425</td>
<td>.162</td>
<td>5.101</td>
<td>5.749</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5

**Descriptive Statistics**
Descriptive Statistics

Dependent Variable: cognition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>bright vs neutral</th>
<th>preferred vs non-preferred</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preferred</td>
<td>Preferred</td>
<td>9.15</td>
<td>.745</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bright</td>
<td>non-preferred</td>
<td>6.95</td>
<td>.826</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>8.05</td>
<td>1.358</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preferred</td>
<td>Preferred</td>
<td>6.90</td>
<td>1.021</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>non-preferred</td>
<td>3.95</td>
<td>1.395</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.43</td>
<td>1.920</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preferred</td>
<td>Preferred</td>
<td>8.02</td>
<td>1.441</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>non-preferred</td>
<td>5.45</td>
<td>1.894</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>6.74</td>
<td>2.115</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2. The above graph indicates that listening to non-preferred music will lead to a lower cognitive testing score (with the score being from 0 to 10). Non-preferred music, compared with preferred music, will disrupt cognition, especially while taking a test. Cognitive Testing scores were found to be higher when listening to preferred music.
Discussion

After conducting the study, there were many things that were taken into account. For instance, the potential bias and threats to external and internal validity, the imprecision of measurements, and the observed effect sizes and power. Also taken into consideration were limitations, weaknesses, implications, and the application of the findings.

Throughout the experiment, there are many different factors that could have affected the results significantly. Internal validity addresses the ‘true’ causes of the outcomes that are observed in the study. However, there must be a strong justification linking the independent and dependent variables together. It is important to have reliable measures of both variables to have strong internal validity. Taking into account the selection, the results could have been affected due to a participant’s specific characteristic. Some of these may include: sex, height, personality, attitude, mental ability, or motor ability. History is another important factor that could have been a threat to internal validity.

On the other hand, external validity deals with applying the study conducted to other people and other situations. Having a good mix of participants at all ability levels would account for strong, reliable external validity. However, there are three major threats to external validity: people, place and time. With this taken into consideration, the results of the experiment could have been affected significantly.

The imprecision of measurements play a very important role in the results as well. There could have been some errors made which influenced the results of the study in either a positive or negative way. For example, the physical traits about the testing environment (color of room, test being given etc.) may have affected some people differently than others. The results then may change significantly according to the changes made. Certain errors made, but not accounted for, can determine significant changes in the results, leading to imprecision of measurement.

It was concluded that overall, the observed effect sizes and power influenced the results of the experiment conducted. Color and music both have a significant effect on cognition when taken into account separately. The effect sizes as described previously in the results section display numbers in which the effect size is significantly low for those two levels; thus, meaning there is a strong relationship between the two. However, there is no relationship between color, music and cognition combined; therefore, proving the hypotheses to be false. It was found that music
and color separately had a medium sized effect on cognition, yet music and color together had an extremely small sized effect on cognition.

This study does have a few weaknesses and limitations. For one, the results of this specific study cannot be generalized to other studies of the same kind. It would be hard to make an assumption about one group of people without having tested that group first.

This study could be helpful to many people. It could be beneficial for those who wish to create an environment that is conducive to learning. A bright, bold color would not be helpful in that it may be distracting, yet that color could boost mood. It is also worth noting that background music in a public place could also affect the mood and possibly the behavior of some people. It is best to learn about the effects of music and color on human cognition and that is why more research should be done on these topics.

Appendix A
Pre-Qualifying Survey

Please answer the following questions below by circling the best answer that corresponds to you. Be sure to print clearly on the line provided.

1. How old are you?
   - 18-24 years old
   - 25-31 years old
   - 32 years and older

2. What is your gender?
   - Male
   - Female

3. Please circle the race that best describes you and state your ethnicity.
   - Caucasian
   - African American
   - Asian
   - Hispanic
   - Native American
   - Biracial
   - Other
   Ethnicity: __________________________________________

4. Do you enjoy listening to the Thrashcore music genre?
   - Yes
   - No

5. Please provide us with your preferred name and contact information (pseudonyms can be used).
   Name: __________________________________________
   Phone number most
General Knowledge Exam

Please respond to the following questions with the corresponding answer that is most appropriate. When you have completed this test, please turn the paper face down on the table in front of you and remain seated until dismissed.

1. How many strings does a violin have?
   a. Four
   b. Three
   c. Two
   d. Five

2. On a computer, ‘favorities’ are accessible from the __ menu?
   a. Title
   b. Shop
   c. Menu
   d. Start

3. What is the number of squares on a chess board?
   a. 72
   b. 64
   c. 32
   d. 48
4. Which of the following is NOT a metal?
   a. Gold
   b. Diamond
   c. Silver
   d. Copper

5. Who told ‘Beware the Ides of March’?
   a. Julius Caesar
   b. Augustus Caesar
   c. Mark Antony
   d. Cleopatra
   e. Figure B.1 General Knowledge Exam Page 1

6. Who was the first President of the United States of America?
   a. George Washington
   b. Thomas Jefferson
   c. James Monroe
   d. John Adams

7. Yen is the currency of which country?
   a. Japan
   b. China
   c. Nepal
   d. Bhutan

8. Where in a contract do some businesses try to hide extra costs?
   a. In the offer
   b. In the money back guarantee
   c. In the fine print
   d. In the Signature section
9. On which continent does Switzerland lie?
   a. Africa
   b. Asia
   c. Europe
   d. North America

10. What is the scientific name for Salt?
   a. Sodium Chloride
   b. Sodabi Carbonate
   c. Sodium Carbonates
   d. Chlorine

Figure B.2 General Knowledge Exam Page 2

Appendix C

Name:________________________________________

Mood Rating Survey

Please indicate which mood you are currently feeling and to what extent.

Note: Circle all that may apply

0= Not at All 7=Very Much

Cheerful - 0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7
Content - 0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7
Relaxed- 0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7
Upset- 0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7
Irritated- 0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7
Angry- 0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Figure C Mood Rating Scale
References


Abigail Knapp  
Wilmington College

---

**Something Smells: Olfactory Imagery in Emile Zola's *L’Assommoir***

What makes an author’s work realistic and immediate? An author must present his story so that the reader feels as if he or she has experienced a slice of life. Emile Zola is a realist and self-described author of naturalism. He tried to scientifically conduct a literary study of the effects of heredity and environment on a number of different characters, and he wrote a twenty volume cycle, *Les Rougon-Macquarts*, to illustrate his ideas on the issue of nature versus nurture. *L’Assommoir* is one novel in the series that portrays the life of a washerwoman inhabiting the slums of Paris. Zola often depicts the living conditions in a turn of the century tenement as disgusting and brutal. The torments of a soiled Gervaise are anything but sanitary. I argue that Zola’s use of olfactory and other sensory imagery creates a vivid, brutal, and immediate inspection of human life that jars the reader and exposes the plight of the female working class at the end of the 19th century. And he unknowingly anticipated the science of the future that would support his writing.

Zola set Gervaise’s story in an ever-changing atmosphere where her struggles were just a small part of the large scale upheaval taking place in France in order to observe and determine whether nature or nurture most affects one's personality. Naturalism is defined in Henderson’s *Glossary of Literary Theory* as “the application of the clinical method of empirical science to all life.” It differs from ordinary realism because of this use of science. Zola knew that to truly observe anything, the viewer must use all of his or her senses. He incorporated every kind of imagery in his novels in order to accurately describe the human nature he saw.

*L’Assommoir* follows the life of Gervaise Macquart. She starts out as a washerwoman with two sons by a man who leaves her for another woman. Eventually, she marries a laborer named Coupeau and has more children. They live frugally but decently until Coupeau breaks his leg in a fall and has to quit work. Gervaise borrows money from the Goujets, her neighbors, to start up her own laundry service, but her husband drinks away all her earnings. As time goes by, she gives up, becomes an alcoholic, and lets her business fail. By the end of the novel, Coupeau has died in an insane asylum, the children have left home, and Gervaise dies of starvation under a stairway.
Zola creates characters with whom the reader can empathize. The awful lowness depicted in many of Zola’s novels, especially in *L’Assommoir*, repelled many critics. They saw him as wallowing in the vilest filth of humanity without any hope of becoming clean. However, changes in opinion could eventually be seen in reviews due to the support of people such as author Henry James and Professor J.W. Davidson, who saw the need to show the baseness of humanity in order to make a change. Indeed, Zola often presents the lives of his characters dispassionately. He does not editorialize, but as Professor Davidson writes,

Zola’s novels […] present [facts] to us in their connection, show us their causes in existing social or other institutions, and their effects upon men’s lives and characters, and so at once suggest a remedy and rouse us to apply it […] Zola […] presents vice in all its prosaic, dull, heartless, disgusting nakedness. No man has made vice so unlovely, so sickening as Zola has done. (qtd. in Edwards 120)

The use of ‘disgusting’ and ‘sickening,’ refers to one of the main techniques by which Zola jars his audience. He strikes at the reader’s nose. The many instances of olfactory imagery in *L’Assommoir* can rankle the reader, sometimes subtly and other times so overtly that one has to take a moment to pause and breathe before reading on.

The human sense of smell is not as strong as many other creatures’, but it is a sense that triggers emotions. People know this from experience, but only fairly recently have researchers delved into this field, and, as Kirsten Weir reports, “the more closely researchers look, the more evidence they find that odors hold sway over our emotions, our cognition, and even our health.” An effect of olfactory imagery known as “the ‘Proustian phenomenon’ proposes that distinctive smells have more power than any other sense to help us recall distant memories” and has been around since the author and critic Marcel Proust wrote about it in the early 20th century, only about thirty years after Zola wrote his novels (Collins). By smelling a certain perfume, for example, a person may instantly remember his or her deceased grandmother. On the other hand, the scent of urine can make a person nauseous. This person knows what has been scientifically proven, that “smells trigger more detailed, arousing, and unpleasant memories of painful experiences than sounds,” or other stimuli (Collins).

Zola was surprisingly accurate in his rigorous application of science in writing, especially in *L’Assommoir*. The narrator describes Gervaise as the product of violence and drunkenness, and her limp is “a curious hereditary result of the brutality which her mother had to endure during her fierce drunken brawls with Macquart” (*Rougons*
Lilian Furst supports the reading of Gervaise as a character exemplifying the power of nature in her article “A Medical Reading of Gervaise in L’Assommoir,” and argues that her nature includes being born with fetal alcohol effect (196). Gervaise suffers from “an impaired ability to learn […] from mistakes […] a certain impulsiveness and naivety; […] self-destructiveness in behavior […] and sweetness of temperament” (Furst, “Medical” 196-197). The cause of these personality traits that are proven to exist in children born with fetal alcohol effect are explained by the narrator as the results from her drunken heritage. Zola critic Gulab Jha supports this reading by saying Gervaise simply lets herself be “the sport of every wind that assaulsts her exposed life, and who, rolling from one gross mistake to another, finds her end in misery, drink and despair” (4). The inevitability of her fate, caused by her very DNA, proves the effects of nature. She enabled her own downfall simply by living the way she was made. By writing this novel, Zola anticipates 20th and 21st century studies on fetal alcohol effect and smell and uses them to determine the fates of his characters and to affect the reader.

The combination of senses rather than a focus on one or two makes L’Assommoir realistic and allows the reader to gather the empirical data needed to experience the scene. The description of Gervaise’s name-day dinner party is rife with olfactory imagery of food, drink, flowers, and many others less pleasant. She hosts the dinner in her shop because there is not enough room in their apartment to host such a lavish party. Smells like “burnt flour” with the sounds of “sputtering in the pans” and the sight of “white aprons” open the kitchen scene with the classic “delicious smell of cooking” for the saint’s day party (197). Here the narrator describes stimuli that appeal to smell, hearing, and sight to evoke the hectic but comforting feeling of being in the kitchen. The unmistakable sound of sauce simmering in a pan rouses memories of home-cooked meals. The smell of burnt flour brings to mind thoughts of dinner rolls. Everyone who has been to a large get together will recognize this scene that draws people from all over the house, or tenement, to “find out what was being cooked” (197). Most will have happy memories associated with a scene like this and can recall the satisfying feeling that cooking and eating so much food gives. As studies have shown, “the mere mention of a positive odour […] increased reports of positive mood” (“The Smell Report”). In this case, the food smells permeate the air, drawing the characters and reader into the scene in the kitchen and away from the depressing reminders of life in the slums.
The anticipation for the dinner is heightened by the smells, and the guests become more primal in their excitement. Their sense of hearing is dulled because “the noise of frying drowned people’s voices” (Zola 202). In contrast, “the smell of roast goose was so powerful that all the nostrils were flaring,” which makes the characters sound like animals (202). The overwhelming “heat from the three stoves and the roaster [that] was asphyxiating” make the smells even more intoxicating (202). Again, the guests resemble a herd of hungry animals waiting around to be fed because the “fragrant scent of flowers” from the gifts brings to mind a field for grazing only to be “mingled with the aromas of cooking” (202). The guests are still human, but the smells of the expected food hit a primal place that is inside all animals. They start “whetting their appetite by coming in to sniff at the pans and the roaster” even though the smells already infused the very air they were breathing (203). Inhibitions begin to lower after waiting a little while for the food to be ready, and the women act like young girls, running around while “their skirts fanned the cooking smells, mixing and spreading them” (203). This only adds to the excitement and primal atmosphere by introducing the lustiness of breathless women to a room suffused with food smells.

A few hours into the meal, the guests are less energetic and give way to the lethargy that comes from bingeing, and the denouement reminds the reader that the characters are products of a poverty stricken existence. Darkness falls during the meal, and when the lamps are lit they reveal “the mess the table was in, with its greasy plates and forks and wine-stained cloth covered with crumbs. The powerful smells rising up made [them] gasp for breath. Meanwhile, noses were turning towards the kitchen, enticed by savoury whiffs of warm air” (212). Anyone who has overeaten before can empathize with the characters in this scene. However, it is surprising that the guests want to keep going. They are so full that “the men unbuttoned their waistcoats” and everyone is sweating (211). It is so rare for these poor people to eat a good, large meal that they will keep eating until they burst. This scene can sicken the reader if he or she imagines how stuffed the characters already are when they continue with the meal. Almost painfully, their noses lead them on; they cannot stop eating before the main dish of roast goose. The inability of the guests to stop eating symbolizes their inability to control their fates. They will eat until they are sick because they can do nothing else. They must slog through this meal as they must keep pushing through their dismal lives, working without any real gain. Here, Zola shows that taking the scientific approach of naturalism does not exclude the author’s use of literary devices like symbolism. He includes the reader in this bacchanalian feast by describing the
sights, sounds, and smells while also pointing out the unfairness and inequality the characters, as well as their real world counterparts, face.

Wine livens up the party, and the dinner again becomes a microcosm of society. The guests overindulge as much in drink as they do in food, making the wine flow “like water down the Seine, or like a stream when it’s been raining and the ground is parched” (216). Indeed, the company is “parched” from living life in poverty. Coupeau is an example of the working man drowning his sorrow at the inevitability of his fate in alcohol. If these poor laborers did not become drunk then they had to face their bare rooms with a clear head and know that that was all they could hope for in life. The narrator compares the empty bottles, flung into a corner, to dead bodies in a cemetery, and the wine “tasted of old casks, but […] soon it seemed quite nutty,” which exemplifies how alcohol changes perception, for after all, the “working man couldn’t get along without wine” (216). Alcohol makes the worker forget his troubles and feel as if he is richer than he is. The only problem comes when the drunks cross the line of acceptable behavior. One girl, Clemence, “puked all down one of the muslin curtains and completely ruined it;” the Lorilleux, Gervaise’s sister and brother-in-law, had a fight; “Goujet had started to cry;” and “Coupeau was still singing” by the end of the party (232). The company breaks apart after drinking to such excess that people could not remember the events of the night the next day. Zola understood the worker’s addiction to alcohol, but he did not condone it. He condemns a society that drives people to alcoholism by systematically exposing the dregs of the great empire. Zola presents this dinner party and its component scents objectively, letting the actions of the characters condemn society’s treatment of poor laborers. However, this clinical detachment, appropriate in naturalism, serves to drive home the awful reality rather than sanitize it.

Zola, through the straightforward voice of the narrator, presents the inequality and unfairness of the world in such a way that the reader wants to change it. His use of sensory imagery, especially olfactory imagery, emphasizes the unsavory aspects of life in the slums of Paris. The reader is brought down into the world Gervaise lives in and gets so close that it becomes uncomfortable. Scent works in such a way because it is connected to the memory and emotion sectors of the brain. As researchers have found, “the perception of smell consists not only of the sensation of the odours themselves but of the experiences and emotion associated with these sensations. Smells can evoke strong emotional reactions” (“The Smell Report”). This makes scent a visceral type of imagery, and Zola does not let
the reader back off and simply view the scenes of abject poverty in L’Assommoir. Even if they are less potent for being mental, not actual, smells, the narrator forces the reader to experience the same smells as Gervaise.

Through his use of smell, Zola’s realism differs fundamentally from other contemporary authors’ realism. For example, Thomas Hardy wrote Tess of the D’Urbervilles without much, if any, use of olfactory imagery. Though there is an abundance of rich visual imagery, appeals to other senses seem to fall away. As Laura Marks notes, there is a “tendency to dismiss the proximal senses [of smell, taste, and touch] as inferior that underpins western thought,” and Hardy is proof (123). Tess’s suffering shows a split between mind and body. Whereas Gervaise lives in the muck of everyday filth, Tess contemplates her place in the world and in religion. Even with multiple breakfast scenes and other various meals, Hardy rarely, if ever, includes the way the food smells or tastes. The proximal senses are too mundane and low for Tess even though she is a working class girl. Over-thinking gives rise to many of Tess’s problems where Gervaise cannot worry farther into the future than what is for dinner.

Writing under realism does not mean that an author cannot create art or use symbolism. However, if the goal is to represent life as it really is, an author cannot forget to add, or consciously omit, aspects of what make up reality. The reader does not need to be bombarded at every turn by the scent of everything, but the senses are a large part of how a person perceives the world and can be what make a scene resonate with or ward off the reader. Both Hardy and Zola present fictional worlds similar to reality, but the difference in their portrayals of those worlds sets them apart. Hardy’s conscious exclusion of the other senses in favor of visual imagery hinders him from reaching that place in the reader’s soul that causes him or her to really connect with the characters. Studies have shown that “people who are more sensitive to social smells are also more sensitive to emotional signals” (Weir). Odors can trigger emotions in a way that sights cannot. This flaw is not so glaringly obvious that the reader picks up on it immediately, though. It is only through reading the works of others authors, such as Zola, that the audience can recognize what enables Gervaise to arouse empathy with more immediacy.

Both Tess and Gervaise, in Gulab Jha’s words, “abused their bodies for the sake of money and comforts,” but where one’s suffering is merely told, the other’s is felt by the reader (1). Zola’s use of sensory imagery to disgust the reader drives home the fact that Gervaise is stuck in a mire of filth and poverty that she has no hope of escaping. On the other hand, Hardy’s pictorial and charming fatalism does not have the same gut-wrenching effect. Zola’s skill
in writing as a naturalist shows in his ability to anticipate the medical and scientific advances made after his publications. Almost a century went by before researchers got around to proving the importance and effects of olfaction that Zola knew already. In order to be a successful observer of human nature and society, an author has to go beyond the visual and to include all of the senses that a person experiences. The reader benefits from getting the whole picture and can more fully understand the flaws the author sees in society when his or her senses are stimulated.

Work Cited


*Edinburgh University Press*. Print.


A Look in the Gilded Mirror: Etiquette’s Effects on Chicago’s Elite Wives, 1890-1920

Wealthy and socially significant in high society, Pauline Palmer was the definition of the elite Chicago wife during the early twentieth century. The daughter of a newspaper owner, Herman H. Kohlstaat and wife, Mabel Kohlstaat, Pauline was already a wealthy Chicagoan before her marriage to Potter Palmer II. Palmer II was the son of Chicago’s merchant prince, Potter Palmer, and the queen of Chicago’s society, Bertha Honoré Palmer. Pauline possessed every privilege. She was educated, influential, and traveled extensively conducting shopping sprees across Europe and America. However, being so well-known came with the honor, or curse, of being at the center of attention. Her 1956 obituary in the Chicago American praised Pauline for being “One of the great ladies without trying to be,” yet, her personal memoirs and letters reveal the opposite: she strived for her status.

In an age where manners mattered, elite women’s actions would be noted by others. Elite women represented class, breeding, education, social influence—all ideas grounded heavily on the social factor. With this emphasis on sociality, the rules of polite conduct came into play in the form of proper etiquette. While beginning her post wedding travels, Pauline wrote to her mother claiming, “it’s ‘still hell to be famous’” (Dwight 34). Everyone looked at her wherever she went and whatever she did. Pauline wrote to her mother in the August 7, 1908 letter that “everyone on board rubbered every time they passed us, and the man who sat next to us at the table...knew our separate histories from a to z.” The awareness that she was rich, famous, was an idea that she already accepted (Dwight 36). She saw herself as somewhat obligated to follow the rules of etiquette. Regardless of an elite wife’s regard for conduct literature, her public persona still interacted with prominent ideals of etiquette. Newspapers reported when the elite held parties, attended events, wore fabulous clothes and so the celebrity associated with these women both disregarded the need for modesty and created an open comparison between the wives’ actions and prescribed notions of etiquette.

Conduct literature assumed that those who were “well-bred,” the elite, naturally possessed traits to be well-mannered, therefore the written prescribed advice served to promote etiquette to those who were not innately endowed with knowledge of appropriate behavior. Late nineteenth century conduct literature like Manner, Culture and
Dress of the Best American Society, which dictated how women should act, states in its introduction that “There are persons [those who are of good breeding] who seem to possess the instinct of courtesy...as to require no instruction or practice in order to be perfectly polite...Most people, however require some rules” (Wells & Stewart). This text, and texts like it, contained codes of conduct for all manner of interaction for those who need it—how employers should treat servants, how to decorate one’s home, where to place flowers, how to write letters, and most importantly for the purposes of this essay, how to perform wifely duties. In the late nineteenth century, social and cultural norms still relegated women’s authority, primarily to the domestic sphere. Since conduct literature targeted women as their audience, conduct literature authors wrote with the domestic setting in mind and viewed women’s concerns as the care and maintenance of the family and the home. “Godey’s Lady’s Book,” a popular, monthly magazine, widely circulated in the United States during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, contained similar prescribed advice.

Rules of etiquette and domesticity acted more as boundaries to be stretched to many wives of prominent and prosperous Chicago men. Being elite changed the circumstances of the domestic sphere. Middle and lower class women barely fit their chores—making three meals a day for the family; cleaning by sweeping, dusting, window-washing, picking up after others, making the beds; washing, drying, ironing, sewing, mending, and folding clothes; raising the children; entertaining—into the twenty-four hours a day allowed, but most elite women did not have to worry about such matters (Matthews 98-99). Women of means hired servants to do the household labor. Instead of conducting the housework, elite women managed the household. This opened more idle time for the elite housewife to devote herself to other interests and more time for conduct literature to assign rules to.

Elite women in Chicago from 1890 to 1920 both encountered new standards of domesticity and altered the terms of domesticity. The Cult of Domesticity marked the mid-nineteenth and mid-twentieth centuries with ideals of purity, piety, obedience, and domesticity (Welter). The time in between these two periods, the time that this paper studies, was a time that Pauline, and women like her, played the role of housewives without an overwhelming emphasis on the domestic sphere. Still, proper etiquette remained prominent in Pauline’s Era despite the Progressive Era beginning as a reaction to rapid industrialization. The Progressive Era was characterized by the middle class struggling for rights, education, better working conditions, and child labor laws. These changes meant very little for
elite wives, so some of them chose to stage their small rebellion against etiquette. While Chicago’s elite wives adhered to most codes prescribed by conduct literature, they could, and did, push the constraints of etiquette and domesticity without perceiving themselves as transgressing social boundaries. Instead, some began to see themselves as both instigators of cultural change and separate from the standard housewife.

Historical Context

Production and Consumption of Conduct Literature

The production and consumption of conduct literature for a female audience increased in volume and importance steadily since the seventeenth century. Although conduct literature existed before the seventeenth century, its significance was not as large and it was not as specific in scope. Conduct literature for men faded by the end of the seventeenth century but prescribed advice for women flourished. Men viewed rules which told them how to live their lives as absurd. Men satirized conduct literature which presumed to limit the privileged white man (Warhol & Herndl, 897). A clear gender divide became visible by the 1690s as publications which were concerned with varieties of prescribed advice for women increased (Warhol & Herndl, 897).

The feminine ideal promoted by conduct literature since the beginning was one of a wife “ensuring a happy household” (Warhol & Herndl, 897). By the turn of the twentieth century there were numerous print materials aimed at women. Magazines like Decorator and Furnisher, The House Beautiful, House and Garden, The Ladies Home Journal, Good Housekeeping, Godey’s Lady’s Book, as well as treatises on domesticity and handbooks on etiquette, were available for consumption by women in the United States (Hoganson, 61). This sort of educational literature that addressed the duties of women and instructed them as to how to treat their domestic arena became quite popular among women of various socioeconomic levels of the hierarchy (Warhol & Herndl, 897).

The values of the woman in the home was emphasized during the mid-nineteenth century’s Cult of Domesticity. American housewives became essential to home during the nineteenth century’s Cult of Domesticity because they were the center of culture and production in the United States Early Republican home (Matthews, xiv, xvi, 3, 6). This Early Republican period provided women with self-esteem and reassurance of their worth to both the family and society (Matthews, 29). The model woman submitted to her husband despite being morally superior to men, was pure until marriage as a result of religious fervor, and maintained the family and the household (Welter).
The second Cult of Domesticity occurred during the mid-twentieth century and emphasized the housewife similarly through her control over material consumption of household goods. The 1950s return to domesticity, if anything, was an attempt to focus once more on the home, but the housewife had already been devalued by society (Matthews). The time between these two periods was a transition, a time where conduct literature remained constant but the rules of domesticity relaxed.

What some scholars considered to be the Golden Age of Domesticity occurred during the turn of the twentieth century. New inventions came to fruition and gave women more free time in which to perfect their craft, and so domestic responsibilities began to be seen as a burden (Matthews, 11, 23, 28-29). These changes acted as the preconditions to a new age of domesticity, perhaps even a “golden age,” dawning characterized by the following: (1) public and private spheres beginning to mix, (2) women becoming increasingly involved in influencing society, and (3) women developing rationales to become publicly active and following through (Matthews, 34). Some scholars believe women had began advancing to this state in antebellum United States, but most often historians consider 1890 to 1920 to be the era when “organized women exercised a great deal of influence over social institutions governing American society” (Kerber, Kessler-Harris, Sklar, 10; Ruegamer 1). Chicago’s elite women embodied the growing influence of women in the public sphere through participation in high society and social organizations.

Chicago’s Elite Wives

The elite wives of Chicago’s rich men enjoyed the privileges of wealth and influence. These women lived in mansions, sent their children to boarding schools, travelled abroad frequently, entertained lavishly, and decorated their homes with the most expensive art and furniture (Dwight 26). Their influence was not limited to the domestic sphere. Many historians retrospectively label the nineteenth century in United States history as time that gave rise to women (Ruegamer 1). Some assert that organizations of women enjoyed immense amounts of influence over society, particularly between 1890 and 1920 (Kerber, Kessler-Harris, & Sklar, 10).

Elite women exercised their social influence to set trends, effectively altering or adding to prescribed advice. Bertha Palmer (1849-1918) was arguably one of the most influential women to live in Chicago. Before Pauline Palmer married her son, Bertha Honoré Palmer was the queen of Chicago (Swanson, 44). Her parents, Mr. and Mrs. Henry Hamilton Honoré were already wealthy and lived on Michigan Avenue before the Chicago Fire of 1871.
Swanson, 44). She received her education at Saint Xavier Academy in Chicago (Ruegamer, 39). Married by the age of twenty-two to Chicago’s Merchant Prince, Potter Palmer, the man who gave birth to the Gold Coast and developed Chicago’s real estate, Bertha was at the center of Chicago society. People regarded her as glamorous and “regal in manner.” Frequently ladies’ magazines like The Woman Beautiful would describe Mrs. Potter Palmer:

‘[P]eople are concerned not so much about what she thinks as they are about her aloof manner, her stunning carriage, the smooth pink and white unwrinkled skin, the perfect teeth, wonderful hair, velvet gowns, her world famous furs’ (Ross, 102).

This quote denotes that as long as these elite wives did their duty as a wife well, their extracurriculars went unnoticed. Women who conformed to conduct literature’s advice, such as Mrs. Bertha Palmer, may have conformed out of necessity in order to be able to transgress in other portions of their social lives.

Aggrandizing Chicago’s cultural and intellectual institutions served as another form of elite wives participation in society. Bertha Palmer became the president of the Board of Lady Managers for Chicago’s 1893 Colombian Exposition, an event that would bring millions of people to United States’ ‘Second City.’ She also joined the Chicago Women’s Club. Bertha and Pauline Palmer contributed greatly to the Chicago Art Institute so that it could exhibit important and valuable art.

A notable poet and writer, and also another women who added to the cultural significance of Chicago, Frances Lillian Wells Shaw (1872-1937), the daughter of Moses D. Wells, a pioneer boot merchant, and Frances E. Searls, married Howard Van Doren Shaw, son of Theodore A. Shaw, the dry goods merchant. Architect Howard Van Doren Shaw designed significant buildings in Chicago which still stand, such as the Goodman Theatre, the Quadrangle Club at University of Chicago, the Fourth Presbyterian Church, and Lake Forest’s Market Square.

Howard Van Doren Shaw was significant to Chicago’s architectural history while his wife was important to Chicago’s women’s literary and cultural history. Frances Wells Shaw enjoyed a career as a successful writer and poet, most known for her poem “Who Loves the Rain” and works published in newspapers and magazines about her travels. This notable Chicago wife frequently travelled, lectured, and wrote to fill her idle time (CHS; Swanson, 100).

A more common activity for Chicago’s elite was engaging in philanthropy. Louise DeKoven Bowen (1859-1953) is remembered as a notable Chicago woman reformer. Daughter of Helen Hadduck and John deKoven Bowen,
a wealthy businessman, Louise inherited her parents’ fortune to add to her personal wealth as well as married a prospering Chicago manufacturer and banker, Joseph Tilton Bowen. Instead of wanting to spend her time perfecting the art of domesticity, she became a leading female reformer in Chicago alongside Jane Addams (UIC Special Collection Finding Aids Biography). She viewed her philanthropic adventures in Chicago as “a moral endeavour and civic responsibility” (Ruegamer, 55). Josephine Knowland Laflin (1862-1949) was another wealthy Chicago woman who participated in philanthropic endeavors. She married Louis E. Laflin, Sr., an engineer and architect and the son of a pioneer Chicago businessmen. She did not participate much in Chicago society (in terms of philanthropy or social clubs) until after the death of her husband in 1922, but was a socially prominent Chicago wife who travelled and also managed her multiple Chicago households. She did keep very detailed and lengthy journals and had regular personal correspondence with her family because she travelled so often (CHS). And of course, Bertha Palmer’s donations to charitable causes would be estimated at twenty-five thousand dollars a year (Ross, 47, 147-160; Swanson, 43; Ruegamer).

The tendency of these elite women to stretch the boundaries of etiquette and undertake civic responsibilities within the city seemed to be somewhat specific to Chicago. Some women’s organizations contained the most educated, wealthy, and socially relevant women in Chicago society (Ruegamer, 15). Julian Ralph, a magazine journalist who observed Chicago’s elite women during this time, noted that there were two characteristics unique to Chicago: (1) “the easy integration of the best women into after dinner entertaining” and (2) “the civic responsibility those same women demonstrated in public affairs” (Ruegamer, 5). These dual roles exemplify the concepts behind the Golden Age of Domesticity; the mixing of public and private sphere with women increasing in both influence and experience in public affairs (Matthews, 34). Ralph went so far as to claim that he did “not believe that in any older American city, we shall find fashionable women so anxious to be considered patrons of the arts and learning, or so forward in works of public improvement and governmental reform as well as charity” (Ruegamer, 5). He used Bertha Palmer and her leadership of the Board of Lady Managers for the Colombian Exposition as a prime example (Ruegamer, 5). This increased value of elite women to society logically signifies a change in perception of the wealthy, at least in Chicago society.
Historiography

Women’s History

Three essential stages exist in women’s history as identified by Kerber, Kessler-Harris, and Sklar: (1) biographical, (2) the recognition of “women’s contributions to developments already deemed important but thought to have been done by men,” and (3) appreciation of how women have affected, changed, or shaped history (Kerber, Kessler-Harris, & Sklar, 6). History, straying from just acknowledging the public sphere of men and men’s accomplishments, first moved into the private sphere of women by discussing them in their stereotypical roles—defining women in terms of whose mother, daughter, or wife she was.

The separation of men’s and women’s spheres into the public and private, respectively, created a trend in history. A trend in women’s history is to argue that women participated in the public sphere, that the spheres of man and women were not so separate. Jennifer Haytock focused on the idea of gender roles within separate spheres in literature and claimed that during wartime these gender roles subvert and distort. Women are allowed to take on roles outside of their narrow sphere during the chaos of war because men are displaced and needed to fight. Hoganson argues that by setting trends for the middle classes in decorating the home with foreign goods, elite women encouraged globalization through trade. McHugh, along the same lines, asserts that the home is not shut off from the public sphere but is very much an arena whose values can impact the public sphere and alternatively, a place where the public sphere can enter and change values within the home.

Conduct Literature

The study of conduct literature can serve many purposes but often historians use conduct literature as a measure of evolving attitudes and changing values. Arthur Schlesinger certainly did so. In his informative book on the evolution of etiquette in the United States, Schlesinger identifies the aristocratic classes as those who perpetuate etiquette; the poor have no such structured traditions nor means to produce the literature (Schlesinger). He labels the late nineteenth century ‘The Cult of Elegance’ and documents that as the level of wealth rose in the United States, the level of etiquette and conduct literature increased. Wouter also considered evolving etiquette. He compared rates of change in American, English, Dutch, and German conduct literature with the respective and comparative social change in each region (Schlesinger). This linking of historical events with changing etiquette is common in the field.
Arditi conducted a very similar study which compared shifts of power between social classes and changing content and form of conduct literature (Wouters).

Lastly, what is most similar to this study, is that of editors Ashley and Clark. These two compare the prescriptions of conduct literature in various forms with that of actual historical practice, though they are considering medieval times. They suggest that gender and class are ideas engraved in texts of a prescriptive nature. The lines of divisions and relational processes naturally arise in conduct literature in the categories of gender and class. Men and women, rich and poor are not prescribed the same advice (Ashley & Clark).

Amalgamation of these Concepts

There is an interdependence between material culture, prescribed notions of behavior, and social and political systems at the turn of the twenty-first century. In a way, conduct literature acts as the connecting thread between political, social, and economic realities for gender and domesticity. The idea that household interiors acted as a physical manifestation of the American housewife does not affect only conduct literature and prescribed notions of decoration, but also the woman’s perception of herself (Hoganson, 58). For the elite, this meant that their wives would spend exorbitant amounts of money decorating their houses to look the way the woman in question wanted to be viewed. Bertha Palmer, for example, built and decorated a mansion whose cost is unknown as her husband, Potter Palmer, refused to keep account of the bills after the total reached one million U.S. dollars before the reception of the house in 1885 (Swanson, 44). (Accounting for inflation, the total for the house would easily clear $25 million dollars in 2012.) Subsequently, as elite women carried the most influence socially, they would set trends that the middle classes would want to follow (Hoganson 58). That could be interpreted as the elite class sharing their ‘privileged knowledge’ (Kerber, Kessler-Harris, & Sklar, 12). Furthermore, etiquette which demanded the elaborate decoration of the home and elite women who did so extravagantly to define themselves, caused the mixture of the public and private spheres. Women wanted goods from other nations to decorate their homes because elite women did so and women entered into the international market as consumers (Hoganson). The paradox of shutting the women into the homes, the “haven from the outside world,” caused women to invite the outside world in (Hoganson, 60; Kaplan, McHugh).
What is most important is that questions of class and importance of domesticity in society clashed. Women of all social and economic classes read conduct literature in some form (Warhol & Herndl, 897). Conduct literature was very sensitive to the notions of “labor and leisure;” there were limits to how many “idle hours” a woman could have and with what to fill them. Women with too much spare time were seen as “deficient in female qualities” if they “spent time in idle amusement” like the wealthy (Warhol & Herndl, 897-907). The trouble was that the wealthy did not view any of their time being spent idly. Spending time to choose expensive dresses was not frivolous, because dressmakers were not just creating clothes or “draping fabric,” they were “preparing a client for her social responsibility” (Dwight, 47). Elite women were seen by all; the focus on material culture for them was more intense than for anyone else.

Elite Wives Conduct in their Own World

By comparing a wife’s duties as prescribed by conduct literature with her own mention of her actions, this research sought to reveal how elite Chicago women perceived etiquette and how they perceived themselves in their conforming and nonconforming behavior. As mentioned previously, one etiquette manual and one magazine are being used as the standard of prescribed etiquette. Both the 1891 manual, Manner, Culture and Dress of the Best American Society, and the monthly magazine, Godey’s Lady’s Book, overlap in their prescriptions of conduct, proving the advice to be standard for the turn of the twentieth century. There can be no assurance that the elite Chicago women read this specific conduct literature, but it was common for women to read conduct literature. The women’s status as elite signifies that their public persona would interact with the conduct literature, even if they did not privately. So when a wife transgresses against a prescribed social notion, she was aware.

The duties and expectations of an elite wife from 1890 to 1920 consisted of certain criteria. A lady should have been brought up in compliance with “the genteel ideal” (Ruegamer, 157). Being soft-spoken, dainty, dignified, modest, quiet, and pure were virtues of the early twentieth century woman. Additionally she should abstain from alcohol, tobacco, profanity, and any action deemed provocative. Her main interests as the moral superior to the male sex would have been religion and domestic affairs (Ruegamer, 157). The “main virtue of a lady was that everyone knew what to expect from her and how she was supposed to behave” (Ruegamer, 157). That which was expected of a wife was clearly stated. A wife’s concerns consisted of “keeping a husband happy and healthy, looking ‘well-turned
out,’ shopping for the latest fashions, managing a large household, enjoying traveling, contributing time and money to civic and cultural institutions” (Dwight, 16). These expectations, and the prescriptions of said etiquette, did not consider how a wife may view herself while adhering to the codes of conduct.

Conforming Behaviors

Conforming behaviors, those thoughts and actions which are consistent with ideas prescribed in conduct literature, outnumber non-conforming behaviors in this essay. For more conforming behavior to exist than non-conforming is only natural. To conform after all means to adapt to a norm, a behavior which is common in society. The presence of these conforming behaviors is expected. However, the blatant superficiality of these behaviors detracts from their significance. Women tended to conform to etiquette which dictated appearance. Adhering to rules of appearance allows outsiders looking in to view the woman in question as a proper wife, performing her duties adequately. By having a well-furnished home, being well-dressed, and throwing grand-looking parties helped a woman seem as though she fulfilled all her obligations.

Shopping

Dressing well showed society that a woman kept up with fashion and possessed the wealth and good taste to do so consistently. While middle class women may have been judged less harshly for not keeping up with the trends, an upper class woman had no reason to be behind in fashion. An article in Godey’s claimed that there was “room for improvement in the appearance of most women,” and they should take actions to do so (Accessible Archives, Inc. Godey’s Lady’s Book, October 1893). Many women viewed their appearance and constantly shopping for the latest fashions as both necessary and serious.

Pauline Palmer minded her outward appearance greatly. She wrote to her mother and mother-in-law about her concerns with her appearance. She purchased various corsets (Dwight, 44). She used “hip-reducers” (Dwight, 103). She wrote to her mother about her weight with disappointment if she had gained weight and happiness if she had lost weight (Dwight, 87). In addition she notes what other people wear, how “fat” other women are, what others are wearing and how the fashions suit them (Dwight, 62, 103).

The amount of money a women would spend on herself revealed how valuable her appearance, and by extension, she was. Josephine Laflin paid for her hair to be washed and her hands to be manicured to keep up
appearances (CHS, Laflin Family Papers, January 9, 1903.). Frances Shaw Wells noted that even when she was traveling she would pay to be able to bathe every day (CHS, Shaw-Wells Family Papers, January 16, 1906). Bertha Palmer would spend obscene amounts on her dresses and jewelry (Dwight, 14). Citizens of Chicago would wait outside Potter Palmer’s Chicago establishments, specifically the Palmer Hotel, to have a chance to see her in her bejeweled and silken glory (Ross, 40).

Decorating the Home

Furnishing one’s home well was necessary for an elite woman as it was a representation of herself. A 1913 decorating manual states, “We are sure to judge a woman in whose house we find ourselves for the first time, by her surroundings. We judge her temperament, habits, inclinations, by the interior of her home” (Hoganson, 58). Seeing the inside of a woman’s home was, at the turn of the century, equivalent to seeing inside her soul. Women knew how serious the interior of their homes were to society and so did the writers of conduct literature. Godey’s Lady’s Book often featured a section of their publication titled “The Beautiful Home Club.” This section mentioned what sort of decorations were in fashion at the time and how a woman might decorate her home. Expensive items like leather arm chairs, stained glass, paintings, fine china, and elaborate rugs would be the standard (Accessible Archives, Inc. Godey’s Lady’s Book. “The Beautiful Home Club,” April 1890). An etiquette manual claimed that it would be “senseless” for a woman to “seek to be admired in general society for her politeness” if her home was not attractive (Wells & Stewart, 250).

Chicago’s elite took decorating and appearance of their homes very seriously. Josephine Knowland Laflin wrote in her diary that she spent the whole day with her husband planning their new lamp shade. Laflin even once wrote to a neighbor in distress that the condition of his yard was unruly, clearly worried that it would reflect badly upon her home (CHS, Laflin Family Papers. Jan 28, 1903). Elite women clearly cared about how others might conceive of them and it is shown via their diaries and personal letters that they would go to great lengths; the potential judgement of them based on their home’s furnishings troubled them. If the home existed as a physical representation of the woman, and the woman was aware of this rule, then a nicely furnished home represented how greatly the woman perceived herself, or at least how well she wanted to be seen by the public.
Bertha Palmer would go further than any other to decorate her home. Her home, known as the Palmer Castle at 1350 North Lake Shore Drive, cost more than one million dollars to build. It had entrances covered in gold leaf, a great hall with stained glass, paintings that covered all the walls of the dining room that seated fifty, forty-two rooms, an elevator, a seventy-five foot long picture gallery (Swanson, 45). She constantly added ‘new treasures’ from distant lands, like Chinese porcelain and Venetian mosaics (Ross, 55). Though a critic might regard this as a glamorous show of her wealth, this was more in concurrence with upper class decorating standards of the period propagated by conduct literature than a flouting of it. Bertha Palmer decorated her home so lavishly because she was the Queen of Chicago, and by extension her home had to be a castle to adequately represent her.

Entertaining

The subsequent expectation after furnishing a house to present one’s self well was inviting society into the home. Etiquette manuals have provide detailed advice on how to behave when one was a guest and when one had guests because woman should have many friends and acquaintances (Wells & Stewart). Godey’s Lady’s Book states that regardless of how tired a woman was, she must always be “full of life at afternoon tea and dinner parties, at dances and balls” in and out of the home (Accessible Archives, Inc. Godey’s Lady’s Book, August 1893). An elite wife’s duty was to build and maintain social connections and stay socially relevant in society.

Josephine Knowland Laflin adhered to the concept of being popular and entertaining frequently regardless of her personal conviction, while Frances Lillian Wells Shaw did not care as much for entertaining, a dislike obvious in her private documents. Laflin frequently mentioned dining with other couple or throwing successful dinner parties (CHS, Laflin Family Papers. July 16, 1903; July 26, 1905; January 7, 1895). Josephine Laflin notes receiving twenty five callers in one day in January 7, 1895 (Laflin Family Papers. January 7, 1895). On another note she excitedly mentioned that her husband bought her bouillon cups as a part of her wedding china, a piece of china which Godey’s Lady’s Book recommended for housewives to create “opportunity for table appointments endless” (Laflin Family Papers. Letter is undated, but year is 1900). The purchase of said gift suggests that her husband supported recommendations in conduct literature and that Laflin appreciated this. There was also a post-script on a letter where Josephine Laflin wrote “I am going to get dressed and force myself to go out and be sociable,” suggesting that she had grown tired of entertaining but continued to do so to live up to expectation (Laflin Family Papers. March 5, 1901).
Nonconforming

Non-conforming behaviors outweigh examples of conforming, though they do not outnumber them. These non-conforming behaviors are not appearance-based as the conforming behaviors, but performance-based. This behavior proved the intelligence and ability of the women. Though entertaining, the first example, is an appearance-based activity, there also exists an opportunity to create meaningful social interactions, as Bertha Palmer will do. Controlling a guest list to an event places the women in a position of control and grants her the capability to determine who will be interacting at the dinner party. Obedience is the other category in this section which reveals that women, even a woman who looked like the perfect wife, could defy a social norm. In fact, women who adhered to most appearance-based conduct literature and therefore seemed like they had fulfilled their wifely duties, may defy other social norms because they had obeyed all the other prescribed ideas.

Entertaining

Throwing more formal parties or dinners was equally as important as accepting daytime callers and making social calls. Godey’s stated in its May 1896 issue that, “Dinner giving is nowadays a high art, and the successful hostess is she who is endowed with tact, and has a fine appreciation of how to being such persons together as are congenial and to serve them with a few dainty dishes exquisitely cooked” (Accessible Archives, Inc. Godey’s Lady’s Book, “Fashion, Fact, and Fancy,” May 1896).

Though Shaw Wells also described a party she threw and near the entry in her diary attached a newspaper clipping which noted, “Mrs. Howard Shaw entertained twenty young people at her Lake Forest residence yesterday” which included dinner and dancing (Shaw-Wells Family Papers. August 1, 1910). Frances Wells Shaw also recorded missing two luncheons and eleven calls in one day (Shaw-Wells Family Papers, October 17, 1905). Her lack of regret and description cannot reveal whether she felt shameful about this or not. Her lack of regard might imply guilt or indifference as to how her social transgressions would reflect on her character as a wife meant to follow norms. Lack of shame combined with intentionality in breaking norms might suggest they were her own brand of micro-reform; she was tired of entertaining and made the decision not to on occasion.

Bertha Palmer hosted legendary parties. Politicians, reformers, labor leaders, foreign royalty, and “protagonists of many odd causes” attended Palmer’s parties (Ross, 56). Note that this was not necessarily
according to the rules. The lists of guests she invited to her events suggests that her guest list was constructed to guarantee her enjoyment of the night, not others. Politicians would not have been comfortable with reformers in the same party. Rather than the pleasure of her guests, Bertha thought her enjoyment was a higher priority than the pleasure of others, suggesting an attitude of superiority. Or it could suggest her own agency. She either meant to be able to adapt and remain flexible despite class divides or adapt the norms to her desires. The blatant transgression might have been her brand of social reform. Her parties, after all, mixed social classes and individuals with conflicting interests, a common theme of the Progressive Era to come in the 1920s.

**Obedience**

The first obligation a wife had to her husband was to obey him. The man was the one who lived in the public sphere and therefore maintained the executive power over his wife who was limited to the private sphere. For the wife, this meant constantly and consistently considering her husband when making any sort of decision. One example in which this is evident was the need for the husband’s approval before undertaking an activity which would require the wife to enter the public sphere, no matter how marginally. An 1891 etiquette manual stated that despite the conventional expectation that a wife should participate in charitable organizations to fill her idle time, a wife should “engage in nothing of the kind, however laudable, without previously consulting [her] husband and obtaining his full concurrence” (Wells & Stewart, 249).

Many of the Chicago elite wives whose lives were examined for the purposes of this essay complied with the prescribed notion of obeying their husbands. It is known that Potter Palmer supported his wife in her charitable endeavors. Not only did he fund her donations, but he was noted as supporting her (Ross, 55). However there was a suggestion that she would have engaged in this regardless. When her husband died, he left everything to her claiming that whomever she married next would need it (Ross, 55). She perceived herself as important to Chicago. When catastrophe struck Chicago in the form of the Chicago Fire (1871) and nearly all of Potter Palmer’s buildings burned to the ground, she refused to leave and start over in another city. “[I]t’s the duty of every Chicagoman to stay here,” Bertha Palmer said, “and help to rebuild this stricken city” (Ross, 7). She perceived herself as a citizen of Chicago, and an important one at that. Though the decision of leaving or not was in her husband’s hands, she used
her domestic influence to convince him to stay. Mrs. Potter Palmer agreed to obey her husband, but ultimately she saw herself as being able to be in control in any situation.

Louise de Koven Bowen displayed an independence similar to Palmer’s. Her husband supported her in her civic responsibilities, but perhaps this is not entirely honest (Ruegamer, 55). Mrs. de Koven Bowen was independently wealthy; her parents left her millions in inheritance money (de Koven Bowen). Would her husband have supported her in her charitable donations if it was his money she was spending? If anything this is not obeying her husband so much as not inconveniencing him while finding her own agency with her wealth.

Conclusion

Conduct literature attempted to hide physical female culture, but elite women embraced these rules of etiquette. Much of female culture was and is based on physical circumstances—puberty, menstruation, pregnancy, menopause—and conduct literature pushed these physical dimensions of being a woman out of public view and replaced them with different duties to attend to (Warhol & Herndl, 40). Frances Wells Shaw claimed that “Manners are the only things that count” (CHS, Shaw-Wells Family Papers, January 16, 1906). Pauline Palmer, Josephine Laflin, and Bertha Palmer did not state explicitly that they believed etiquette was above all else, but they generally followed the rules prescribed by etiquette manuals besides the occasional, blatant transgressions. Even Bertha Palmer followed the rules despite having once said that she doubted that society could admire the “stupid, superficial fools they have trained us to become” (Ross, 45). In fact, she was the queen of Chicago society, who set many of the trends to etiquette and home decoration herself. Etiquette seemed to be inescapable. It is possible that this oppression of female culture allowed for greater autonomy for the elite woman. By highlighting her appropriate etiquette, a woman would have been able to take advantage of this public perception to push the bounds of her constraints in other areas, such as intellectual, cultural, and social endeavors of her choosing. If a woman was seen as silly, focused on material possessions, ignorant of the public sphere, then men would never think that their wives’ actions were as significant, even if they were mixing businessmen and reformers at parties like Bertha Palmer.

Wealthy women could set trends (Hoganson). They could influence their husbands to move to other cities, purchase specific land or items, donate to organizations. Poor and middle class women could not do this. Women
could fight through and alongside their husbands for improving working conditions in the streets, but it would be a long struggle. The extent to which one could alter the rules was dependent on status in society.

There are two types of wives. Most of the conduct literature did not acknowledge this idea, but a section of a fictional story published in Godey’s Lady’s Book portrays it simply. The main male character says:

“I believe that for an intellectual man only two courses are open; either he ought to marry some simple, dutiful woman who will bear him children, and see to the household matters and love him....; or else, on the other hand, he ought to marry some highly intelligent lady able to carry her education far beyond school experiences and willing to become a companion in the arduous paths of intellectual labor” (Accessible Archives, Inc. Godey’s Lady’s Book, August 1893).

This quote, though it is only in a fictional story for the amusement of early twentieth century women, presents the idea as a potential reality. Women did not have to obey their husband down to the word, entertain society as if it were a constant obligation, decorate beautifully, and manage the household. Women could do more. They could engage in charitable endeavors and form organizations that represent their beliefs. Chicago’s elite women did it all.

Elite Chicago wives followed the prescribed etiquette, but they made the rules work in their favor. Josephine Laflin was a perfect wife in terms of her personally recorded history found in journals and correspondence. She also contributed to charitable organizations. She became even more involved in philanthropy once her husband died because widows did have more freedom in society. She was both the perfect housewife and the well-educated woman. A letter addressed to Josephine Laflin stated that the city needed individuals with her “fine grained culture to leaven the lump of —let me call it—bourgeois banalité. We need people with a noble purpose and high principles and the courage to state them, to keep the lamp of progress burning” (CHS, Laflin Family Papers. November 24, 1902). This showed that there was an acceptance of strong and independent women despite conduct literature which opposed them.

The perfect example of Chicago’s elite encompassing all the duties of both a wife and a woman with civic responsibilities was Bertha Palmer. Palmer dressed well, decorated well, paid attention to fashion, and followed most codes of conduct in society. She also donated thousands of dollars to charitable organizations, joined the Chicago
Women's Club, single-handedly sustained the Chicago Art Institute, and helped bring to actualization the 1893 Colombian Exposition as the President of the Board of Lady Managers (Ross, 47; Ruegamer). As a younger wife she lived vicariously through influencing the men in her family; encouraging her husband to build up Chicago as a cultural center and donate to charitable organizations (Ross, 47). Additionally, she judged all people by one standard of justice. She believed in setting the same expectations for herself and others (Ross, 68). She perceived herself as extremely capable and proved it. Instead of acting as a simple housewife, many of these elite women used their social standing to redefine themselves and justify their unconventional actions.

These elite women effectively navigated and stretched the boundaries of etiquette prescribed by conduct literature and still maintained their self-perception as good wives because they chose to interpret prescribed notions of advice differently. An 1891 American etiquette manual claimed, “Women observe all the delicacies of propriety in manners and all shade of impropriety, much better than men;...because their perceptions are more refined than those of the other sex who are habitually employed about greater things” (Wells & Stewart, 54). While this may be true that a woman would notice improper actions more easily, it was up to them to really decide what to see as improper. Additionally being improper, or “in error,” was not necessarily being wrong (Warhol & Herndl, 40). Bertha Palmer was quoted as saying that she viewed herself as the “nation’s hostess and the nation’s head woman servant” (Ross, 100). That meant that she did not see domesticity as a matter of the home, but as a matter of the city, state, and nation. She clearly defined domesticity not as a woman serving the man, but as a citizen serving mankind. This allowed her to believe that “women should be independent, educated, and with all their gifts developed and exercised because we cannot afford to lose the reserve power of any individual” (Ruegamer, 203). Her choices to ignore or designate new meaning to some facets of etiquette allowed her to be the powerful woman she was. Each of these powerful women likely did and believed the same. They redefined domesticity and what it meant to be a “good woman” and “good wife.”
Primary Sources:

Accessible Archives, Inc. Godey’s Lady’s Book,
Chicago Historical Society

Secondary Sources:


Wells, Richard A. and Stewart, George R. Manner, Culture and Dress of the Best American Society, Including Social, Commercial and Legal Forms, Letter Writing, Invitations, &c., also valuable suggestions on Self Culture and Home Training. Omaha, NE: Clark, 1891.


Grace Kruse  
Purdue University Calumet  

Native Americans in Yellowstone National Park  

Our national parks stand as a symbol of nature’s beauty and the American commitment to the protection and preservation of the land along with the numerous plant and animal life that inhabits it. The first and perhaps the most iconic of our national parks is Yellowstone. Made into a national park in 1872 with the signing of the Natural Resource bill by Ulysses S. Grant, Yellowstone set in motion a broader movement of fostering protection of the landscape in the United States that would go on to form the basis of the national park system. The importance of portraying Yellowstone Park as a wilderness was significant because of the potential the park held in becoming a cultural icon for America. Establishing the park came at a time when the nation lacked clear cultural icons that served as symbols of national identity as other European countries had with their great architecture and extensive histories. While the United States did not have this kind of history, it could forge one out of the unparalleled and unique beauty of its very own landscape. Despite Grant’s lofty intentions there is a much more negative overlooked history behind the creation of the park. This paper explores the unethical policies and some of the unintended consequences of the park’s development, some born of the Grant Administration’s lack of foresight and prejudice against Indians and working class Americans. The establishment of Yellowstone national park disrupted the way of life for Native American tribes who formed lived, hunted, and crossed through the park lands, and it likewise created unnatural boundaries that disrupted the ecosystems of animals. It becomes readily apparent that the park was to serve the lofty ideals of a particular group of Americans at the expense of other less favored groups.  

One of the government’s early decisions in creating the first national park was to present it to the public as a “pristine wilderness” in need of protection for the enjoyment for future generations (Steinberge 158). In other words, the park was empty and undisturbed and should be kept that way. American tourists feared Indians so their presence in the region should be concealed. This was the age of the last great Indian Wars when whites associated all Indians with the great warriors’ Crazy horse and Geronimo. Would-be visitors would be deterred if they thought ‘real’ Indians used the park lands. The government and the railroads that helped the fund the parks wanted the parks to generate revenue and political support. It did not trouble their conscience that they would have to rewrite history to make the
parks serve these desired ends. The image of a pristine wilderness was one that was artificially produced because various Native American tribes such as the Bannock, Nez Perce, Crow, Blackfeet Flathead, and Shoshone utilized the area and the Sheep Eaters were residents of the area (Weixeiman 51). In order to present their desired image of wilderness the government had to essentially erase the presence of Native Americans from Yellowstone. In doing so the Government denied the way of life that these tribes had established while inhabiting that area in all the years prior. Native Americans utilized the park in various ways. For example the Shoshones hunted buffalo, fished and gathered various plants that most likely utilized the park (Steinberg 148). In addition Huges describes further Native American presence in the form of Western Native Americans having access to the park through the Bannock Trail located in the northern part of the park which was used to travel through the Rocky Mountains to hunt bison on the eastern planes (Huges 21). Also Huges mentions the Blackfoot of western Montana traveled across the Yellowstone Plateau to raid the Crow and Shoshone (Huges 22). Buffalo soldiers and other park guards drove out Indians and blocked them from entering the park to hunt or simply pass through en route to other places.

The removal of these Native Americans from the area was accomplished through a series of government treaties and the stationing of soldiers at the park’s periphery. The signing of treaties between the Native American groups of the region and the Government would effectively limit these groups to reservations as well as limiting their access to Yellowstone. Directly, the treaties lessened the amount of land Native Americans once held. More importantly though, moving Native Americans to reservations reflected a shift in the Native American policy the government held. A policy of attempting to assimilate Native Americans into the overall American culture was adopted. This policy can be seen by the various provisions made within treaties. For example, Steinberg mentions that in the Treaty with the Western Shoshone in 1863, article six states that “the President of the United States shall deem it expedient for them (western band Shoshone) to abandon the roaming life, which they now lead and become herdsmen or agriculturists, he is hereby authorized to make such reservations for their use.” (Steinberg 338). That represented a massive shift in the way of life for them. These Native American tribes depended on buffalo for a source of food thus requiring them to move from place to place. Now under the treaty Native Americans were encouraged to settle down and become farmers or herdsmen seemingly overnight. Also in the treaty with the eastern band Shoshone and Bannock of 1868, article seven refers to the reservation as an “agricultural reservation”. [285]
Provisions within the various treaties also included the building of churches, mandatory English based education, the giving out of American clothing and building of mills (Nabokov & Loendorf 218). All of these provisions showed clearly that not only did the government want to move them but change them so that they could be more like the rest of the country. It is hard to see any link between that urged change and the proposed reasons for creating Yellowstone. Rather this was their attempt at ‘civilizing’ these people while they had the opportunity. In doing so they ignored just how important that land and their way of life was to them. It was more than just changing how they lived but who they were as people and as a tribe. For instance many of the tribes shared cultural histories that linked them to Yellowstone though the use of hunting grounds, religious practices, and creation stories. Unfortunately those ties became more and more strained with the increasing limited access to the Yellowstone area. It seems the government systematically wanted them to become estranged from Yellowstone, later evidenced as with the passage of the Supreme Court decision Ward v Race Horse which further impacted the Native American way of life. The ruling overturned the right of Native Americans to hunt on unoccupied government lands. A serious blow to the various tribes who hunted to support themselves and to supplement the inadequate food rations on the reservations. An agent of the Fort Hall Reservation once explained, “Being short rationed and far from self-supporting, according to the white man’s methods, they (Bannock and Shoshones) simply follow their custom and hunt for the purpose of obtaining sustenance (Steinberg, 149). In addition to this restriction, Nabokov and Loendorf detail in their book Restoring a Presence American Indians in Yellowstone National Park further depict restrictions on Native Americans such as the Indian Appropriation Act of 1871 which degraded the status of Native American groups. This act outlawed the recognition of Indian tribes as nations or independent powers and the negotiation of additional treaties was forbidden (Nabokov & Loendorf 34). Essentially Native American political authority went unrecognized on top of everything else, thus ensuring the government’s policies would not be challenged by Indians. Ultimately shifting them from free traveling tribes to clusters of dependent natives confined to reservations (Nabokov & Loendorf 34). Again their policies in connection with creating and maintaining Yellowstone went so far overboard as to systematically alter the Native American people in the region. It is hard to imagine how so completely affecting the Indians was essential to the parks creation and survival.
Besides the presence of Native Americans being a direct contradiction to the efforts to promote Yellowstone as wilderness, other more selfish factors contributed to the gradual pressure to remove Native Americans from Yellowstone. The amount of tourists that would come to visit the park provided an excellent opportunity for individuals to make a profit in the tourist industry. This can be seen in the Northern Pacific Railroad companies attempt to build a line that would bring tourists to Yellowstone, guides that would offer to show tourists around the park, and the amount of hotels that would attempt to set up in Yellowstone. In fact congress passed the Sundry Civil Bill of 1883 which prohibited concessioners from locating facilities within one quarter mile of any geyser in the park so that concessioners could not monopolize on the parks features, for example blocking the view of Old Faithful a geyser within the park(Byrand 59). However fears of a Native American presence within the park made potential tourists rethink about visiting the park. As Park Superintendent Moses Harris who explained in 1888: “the mere rumor of the presence of Indians in the park is sufficient to cause much excitement and anxiety”(Steinberg 148) The presence of Native Americans even the rumor of their presence could threaten tourism to the park. As a result, efforts were made to lessen the presence of Native Americans by the government through the signing of treaties that limited access to the park and on the part of park mangers. An attempt was made, to cultivate an image of Native Americans not having any connection to the park. In a blatant lie, Park Superintendent Philetus Norris even remarked that Native Americans avoided the park because they held the geothermal features in “superstitious awe”(Weixelman 55). Additionally, Norris’s description of the Sheep Eaters, a Native American group that actually lived within the park, as a “pygmy tribe of three or four hundred timid and harmless Sheep Eater Indians.”(Nabokov&Loendorf 142). These descriptions clearly appear to down play the threat that the Sheep Eaters and any other Indians would pose to visitors to the park. Norris perpetrated these mistruths for the economic gain of those involved with the park. At the same time he erased the historical memory of the tribes, he actively attempted to erase the Native American presence in Yellowstone and make his assertions come true. For example he would travel to personally visit the Native Americans of the Fort Hall and Lemhi reservations to foster, “a solemn promise to abide by the terms of their treaty in Washington and also that thereafter they would not enter the park.”(Nabokov&Loendorf 190). Norris even went so far as attempting to convince surrounding tribes that they could only “visit the park at their own peril with the civil and military officers of the government.”(Nabokov&Loendorf 189). In addition most of the Sheep Eaters were
relocated at the Wind River, Fort Hall and Lemhi reservations. (Nabokov&Loendorf 229). All these actions were done for the intended purpose of making the park appear as if Native Americans rarely used the land there and that existing tribes that did were harmless. This story offered a way of alleviating fears as Yellowstone park ranger wrote, “these agreements were widely advertised and in order to further neutralize any fear of Indian trouble a policy of minimizing past incidents was evolved. The recent invasions were represented as unprecedented, actually anomalous. Indians had never lived in Yellowstone, were infrequent visitors because they were afraid of the thermal activity! It was not a conspiracy against the truth just an adaptation of business psychology to a promising national resort.” (Nabokov&Loendorf xii). Realizing the potential in attracting tourists to the park, railroad officials and park officials most notably park superintendent Norris took steps to minimize the presence of Native Americas though the downplaying of visits of Native Americans to the park as highly unusual, and perpetrating the myth that Native Americans avoided the area because as Norris claimed they held it in “superstitious awe” (Steinberg 148). More accurately as Philip Burnham pointed out, “The national parks ultimately become rich peoples playgrounds and in some cases economic ventures, at the expense of Indians ....that the national parks as presented by the Natural Park Service as scenic wonders and home to various wildlife, but not for indigenous human inhabitants...whose traditional land use practices were no longer allowed; and that in the second and third decades of this century as wealthy Americans were discouraged from touring Europe and encouraged to come to national parks, Indian people still needed permits to leave their reservation.” (Nabokov&Loendorf 306). This almost perfectly describes how the development of Yellowstone affected Native Americans. Native American concerns were never really even considered, as long as the people of America got their vacation spot nothing else mattered. Their small gain came at the direct and substantial loss of Native Americans.

The enacting of government policies that limited Native Americans access to Yellowstone significantly, reduced presence of Native Americans and thus allowed the myth of the park as an area of wilderness to develop. The promotion of such an image was used by park officials in an effort to entice people to visit Yellowstone for its geological marvels and abundance of wildlife. The emphasis of these two main features would shape the park to become a tourist and hunting destination. While one of the focuses of the paper is to illustrate the environmental impact the creation of Yellowstone had, it is notable to point out that, prior to the parks establishment, it was already...
affected by Native Americans, who set fires to manage the landscape and hunted in the area. Nevertheless the formation of the park would have significant environmental ramifications.

Perhaps one of the most significant effects of the creation of the park can be seen on the ecosystem. For example, wildlife, such as white-tailed deer and beavers vanished from the park by 1930. The park’s boundaries were drawn artificially. This meant the boundaries did not represent the natural migration patterns of the wildlife in the area which resulted in the wildlife leaving the park boundary. In addition lack of funding and laws protecting the wildlife left the park susceptible to unchecked hunting and poaching. The devastating impact of the extensive poaching and hunting can be seen that between 1889 and 1894 one of the last remaining buffalo herd was decimated. Decisions to increase the number of big game animals for hunting purposes lead to the intentional killing of predators such as wolves and coyotes. Besides the impact on wildlife within the area the companies also used the park. For example the Yellowstone Park Improvement Company was allowed to cut as much timber as it wanted and rechanneled some of the hot springs with in the park.

Throughout the process of creating Yellowstone as the country’s first national park, those making the decisions within the government generated a happy, distorted image of what they were doing for the public benefit. Yet upon further examination their actions showed their disregard for how those choices would affect the land and surrounding inhabitants, especially the Native Americans. At the very least their actions seemed opportunistic by seizing the chance to change the natives in that area. At their worst it seems they may have had those intentions from the beginning and used the creation of the park as yet another excuse for solving the country’s “Indian problem.” Either way, their actions were inexcusable and when weighed against the reasons they put forth for creating the park, it is clear they erred. Yes, Yellowstone is a beautiful place that we can all appreciate but was preserving it more important than the lives of those who lived on and off the land?
Works cited


